

ABSTRACT OF THESIS

Name of Candidate John Wilbur Silva
Address 73 Craiglea Drive, Edinburgh
Degree Ph.D. Date 1972
Title of Thesis "A Study of the Theology of Church Government and the Practice
of Church Administration, with Special Reference to the Churches
in Asia."

The theology of church government and administration is held to be of real relevance to the important question of church growth. It is the argument of this thesis that there is no theological barrier to the pragmatic adaptation of the structures of church government. It is held that, subject to the guidance of the Holy Spirit, the adaptation of church structures to meet the demands of differing historical, cultural, social and spiritual conditions is both theologically possible and practically necessary to assist in the fulfilment of the mission of the Ekklesia.

The importance, limitations and methodology of the study are discussed in the introduction. Important definitions are also included in this portion of the study. The major body of the research is divided into three sections.

In the first section, study is made of the theological implications of church government as it relates to four major areas: the nature of the Ekklesia; the relationships within the Ekklesia; the authority for government within the Ekklesia; and the role of church government in the fulfilment of the mission of the Ekklesia. Comparison is first made of the traditional Western polities, and the conclusion is drawn that major theological differences do exist between Catholic and Protestant Christians in regard to these four bases of church government. However, it is seen that Protestant polities are divided only in expression of a fundamental unity regarding these theological bases of church government. Pragmatic adaptation of church structures is seen as both theologically acceptable and practically necessary to promote church growth.

The second section deals with paternalistic structures of church government as seen in the Mission Churches of Asia. These structures are examined both historically and for their effect upon the development of the Asian churches. These paternalistic structures are rejected on the basis of their detrimental influence upon the development and growth of the churches in Asia.

The third section of the study centres upon the close relationship between church structures and the historical, cultural, social and spiritual influences at work within the Asian churches. As the churches of Asia become truly indigenous, they would seem to modify inherited church structures to fit the totality of the Asian milieu.

Examination is made of the present practices and structures of churches in Taiwan, Hong Kong, India, Japan and the Philippines. These structures are discussed in terms of the four theological bases of church government.

First, examination is made of the nature of the Ekklesia and structures of the churches. It is seen that the incarnational nature of the Ekklesia places the churches in a role of reconciliation. This reconciliation of the world to God through the Ekklesia demands that the nature of the Ekklesia be thought of in terms of missionary activity.

Thus, the nature and the purpose of the Ekklesia determines the nature and form of the various structures of church government. This applies to the churches of Asia, for these churches must act for God in the world to which God has commissioned them. It is seen that the world of Asia is experiencing a thorough-going revolution, demanding a corresponding revolution within the churches to meet the new situation. The missionary activity of the Asian churches is entering a new phase, with these churches fulfilling their role of reconciliation within the Asian milieu, and at the same time, resolving the relationship between the Indigenous Church and the Universal Church.

Second, authority for church government is considered on three levels. In relation to the clergy, there is the question of ordination and training. Yet another area of concern is the relationship of authority as claimed by Church and State. While there is widespread religious liberty, the Asian churches must be prepared with structures to express the authority of Christ under all conditions. A final area of authority in structures which must be considered is the role of the Mission Society in the on-going mission of the Asian churches. The place of the Mission Society involves social, practical and theological problems. Authority in all church structures is closely concerned with the relationships within the Ekklesia.

Third, church government and the relationships within the Asian churches is of importance to the missionary activity of the churches. Examination is made of church structures and the relationships within the local congregation, between the local congregation and larger church structures, and between the clergy and the laity. Relationships within the Asian churches also involve the need for structures to define and practice discipline at all levels.

Fourth, structures to assist in the fulfilment of the purpose and mission of the Ekklesia are considered. It is seen that the purpose of church government is directly related to the world of Asia, for it is in this world that the Ekklesia must win the people of Asia. To this end, where necessary, church structures must be revised and adapted to the needs of the Asian situation. The present time is seen to afford a new opportunity to develop structures for mission; the Asian churches will need to seize this opportunity.

On the basis of the study of these four areas of church structure, the final two chapters of the section deal with contemporary reforms in governmental structures as the churches of Asia seek to take advantage of these new opportunities to re-form structures for mission. It is seen that larger church structures are being reformed, as polity is adapted to the missionary purpose of the Ekklesia. Reforms are also being planned and instituted on the congregational level, as local structures are adapted to fulfill the mission of the Ekklesia in their own locale. Patterns for the full utilization of the resources of the laity and the ministry, as well as practical arrangements for missionary activity at all levels are seen to be developing.

The study closes with one final chapter of principles and suggestions for the adaptation of church structures for missionary activity and church growth. It is hoped that these suggestions and principles may prove to be of some value in the promotion of church growth, both in Asia and throughout the world, through the pragmatic adaptation of church structures.

A STUDY OF THE THEOLOGY OF CHURCH GOVERNMENT
AND THE PRACTICE OF CHURCH ADMINISTRATION,
WITH SPECIAL REFERENCE TO THE CHURCHES IN ASIA

BY

JOHN WILBUR SILVA



A THESIS

SUBMITTED TO THE FACULTY OF DIVINITY,

THE UNIVERSITY OF EDINBURGH,

IN FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS

FOR THE DEGREE, DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

1972

To my father, Rev. E. L. Silva

whose life as a Christian missionary and a Christian man

has served as both challenge and inspiration

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

In any study such as this, the family of the one seeking the degree is closely involved; my family is no exception. However, I do feel that my family has been exceptionally patient and understanding. Without their encouragement and willingness to adapt to the limitations imposed by the demands of this study, my own efforts would have been fruitless.

My Supervisors, Professor J. C. Blackie and Dr. A. C. Ross, have provided invaluable advice and sympathetic encouragement.

Special thanks are also due to Mr. John Nimmo and the staff at the Social Sciences Research Centre. They have proved friends indeed.

Mrs. Linda Stupart, as Secretary to the Faculty, and Mr. Iain Hope, as Assistant Librarian, have also been of great assistance in the preparation of this study.

ABSTRACT

The theology of church government and administration is held to be of real relevance to the important question of church growth. It is the argument of this thesis that there is no theological barrier to the pragmatic adaptation of the structures of church government. It is held that, subject to the guidance of the Holy Spirit, the adaptation of church structures to meet the demands of differing historical, cultural, social and spiritual conditions is both theologically possible and practically necessary to assist in the fulfilment of the mission of the Ekklesia.

The importance, limitations and methodology of the study are discussed in the introduction. Important definitions are also included in this portion of the study. The major body of the research is divided into three sections.

In the first section, study is made of the theological implications of church government as it relates to four major areas: the nature of the Ekklesia; the relationships within the Ekklesia; the authority for government within the Ekklesia; and the role of church government in the fulfilment of the mission of the Ekklesia. Comparison is first made of the traditional Western polities, and the conclusion is drawn that major theological differences do exist between Catholic and Protestant Christians in regard to these four bases of church government.

However, it is seen that Protestant polities are divided only in expression of a fundamental unity regarding these theological bases of church government. Pragmatic adaptation of church structures is seen as both theologically acceptable and practically necessary to promote church growth.

The second section deals with paternalistic structures of church government as seen in the Mission Churches of Asia. These structures are examined both historically and for their effect upon the development of the Asian churches. These paternalistic structures are rejected on the basis of their detrimental influence upon the development and growth of the churches in Asia.

The third section of the study centres upon the close relationship between church structures and the historical, cultural, social and spiritual influences at work within the Asian churches. As the churches of Asia become truly indigenous, they would seem to modify inherited church structures to fit the totality of the Asian milieu.

Examination is made of the present practices and structures of churches in Taiwan, Hong Kong, India, Japan and the Philippines. These structures are discussed in terms of the four theological bases of church government.

First, examination is made of the nature of the Ekklesia and structures of the churches. It is seen that the incarnational nature of the Ekklesia places the churches in a role of reconciliation. This reconciliation of the world to God through the Ekklesia demands that the

nature of the Ekklesia be thought of in terms of missionary activity. Thus, the nature and the purpose of the Ekklesia determines the nature and form of the various structures of church government. This applies to the churches of Asia, for these churches must act for God in the world to which God has commissioned them. It is seen that the world of Asia is experiencing a thorough-going revolution, demanding a corresponding revolution within the churches to meet the new situation. The missionary activity of the Asian churches is entering a new phase, with these churches fulfilling their role of reconciliation within the Asian milieu, and at the same time, resolving the relationship between the Indigenous Church and the Universal Church.

Second, authority for church government is considered on three levels. In relation to the clergy, there is the question of ordination and training. Yet another area of concern is the relationship of authority as claimed by Church and State. While there is widespread religious liberty, the Asian churches must be prepared with structures to express the Authority of Christ under all conditions. A final area of authority in structures which must be considered is the role of the Mission Society in the ongoing mission of the Asian churches. The place of the Mission Society involves social, practical and theological problems. Authority in all church structures is closely concerned with the relationships within the Ekklesia.

Third, church government and the relationships within the Asian churches is of importance to the missionary

activity of the churches. Examination is made of church structures and the relationships within the local congregation, between the local congregation and larger church structures, and between the clergy and the laity. Relationships within the Asian churches also involve the need for structures to define and practice discipline at all levels.

Fourth, structures to assist in the fulfilment of the purpose and mission of the Ekklesia are considered. It is seen that the purpose of church government is directly related to the world of Asia, for it is in this world that the Ekklesia must win the people of Asia. To this end, where necessary, church structures must be revised and adapted to the needs of the Asian situation. The present time is seen to afford a new opportunity to develop structures for mission; the Asian churches will need to seize this opportunity.

On the basis of the study of these four areas of church structure, the final two chapters of the section deal with contemporary reforms in governmental structures as the churches of Asia seek to take advantage of these new opportunities to re-form structures for mission. It is seen that larger church structures are being reformed, as polity is adapted to the missionary purpose of the Ekklesia. Reforms are also being planned and instituted on the congregational level, as local structures are adapted to fulfill the mission of the Ekklesia in their own levels. Patterns for the full utilization of the resources of the laity and the ministry, as well as practical arrangements for

missionary activity at all levels are seen to be developing.

The study closes with one final chapter of principles and suggestions for the adaptation of church structures for missionary activity and church growth. It is hoped that these suggestions and principles may prove to be of some value in the promotion of church growth, both in Asia and throughout the world, through the pragmatic adaptation of church structures.

C O N T E N T S

Page

INTRODUCTION

I.	Statement of the Problem	1
II.	Definition of Terms	2
	A. Church structures	2
	B. Church	2
	C. Asia	4
	D. Mission Church	4
	E. Paternalism	5
	F. Indigenous Church	5
III.	The Importance of the Study	6
IV.	Limitations of the Study	9
V.	The Methodology of the Study	10

SECTION ONE

CHAPTER ONE: THE THEOLOGICAL BASES OF CHURCH GOVERNMENT

I.	The Theological Bases Defined	13
	A. Universal factors in government	13
	B. Universal factors in church government	13
	1. Government and the nature of the Ekklesia	13
	2. Government and authority in the Ekklesia	14
	3. Government and relationships in the Ekklesia	14
	4. Government and the mission of the Ekklesia	14
II.	A Biblical Definition of "Church"	15
	A. Reasons for a Biblical definition	15
	1. Theological definition controversial	15
	2. Definition according to essential nature inadequate	15
	3. Biblical definition most comprehensive	16
	B. Definition through Biblical terminology	16
	1. Etymological description	16
	2. Metaphorical description	19
	3. Description as "Redeemed Community"	21
	4. Description in terms of purpose	23
	5. Description in terms of polity	24
III.	The Forms of Church Government	28
	A. The episcopal form	28
	1. Government through the episcopate	28
	2. The theological bases of episcopal polity	29
	3. Summary	47

	<u>Page</u>
B. The presbyterian form	48
1. Its Reformation origin	48
2. Its regard for scriptural authority	50
3. Its theological bases	51
4. Difficulties in presbyterian polity	55
5. Summary	59
C. The congregational form	59
1. A part of the Reformation	59
2. Marked by definite theological bases	62
3. Summary	75
IV. Summary Statement	75

CHAPTER TWO: AN ANALYSIS OF THE FUNDAMENTAL NECESSITIES INTEGRAL TO THE THEOLOGICAL BASES OF CHURCH GOVERNMENT

I. The Purpose of this Chapter	77
A. Three important definitions	77
B. The point of ultimate division	78
II. An Analysis of the Theological Bases of Church Government	79
A. A comparative analysis of theological factors	79
1. Catholic theological unity	79
2. Protestant theological unity	85
3. Catholic and Protestant polities theologically exclusive	111
B. An analogical analysis of governmental philosophy	112
1. Antithetical governmental philosophies	112
2. Governmental philosophy as a source of identity	124
III. The Pragmatic Adaptation of Protestant Polity	125
A. Two basic factors in pragmatic adaptation	125
1. The historical factor	125
2. The social factor	134
B. Pragmatic adaptation and the Holy Spirit	140
IV. A Summary Statement	146

SECTION TWO

CHAPTER THREE: PATERNALISM DEFINED AND ILLUSTRATED

I. Paternalism Defined	150
A. The living church	150
B. The living church and paternalism	153
1. Paternalism defined	153
2. Paternalism as a force for distortion	154
II. The Fact of Paternalism	155
A. Paternalism as an attitude	155

	<u>Page</u>
1. Western feelings of superiority	156
2. Asian feelings of inferiority	159
B. Paternalism in missions as an historic problem	160
1. Nineteenth century paternalism	160
2. Efforts to eliminate paternalism	171
C. Paternalism a continuing concern	174
1. A continuing threat to church life	174
2. A continuing problem in relationships	176
3. A source of valuable information	176

CHAPTER FOUR: THE EFFECTS OF PATERNALISM UPON THE POLITY AND ADMINISTRATION OF MISSION CHURCHES

I. The Purpose of this Chapter	177
II. The Effects of Paternalistic Policies Upon Asian Church Structures	178
A. An expression of Western church genius	179
1. Necessary to recognize the Asian genius	179
2. Desirable to recognize the Asian genius	191
3. Historical recognition of this principle	196
B. A hindrance to the mission of the Church Universal	201
1. The Mission Church and the Church Universal	201
2. Self-hood as a final goal	207
3. The frustration of these goals	210
C. A false base for authority in the Ekklesia	224
1. The importance of a proper base for authority	225
2. Paternalism as a false base of authority	227
3. The effects of paternalistic policies	229
4. A summary statement	235
D. A distortion of relationships within the Ekklesia	235
1. Paternalism and decision-making structures	236
2. The inherent problems of paternalistic structures	242
3. A summary statement	249
III. Summary	251

SECTION THREE

CHAPTER FIVE: CHURCH STRUCTURES AND THE NATURE OF THE CHURCH

I. A Statement in Review	254
II. Church Government in Relation to the Nature of the Church	255
A. The incarnational nature of the Ekklesia	256
1. The Biblical view	257
2. The proper theological order of reference	257
B. The Church and missionary activity	258
1. The effect on church structures	259
2. Structures not essentially immutable	260
3. The need for flexibility of structures	260
C. The activity of the churches in Asia	261
1. "Ecclesiastical schizophrenia"	261
2. Asia in a revolutionary time	262
3. The "Indigenous" Church and the Universal Church	265
D. A summary statement	269

CHAPTER SIX: CHURCH STRUCTURES IN RELATION TO AUTHORITY FOR GOVERNING

I. Mission and Authority	271
II. Mission and Authority in Asia	271
A. The authority of the clergy	271
1. The source of authority	272
2. These problems seen as a result of paternalism	287
3. Summary	291
B. The authority of Church and State	291
1. Religious liberty and the churches	292
2. Suggested principles	310
C. The Mission and the Church	312
1. Two foundational statements	312
2. The place of the Mission organi- zation	316
D. A summary statement	336

CHAPTER SEVEN: CHURCH STRUCTURES AND RELATIONSHIPS WITHIN ASIAN CHURCHES

I. Four Areas of Concern	339
A. Relationships within the congregation	339
1. A socially homogenous congregation	339
2. The effect of secular social factors	340
3. The value of neutral leadership	342
4. Summary	343

	<u>Page</u>
B. Relationships involving larger church structures	344
1. Church growth through larger structures	344
2. Suggested principles	346
C. Relationships between clergy and laity	346
1. A dominant clergy	347
2. Undesirable results	350
3. Encouraging trends	353
4. Summary	354
D. Relationships in discipline	355
1. Four types of relationships	355
2. Suggested principles	362
II. Summary Statement	362

CHAPTER EIGHT: CHURCH STRUCTURE AND THE PURPOSE OF THE CHURCH

I. The Incarnational Church in the World of Asia	365
A. A concern for the world	365
1. Population trends	365
2. Asian society	369
B. Summary	374
II. The Indigenous Church in the World of Asia	375
A. The structures of the Asian churches today	375
1. Paternalism and weaknesses in church structure	375
2. New Opportunities to develop structure for mission	377
B. Social change as an opportunity for the churches	380
III. Summary	383

CHAPTER NINE: REFORMS IN LARGER CHURCH STRUCTURES

I. The Call for Reform of Structures	384
II. Efforts Toward Reform of Structures	384
A. The churches in India	385
1. A trend toward a constitutional episcopacy	385
2. The influence of cultural factors	389
3. The churches and the community	395
B. The churches in Hong Kong	395
1. A trend toward a congregational polity	395
2. The influence of cultural factors	397
3. The churches and the community	400
C. The churches in Taiwan	401
1. A trend toward congregational polity	401
2. The influence of cultural factors	402
3. The churches and the community	405

	<u>Page</u>
D. The churches in Japan	406
1. A trend toward independence	406
2. The influence of cultural factors	408
3. The churches and the community	412
E. The churches in the Philippine Islands	413
1. A suggested trend towards centralization	413
2. The influence of cultural factors	415
3. The churches and the community	415
F. Summary statement	416
 CHAPTER TEN: REFORM OF CONGREGATIONAL STRUCTURES	
I. The Place of the Congregation Within the Church	418
A. The importance of the congregation	418
B. The congregation and structures for mission	421
C. The congregation, structures for mission and cultural factors	422
1. Social relationships	423
2. Structures to complement the culture	425
D. Summary	434
II. Three Important Components of Congregational Life	434
A. The laity and structures for mission	435
1. Successful lay witness	435
2. Benefits from lay witness	438
3. The lay witness as a complementary ministry	443
B. The clergy and structures for mission	443
1. The need to change the pattern of the ministry	444
2. Attempts to change the pattern of the ministry	447
3. Suggested principles	453
C. Finance and structures for mission	454
1. Finance and the ministry	454
2. Finance as a source of strength	458
III. A Summary in Retrospect	461
 CONCLUSION	
CHAPTER ELEVEN: SUMMARY STATEMENTS AND SUGGESTIONS	467
BIBLIOGRAPHY	478
 APPENDICES	
Appendix One	
Appendix Two	

INTRODUCTION

I. STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM

This is a study of the theological bases of the various forms of church government and the prevalent practices of church administration in the Church. The area of special concern is the churches in Asia.

It is necessary for the purpose of this study to place the churches in Asia into two distinct divisions. The first of these divisions may be called the Mission Church; the second may be called the Indigenous Church. It is recognized that these divisions are made arbitrarily, especially as it may be seen by the most superficial examination that the Mission Church and the Indigenous Church are basically churches in process. The Mission Church, in general theory, is designed to become the Indigenous Church.¹

It is felt that the arbitrary nature of this division is justified by the nature and purpose of this study. The study consists primarily of a comparison (and possibly a contrast) between the church government and administration of the Mission Church and the Indigenous Church. The purpose of this study is to determine if the church government and administration of the Mission Church is making the greatest possible contribution to the formation of the Indigenous Church. The further purpose of this study is to determine if the polity and administration of the Mission Church is theologically necessary and practically most

1. Allen, Roland. Missionary Principles. (London: Lutterworth Press, 1964), p. 54.

desirable for the Indigenous Church. It is hoped that the accomplishment of these purposes will also make the study valuable for the promotion of church growth on the denominational and ecumenical level on a world-wide scale.

II. DEFINITION OF TERMS

A. Church Structures

All forms of organization and administration at all levels of church life may be described as church structures. Church structures may be more closely differentiated in at least two ways:

1. Church Government.

The polity whereby the particular Church or denomination is governed is known as church government. This form of church structure deals with the principles which underly the formation of the governing bodies of the denomination or Church. It involves the organizational patterns of the church on both the general and local level.

2. Church Administration.

The execution in the regular functions of the local church of the underlying principles of the polity which governs the Church or denomination is known as church administration. This involves church structures which are complementary to the larger structures of church government.

B. Church

A more detailed definition and explanation will be

given in the section of the study dealing specifically with this question. The definitions given at this point will be more descriptive of the levels of function than descriptive in terms of the particular etymological significance of the term.

1. The Church Universal.

That spiritual organization which embraces all Christians in a spiritual fellowship and which transcends all human, artificial barriers is known as the Church Universal. In the text of this study, Church Universal and the term, "Ekklesia", may be used interchangeably.

2. Confessional Family.

Those branches of the Church Universal which are differentiated from other Christian groups through confessional formulations, organizational differences or other human forms of distinction shall be known as Confessional Families. In the text of this study, Confessional Family and denomination will be used to refer to the differences in various branches of the Church Universal. Although this form of interchangeable usage ignores the common distinction between the theological and denominational organizational differences, it is felt that the purposes of clarity will best be served by such a broad-based descriptive term.

3. Congregation.

The nuclear unit of the Church Universal is known as the congregation. It is a group of believing and worshipping Christians organized to fulfil the functions

of the Church Universal, within the particular locale in which it exists. As such, its relationship to the Confessional Family, or its lack of such a relationship, is of secondary importance to its relationship to the Church Universal.

Thus, it may be said that the term "Church" encompasses three general meanings. These must be clearly distinguished. The Church Universal refers to a spiritual body or concept. The Confessional Family refers to a human organization. The congregation refers to a nuclear organization.

C. Asia.

The area of the world which is distinct from Europe, Africa and the Americas is known as Asia. For the purposes of this study, it may be limited by India on the west, China on the north, the Philippines on the south and Japan on the east.

D. Mission Church.

The Mission Church is that Confessional Family founded by expatriate missionaries, and in which these missionaries remain a dominating factor in the life of the Confessional Family. It is a sponsored organization, in that it is dependent upon outside agencies for its financial support and for its ultimate government. The domination of the missionaries in church life is a distinguishing characteristic of the Mission Church; however, the influence of the missionaries need not necessarily result in paternalistic church structures, if long-range

plans are conceived and executed to bring the Mission Church into maturity and self-hood. Thus, a Mission Church may be so dominated by missionary influence that the structures are accurately described as paternalistic; nevertheless, a Mission Church does not necessarily and by definition have paternalistic church structures, i.e., structures which hinder or prevent the Mission Church from achieving self-hood and becoming an Indigenous Church.

E. Paternalism.

The relationship between two parties or groups, such as a Mission Society or missionaries, on the one hand, and the Confessional Family founded by the missionaries, on the other, in which the missionaries or Society exercises "care and control suggestive of those followed by a father", is known as paternalism.² This may also refer to the principles and practices involved in this relationship. Paternalism affects church structures through the institution of practices and policies which perpetuate this relationship. In this sense, church structures may be paternalistic.

F. Indigenous Church.

The Indigenous Church is that Confessional Family which has become native to the country or culture in which it has been formed. This is the general usage followed by this study. However, a wider, and in a sense, more precise usage would include all Christian Churches, regardless of origin, which are native to their locale. An

2. Webster's New Collegiate Dictionary. (Springfield, Mass.: G & C. Merriam Co., 1951, p.

Indigenous Church is able to govern itself and has the necessary financial resources to support and maintain its essential programs. It also has the necessary spiritual resources to propagate itself. The Indigenous Church is independent, not in the sense that it is not dependent upon the resources found in God and shared by the Church Universal, nor in the sense that it isolates itself from the Church Universal, but rather in the sense that it is not dependent upon the resources of other bodies for its continued life and function.

III. IMPORTANCE OF THE STUDY

Ten years of service as a missionary in Taiwan and Hong Kong have convinced the writer that the Christian Church is facing a crisis. This crisis is not merely one of conquest by inimical military or ideological forces, as was the case in the Moslem wars. Apart from any questions of spiritual vitality which must necessarily involve value judgments, the Ekklesia does not occupy the position of authority in society which it once enjoyed. But more important than diminished authority is the problem of dwindling influence; this is resulting in a failure to fulfil its role, a role which Christ himself designated. "The Church is commissioned by Jesus to take the Gospel into the world...and we face the fact that we have failed to get it there...We have been woefully ineffective in our obligation to the unchurched."³

3. Dolan, Rex R., The Big Change. (Toronto: Ryerson Press, 1967), p. 7.

The failure of the Church Universal as a bearer of God's Good News may be seen in the fact that large portions of the world have never been considered as part of the Corpus Christianum. The countries of Asia fall into this category. Within the world of today, those countries of the world with the fastest rate of population growth are largely peopled with Hindus, Buddhists, Taoists and other devotees of non-Christian religion. The fact of the population explosion and its effect upon the Church will be discussed in detail in a larger section of the study; it is sufficient to note here that the Church in its mission is being affected adversely through the population explosion.

But even in the "Christian" countries of the world, it is possible to see that the Church is facing a crisis. Sissons points out that the traditional beliefs and position of the Church are being challenged from outside by those opposed to the Church and from within by those who profess to support them.⁴ Criticism is being levelled at the Church from outside, and questions are being asked by church people which show a lack of confidence in the organized Church. Many of these questions have to do with the practicality of the organizations of the Church.⁵

Inasmuch as there seems to be this crisis which faces the Christian Church today, it is felt that a study of the theology and practice of church government and

4. Unpublished lecture by Mr. Sissons, in the course, "Church and Society", New College, Oct. 10, 1970.

5. Dolan, Op.cit., p. 3.

administration, with special reference to the churches of Asia as examples, is both relevant and important.

It would be foolish to assert that the problems of the Christian Church are caused solely by inadequate forms of church government and administrative practices. However, many leaders of the churches in Asia do feel that one of the problems which face these churches is the transfer of Western thought and practice to the Asian situation. This would include church structure which is not suitable for Asia. Griesen states, "One of the major problems which our denomination faces in the formation of the indigenous church is the inability or unwillingness of the Chinese pastors to use productively the polity and practice which we have found suitable for Canada and the United States."⁶ A Chinese Christian leader states that as long as Western forms and practices are imposed upon Asian churches, there will be weak leadership and weak churches.⁷

The importance of this study lies first of all in the attempt to investigate these alleged problems; is there validity in the claim that church structures are retarding or preventing church growth? If present polity and practices are actually contributing to the above-mentioned problems, the second important contribution could be the

-
6. Conversation with Rev. Paul D. Griesen, Principal of Ecclesia Seminary, Hong Kong field of the American Assemblies of God, and Chairman of the Hong Kong Evangelical Missions Fellowship, August, 1970.
 7. Chang, Y.T., reported in the seminar, "The Chinese Church as a Missionary Church", held in Hong Kong, February, 1969.

formulation of principles on church structures and suggestions for possible solutions.

IV. THE LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY

The basic limitations of this study must necessarily be derived from its purpose. The purpose, as stated above, is to determine if the church structures now found in the churches in Asia are based upon theological necessity and meet the pragmatic test of most effectively advancing the Church Universal in its life and work in Asia.

Thus, the study of theology and church structures will not attempt to develop a systematic theology of church government and administrative practices. The major concern is to determine the relationship between church structures and theology, in order to see if pragmatic adaptation of church structures is precluded by theological considerations.

This purpose will preclude at least two possible results of this type of study. First, the study will not serve as an apologetic for, or theological treatise upon, any form of church government. Second, this study will not be intended as a guide to productive administrative practices and principles of ecclesiastical managerial skills. These are both outside the scope of this study.

The purpose of this study imposes yet another limitation. It is outside the scope of this present study to write upon the values of the indigenous church as a missionary policy. While there may well be conclusions from the study which are relevant to the debate upon the

best type of missions policy, this will be a study of church structures, using the churches in Asia as examples, rather than a treatise on missiology.

V. THE METHODOLOGY OF THE STUDY

Apart from this introductory section, the study may be divided into three sections, each of which are divided into chapters dealing with a portion of the general subject under discussion in the section. The sections deal with the theological implications of church structures, the historical and contemporary developments relating to paternalistic church structures, and finally, with the present and evolving church structures in contemporary Asia.

The theological implications of church structures may be discussed in terms of the theological bases of church government, primarily as these are related to the bases of the episcopal, the presbyterian and the congregational forms. There is a wide spectrum of polity which comes under the heading of episcopal. This will be dealt with in terms of the Roman Catholic, the Anglican and the Modified Episcopal views of the episcopacy. The presbyterian form of church government may best be understood by an examination of the general principles of presbyterianism. Congregationalism may be either of the federated type, such as the Southern Baptist Church, or of the original type, which would preclude any organization above the congregational level.

The purpose of this part of the study will be to determine at what points, if any, it is possible to modify and adapt various forms of church government and administrative structures without unacceptable theological compromises.

Going from the study of the forms of church government and their theological implications, the second section of the study will deal with the fact and effect of paternalism in Mission Churches and with the resultant effects upon missionary activity on the part of the churches in Asia. Paternalism is of real importance to the history of the Confessional Families in Asia, inasmuch as it may be shown to be the bridge and bond between Western church structures, based upon theological presuppositions, and the historical church structures of many of the Confessional Families in Asia. This takes on special importance through an examination of the effects of paternalistic structures upon the advance of the Church Universal within the Asian milieu.

The third section of the study will deal with the contemporary church structures now found in Asia. Particular attention in this part of the study will be paid to any modifications in church government and administrative practice, either during or after the time the Indigenous Churches have achieved self-hood. It will then be shown, where possible, what effect, both actual and potential, these modifications have upon church growth and the general life of the Confessional Family.

The final chapter will endeavour to formulate

principles for the development of church structures which will promote the growth of the Church Universal at all levels of its life and activity.

CHAPTER ONE

THE THEOLOGICAL BASES OF CHURCH GOVERNMENT

I. THE THEOLOGICAL BASES DEFINED

A. Universal Factors in Government

There are at least four universal factors in government. The fact of government implies the existence of a governing body. However, no governing body is self-existent; it is created in relation to, if not always from, a body to be governed. These two bodies, the governed and the governing, exist on the basis of relationships, not only between but also within the complementary bodies. These relationships are based on authority, both its source and scope as well as its exercise. The fourth universal factor in government is the purpose for which government, in the broader sense of governed and governing, is created and exists.

B. Universal Factors in Church Government

These four factors are the political bases of the government of nations. However, in the area of the Church, they transcend the political and become the theological bases of church government. A study of the theological bases of church government will thus involve a minimum of four areas of concern.

1. Government and the nature of the Ekklesia.

The first concern will be government in relation to the nature of the Ekklesia. In other words, the basic concern here is the role of government in forming,

determining or perpetuating the esse of the Church Universal.

2. Government and authority in the Ekklesia.

The second concern will be with government and authority in the Church Universal. It is necessary to examine the sources, scope and exercise of this governing authority.

3. Government and relationships in the Ekklesia.

The third basic concern will be government and the question of relationships. Relationships within the Church Universal and its government are both horizontal and vertical, involving both sequence and scope.

4. Government and the mission of the Ekklesia.

The final concern will be the role of government in the mission of the Church. What part does the government of the Church Universal have in shaping, limiting and accomplishing the commission of the Church?

The study of the theological bases, at this point, shall be limited to a survey of the more important theological positions assumed as the rationale for various polities of the Christian churches. It is not the primary purpose of this portion of the study to either isolate and compare differences or to show possible similarities. Rather, this shall be a summation of the various polities without particular reference to each other. Two procedural limitations will be observed. First, all statements and conclusions will be drawn solely from proponents of the different positions. Second, all statements used will be apologetic rather than polemic in nature.

II. A BIBLICAL DEFINITION OF "CHURCH"

A. Reasons for a Biblical definition

In order to facilitate the study of the theological bases of church government, it is necessary to define exactly what is meant by "church".

1. Theological definition controversial.

There are numerous possibilities for controversy in such a definition if one attempts to give a theologically-oriented statement. Therefore, at this point, the emphasis will be upon Biblical statements as they may be used to form a descriptive definition of "church". Theological differences may then be dealt with as there is necessity during the presentation of differing views on the interpretation of the theological bases of church government.

2. Definition according to essential nature inadequate.

This descriptive definition will not be an attempt to discuss the essential nature of the Ekklesia. Apart from the theological problems which this would raise, a definition of "Church" based on a discussion of the Universal Church's essential nature would be somewhat irrelevant and would not be sufficiently definitive for the purposes of this study. This may best be understood by the use of an analogy.

If one were to analyze the Kohinoor diamond for its essential nature, it would be legitimate to state that the Kohinoor diamond is a large piece of crystallized carbon. This is a simple and definitive statement of its essential nature. While this definition would possibly be satisfactory

to the scientist who is concerned with its molecular compounds, the jewellers who have cut and polished the Kohinoor diamond, the owner who has purchased it, and all those who have viewed its great beauty would agree that this is not enough. The truth is, that however accurate this definition might be in terms of physical properties, there is much more to any diamond than the way in which its molecules have been arranged through the millenia of pressure which formed the rough stone.

3. Biblical definition most comprehensive.

In the same way, it is impossible to meet the needs of this study with a formal statement, "The Church is..." If one is to appreciate the splendour of the Kohinoor diamond, it is essential to see the light reflected from its many facets. If one is to understand the Church Universal in terms which will be definitive for this study, it is essential to examine five major facets recorded in the New Testament.

B. Definition through Biblical terminology

It is hoped that by examining the etymological roots of the word, "Church", the metaphorical descriptions used by the various writers, and by studying the composition, government and purpose of the Church as seen in the New Testament, a foundation will be laid for the study of present-day theological interpretations of church government and administrative practices.

1. Etymological description.

The modern word, "church", comes from the Greek

adjective, *τω κυριακόν* (to kuriokon), used first to refer to the house of the Lord and then to the people of the Lord.¹ However, this was not the word used by the Christians in the New Testament when referring to the Church. That word was *ἐκκλησία* (ekklesia), and came from common koine usage when referring to a public assemblage called together by a herald. It is used this way in Acts 19:32,39,40.² It may be said that the term came first of all from a secular source and was only latterly applied to a religious meeting.³ Diessmann suggests that there is a natural reference, deliberately chosen, to the fact that God was in Christ, calling men out of the world.⁴ Whether this was actually a deliberate reference to the saving act of God in Christ, or whether the word was adopted for some other reason, it is possible to see that there were two major influences in the choice of "ekklesia" by the Christian community. First, the Septuagint consistently translated the Hebrew *קהל* (qahal) by this term; this was only natural and proper as they both have the same root meaning. Furthermore, the LXX translation enriched the Greek meaning, for it used this word not only to refer to a gathering of the people, but

-
1. Harrison, E.F., ed., Baker's Dictionary of Theology. (Grand Rapids, Michigan: Baker Book House, 1960) "The Church", by William Childs Robinson, p. 123.
 2. Schmidt, K.L., The Church. (London: Adam and Charles Black) p. 7.
 3. Ibid., p. 24.
 4. Deissmann, A., Light From the Ancient East. pp. 112-114, quoted by Schmidt, p. 25.

more especially to the assembly or congregation of the Israelites as they gathered before the Lord or for other religious purposes.⁵ Second, there was the Hellenistic influence which became increasingly prominent as more Hellenistic Jews and their gentile adherents became Christians.⁶ These Jews, upon becoming Christians, seem to have rejected the localized concept of "sunagoga" and preferred to use the more inclusive "ekklesia" as not only referring to the local congregation but also to the entire body of believers in Christ.⁷

It is at this point that Cremer's translation of "ekklesia", while going beyond the ordinary lexical usage, seems to have captured more accurately the spirit of the usage of the term in the New Testament than does a direct, literal translation. Here, as in other dictionaries and lexicons, there are two general usages recognized. But the emphasis is not merely upon the fact that this is an assembly which has been called together; Cremer emphasises that the totality of believers form a summoned assembly, but one which has been summoned for the purpose of redemption. Thus, he would emphasize that the Ekklesia is the "Redeemed Community" (Heilsgemeinde). The redeemed community may also take a localized form (in lokaler Begrenzung), but the same careful emphasis is placed here

5. Harrison, Op.cit., p. 123.

6. Schmidt, Op.cit., p. 30.

7. Schmidt, Op.cit., p. 30.

on the fact that this is a community summoned for and constituted by the completion of God's redemptive purpose.⁸

2. Metaphorical description.

God's redeemed community stands in a special relationship to God. This relationship is distinctive in its emphasis upon the accomplished redemptive purpose of God as opposed to the potential redemptive purpose of God in relationship to those who are not members of the Ekklesia. This distinctive relationship is emphasized and illustrated by the use of eight metaphors in the New Testament. These eight metaphors may be divided into two categories.

a. Social metaphors.

The first of these divisions would refer to the social relationship of the Ekklesia to God. One social metaphor is that of the flock in relationship to the shepherd. References to God or Christ as the divine Shepherd of the flock are found in Matt. 9:36, 10:6, 15:24; Luke 15:6; John 10; Hebrews 13:20 and I Peter 2:25. The second of these social metaphors is that which refers to the Ekklesia as the people of God, in the sense of a political entity. One might also refer to this as a spiritual ethnic group. References to this are found in Matthew 1:21, 2:6; Luke 1:17, 68; Acts 15:14; II Corinthians 6:16; Titus 2:14; Hebrews 8:10, 10:30, 11:25, 13:12; I Peter 2:9, 10 and Revelation 18:4, 21:3.

8. Cremer, H., Biblico-theological Dictionary of New Testament Greek.

These two social metaphors refer to the leadership of God as he cares for and directs the redeemed community. Two other social metaphors refer to the illuminating or indwelling presence of God in relation to his Ekklesia. There are references to His people as the City of God or as the New Jerusalem. These are found in Galatians 4:26; Hebrews 11:10,16, 12:22, 13:14 and Revelation 21 and 22:14, 19. Then there are the references to the Ekklesia or its members as a house, a building or the temple of God. These are used exclusively by Paul, and may be found in I Corinthians 3:16,17; II Corinthians 5:1, 6:16; Ephesians 2:19,21 and II Timothy 2:20. A third type of social metaphor refers to the covenant between God and his redeemed community. The explicit emphasis is upon God's renewal of his covenant relationship in which a New Israel is formed and is the recipient of all the benefits promised in the Old Covenant. The implicit emphasis is upon the obligations of the people of the New Covenant to their God. These references may be found in Romans 11:25,27; Galatians 3:15-29, 4:24; Ephesians 2:12,13; Hebrews 8:6-10, 9:15, 10:16-18,29, 12:24, 13:20.

b. Mystical metaphors

Apart from the social relationship of the Ekklesia to God, the New Testament describes the Church in a group of metaphors which may be classed as mystical. The first metaphor in which the mystical union of the Church Universal with Christ is emphasized is found in John 15. The Vine and the branches are given as a picture of the Ekklesia in

relationship to Christ, receiving life through him and as a result bearing fruit. Paul often refers to the Ekklesia as the body of Christ. The emphasis here in this second mystical metaphor is upon the spiritual union of Christians with Christ and hence with each other. This may be seen in Romans 12:4,5; I Corinthians 10:16,17, 12:12-27; Ephesians 1:23, 4:1-16; Colossians 1 and 2 and 3:15. There is a third mystical metaphor, referring to Christ as husband or bridegroom and the Ekklesia as wife or bride. The emphasis intended by this is the unity of Christ and his Church and upon the mutual love which they share. This may be traced in Revelation 21:2, 19:7; Ephesians 5:22-23.

All of these metaphors, with their emphasis upon the social and mystical aspects of the Ekklesia of God are descriptive of the relationship of God in Christ to the redeemed community, but they are not definitive of the composition, government and purpose of the Church. It is to this aspect of the study that attention must now be turned.

3. Description as "Redeemed Community"

The composition of the Ekklesia of God may be determined by the emphasis upon the redeemed community. The Church as redeemed community is composed of the people of God λαός (laos). The status of laos is not granted to one through human means or human recognition. One becomes a member of the Ekklesia only by radical change in one's life. The radical nature of this change is seen in the New Testament statements concerning redemption. Christ

said that it was necessary to be "born again".⁹ This was to be accomplished from above "of water and the Spirit".¹⁰ Paul emphasized the nature of the change when he contrasted the new creation and the old, and the difference which this made in the life.¹¹ One who becomes a member of the laos is said to have been "translated", that is, brought from one state or place of being into a totally different state.¹² The emphasis placed upon the idea of translation may also be of a change of citizenship, viz., a citizenship in heaven.¹³ Conversion *ἐπιστροφή* (epistrepho) also shows the complete turn-about which occurs in the life of the laos.¹⁴ It is not within the scope or purpose of this study to deal in any way with such controversial questions in this radical change as predestination, free agency or the necessary means or methods of achieving this change. Discussion here is confined to emphasis upon the fact of radical change in relation to the laos who constitute the Ekklesia. On this basis, it may be said that the laos of God who constitute the Ekklesia have achieved this status through the action of God in redemption, which has resulted, on the human level, in a radical change. The accomplished change in the laos may also be shown to serve as a link of

9. John 3:3.

10. John 3:5.

11. II Corinthians 5:17.

12. Colossians 1:13.

13. Philipians 3:20.

14. I Thessalonians 1:9.

purpose in the relationship of the Ekklesia to those who have not yet become members of the redeemed community.

4. Description in terms of purpose.

The purpose of Christ in founding the Ekklesia may be summarized in his great commission, as expressed in Matthew 28:19. McGavran finds a definite distinction of sequence in this commandment. There is first of all the command to "disciple *μαθητεύσατε* (matheteusate) the nations". This then takes two subsequent courses of action, to baptize (symbolic of conversion) and to teach obedience to Christ.¹⁵

a. Reconciliation.

Paul develops the responsibility of the Ekklesia in the conversion of unbelievers by stating that the Ekklesia has been entrusted with the ministry of reconciliation, that God makes his appeal through the laos of God, and that Christians are the ambassadors of God.¹⁶ The purpose of the Ekklesia, however, is not confined to this conversion of unbelievers.

b. Perfection.

There is a further purpose seen in the command of Christ to teach the observation (obedience) of all that he has commanded. This didactic purpose is further underscored in Christ's command to Peter, upon affirmation of love for Christ, to feed His sheep.¹⁷ Paul states that the

15. McGavran, Donald, How Churches Grow. (London: Friendship Press, 1955), p. 26.

16. II Corinthians 5:18-20.

17. John 21:15-17.

gifts which Christ has given include apostles, prophets, teachers, pastors and teachers. The purpose of these gifts is to make it possible for Christians to come to "mature manhood, to the measure of the stature of the fullness of Christ".¹⁸ This is to be accomplished by the use of these gifts "for the equipment of the saints, for the work of the ministry, for building up the body of Christ".¹⁹ All the saints are to have mutual concern for each other,²⁰ bear one another's burdens,²¹ and live in such a way that there was no stumbling-block placed before a brother.²² The Ekklesia is thus seen to have an internal purpose of mutual self-help and teaching toward maturity.

5. Description in terms of polity.

However, the Ekklesia is not merely to be an inchoate group of people who are dedicated to the ideals of Christ.

a. The Holy Spirit and organization.

There was the promise of Christ that he would give divine power for the accomplishment of this purpose,²³ and that there would be adequate guidance from above so that the work would not suffer. This was to come in the person

18. Ephesians 4:11-13.

19. Ephesians 4:12.

20. I Corinthians 12:25.

21. Galatians 6:2.

22. I Corinthians 8:9.

23. Matthew 28:19.

of the Holy Spirit, expressly sent to lead Christ's followers into full knowledge of truth,²⁴ and to act as the Counselor *παράκλητος* (Parakletos) to work in and through the Ekklesia.²⁵ It is in this area of divine Counselor, leading into truth for the good of the Ekklesia, that there were various provisions made for church government.

The work of the Holy Spirit in establishing the polity of the early Ekklesia is paradoxical. There is abundant evidence that it was recognized that governmental forms and practices were both necessary and desirable in the operation of the Ekklesia. On the other hand, there seems to be no clear delineation of the relationships between these various forms recorded in the New Testament.

b. Church offices.

Apart from the various principles which Paul embodied in his letters to the churches, principles which touched upon church government and administration in varying degrees, there was recognized by Paul and the churches the fact of various ministerial orders. Paul states categorically that God had appointed in the Ekklesia men to serve as apostles, prophets, teachers, workers of miracles, healers, helpers, administrators and speakers in various tongues.²⁶ It seems legitimate to infer, even though by the argument of silence, that the other leaders of the Ekklesia at that time agreed

24. John 16:13.

25. John 16:7-15.

26. I Corinthians 12:28.

with this summary. There is no recorded instance of opposition to Paul's teaching on this, and these different groups are found at work through the history of the first-century church.

However, this general statement of the work of God in the government of the Church does not give specific details of relationship or authority. The administration of the local churches is done by three groups of men. The Greek New Testament uses three distinct terms for them:

1) ἐπίσκοποι (episkepoi), from which come the English words, bishop and episcopal; 2) πρεσβύτεροι (presbuteroi), which is the source of presbyter; and 3) διάκονοι (diakonoi), which is the root of the English, diaconate. The above summary of the government of the New Testament Ekklesia is sufficient at present to establish the fact of, as well as the rudimentary outlines of church government and polity in the early Ekklesia. As the theological implications of church government are discussed further, differing interpretations of these basic facts will be made clear.

c. Summary.

Before proceeding with these differing interpretations, it would be well to review what has been established as a foundation for further study. First, the term "Church", has been shown to be etymologically derived from the term, Ekklesia..."a redeemed community". This applies both to the general or world-wide church and to the localized community. Both may legitimately be called the Ekklesia. Then, by a metaphorical study of the concepts expressed in

the New Testament, it has been shown that the redeemed community of the Ekklesia stand in a special relationship to God. This special relationship embraces both social and mystical aspects. Third, it has been shown that the Ekklesia is constituted by divine action in redemption which results in a radical change of life for the ones who thus become the laos of God and members of the Ekklesia of God in Jesus Christ. Fourth, the external purpose of evangelism and the internal purpose of perfecting have been seen to be held in balance within the early Ekklesia. Finally, a study of the New Testament has revealed that church polity was an established fact, provided by the leadership of the Holy Spirit and recognized as necessary and desirable throughout the New Testament Ekklesia.

In other words, there seems to be no question as to the fact of church government and the presence of church polity. The questions lie in the differing interpretations of the meaning of the New Testament records and the conclusions drawn from the theological bases of church government.

These differing interpretations and conclusions have resulted in the establishment of three basic forms of church government, the episcopal, the presbyterian and the congregational.²⁷ These forms of church government, in their pure form, have differing theological bases, which in turn divide them from each other.

27. Harrison, op.cit., "Church Government" by Leon Morris, p. 126.

III. THE FORMS OF CHURCH GOVERNMENT

A. The Episcopal Form

1. Government through the episcopate.

Episcopal church government is a form of polity and should not be confused with denominational distinctions such as the Episcopalian Church or the Methodist Episcopal Church. These denominations are named on the basis of their polity. The designation for this form of church government comes from the word *ἐπίσκοπος* (episkopos), from which is derived also the word, bishop.²⁸ Thus, the episcopacy refers to that system of church government in which the principal officer is the bishop.²⁹ The episcopacy nevertheless embodies three orders of ministers; apart from the principal officer (the bishop), there is the priest (or presbyter) and the deacon.³⁰ As principal officer, the bishop possesses and exercises supreme authority within his ministry; as principal officers, the body of bishops possess and exercise like authority on the corporate sense.

It is this question of authority, as possessed and used by the episcopate that is of primary importance for a study of the theological bases of episcopal church government.

2. The theological bases of episcopal polity.

There are divisions of opinion and practice within

28. Harrison, ed., op.cit., "Episcopacy" by L. Morris, p.184.

29. Harrison, ed., Ibid., p. 184.

30. Green, Michael, Called to Serve. (Philadelphia, Penn.: Westminster Press, 1964), pp. 33-35.

those groups which follow the episcopal form of church government. There is a very strong disagreement between the advocates of the episcopal polity as to what constitutes the essence of episcopacy. Morris states that the bishop's "essential function is that of a pastor to his flock". He supervises his diocese and as a "father in God" to his people, he alone performs rites such as confirmation and ordination; it is in the fulfilment of these services of the ministry "and not in anything else that the essence of episcopacy consists".³¹

a. The question of apostolic succession.

The mere presence of one who bears the title of bishop and performs the above-mentioned tasks would not satisfy many episcopal churchmen. Indeed, Morris himself states, concerning the Methodist Episcopal Church, that inasmuch as their bishops and ministers are not necessarily in apostolic succession, they are not "within episcopacy in the traditional sense".³² It may therefore be seen that one of the important controversies concerning the episcopal form of church government centers about "apostolic succession".

1) Apostolic succession defined.

Apostolic succession is that belief that there has been an orderly succession of ordination, originating with the Apostles and continuing to the present day. Those who

31. Harrison, ed., Op.cit., "Episcopacy" by L. Morris, p. 184.

32. Ibid., p. 184.

can trace their connection with the Apostles in this manner are true ministers; those who cannot show their connection with the Apostles in this manner are not.³³

The effect of this argument is easily perceived. Only those ministers who are within the apostolic succession are true ministers. Only a true minister can become a bishop. The bishop is the chief officer of the church in the episcopal system. Therefore, apostolic succession is essential to the episcopate. This will be developed further below; for the present, it is necessary to examine this doctrine of apostolic succession more closely.

There are two historically definitive ideas of apostolic succession.³⁴ The first, arising in the second century during the struggle with the Gnostics, emphasized first of all, the necessity to trace the descent from consecrator back to the apostles, but also, and equally important, emphasized the solidarity of faith and witness with the regularly appointed Bishops of each Catholic community. The importance of this was the insistence that the individual's right to be regarded as a minister of God rested both on the relation to the Ekklesia at large and to the free choice of the local community. The second historical concept of apostolic succession does not emphasize the part of the community in choosing its bishop; rather, as Gore quotes Augustine, "The men who from time to time were

33. Farrar, Thomas, The Christian Ministry. (London: William Wells Gardner, 1880), p. 3, cf. pp. 9-15.

34. Gore, Charles, The Church and the Ministry. London: Longmans, Green & Co., 1919), p. 60.

to hold various offices involved in the ministry would receive their authority to minister, in whatever capacity, ...from above...".³⁵ It was in this sense of a qualifying consecration from above that every ministerial act would be performed "under the shelter of a commission received by the transmission of the original pastoral authority".³⁶

2) The importance of apostolic succession.

The dispute about apostolic succession cuts across denominational lines and unites Catholics and Anglicans against other Christians, including Anglicans. This dispute is basically concerned with the authority upon which church government is based and is centred about three questions: 1) The origin of the episcopacy; 2) The importance of the episcopacy; and 3) The implications of the doctrine.

a) Instituted by Christ

The ecclesiastical order based upon apostolic succession is first and foremost regarded as divinely ordered. Referring to the relative exercise of ministry, Bea states, "The divinely established ecclesiastical ministry is exercised on different levels by those who have from the early times been called bishops, presbyters and deacons."³⁷ In stating that bishops, presbyters and deacons have from early times been different and distinct levels of ministry, and that this is through divine

35. Gore, Ibid. p. 59.

36. loc. cit.

37. Bea, Augustin Cardinal, We Who Serve. (London: Geoffrey Chapman, 1969), p. 26.

institution, the exponents of apostolic succession base their arguments on scripture. Episkipoi is found four times when describing the function of a man as an overseer or superintendent; it is used twice again in describing the office of a bishop. Presbyteros is found seventeen times in the New Testament. These scriptural references are interpreted to show that the term, "presbyter", denoted the person who had the local oversight of a church. The term, "episkipos", denotes the person who had the oversight of a number of local congregations.³⁸ It is emphasized that the different levels of ministry were instituted by Christ for the good of his church.

"For the nurturing and constant growth of the People of God, Christ the Lord instituted in his Church a variety of ministries which work for the good of the whole body. These ministers are endowed with sacred power for the service of their brethren and work together with their brethren for the glory of God and salvation."³⁹

From the first, the Church was provided with a continuing ministry. This included the episcopate.⁴⁰ The relationship of the episcopacy to the apostles is emphasized, "The bishops in the divine institution of orders have succeeded to the place of the Apostles as the shepherds of the Church."⁴¹ The apostles are not seen as twelve individuals, but as a social unit made up of the twelve. Christ instituted them

38. Bea, *ibid.*, p. 25.

39. *Lumen Gentium*, no. 28 (References from Council documents are taken from *The Documents of Vatican II*, Ed., Walter Abbot, S.J., London, 1966).

40. Butler, Christopher, *The Theology of Vatican II*. (London: Darton, Longman & Todd, 1962), p. 97.

41. *Lumen Gentium*, no. 20.

in this way, for the purpose of acting as a body representing the Twelve Patriarchs of the Jewish faith.⁴² Apostolic succession is a matter of the bishops in general succeeding to the apostles considered as a body.⁴³ Thus far, it may be seen that there is a claim that the bishops trace their origin back to the Apostles. The appointment of the Apostles comes from Christ for the purpose of a continuing ministry. However, in what way did Christ institute this Apostolic-episcopal ministry?

Farrer, Kirk and other Anglo-Catholic writers^{πSw} emphasize that Christ is using the Hebrew concept of (shaliach), a man sending forth a deputy with full authority to represent him and whose acts were to be considered to be the same as if the sender had done them himself. Thus, Christ was sending forth his apostles and establishing a succession of men by which his authority could be handed down in the Church.⁴⁴

Scriptural authority for this succession of authority through the Apostolate was to be found in the passages dealing with the laying on of hands. Apostolic succession is traced through the activity of the Apostles in laying on hands at ordination, for it was by this act that apostolic authority and the apostolic nature of the ministry was imparted to those who followed the Apostles.⁴⁵

42. Butler, Op.cit., p. 97.

43. Ibid., p. 98.

44. Kirk, K.E., The Apostolic Ministry. (3rd ed.), (London: Lutterworth Press, 1957), p. viii, cf. p. 228.

45. Bauer, J.B., ed., Encyclopedia of Biblical Theology. (London: Sheed & Ward, Ltd., 1970), "Apostle" by E.M. Kredel, pp. 32 & 37, cf. "The Church" by V. Warnack, p. 113.

The successive relationships within the Church are clearly traced by Leon-Dufour: "The Church is entrusted to men, first to the Apostles, chosen by Jesus through the Holy Spirit (Acts 1 and 2), and then to those who will receive by the imposition of hands the charism to govern."⁴⁶ Passages quoted in support of this are Acts 13:3, 14:23; I Timothy 4:14, 5:22; II Timothy 1:6.

b) Of unique importance

It is generally conceded that these passages do not conclusively show that monepiscopacy was the sole policy of the primitive Ekklesia; nevertheless, by the time of Ignatius (A.D. 117), there is a strong presumption that apostolic succession and monepiscopacy are equivalent and normative.⁴⁷ Jalland states that, while monepiscopacy did not come to be established in all places at the same time, there were four basic reasons why this was the ultimate expression of the institution of apostolic succession. First, this was the expression of the original concept of "apostle" (equated with shaliach), vested with the full authority of his divine principal. Second, there was a need for a liturgical president. Third, there was a practical value in having a permanent chairman for the local corporate presbyterate. Fourth, it was very convenient to have a single representative from the local Ekklesia in relations with the other Ekklesia.⁴⁸ While it is generally

46. Leon-Dufour, Xavier, Dictionary of Biblical Theology, (London: Geoffrey Chapman, 1967), p. 63.

47. Line, John, The Doctrine of the Christian Ministry, (London: Lutterworth Press, 1959), p. 61ff.

48. Jalland, T.G., The Origin and Evolution of the Christian Church, (London: Hutchinson's Univ. Library, 1948), p. 107.

held that monepiscopacy is the expression of the apostolic tradition of succession, it is also conceded that the form (monepiscopacy) is not as important as the fact of the doctrine.⁴⁹ It is this importance of the doctrine which must now be examined.

(1) Important to mission

If the Church is to fulfil its mission, it will need the apostolic ministry. "The real mission of the Church in the world is to co-operate in the redemption and return of the creation to God."⁵⁰ The Church's mission will last as long as the world and so will the visible structures and powers given for this mission. This includes the apostolic powers transmitted through consecration by the imposition of hands.⁵¹

(2) Important to purity of doctrine

Apostolic succession is essentially identified with the purity of the doctrine of the Church. The Church's doctrine of succession is of the very fabric of the whole idea of Gospel revelation. It is the concept of a divine gift which cannot be self-originated but must be received through the communication via the channels of the divinely-instituted visible and organic society.⁵² Apostolic succession was an historically valuable weapon in the fight against heresy. Irenaeus refutes the claims of the

49. Gore, Op.cit., p. 62.

50. Bauer, Op.cit., p. 113.

51. Leon-Dufour, Op.cit., p. 61.

52. Gore, Op.cit., p. 63.

Gnostics by showing the apostolic succession of the bishops and cites them as the rulers/leaders of the churches who have the true doctrine because they have been appointed and ordained within this apostolic succession, something which the Gnostics could not claim for themselves.⁵³ Indeed, Gore would go so far as to say that repudiation of the doctrine of apostolic succession is equivalent to heresy. The origin of heresy is essentially sinful pride. The principle of apostolic succession is basically the principle involved in the Incarnation and the Sacraments. There is an offering of the earthly (a body or the bread) which is consecrated from above and thus partakes of both earthly and heavenly character. When a man takes unto himself that office which must come from above, this is an expression of that sinful pride which is the basic condition which leads to heresy, for a refusal to submit to apostolic succession is a repudiation of a part of the whole of Christianity. "The whole of what constitutes Christianity is a transmitted trust."⁵⁴

The "transmitted trust" is a tradition given down to the Church through the ages and there can never be a legitimate innovation. "Nihil innovandum nisi quod traditum" is put forth by Gore as a fundamental Christian principle. He then goes on to equate the truth revealed in Christ and the tradition of apostolic succession as first of all, immutable but adaptable, and secondly, possessed of a

53. Jalland, Op.cit., p. 104.

54. Gore, Op.cit., pp. 61-63.

necessary continuity, the violation of which is heresy.

"What heresy is in the sphere of truth, a violation of apostolic succession is in the tradition of the ministry."⁵⁵

Gore would not say that the man who takes non-apostolic orders is deliberately guilty of heresy, for he may not have the right knowledge or there may be other causes which exempt from responsibility in whole or part. But judged objectively, Gore states, the result is the same.⁵⁶

(3) Important to the validity of the ministry

Closely connected to the purity of doctrine as preserved through apostolic succession is the belief that the validity of the ministry is dependent upon apostolic succession. Bishops are the only ones who have a full share in the priesthood of Christ, and the presbyters are dependent upon the Bishops in the exercise of their limited power of priesthood.⁵⁷ There are two levels to the ministry. The first level has not only the power to fulfil the ministerial functions but also has the power to transmit the ministry. The second level merely has the right to perform the functions of the ministry. Should the second level ever attempt to transmit the ministry, this transmission would be invalid, in accord with the church principle that no ministry is valid when self-assumed, that is, taken without apostolic transmission of authority.⁵⁸

55. Ibid., p. 63.

56. Ibid., p. 63.

57. Bea, Op.cit., pp. 25, 26.

58. Gore, Op.cit., p. 62.

The importance of this to the purity of the ministry and its functions may be seen by the statement of Butler that a Universal Church without a ministry of hierarchy would not cohere as a body but be a mere sum of individuals.⁵⁹

(4) Important in benefits to Christians

The Universal Church, as a unified body of believers, is given spiritual benefits by the very example of apostolic succession. The ministerial succession is valuable because it serves the end of constantly bringing to the attention of Christians that their new life is a communicated gift.⁶⁰ It is only through the doctrine of apostolic succession that the receivers of the gifts of salvation are ministered to by men who are representatives of God the giver and not of men the receivers.⁶¹

(5) Important to morale of the ministry

Apart from the benefits bestowed upon the believers through this doctrine, apostolic succession is important for its effects upon the morale of the ministry. This doctrine seems to correspond, "as nothing else does", to the meeting of the needs of the ministers of the Church in supplying strength through a sense of satisfactory commission.⁶²

c) Disturbing implications

It may thus be seen that apostolic succession is held to be of central authority in church government, inasmuch

59. Butler, Op.cit., p. 96.

60. Gore, Op.cit., p. 65.

61. Ibid., p. 68.

62. Ibid., pp. 68-69.

as it is through the apostolic ministry that true authority for rule is transmitted. Stemming from the operation of a truly apostolic authority is the preservation of the purity of doctrine, Christian dependence upon God and a ministry which is both valid and empowered with the knowledge that its ministry is authoritatively commissioned. All of these are of central importance for the fulfilment of the commission of the Ekklesia.

With this in mind, it is not surprising that the advocates of apostolic succession insist that the logical and necessary conclusion of the matter should be the re-ordination of those who are outside this tradition.⁶³ Rejection of the validity of Anglican orders has already led the Vatican to declare them "absolutely null and utterly void", necessitating submission to the Roman rite of ordination.⁶⁴

This rather lengthy study of the claims of those who advocate apostolic succession as a doctrine and as a necessary institution in the Church is important inasmuch as it is at this point that there would seem to be a clear and definite division in all matters concerning church government and administration. The practical effect of the theological orientation of these claims is that only those who have been ordained in the apostolic succession

63. Ibid., pp. 92, 304ff.

64. Because of defect of form and intent, "we pronounce and declare that ordinations carried out according to the Anglican rite have been and are absolutely void." Papal Bull, "Apostolicae Curae" 1896, quoted by J.J. Hughes, Absolutely Null and Utterly Void. (London: Sheed & Ward, 1968), cf. p. 286.

have the divinely bestowed grace to govern.⁶⁵ Episcopacy is the necessary and legitimate form of government for the Ekklesia, and the essence of the episcopate is apostolic succession. However, this position is not accepted by many who have an episcopalian form of government, much less by those who follow the presbyterian or congregational forms.

b. Apostolic succession rejected by some

An examination of churches with episcopal forms of government shows that the episcopacy may be held important and desirable without formulating a doctrine of theological necessity. There are historical and practical factors which are held to be equally important and which are admitted to be determinative.

1) Scriptural grounds cited

Those who reject the theological nature of the question find that the Biblical evidence for apostolic succession is inconclusive.

"If we accepted popular forms of the doctrine that the existence of the true Church depends upon the commission given by Christ to the Twelve and handed by them to episcopal successors, the vagueness of the Biblical evidence on this crucial point would be intolerable."⁶⁶

Lightfoot states that there may well be a trace of the bishop's office in the person of James at the Church of Jerusalem, but the New Testament presents no distinct

65. Leon-Dufour, Op.cit., p. 63.

66. Minchin, Basil, Every Man in His Ministry. (London: Darton, Longman & Todd, 1960), p. 10.

traces of such organization in the gentile congregations.⁶⁷ Whatever there may have been in terms of rudimentary development at Jerusalem, the normative practice was to speak of the bishops and presbyters as synonymous in responsibility and function. The difference was not one of office but of locale.⁶⁸ The episcopacy was not necessarily given en bloc by God. Minchin feels that it did not take its developed form until the second century. In his view, the fifty years after the New Testament times are so obscure that they may legitimately be styled as a "tunnel period".⁶⁹ Telfer has examined the evidence carefully and sets the rise of moniscopacy as dating to the last part of the second century,⁷⁰ and Green shows that although moniscopacy was established by the end of the second century, the Apostolic Constitutions show a recognition of the earlier identification of office between bishop and presbyter.⁷¹ The important point to note here is the agreement that the new Testament does not set forth the episcopate as a clear and obligatory institution and practiced universally from the inception of the Universal Church.

2) Evolutionary nature cited

There seem to be various reasons for the rise of the

67. Lightfoot, J.B., The Christian Ministry. (London: Macmillan and co., 1901), p. 27.

68. Ibid., p. 20.

69. Minchin, Op.cit., p. 115.

70. Telfer, W., The Office of a Bishop. (London: Darton, Longman & Todd, 1962), pp. 64ff.

71. Green, Op.cit., p. 43.

episcopacy after the death of St. John and the close of the Apostolic Age. First, there was the problem of heresy. The Gnostic movement and the struggle which this engendered within the Ekklesia led to the concentration of pure doctrine about the person of a bishop.⁷² Second, there was a distinct problem engendered within the Ekklesia by the conflicting cultures, claims and desires of the Jewish and gentile Christians. This could best be solved by the adjudicative action of the bishop.⁷³ Third, the problem of persecution and the need for a rallying point to be found in the person of a strong leader was influential in the evolution of the episcopacy.⁷⁴ The bishop's office was formed, not out of the apostolic order by localization, but out of the presbyterial office by elevation. The title, which seems to have been applied to all the presbyterate at first, was later applied to the chief presbyter.⁷⁵

The evolutionary nature of this rise is set in contrast to the claims of those who see the episcopal form of government as divinely instituted. After tracing the terms, "presbyter" and "bishop" through many patristic writings, Lightfoot draws the following conclusions:⁷⁶

72. Lightfoot, Op.cit., p. 40. The emphasis upon the bishop as the guardian of orthodoxy is traditional and strong among all episcopal churchmen. This seems to relate back to the anti-Gnostic struggles.

73. Green, Op.cit., p. 47.

74. Lightfoot, Op.cit., p. 83.

75. Ibid., p. 25.

76. Ibid., pp. 72-74.

- 1) The episcopate was created out of the presbytery as functions differed, with a higher office coming from lower, equal offices.
 - 2) This transference was not accomplished so much by a single, creative act as by progressive but uneven development,
 - 3) This development was affected by differences in national temper and characteristics.
 - 4) Its maturer forms are seen first in those regions where the last surviving apostles ministered and lived.
- 3) Seen as one form among forms of polity

Inasmuch as there seems to be an impetus from circumstances rather than the divine creation and institution of the episcopate, it may be seen that the episcopacy is one of the forms of church government rather than the one form. Hebert states that the episcopacy is right...but there is also authentic life in non-episcopal churches.⁷⁷ The Thirty-Nine Articles of the Church of England state that no man may assume the office of the Ministry without a lawful call and mission. It is further stated that such calling and mission can only be given by those "who have public authority given unto them in the Congregation to call and send ministers into the Lord's vineyards".⁷⁸ This article does not specify who these men are who are to call the minister and who have this public authority to send forth. Neither does this article bind the Church of England to any one polity.⁷⁹ What this

77. Hebert, A.G., Apostle and Bishop. (London: Faber and Faber, 1963), p. 18.

78. Article 23, quoted by Maclear and Williams, An Introduction to the Articles of the Church of England. (London: Macmillan & Co., 1896), p. 280.

79. Knox, David, Thirty-Nine Articles. (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1967), p. 39.

does is to make clear that the Church is an organized body, not merely an aggregate of individuals.⁸⁰

4) Emphasis upon mission

The strong emphasis upon order through structure which is a characteristic of episcopal churches is found in the values set forth for the episcopacy by its advocates.

"It is not only, or chiefly, that the Bishop can exercise a juridical function in checking heretical teachings; but rather that his office covers, and correlates with one another, not only sound doctrine, but evangelistic work, pastoral oversight of clergy and people and the liturgical ministry of the sacraments, as no other form of ministerial office can ever do."⁸¹

The apostolic function rather than the mere fact of apostolic succession thus become of importance.⁸² The theological emphasis here has been placed upon the fulfillment of the Church's mission rather than any of the questions involved in authority for church government.

An interesting development is presently finding expression in the works of Catholic theologians and writers. The Roman Catholic system is often, and rightly, regarded as the highest expression of a rigid form of the episcopacy. It is expressed in a doctrine of the episcopacy and in a Canon Law which invalidates all other forms of ministry.⁸³ Thus, it is of significance to note that this doctrine of episcopacy, in its Catholic expression, is being questioned

80. MacLear, Op.cit., p. 280.

81. Hebert, A.G. The Form of the Church (London: Faber & Faber, 1948), p. 126.

82. Ibid., p. 127.

83. Hebert, Apostle and Bishop. pp. 16,17.

by Roman Catholics. These writers are perhaps the vanguard of a new and more conciliatory attitude on the part of the Roman Catholic Church; however, it would be premature, at least for the present time, to more than take note of the expressions of this minority. Kung repudiates the necessity and the historical validity of the apostolic succession.⁸⁴ To him, the apostolic ministry is never one of hierarchical power and authority; rather, the radical nature of the apostolic office is in ministry and in service.⁸⁵ On church order and leadership, Kung states that Catholic theologians are questioning the constituent nature of the Church Universal.⁸⁵ The Douay catechism would make the essence of the Church dependent upon the episcopate, for it states that the Church is the body of Christ, consisting of the people of God under the direction and leadership of the Bishops. This position is called into doubt by Thornton, who feels that the church is present in the local congregation without reference to the Bishops. "St. Paul addresses the local churches with 'Ye are the body of Christ'...no mere portion of it, still less a group of individuals within it, but the complete Body in microcosm."⁸⁶ The New Testament speaks of charismatic gifts, and this is now held to refer to gifts given to the entire membership of the Body of Christ for service to God.

84. Kung, Hans, The Church. (London: Burns & Oates, 1967), pp. 402-413.

85. Ibid., p. 354.

86. Thornton, Martin, Pastoral Theology: A Reorientation. (London: S.P.C.K., 1956), p. 19.

"Charisms are not special marks of distinction belonging to a chosen few, whether on account of their enthusiasm or of their office in the Church, but a distinguishing mark of the whole Church, of the fellowship of all believers. In a Church or community where only ecclesiastical officials rather than all members of the community are active, there is grave reason to wonder whether the Spirit has not been sacrificed along with the spiritual gifts."⁸⁷

c. The modified episcopal polity

It is in this area of these spiritual gifts, their exercise and their results, that episcopal churchmen are seeing an expression of God's approval upon non-episcopal orders. These orders may take the form of a modified episcopacy or an entirely non-episcopal form of church government.

1) The importance of the laity

Modified episcopacy is in one sense a hybrid form of church government. If the episcopacy is taken in the broad sense which makes the essence of the episcopate the oversight of the flock exercised by the bishop, which consequently implies the emphasis upon ecclesiastical office to the minimization of lay participation, then a greater emphasis upon lay participation within the framework of the episcopacy would be the essence of the modified form.

2) Characteristics

There are at least three characteristics which are common to those groups which follow the modified episcopal form of church government.

87. Kung, Op.cit., p. 187.

a) First, they are derivative groups. They can be found to have originated in a church which observed the full episcopal orders. However, whether for reasons of exclusion or separation, a new group was formed, separate and distinct from the original episcopally-governed body.

b) Second, modified episcopal groups do not place strong emphasis upon apostolic succession. In general practice, the ministry of these groups is considered invalid by episcopal groups, for there has been a loss of apostolic succession.

c) Third, and perhaps most important, there is a strong emphasis upon the laity in church government. In modified episcopal churches there is a strong trend toward democratic procedures. There are varying degrees of parity between the clergy and the laity, and in some groups, this has developed into absolute parity.

3. Summary.

In summary, then, it has been shown that the episcopal form of church government is centered upon the ministry, especially upon the office of the bishop. The main theological emphasis is upon authority. The Catholic/Anglo-Catholic form of the episcopacy would be insistent upon apostolic succession as the source of this authority. It is held that without this succession, the ministry is invalid and the benefits credited to the episcopal form of government cannot be realized. Other episcopal churchmen deny the necessity of this succession, and these would state that purity of doctrine, fulfilment of the mission of

the Church and other benefits derived from the episcopal form of government do not necessarily derive from authority based upon apostolic succession. The theological emphasis is changed from authority to govern to an emphasis upon government as a means of benefiting the Ekklesia and advancing the cause of Christ.

B. The Presbyterian Form

1. Its Reformation origin

The Presbyterian form of church government is closely connected with the Reformation.

a. Protestant in character

In its original concept and primitive practice, it is a true expression of the Protestant spirit. First of all, it is an attempt to found a church government based solely upon the authority of the Scriptures.⁸⁸ This is the positive side of Protestantism; there is a protest for a return to scriptural practices. Secondly, it is a protest against corrupt practices and policies which would vitiate the spiritual life and power of the Church and hinder it in its work for Christ. This is the other, the negative side of Protestantism.⁸⁹

b. The influence of Calvin

If the Reformation is taken as the starting point for the study of the presbyterian form of church government,

88. Paterson, William, The Church of the New Testament. (London: H.R. Allenson, 1902), pp. 55-57.

89. Henderson, G.D., Presbyterianism. (Aberdeen: Univ. Press, 1954), p. 21.

there is one person who demands consideration. John Calvin, through his practices in the Church of Geneva and his writings, most notably his Institutes, is the most influential person in the formation of presbyterianism. It was his influence and teaching which brought about the distinctive presbyterian eldership, the mark of those Reformation churches which follow the Calvinistic tradition.⁹⁰

Calvin's position on the offices of church government was based on his interpretation of Scripture, and on that basis he dogmatically stated, "There are four orders of offices which our Saviour has instituted for the government of the Church, first pastors, next doctors, then elders and fourthly deacons."⁹¹ Presbyterians have followed Calvin in regarding apostles, prophets and evangelists as extraordinary officers whose work was limited only to the special circumstances of the primitive Church.⁹² The pastors and teachers are classed together on the basis of Ephesians 4:11; pastors (with teachers) were deduced from Romans 12:7,8, while I Corinthians 12:28 is also cited as further proof.⁹³ Calvin further adduces a division of labour in the eldership on the basis of I Timothy 5:17.⁹⁴ This division of labour consists of the elders who perform the functions of the minister and those elders who have the duty of rule.⁹⁵ There was no exposition of a

90. Henderson, G.D., The Scottish Ruling Elder. (London: James Clarke & Co., 1935), p. 11.

91. Ibid., p. 25.

92. Paterson, Op.cit., p. 29.

93. Henderson, The Scottish Ruling Elder, p. 26.

94. Ibid., p. 27.

95. Ibid., p. 28.

distinction between the clergy and the laity. "Governments" in I Corinthians 12:28 and "ruling" in Romans 12:8 were held to refer to "seniors selected from the people to unite with the bishops in pronouncing censures and exercising discipline, for this is the only meaning which can be given to 'He that ruleth with diligence'." ⁹⁶

It has been stated above that Calvin was of the greatest importance in the development of the presbyterian form of church government. It has also been shown that Calvin relied heavily upon Scripture as he interpreted its meaning.

2. Its regard for scriptural authority.

The central place of Scripture in presbyterianism may be seen by a study of the principles which Calvin incorporated into his fourth book of Institutes. ⁹⁷ First, the written word of God is the only rule of practice for the affairs of church government and the execution of the duties of the officers. Second, the worship and government of the Church are plainly regulated in Scripture and it is therefore unlawful to introduce practices which are not warranted in the Word of God. Third, only those further regulations which may be inferred from the Scriptures but which are not clearly set forth to meet the need of a specific instance, and which at the same time have the honest objective of securing the execution of God's will,

96. Henderson, The Scottish Ruling Elder, p. 28.

97. Cunningham, Wm., Discussions on Church Principles. (Edinburgh: T & T Clark, 1863), p. 250.

may be proposed by ecclesiastical authority. Even then, these further regulations may be superseded and disregarded by individuals on the basis of their Christian consciences.

3. Its theological bases.

While presbyterianism was founded upon a reaffirmation of scriptural authority and heavily influenced by Calvin's interpretation of scripture, it should not be felt that there was a uniform and equal development of presbyterianism in all parts where it spread. For example, the presbyterian churches of France differ from those of Hungary, and both differ greatly from Scottish presbyterianism. This may be traced to social, political and national differences.⁹⁸ The unifying theological basis, however, was definitely reliance upon scriptural authority. But it is Scottish presbyterian churches which have played the greatest role in the history of presbyterianism.

It is perhaps ironic that the presbyterian church in Scotland is not known by that name. The Church of Scotland and the smaller Free Church of Scotland are presbyterian in their constitution, but they consider themselves as the Church of Jesus Christ in Scotland.⁹⁹ They have been the fountainhead for that presbyterianism which has spread to America and Canada and have cooperated in the establishment of a vast missionary program which reached out into all parts of the world. This worldwide advance is

98. Henderson, The Scottish Ruling Elder, p. 11.

99. Campbell, Relations of Christian Churches, p. 163.



founded upon clearly stated theological bases underlying fundamental presbyterian principles.

a. The priesthood of the believers.

The first fundamental presbyterian principle states that the priesthood of the believers is essential to the Church. This deals with the theological basis of church government in the area of the relations within the church. It was held fundamental that the believer had full access to God without the necessity of a mediating priest. The part in church government and the part in public worship which Calvin and the reformed churches gave to the laity is a part of the expression of this belief.¹⁰⁰

"The old separation between the clergy and the laity, so marked by the division between Canon and civil law, and symbolized by the refusal of the Cup to the people disappeared. The Liberty of the Christian man was established, and the cleric was distinguished from his brother only by his function, by the particular nature of the service he was able to render in the Church."¹⁰¹

b. Guaranteed rights of the people.

Closely connected to the principle of the priesthood of the believers is that principle which states that the people of the Ekklesia have guaranteed rights. It was not merely as an expression of the priesthood of the believers that part in church government was given to the laity; this in itself is an inalienable right.¹⁰² But this principle was based upon reference to the theological bases of authority and fulfilment of mission. Church government

100. Henderson, The Scottish Ruling Elder, p. 15.

101. Ibid., p. 15.

102. Hodge, Charles, The Church and its Polity. (London: Thomas Nelson & Sons, 1879), p. 124.

was not to be a series of edicts from authority above and apart from the people. Rather, it was to come from within the body of believers and to be an expression of the responsibility and rights of Christian men. "The reformed scheme not only endowed the layman with a new sense of vocation in his ordinary occupation and his home life, but brought to his notice rights and responsibilities in connection with organized religion."¹⁰³

Two of these inalienable rights of the people were self-discipline and representation. These bear directly on the fulfilment of the mission of the Church, which has been shown above to include both the perfection of the saints and evangelization of the unconverted. Discipline was conceived of as basically a form of spiritual ministry in which there was included "the cure of souls, the care of the whole spiritual and moral well-being of the community, to the building up of righteousness and the general establishment of a Christian standard in thought and conduct."¹⁰⁴ Integral to this type of spiritual discipline was the concept of democratic representation. The authority in presbyterianism resides in the duly elected representative of the congregation in the appointed church court.¹⁰⁵ This is in accord with the New Testament principle of the "superintendence of the whole church of its own interests, and the adjudication by the entire church in its own

103. Henderson, Presbyterianism, p. 70.

104. Ibid., p. 69.

105. Gettys, Joseph, What Presbyterians Believe. (Clinton, Georgia: Presbyterian College Press, 1953), pp. 9,10.

spiritual affairs, and by its own officials in their proper, legitimate places and functions."¹⁰⁶ This would preclude all interference from any civil power on earth.¹⁰⁷ The people were free from the corrupted episcopal system which was rejected and overthrown by the Reformation. The people, through the elected elder, are given first of all their own representatives and secondly a safeguard against clerical domination.¹⁰⁸ The right to discipline and govern themselves, on scriptural principles, freed the people to do God's work and fulfil the mission of the Ekklesia.¹⁰⁹

c. Parity of the ministry

Freedom from episcopal domination through a guarantee of the rights of the people did not mean that the clergy was relegated to a subordinate position and an unimportant role. While the people are given distinct rights and privileges, the parity of the ministry is also safeguarded.¹¹⁰

105. [Contd.]

Each presbyterian church is constituted in relation to the Presbytery in which it is located. Thus, the most important of these church courts, whether in potential or actual executive power, is the Presbytery. The emphasis upon the place of the Presbytery may vary according to the country, but the intended function, as reflected in the constitution of classical presbyterianism, places the Presbytery in a pivotal position between the local congregation and the higher church courts. General supervisory powers, control of ministerial relations and organizational authority reside primarily in the Presbytery. For further information, cf. Book of Church Order, 1964, pp. 44-47, and A Manual of Church Doctrine According to the Church of Scotland, edited by Torrance and Wright, 1960.

106. Paterson, Op.cit., p. 102.

107. Ibid., p. 102.

108. Henderson, Presbyterianism, p. 60.

109. Henderson, Presbyterianism, p. 59.

110. Hodge, Op.cit., p. 125.

"The theory of parity arose by way of opposition to a type of authority which had lost public confidence; but its positive content came to be, not so much any idea of levelling among officials, as a devout emphasis upon the Headship of Christ, and so of the spiritual nature of their trust and their common dependence upon grace."¹¹¹

The ministry is independent and secure under adequate safeguards as to doctrine and conduct. As the representative of the people for Christ, the minister is ordained to proclaim the Word, celebrate the sacraments and direct public worship without regard to the opinion of a bishop or other ecclesiastical superior. On the other hand, through his right to act under presbytery discipline with appeal to the highest court, the minister is free from slavish dependence upon the whims of his congregation.¹¹² Here again, the emphasis upon mutual responsibility to Christ the Head and the relationships within the Church are seen to be theological bases for this fundamental principle of parity.

4. Difficulties in presbyterian polity.

The presbyterian emphasis upon scripture as the basis for authority, from which were derived the other theological bases for this form of church government, was truly Protestant in its character. Nevertheless, the equation of the presbyterian form of government with scriptural truth can lead to undesirable distortion of the theological bases of this polity.

a. Potential for controversy

When there is a doctrinaire insistence upon the form

111. Henderson, Presbyterianism, p. 162.

112. Ibid., p. 162.

of church government, the seed is sown for controversy which can be both non-productive and positively harmful. At one time in the history of presbyterianism, the form of polity was defended with as much vehemence and rigidity as any advocate of apostolic succession would use in his arguments.

This is not necessarily surprising when one remembers that great influence of Calvin upon presbyterianism, and that to Calvin there was room for flexibility in things not pertaining to salvation, "but the fundamentals of Order were clearly for him matters of dogma, settled by biblical authority."¹¹³ This was the great underlying influence in the development of the presbyterian polity, and its advocates must be remembered to be in strong reaction against the corrupt practices of the Church of their time. The reformers could not be content to repudiate the episcopal form of government which they found unscriptural; they must also replace it with a valid substitute. This substitute could not be an innovation; rather, it must be a return to the scriptural standard, for there were certain essential principles for the organization and action of the Church which were to be found in scripture. Hodge explains this equation of scriptures and polity. Scriptural principles are first of all jure divino. They are clearly taught in the Word of God and as such are intended to be of universal and perpetual obligation. Secondly, these

113. Henderson, Presbyterianism, p. 65.

scriptural principles are the essential and constituent principles of Presbyterianism.¹¹⁴

It was held that the New Testament Church was modelled on the synagogue because Christ recognized the adaptability of the Proto-Presbyterian system.¹¹⁵ The church life of the primitive Ekklesia was seen to reflect the presbyterian form of government,¹¹⁶ and it was thus held that the action of the Reformers in establishing a presbyterian form of government was in actuality restoring the Christ-instituted government of His Church. This left no room for others who followed a differing polity.¹¹⁷

At times in the past, this rigidity has proven a source of strength in preserving the theological bases of presbyterian polity. An example of this may be seen in the reaction of Scottish churchmen against state control of the church. The presbyterian position is that the Church and State should be separate societies, each sovereign in its own sphere.¹¹⁸ This is in accord with the principle of the rights of the people, based theologically upon authority in the Church and the fulfilment of the Church's mission. When the episcopacy of the Church of England was to be imposed upon the Scottish Church, on the grounds of loyalty to the King as head of the Church in England, this was unacceptable, both for reasons of immediate

114. Hodge, Op.cit., pp.122ff.

115. Paterson, Op.cit., pp. 16-17.

116. Ibid., pp. 166-198.

117. Ibid., p. 183.

118. Cunningham, Op.cit., p. 164.

conscience and of future consequence. It was a question of authority; the rule of the king could not be allowed to supplant the rule of scripture.¹¹⁹ Secondly, the right of the members of the church to call their own ministers was held to be a scriptural principle, one which could not be surrendered in good conscience, but which would be endangered if Erastian claims were recognized.¹²⁰ Thirdly, it was feared that concessions on the form of polity would lead to eventual state control, which would hinder the fulfilment of the mission of the Church. It was this which caused Melville to reject the appointment of bishops.¹²¹

This historical controversy is mentioned at this time because of the theological implications for church government. Are these implications still of importance for today? This is a question which must be answered in a different part of this study, as the relevance of these theological bases of church government for the Church today, especially the Church in Asia today, is discussed below.

b. Effect on mission.

Henderson brings out another aspect of the theological implications of presbyterian church government in his discussion of American presbyterian movements.¹²² He has come to the conclusion that insistence upon the

119. Cunningham, Op.cit., pp. 165, 166, 218.

120. Cunningham, Op.cit., pp. 290ff, 470ff.

121. Henderson, The Scottish Ruling Elder, p. 37.

122. Henderson, Presbyterianism, p. 154.

comparatively rigid system of presbyterian government handicapped the spread of the Presbyterian church on the American frontier. Is there room for adaptation within the framework of the theology of church government, or is adaptation to be equated with compromise? This must be discussed below, as well.

5. Summary.

For the present, it is sufficient to say that the presbyterian form of Church government is theologically based upon the authority of the scriptures. Upon this basis, presbyterians have built a polity which makes specific provision for the theologically-oriented factors in Church government: first, the relationships of members of the church; second, fulfilment of the Church's mission; and third, the role of government in relation to the nature of the Church. It has been shown that these differ both in form and substance from the episcopal polity; it may now be seen that the congregational polity differs from both the episcopal and the presbyterian forms of government.

C. The Congregational Form

1. A part of the Reformation

Those churches which have congregational polity trace their origins back to a second Protestant movement which arose during, and out of, the Reformation. For convenience, this may henceforth be called the "Assembled Church" movement.¹²³

123. The term, "Assembled Church", is introduced here in a technical sense as an endeavour to avoid certain theological connotations inherent in other names commonly
[Contd.]

This movement may be defined as the "effort of Christians of varying theological beliefs and ecclesiastical backgrounds to restore the New Testament emphasis upon a Spirit-filled community of faith."¹²⁴ It was held that the Ekklesia had been defiled through the dominance of secular influences in the social order. This was not necessarily a new movement; however, it was in the sixteenth century that it became most articulate in the Anabaptist/Mennonite movements on the continent of Europe and in the Puritan Separatist and Non-conformist movements in England.¹²⁵ While insisting that theirs'

123. [Contd.]

used. The term, "Gathered Church", not only conveys a picture of a form of polity; it also has a definite connotation as an expression of a particular theory of the nature of the Church. The term, "Confessional Church", expresses the necessity of personal confession of faith, which is an important feature found in these churches. A problem of confusion arises here, however, for this term is more commonly used in reference to churches which unite about formal confessions of faith, such as the Westminster or Augsburg Confessions. If "Free Church" is used, there is the problem of identification with the Free Church of Scotland, whose polity is presbyterian rather than congregational. The emphasis here is upon polity as a distinctive feature which unites such different bodies as Baptists, Mennonites, Brethren, Quakers and Congregational churches, without reference here to certain theological distinctives which do not come within the scope of this study. Cf. Underwood, A History of the English Baptists, pp. 16-20. These should be distinguished from certain heretical or semi-heretical movements found on the fringe of the Reformation. Cf. George, The Protestant Mind of the English Reformation, pp. 93-94, 393-395. Apart from this term, "congregational" shall be used as an alternative reference to this movement studied here in its general form of polity. This should not be confused with the Congregational denominations, included here for their polity.

124. Torbert, R.G. A History of the Baptists. (London: The Carey Kingsgate Press, Ltd., 1963), p. 17.

125. Ibid., p. 29.

was the correct position, these churchmen did not arbitrarily reject Christians of other bodies.

a. Protestant in character.

This is not to say that there was no line of demarcation beyond which the hand of Christian fellowship could not be extended. The "Assembled Church" movement was a part of the Reformation and therefore would be, by nature, a discriminating movement. Dulles divides Christianity into two groups, the Evangelic and the Catholic.

"The evangelic notion is that the Christian religion, the Christian consciousness, forms and determines Christian churches which all manifest the Church. The catholic notion is that there exists a formally established society which, as the Church, forms and determines the Christian religion."¹²⁶

This expresses the controversy which divided the Protestants from the Roman Church, and which at the same time served to unite the Protestants in their religious ideals. The fact that there was general unity in protest did not preclude distinct differences, particularly in the interpretation of the general principles involved.

b. Unified by polity

A point of distinction should be made at this stage of the discussion. The Assembled Church movement was not united by a formal theological confession of faith; it was united about a theologically-based form of church government. Different denominations with varying theological emphases and beliefs have grown out of this

126. Dulles, A.M. The True Church. (New York: Fleming H. Revell Co., 1907), p. 13.

movement; they are still united by a congregational polity. Thus, when reference is made to congregationalism or to congregational churches, the meaning includes, but goes beyond the Congregational Church as a denomination.

2. Marked by definite theological bases.

The basic theological principle which underlies congregational polity deals with authority.

a. Bible is supreme authority

The source, scope and exercise of authority for church government are all encompassed in this one basic principle.

"The Bible...interpreted by sanctified common sense, with all wise helps from nature, from history, from all knowledge, and especially from the revealing Spirit...is the only, and sufficient, and authoritative guide in all matters of Christian practice, as it is in all matters of Christian faith: so that whatsoever the Bible teaches by precept, example, or legitimate inference...is imperative upon all men, at all times; while nothing which it does not so teach can be imperative upon any man at any time."¹²⁷

This sweeping statement of scriptural authority is of direct consequence to the study of the theology of congregational church government. Tradition, whether or not in conjunction with the scriptures, ecclesiastical practices, patristic writings or any other thing which is originated by man must not be allowed to refute or compromise the truth which is found in the Bible.¹²⁸

b. Church formed by the polity

The first of the theological implications embodied

127. Dexter, Henry, Congregationalism. (Boston: Nichols & Noyes, 1865.

128. Davidson, S. The Ecclesiastical Polity of the New Testament. (London: Jackson & Walford, 1848), p. 2.

in this statement of Biblical authority refers to the place of polity in relation to the nature of the Ekklesia. It is necessary first of all to examine the distinctive view of the Church Universal which is held by congregationalists.

1) Congregation becomes Ekklesia.

It is within the local congregation as a church that it is possible to find the Ekklesia, for Christ has promised, "Where two or three are gathered together in my name, there am I in the midst of them". Where Christ is, there is the Ekklesia.¹²⁹ The true Ekklesia is not to be distinguished by any purely external sign. Wherever God's Word is preached and heard, wherever the sacraments are rightly administered and wherever Christian discipline is wisely enforced, there the Church Universal is present.¹³⁰

2) Congregation self-governing

It is the emphasis upon the Church Universal as the local congregation which is the distinctive mark of congregationalism. Every local church has within itself all the power and right necessary for the performance of the duties of the whole Ekklesia.¹³¹ It may then be said that church government, as one of the duties of the Church Universal, is centered in the local congregation.

129. Pierce, Wm., and Horne, C.S., Primer of Church Fellowship. (London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1893), p. 36.

130. Horton, W.M., Our Christian Faith. (Boston: Pilgrim Press, 1945), p. 50.

131. Dulles, Op.cit., p. 259.

3) Congregation self-determinative

The Ekklesia is any congregation gathered together for the worship of God under the authority of Jesus Christ.¹³² The presence and governing authority of Jesus Christ as Head of the Church, within the local congregation, also gives the local congregation the authority to govern itself. The scriptural usage of Ekklesia refers, in "its most distinct and frequent sense", to a local Church; i.e., a gathering of Christians in a particular place.¹³³ In terms of church government, the local congregation, as the Ekklesia, is self-determinative.

a) Determines own membership

It is self-determinative, first of all, because each congregation has the right to admit new members. The person desiring to unite with the Church Universal was required to make a public confession of faith before the local congregation. The local congregation then would decide whether it desired to admit him into fellowship.¹³⁴ Dismissal and discipline are also the prerogative of the local congregation.¹³⁵

b) Determines own officers

The local church is self-determinative, in the second place, because each congregation has the right to choose its own officials, including its ministers. This is proven from the scriptural record of apostolic practice.¹³⁶ The church

132. Davidson, D., The Congregationalist's Manual. (Edinburgh: Waugh & Innes, 1833), p. 9.

133. Dexter, Op.cit., p. 32.

134. MacHardy, Geo., Congregational Principles. (Edinburgh: Congregational Union, 1894), p. 6.

135. Dexter, Op.cit., p. 38.

136. MacHardy, Op.cit., p. 18.

at Jerusalem and the Graeco-Roman churches were fully independent in their organization. They decided their own internal organizational form; they decided its constituency. All this was without reference to apostolic or other external control. It was not until much later that the rise of ecclesiasticism substituted church orders for the original unifying principle of self-government.¹³⁷

c) Determines own affairs

The New Testament record shows further, that the local church was self-determinative, in the third place, because each local congregation decided in local assembly, aided only by their self-elected officials, all matters which pertained to the life of the local congregation. This may be seen in Acts 1:15-26, 6:1-6 and 15:4-31.¹³⁸ The participation in the local assembly is so important that many feel that when a congregation becomes so large that all its members cannot conveniently meet together for discussion and decision, it cannot fulfil its responsibilities as the Church, for it cannot follow the apostolic example of self-government in the most representative sense.¹³⁹

Thus far, it has been shown that the congregational standard is that the local congregation is the true Ekklesia, under the Headship of Jesus Christ. The true Ekklesia is to govern itself in the areas of membership, choice of officials and the transaction of its own business.

137. Dulles, Op.cit., pp. 258, 259.

138. Dexter, Op.cit., pp. 39-41.

139. Pierce and Horne, Op.cit., pp. 37-39.

In this way, congregational church government is self-determinative in matters regarding the essentials of the Church Universal.

❧ c. Provisions for relationships within the Ekklesia.

But this question of each congregation exercising self-government is inseparable from the question of relationships within the Ekklesia. This may best be dealt with by examining first the mutual relationships of the believers and then showing the role of the officials in the Church Universal.

1) Relationships based upon Christian equality

The congregational ideal is that of a true democracy, and this held to be based upon scriptural practice and authority. Christ is the head of the Ekklesia today, as when he was on earth, and all are equal brethren. Matthew 18: 15-17, 20-28 is interpreted as proof that "No one has a right, not even an Apostle, to 'lord it over God's heritage'."¹⁴⁰ On this basis, the layman and the minister meet on equal terms, for the Ekklesia consists in the people of God rather than in its rulers or officers.¹⁴¹ All members of the church, including the minister, have this equality of essential right and privilege,¹⁴² but always subject to the Lordship of Christ.¹⁴³

140. Ibid., p. 37.

141. Selbie, W.R., Congregationalism. (London: Methuen & Co., 1927), p. 49.

142. Dexter, Op.cit., p. 38.

143. Selbie, Op.cit., p. 49.

2) Only two permanent offices

When it is stated that the minister (and other officials) are of an equality with the people, the emphasis is upon the scriptural rejection of an ecclesiastical hierarchy which might be regarded as essential to the perpetuation of the Church or as a possible rival for the authority vested in Christ alone. The Church Universal is constituted of equal brethren, a body of believers under Christ, and therefore has no need for "holy orders" for its life or functions.¹⁴⁴

a) Office of the pastor

This is not to say that congregationalists reject the ministry as a body. But the body of believers constitute the Ekklesia and thus it is from the body of believers that the ministry must come. The local church is a spiritual manifestation of the Church Universal and can act in the name of the Ekklesia to recognize a man as a minister of God raised up by God for service.¹⁴⁵ A man's ministry is self-validating, because "consecrated industry, sincerity and conviction...show the validity of (a man's) orders in a way which no one can deny."¹⁴⁶ Such a ministry cannot be regarded as a ministry of presumption; the truth is that the man does not take a ministry to himself. The ministry does come from above, but through the action of the

144. Dulles, Op.cit., p. 253.

145. Dulles, Op.cit., p. 262.

146. Peel, Albert, Inevitable Congregationalism. (London: Independent Press, 1937), p. 76.

members of the Ekklesia. It is not a matter of hierarchical transmission of authority but a transmission of God's authority through the priesthood of the believer.¹⁴⁷

b) Office of the deacon

Apart from the minister, each congregational church has one other permanent office. This is the diaconate.¹⁴⁸ These two permanent offices within the Church Universal are held to be founded upon scriptural authority.

There are in the New Testament two instances of the formal enumeration of labourers and gifts in connection with the Ekklesia. These may be found in I Corinthians 12:28ff and Ephesians 4:8-11. The majority of these offices and gifts are held to be temporary in nature. In addition to these, the New Testament at various times makes mention of presbyters, elders, bishops, Angels of the Churches and deaconesses.¹⁴⁹ It is held that presbyters, elders and bishops are the synonyms for the office of pastor, that Angels of the Churches and deaconesses are offices limited to the apostolic times, and that deacons are the complementary order of ministry, together with the pastors, which Christ designated for his Church.¹⁵⁰ In relation to the office of the pastor, II Timothy 5:17, if interpreted correctly, does not admit of an exegesis which furnishes both a ruling and a teaching eldership; the two are in actuality only one office.¹⁵¹

147. Dulles, Op.cit., p. 260.

148. Davidson, D., Op.cit., pp. 66-76.

149. Dexter, Op.cit., pp. 69-72.

150. MacHardy, Op.cit., p. 24.

151. Davidson, S., Op.cit., pp. 185-188.

c) Officials responsible to congregation ^{or}

There was definitely no priestly status or function on the part of the pastor/teachers; whether they were called bishops, elders or presbyters, the only way in which they could be called priests was in the same sense as all believers are priests before God.¹⁵² The diaconate in the earliest churches came about as there was a distinction between pastors and deacons caused by the recognition of natural abilities and the normal demands of church life.¹⁵³ This division of labour resulted in the election by the churches of pastors whose duty it was to take care of the spiritual interests of the church and superintend its various activities and a second group, the deacons, whose duties included the oversight of the temporal interests of the Church, the administration of the various funds, and the care of the external arrangements of the church.¹⁵⁴ Others who work in the church, such as Sunday School teachers, youth program directors and mission workers are a class of workers which has grown up for the present time. These are generally not appointed by a formal vote of the church, for they do not occupy a distinctly official position.¹⁵⁵

The congregationalist emphasis upon the authority for ministerial service coming through the congregation has led to a difference on the practice of ordination as a ceremony. The practice of older congregational bodies was

152. MacHardy, Op.cit., p. 28.

153. Ibid., p. 29.

154. Davidson, D. Op.cit., pp. 74-75.

155. MacHardy, Op.cit., p. 24.

to minimize the ceremony of ordination. This was a reaction against the sacramental nature invested in ordination by the Catholic church. However, even among these older bodies it was recognized that an induction service was desirable, and the question of ordination seems to be largely a matter of local option.¹⁵⁶ The scriptural accounts of ordination by Paul or others who were not members of the local congregation is explained as a requested superintendency on the part of the apostles for the election of officers rather than an appointment without consultation, which is felt to be implied in the modern usage of the term. This referral of power to the congregation is felt to be closer to the true meaning of the Greek usage and more in accord with the limiting contextual evidence.¹⁵⁷ Today, there is more emphasis upon ordination as a ceremony; nevertheless, the congregational churches continue to infuse the ceremony with the significance that this is the local church, as the Body of Christ guided by the Holy Spirit, expressing God's will through their action.

Thus, the authority which the pastors and deacons have comes from the local church. This democratic selection does not create a permanent office which can be held without regard to others; the power continues to reside in the congregation as the priesthood of believers which constitutes the church. And even as the pastor or deacon is elevated to office by the congregation, so the

156. Dexter, Op.cit., p. 137.

157. Davidson, S., Op.cit., pp. 217-229.

congregation, upon evidence that the personal life, the doctrine taught, the performance of duties is not in accord with the will of God as revealed in the Word of God, may dismiss a pastor or deacon from his office.¹⁵⁸

It may be seen that the congregational theory of relationships is based upon democratic practices held to be taught in scripture. As Christ is above all, so all are equal before Him. There is an equality of essential right and privilege, but always subject to the Lordship of Christ.

3) Unitary independence

A further aspect of the relationships within the Church is involved in the relative position of local congregations to one another. MacKinnal quotes Fletcher as distinguishing between "Congregational Independency" and "Aggregate Independency".¹⁵⁹ Congregational independence is that which has been described above in the discussion on self-government. But aggregate independence is the freedom of the Ekklesia of the local congregation from outside control.¹⁶⁰

a) Ecclesiastical independence

Each congregation as the Ekklesia is on a level of essential equality with all other congregations, and such is answerable only to Christ.¹⁶¹ This is felt to be of essential importance to the free operation of the Church,

158. Ibid., p. 271.

159. MacKinnal, A., Evolution of English Congregationalism. (London: James Nisbet & Co., 1901), p. 43.

160. Ibid., p. 43.

161. Dexter, Op.cit., p. 43.

and indeed, to the very spiritual life of the Church.

"Directly an earthly ruling authority envelopes the church in its coils, the church's power of being loyal to her Lord is crippled, and is in danger of being made altogether impossible."¹⁶² On this basis the congregationalists would reject any hierarchy, no matter how rudimentary, and would reject even such outward control as might be found in a formal Confession of Faith.¹⁶³ Such control would be a compromise of the doctrine of individual conscience. Each man is directly responsible for his actions before God, as stated in Romans 14:10,12, and inasmuch as the local congregation consists of those who have come together to form the Ekklesia on the basis of their own consciences, they must have the final decision. Supra-local control cannot be accepted or allowed to interpose itself between the believer and Christ, or between the Ekklesia and Christ.¹⁶⁴

It is in this connection that Dulles quotes Schliermacher as saying that in Protestantism the Church is reached through Christ; in Catholicism, Christ is reached through the Church. The believer is to have direct access to Christ; the Church is also to have direct access to Christ. Supra-local control prevents this and is thus a negation of the truly Protestant concept of the relationship

162. Clemance, C., New Testament Church Orders and Discipline. (London: John Snow & Co., 1876), p. 5.

163. Dale, R.W., History of English Congregationalism. (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1907), p. 383.

164. Goodrich, Albert, A Primer of Congregationalism. (London: Congregational Union, 1909), pp. 95, 96.

between Christ, Church and Christian.¹⁶⁵

Authority is entrusted to the local congregation as the Church Universal by Christ the Head; some of this authority is then entrusted to those whom the church elects as its own rulers.¹⁶⁶ This authority is declarative, not legislative, within the congregation; there is certainly no room for control by a hierarchy or by a conciliar body.¹⁶⁷ Moreover, this congregational refusal to accept supra-local authority has historically brought the members of this movement into conflict with the state.

b) Civil independence.

The basis of this conflict was the demand for freedom of conscience. Inasmuch as conscience cannot be compelled by power or converted by favour, the purely religious actions of churches must never be subjected to civil authority any more than these actions can be submitted to external authority.¹⁶⁸ As a result of this insistence on freedom to worship in accord with the individual conscience, congregationalists in England have been subjected to persecution, imprisonment and exile. At times in England, insistence on this freedom to worship as an independent congregation led to execution for treason.¹⁶⁹ When the early pilgrims in America, many of whom were virtual refugees for their religious beliefs, insisted upon

165. Dulles, Op.cit., p. 13.

166. Dulles bases this upon the New Testament record of church relations. He traces this record in detail, pp.133-135.

167. Davidson, D. Op.cit., p. 183.

168. MacKinnal, Op.cit., p. 44.

169. Peel, Albert, The Noble Army of Congregational Martyrs. (London: Independent Press, 1948), pp. 17-22.

separation of Church and State, it was with this background. One may ask if the fact of persecution did not become more meaningful than the original principle; however, this cannot be discussed at the present but must be dealt with below.

4) Polity and mission.

One thing more must be discussed in relationship to the congregational insistence upon independence. Congregational Christians would state that it is this independence which is the source for greatest scope in the fulfilment of the mission of the Ekklesia. Congregational polity thus is given a theological basis as the superior form of church government as a tool for fulfilling Christ's commission and purposes. The congregational polity promotes the spiritual life of the Christian towards the great end of the perfection of the saints through its implementation of spiritual worship, Christian edification through the teaching ministry, and fraternal association in relation to Christ.¹⁷⁰ The earnest Christian is not only best edified through this polity; the wayward brother is best disciplined by congregational methods. Discipline comes from within the brotherhood, and is the best assurance of mutual understanding and love. Congregational discipline has been defined as the "care which the members of Christ's body have for one another."¹⁷¹ The great ends of evangelism are also said to be best promoted through the congregational polity. It was as the early Ekklesia, in its congregational purity, went forth spreading

170. Goodrich, Op.cit., pp. 102-103.

171. MacKenna, Op.cit., p. 49.

the Gospel that the world was "turned upside down".¹⁷² Congregationalists feel that the Gospel is best spread, whether in "Christendom" or in the "mission fields", through the use of the powerful freedom in Christ which is the impetus and mark of the Assembled Church movement.¹⁷³

3. Summary.

The congregational form of government has been shown to be strongly rooted in theology. The theological basis for congregationalism is found in the scriptural account of the ecclesiastical polity of the early church. Thus, the authority for this polity is found in scripture. Furthermore, it is held that polity is closely connected with the form and nature of the Church. The theological question of relationships within the Church is formative in the areas of the mutual relationships of the believers, the place of church officers, the independence of the local congregation as the Ekklesia, and the fulfilment of the mission of the Church Universal. On these bases, congregationalism is held to be theologically grounded.

IV. SUMMARY STATEMENT

This chapter has been concerned with a study of the theological bases of the episcopal, presbyterian and congregational forms of church government. The distinctive theological emphases of these three polities have been

172. Peel, Inevitable Congregationalism. p. 64.

173. Dexter, Op.cit., p. 266.

examined as they relate to the nature of the Ekklesia, authority, relationships within the Ekklesia, and the fulfilment of the mission of the Church Universal. It may be shown from the findings of this examination that there is one basic point of theological division.

This division centres about the question of authority for church government, in relation to the question of apostolic succession. Advocates of apostolic succession would claim that the nature of the Ekklesia, its authority as seen in a valid ministry, the relationship within the Ekklesia, and the ability to fulfil the mission of the Church Universal are all dependent upon the maintenance of apostolic succession. On the other hand, Protestants reject these claims; rejection of the necessity of the doctrine would lead to rejection of the entire theological basis for episcopacy based upon apostolic succession.

Thus, for those episcopal churchmen who do not accept the necessity of apostolic succession, for the presbyterian and for the congregationalist, the seat of authority is agreed to be the Bible as a guide to church polity. There is room for discussion of the other theological issues when this common seat of authority is granted. The nature of the Ekklesia, the fulfilment of the Universal Church's mission and the relationships within the Church Universal all become matters of theological importance which are governed by the most important theological consideration, that is, the authority of the Bible.

The implications of this are of great complexity and must be dealt with in the following chapter.

CHAPTER TWO

AN ANALYSIS OF THE FUNDAMENTAL NECESSITIES INTEGRAL TO
THE THEOLOGICAL BASES OF CHURCH GOVERNMENT

I. THE PURPOSE OF THIS CHAPTER

It has been shown that the theological bases of church government centre about four questions. There is the question of authority, the question of the effect of church structures on the nature of the Ekklesia, the question of relationships, and finally, the question of the effect of church structures upon the fulfilment of the mission of the Ekklesia. The different approaches to church government are generally classified under the broad divisions of episcopal, presbyterian and congregational. The broadly inclusive theological bases of church structures have been discussed in the previous chapter. It is the purpose of this chapter to determine what are the fundamental necessities integral to these theological bases of church structure.

A. Three Important Definitions

It would be well at this juncture to establish three definitions which underly this continuing study. "Fundamental" is that which is of, or pertaining to, the foundation or basis.¹ A fundamental quality is one which is essential or basal. "Integral" is that which is essential to completeness.² "Necessity" is that which is necessary,

1. Bethel, J.P., ed. Op.cit., p. 336.

2. Ibid., p. 437.

as a requisite, an indispensable, such as the necessities of life.³ Thus, this particular section of the study will devolve about an analysis of those basic qualities which are requisite or indispensable to the essential completeness of the theological bases of church governmental structure.

B. The Point of Ultimate Division

The question of what is fundamental, necessary and integral to the theological bases of church government may be seen in the view taken regarding the doctrine of apostolic succession. This may be shown in two ways. First, it may be shown that there is one form of church government completely dependent upon the realization of this doctrine of the polity of the church. The doctrine of apostolic succession is a fundamental necessity to the theological bases of this form of polity. Second, it may be further shown that the remaining forms of church structure are not of an essential diversity. While there are differences to be seen in the theological bases of these various forms, these differences are basically a matter of form rather than expressions of that which is fundamentally necessary.

At this point, it is necessary to examine the theological bases of church government to show the validity of this contention.

3. Ibid., p. 561.

II. AN ANALYSIS OF THE THEOLOGICAL BASES OF CHURCH GOVERNMENT

There are two ways in which it is possible to analyze the theological bases of church government in order to determine the fundamental necessities integral to these bases.

A. A Comparative Analysis of Theological Factors

The first is a comparative analysis of the dividing and unifying factors involved in the theological bases of church government. One group of Christians insists that the Ekklesia may only be governed through bishops whose place is given and secured through apostolic succession. In contrast to this, another group of Christians states that the Church Universal may be governed by bishops, but that government may also be through other means. Apostolic succession is not the accepted test of validity. Both parties would insist that their is the correct view, based upon theological necessity and not subject to compromise.

1. Catholic theological unity

The first group described above consists of the Anglo-Catholics and the Roman Catholics, who are united together on the necessity of the Historic Episcopate. It is proposed to introduce "Historic Episcopate" as a technical term, denoting the fact of bishops as a form of church government based upon apostolic succession.

a. The mission of the Ekklesia

There is first of all, agreement on the necessity of the Historic Episcopate in the completion of the mission of the Church.

The Roman Catholic position would make the transmission of grace dependent upon the Historic Episcopate. Bea quotes the Lumen Gentium to this end:

"This sacred Synod teaches that by divine institution bishops have succeeded to the place of the Apostles as shepherds of the church....In the bishops, therefore, for whom priests are assistants, our Lord Jesus Christ, the supreme High Priest, is present in the midst of those who believe. For sitting at the right hand of God the Father, he is not absent from the gathering of his high priests, but he is preaching the Word of God to all nations and constantly administering the sacraments of faith to those who believe. By their paternal role (cf. I Cor. 4:15), He incorporates new members into His body by a heavenly regeneration, and finally by their wisdom and prudence He directs and guides the people of the New Testament in its pilgrimage toward eternal happiness."⁴

One may see from this statement that the presence of Christ, his work of preaching and regeneration, and the government of the Church are all placed directly upon the existence and operation of the historic episcopate.

The Anglo-Catholic position would be in essential agreement with this. Mascall may be able to say, "The one thing of which we can be quite sure is that God gives to those who participate (in the sacraments of other churches) every grace for which they ask and which he knows that it is good for them to have."⁵ However, this gift of grace must be considered as an ex gratia act on the part of God, based upon the faith of the believer rather than in the ability of ministers who do not have apostolic succession to perform

4. Bea, op.cit., pp. 28,29.

5. Fisher, Geoffrey, The Anglican-Methodist Conversations and Problems of Church Unity. (London: Oxford Press, 1963), p. 27, quoting E.L. Mascall, Barriers to Unity.

valid sacraments. If such ministers could celebrate validly, "the whole rationale of the sacramental system, is pro tanto invalidated".⁶

b. Authority within the Ekklesia

Apart from this agreement on the position of the ministry in the transmission of grace, there is also agreement that the Historic Episcopate is essential for authority to govern within the Ekklesia. The Catholic position is that the Historic Episcopate is at all times "presiding in place of God over the flock whose shepherds they are, as teachers of doctrine, priests of sacred worship and officers of good order."⁷ For the Anglo-Catholic also, it is only in the Historic Episcopate that one may find the authority which is proper for the exercise of the ministerial office. Only in the reception of apostolic authority, as held to be instituted by Christ, can the ministry receive the validating authority.⁸ Mascall emphasizes that the validity of the ministry is dependent upon the Historic Episcopate.

"The focal position which the apostolic episcopate holds in the organic Body of Christ is shown by the fact that the bishop, in Catholic Christendom, is the link between the universal and the local church."⁹

He states further, "It is the ascended Christ, the Great High Priest and Apostle, in whom the universal episcopate

6. Moberly, R.C., Ministerial Priesthood (London: John Murray, 1899), p. 106.

7. Bea, op.cit., p. 28.

8. Moberly, op.cit., p. 69.

9. Mascall, E.L., The Recovery of Unity (London: Longmans, Green and Co., 1958), p. 173.

itself is rooted and from whom its apostolic and priestly character flows, who is the ultimate agent in every ordination and consecration."¹⁰ It should be noted that the universal episcopate and the act of ordination to the ministry are inseparably linked, as may be seen in examination of Mascall's arguments.¹¹

c. Necessary as the esse of the Ekklesia

There is yet another area of agreement between the Anglo-Catholic and the Roman Catholic position. The Historic Episcopate is maintained to be of the esse of the Ekklesia. On this view, no body lacking this episcopate can properly be called an Ekklesia at all.¹² Those who have been ordained within this episcopate are "exclusively" God's ambassadors. They are such, not on the basis of a ritual of ordination which was technically correct or because of the ancient nature of episcopal ordination. Theirs is the ministry which God has appointed to constitute the character of the society wherein his grace is to operate with the least impediment.¹³ "The Church, under God, derives its being from the Apostolic Ministry, so that where there is no Apostolic Ministry there can be no Church."¹⁴ The Roman Catholic position is essentially the same.¹⁵

10. Ibid., p. 186.

11. Ibid., pp. 185ff.

12. Packer, J.I., ed., All in Each Place (Appleford: Marcham Manor Press, Ltd., 1965), p. 150. "Oversight and Bishops" R.E. Nixon.

13. Peck, A.L., Anglicism and Episcopacy (London: Faith Press, Ltd., 1958), p. 95.

14. Ibid., p. 95.

15. Basic disagreement on church government is not on the place of apostolic succession but on the place of the Pope. Both Catholic groups agree on the necessity of apostolic succession. They disagree on the functional expression... should it be the Pope or the episcopacy? Cf. Butler, Idea of the Church, p. 93.

The Ekklesia is neither merely a mystery nor an institution limited to the temporal sphere. She is a single complex reality in which both these aspects can be discerned. This reality subsists in the Catholic Church.¹⁶ Thus, it may be seen that the Catholic Church is the equivalent of the Church of Christ. Vatican II was basically a re-affirmation of the juridical theory of the Church Universal as a pyramid consisting of the hierarchy with the Pope at the apex.¹⁷ The relationship of the hierarchy to the Ekklesia is seen in the statement that the reality of the Church "subsists in the Catholic Church, governed by the successor of Peter and the bishops in communion with him."¹⁸ The fact of the Church Universal, in other words, is inseparable from the Petrine government of the Church. This is based on two convictions. First, the esse of the Ekklesia must include or consist of full communion and visible unity. Second, this unity is centred in the apostolic and episcopal college which is headed by the Bishop of Rome as the successor of St. Peter.¹⁹ This unity is integral to the Catholic view of the Church Universal as a visible society. Butler proposes the analogy of a political society which must have a governing head to subsist as a society. If this governing head were to leave, the society would become inchoate and anarchical. The only way to prevent this is to appoint a

16. Butler, Vatican II, p. 91.

17. Novak, Michael, The Open Church (London: Darton, Longman and Todd, 1964), pp. 95-97.

18. Butler, Vatican II, p. 91.

19. Ibid., p. 120.

regency during the absence of the head of state. In the case of the Ekklesia, Christ the Head has left, but has made provision to maintain the cohesive unity of the society which he founded. This provision is in the apostolic ministry headed by the Pope as the Regent and Vicar of Christ.²⁰

d. Necessary for relationships within the Ekklesia

Within this Church, the relationships are consistently vertical. The bishop is the mediator between the people and Christ. Taking Paul's analogy of Christ as the Head and the Church as the Body, it is said that the ministers are the specialized organs for the life of the Body.²¹ The place of the bishop in relation to the other members of the Ekklesia is easily misunderstood. The bishop has great power; pre-Reformation abuse of this power does not negate the necessity for submission to the authority of the bishop.²² Out of Christ's commission to the Apostles, the successor of whom the bishop stands, there comes forth a three-fold base of power and authority. The first of all is the power of the priest in the performance of the sacraments through which grace is transmitted.²³ The second is the power to exclude from the fellowship and life of the Ekklesia; this is the power of excommunication.²⁴ Finally, there is the power of absolution.²⁵ The supreme authority

20. Butler, The Idea of the Church, pp. 40-45.

21. Moberly, Op.cit., p. 69.

22. Line, Op.cit., p. 151.

23. Ibid., p. 151.

24. Butler, The Idea of the Church, p. 48.

25. Line, Op.cit., p. 156.

of the bishop is understood if it is realized that "he who hears them, hears Christ, while he who rejects them, rejects Christ, and him who sent Christ."²⁶ With such power as this, the paternalistic authority of the bishops is to be recognized by the people of God and used by the bishops for the service of the people of God.²⁷

The essential agreement of Anglo-Catholics and Roman Catholics on the theological necessity for the Historic Episcopate as the basis of church government may be seen from this brief discussion. The authority of those who govern is dependent upon their succession to the Apostolic place and commission. Christ's work of reconciliation, regeneration and perfection is dependent upon the Historic Episcopate, as is the very constitution of the Ekklesia as a visible society. Finally, the consistently vertical relationships within the Church Universal are maintained through the existence of the hierarchy which is the outgrowth of the Historic Episcopate. Differences do exist, but these are basically merely branches which grow in different directions from the root and trunk of the Historic Episcopate.

2. Protestant theological unity.

Inasmuch as it has been shown that the Anglo-Catholic and the Roman Catholic are in essential agreement upon the theological necessities integral to church government, this branch of Christianity may be described as Catholic. Another

26. Bea, Op.cit., p. 28.

27. Ibid., p. 29.

descriptive term may be introduced at this point to encompass the remainder of Western (non-Orthodox) Christianity.²⁸ Those Christian groups which do not base their forms of government upon the Historic Episcopate shall now be termed as Protestant. Following Skydsgaard, it must be understood that these two terms are abbreviations for the longer designations, "Catholic Christians" and "Protestant Christians". With this in mind, it is possible to use the two terms in the technically descriptive sense and leave aside any controversial or polemic connotations.²⁹

The question now arises as to the relative importance of those factors in Protestant church government which serve to divide and which serve to unite. Are the divisive factors of a fundamentally necessary nature and as such integral to the theological bases of church government? It is the contention of this study that they are not; on the contrary, the theological necessities integral to Protestant church government are held to be essentially unifying.

a. Scripture as the basis of authority

Protestants agree on the source of divine authority for church government. It has been shown that the New Testament is used as the sourcebook for justification of bishops in the episcopal churches, elders in the presbyterian churches, and pastors and deacons in the congregational churches. The differences are in interpretation rather than

28. Skydsgaard, K.E., One in Christ. (Philadelphia: The Muhlenberg Press, 1957), pp. 78-104.

29. Ibid., pp. 37-40.

in the original sources. All would agree on the primary importance of the Scriptures as the source of polity.

1) The episcopal view

The episcopal position is that the scriptures are of supreme importance as the normative element in all the Ekklesia's teachings. This arises from its essential character as "the verbal precipitate of the Church's primordial life", and as such keeps the Church Universal true to its historical roots.³⁰ "The Biblical documents should be viewed in the first instance as the archetypal and normative tradition, the authentic apostolic paradosis which must form and, where necessary, reform the later paradosis...."³¹ The Holy Spirit is the source for the authoritative Holy Scriptures, for he led the early Ekklesia to receive the Old Testament as divine instruction for Christians, caused the apostolic witness to be written down, and then caused this written form to be recognized as co-authoritative with the Old Testament.³² It is on this basis of scriptural authority that episcopal churchmen have maintained that the episcopacy is a valid and scriptural polity, but it is not maintained that this is either the only valid form or what it is specifically enjoined in scripture.³³

2) The presbyterian view

The close identity of the presbyterian view is apparent in the typical statement of the Presbyterian Church

30. Buchanan, C.O., ed., Growing Into Union. (London: S.P.C.K., 1970), p. 36.

31. Ibid., p. 37.

32. Ibid., p. 38.

33. Knox, Op.cit., p. 40.

in the United States. Speaking of the origins of presbyterian polity, it is officially stated that these "have their historic roots in the Protestant Reformation, which sought to reform the structure and life of the Church as well as the doctrine of the Church according to the Word of God".³⁴ Thus, Hodge can say, "We must be able to produce a 'Thus saith the Lord' for everything, whether a truth, or a duty, or a mode of ecclesiastical organization or action, which we make obligatory on the conscience of other men."³⁵ But he goes on to say that there is no scriptural warrant to be found for making an ecclesiastical organization a matter of conscience.³⁶ This is the traditional presbyterian position that their polity is agreeable to the Word of God but not jus divinum.³⁷ While it is insisted that presbyterianism is a scriptural form of government, it is readily conceded that other forms are found in the New Testament as well.³⁸

3) The congregational view

The other form of polity which developed into denominational distinctives following the Reformation was the congregational. It was from the Reformation that the Scriptures came to replace the institutional Church as the practical authority in all religious concerns, including the

34. Stated Clerk, ed., The Book of Church Order, 1964. (Richmond: The Presbyterian Church in the United States, 1967) p. 5.

35. Hodge, Op.cit., p. 122.

36. Ibid., p. 122.

37. Ibid., p. 131.

38. Bryden, W.W., Why I Am a Presbyterian. (Toronto: Presbyterian Publications, 1934), pp. 34-36.

new interest in the polity of the New Testament. The early congregationalists in their new-found dependence upon scripture tried to rigidly follow every detail of worship and organization which they saw in the apostolic record.³⁹ But this early emphasis has shifted to a more balanced view. The authority of the scriptures is still recognized; however, it is now conceded that there is scriptural room for adaptation and development.⁴⁰

4) United in principle

Thus, it may be seen that all three forms of Protestant polity are based upon the authority of the Scriptures. Two basic points stand out in this. First, the final rule for the governmental life and practice of the Ekklesia must be the principles found in the Bible. Second, it is recognized by Protestants that the application of these Biblical principles is a matter for broad interpretation and Christian tolerance rather than dogmatic narrowness. On this basis, it may be stated that dependence upon scriptural authority is the fundamental necessity integral to the theological basis of authority for church government. Protestant polity is unified about this necessary principle; it is divided only in the forms of expression.

b. The mission of the Ekklesia

Furthermore, Protestants are in fundamental agreement on the role of government for the fulfilment of the mission

39. Peel, Inevitable Congregationalism, p. 40.

40. Ibid., pp. 43, 44.

of the Ekklesia. It has been seen that the Christian view of the mission of the Ekklesia is salvation and edification; this, however, is one of the fundamental areas of disagreement between the Catholic and Protestant branches of Christianity.⁴¹ It has been shown that the Catholic position is that the Historic Episcopate is necessary for the fulfilment of the mission of the Ekklesia; without the episcopacy, there is no salvation, there is no edification. But the Protestant position may be shown to differ from this. The Protestant emphasis was not upon the government seeking to fulfil the mission of the Ekklesia; it was first of all upon the intensification and purification of religious belief and practice.⁴² However, the emphasis upon all Christians rather than the clergy alone was the necessary Protestant corollary to the first emphasis.⁴³ It is the contention of this study that Protestants are united, despite differences in the form of polity, in the belief that the government is an instrument rather than essential in the fulfilment of Christ's commission to his Church. This is a Protestant principle which is necessary and integral to the theological bases of church government.

1. The episcopal view

Episcopal churchmen show an historic and continuing concern for the completion of the task which Christ has given to the Church. It may be said that this concern has

41. George, C.H. and K., The Protestant Mind of the English Reformation. (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1961), p. 26.

42. Ibid., p. 27.

43. Ibid., p. 29.

been expressed in the use of authority as a tool. But it must be stressed that the Protestant episcopal emphasis would be upon the utility rather than upon the necessity of the episcopacy. This may be seen in a consideration of what makes a man a Christian.

This question is "one of fundamental importance, and one to which the Reformers of the Church of England gave much careful thought."⁴⁴ On the basis of a thorough and careful exegetical study of New Testament texts, Cole arrives at the conclusion that salvation is a result of personal faith in Christ, to which the sacrament of baptism is a confession before men.⁴⁵

"It is clear that water-baptism is the normal sign of entry into the Christian community of the New Testament; but it is also clear that that which makes a man a member of Christ is the faith which in baptism he confesses."⁴⁶

The Reformers of the Church of England took the Protestant view that salvation was not to be equated with sacramentarian action by the episcopacy. The sacramental question, which

44. Cole, Alan, The Body of Christ. (Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1964), p. 31. For the purposes of this discussion, the Church of England shall be considered as representative of the Protestant episcopal, if for no other reason than that the official Anglican position has been frequently confused with the Catholic position. This has led to a misunderstanding of the truly Protestant nature of the Anglican Church, as Hodge (Op.cit., p. 139) says, "Anglicans cannot envision salvation apart from communion with Bishops, and for this reason, they make the Bishop essential to the Church". By showing that this is not the case, other less "suspect" forms of episcopal churches will also be shown to be within the Protestant tradition.

45. Ibid., pp. 30-39.

46. Ibid., p. 36.

by its very nature involves the episcopate, centres in the distinction between "presbuteros" on the one hand, and "hierus" and "sacerdos" on the other, between the pastoral and the sacerdotal. "When at the Reformation the Church of England recovered its liberty of self-direction and self-government as a particular church, it had to decide what to do about the two very different meanings of the word, "priest"." The choice to be made was between the primary Apostolic meaning of presbyter and pastor and the secondary meaning of sacerdos. "The Church of England took it into its formularies and into its doctrine in its primary sense only. It was bound to do so in obedience to its principle of accepting Scripture as the standard of right belief."⁴⁷ On this basis, it may be affirmed that the way of salvation is held to be through faith, in the Protestant tradition, rather than sacramentarian action of the bishop, which is the Catholic tradition.

Not only was this rejection of the sacramentarian aspect of the episcopacy within the Protestant tradition, but the Anglican emphasis upon the place of the laity in the Church and its mission is also distinctively Protestant. The "Report on Anglican-Methodist Conversations" takes I Peter 2:9 as the authority for speaking of the "corporate priesthood of the whole Church".⁴⁸ The life-long adherence of Wesley to the Anglican Church is well-known; equally well-

47. Fisher, G., The Anglican-Methodist Conversations and Problems of Unity. (London: Oxford Univ. Press, 1964), p. 14.

48. Ibid., p. 13.

known is his zeal for the mission of the Church, which caused him to state, "The world is my parish".⁴⁹ It was this emphasis upon the mission of the Ekklesia which not only caused him to take the world as his personal parish, but which also caused him to emphasize the role of the laity, and to provide for this role in such distinctive expressions as the class-meeting⁵⁰ and lay-preachers.⁵¹ This was the practical application of Cranmer's statement on the Christian priesthood, "The difference between the priest and the layman...is only in ministration".⁵² But what of the opposing views of the ministry and the episcopacy within the Anglican Church?

These views are accepted with toleration because of the comprehensive nature of the Anglican Church.⁵³ However, two matters should be understood. First, these views of the episcopacy and the ministry are not to be held as official. "...those Anglicans who do not adopt Tractarian views of the ministry and sacraments have a right to ask that these comparatively recent intrusions (*italics mine*) into the historic ethos of Anglicanism should not be regarded as the quasi-official view of the Church."⁵⁴ Second, by taking this unofficial view of the episcopacy, the Tractarians

49. Sparrow, S., John Wesley and the Church of England. (London: S.P.C.K., 1934), p. v.

50. Tenney, M.A., Blueprint for A Christian World. (Winona Lake, Ind.: Light and Life Press, 1953), p. 230.

51. Rigg, J.H., Church Organization. (London: T. Woolmer, 1887), p. 223.

52. Green, Op.cit., p. 85.

53. Ibid., p. 87.

54. Ibid., p. 87.

place themselves in the Catholic tradition, but this should not be allowed to obscure the fact that the official Anglican position is vitally Protestant.⁵⁵

On this basis, it is possible to state three things concerning the episcopal view of the role of the government in the mission of the Church. First, the mission of the Ekklesia is salvation and edification, both of which are dependent upon personal faith rather than sacramental ministry. Second, by freeing the episcopacy of its "stigma" of sacramentarianism, it is possible to recognize the valuable service to be rendered by bishops, as spiritual and administrative leaders, while at the same time maintaining the proper emphasis upon the ministry of the laity. Third, the episcopal view of the role of the government in the fulfilment of the mission of the Ekklesia is truly Protestant.

2) The presbyterian view.

It is now possible to turn to the consideration of the presbyterian polity. The Reformation roots of the presbyterian churches have already been shown; the expression of this Protestant tradition in the role of the

55. The argument concerning the Protestant/Reformation character of the Church of England is limited only to the official position on the episcopacy. The Anglo-Catholic wing comprises only fifteen per cent of the Church of England. The composition of the Church of England is analyzed by Neill in his book, Anglicanism, p. 402. The Bishop of Woolwich deplores the Anglo-Catholic view of the episcopacy as a "gimmick for validating the sacraments".. (Green, Ibid., 87).

polity as it affects the Church and its mission must now be examined to determine the points of unity and division with other Protestants.

It is recognized that the responsibility of the Church is the advance of the cause of Christ, to carry out God's plan for the redemption of mankind.⁵⁶ This is a point of unity; however, it leads to a point of difference with other Protestants. Whereas the episcopal churchman would emphasize the authority inherent in the episcopacy as a tool for mission, the presbyterian would emphasize the order inherent in the eldership as the most effective tool for both evangelism and edification. The piety and ability of a Christian man were given their reward in his ordination as an elder, an "office-bearer with a divine calling in the Church as representing his fellow-members".⁵⁷ Protestant emphasis upon ordered equality and responsibility is seen here. There was the assumption of the office...this emphasizes the fact of responsibility in ordered service. There was also the representation of his fellow-members...this emphasizes the fact of ordered equality. Order in equality and order in responsibility are integral to the presbyterian view of the role of government in the mission of the Church. The eldership, with its parity between the ruling and teaching elders, is the result.

"Because the Church is formed by One Spirit into one Body with Christ, the participation of the Church in the ministry of Christ is primarily

56. Gettys, Op.cit., p. 84.

57. Henderson, Presbyterianism, p. 71.

corporate. Thus the ministry of the Church refers primarily to the royal priesthood which pertains to the whole membership of Christ's Body."⁵⁸

There is a unity of the Spirit in which Christ the Head can place in order each member of the Body "according to a diversity of function and in a mutual subordination of love."⁵⁹

It was this emphasis upon a corporate priesthood and a diversity of ordered function which sprang from a rejection of the corrupt form of episcopal government and led to the establishment of the presbyterian polity for the fulfilment of the mission of the Church.

"In the eldership, Renaissance individualism was consecrated to the service of Christ and to Christian witness in the world. The reformed scheme not only endowed the layman with a new sense of vocation in his ordinary occupation and his home life, but brought to his notice rights and responsibilities in connection with organized religion."⁶⁰

Calvin and subsequent reformers took this new awareness on the part of the Christian man and molded it into a truly Protestant polity of ordered responsibility and ordered equality, and then used this presbyterian form of government as a tool for the fulfilment of the mission of the Church.

3) The Congregational view

Where the presbyterian emphasis in polity was upon order, the congregational emphasis could be characterized as a polity of local initiative for the fulfilment of

58. Torrance, T.F., Royal Priesthood. (Edinburgh: Oliver and Boyd, Ltd., 1955), p. 35.

59. Ibid., p. 88.

60. Henderson, Presbyterianism, p. 70.

Christ's commission. Congregationalism can legitimately claim that the Reformation brought to the fore the local church as "the focal point of the Church Universal...It is from this local frontier-post that the world mission of the Church must be pursued".⁶¹ Here again is seen the concept of utility rather than necessity; a means rather than an end. The genius of congregational polity is that it is designed to bring the Gospel into the local area through the local church. The local church is thus operative on the very grounds in which are formed the most enduring values of life, the "primary" groups found in the family, the neighbourhood and other small, intimate forms of group association.⁶² The former fragmentary and unitary isolation of the early congregational churches has passed away with the relief from persecution and other historical factors which helped shape the earliest polity. This has been replaced with a new willingness to co-operate and receive advice, all of which will benefit the local church because it belongs to the One Church. Nevertheless, the local church is in itself competent to make the final decision in all matters affecting its faith and practice.⁶³ It is felt that this local autonomy and its resulting local initiative is most beneficial in promoting the cause of Christ, for it is a visible witness that "not organization, not machinery, make a Church, but Spirit and life."⁶⁴

61. Goodall, N., The Local Church. (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1966), p. 9.

62. Horton, W.M., Our Christian Faith. (Boston: Pilgrim Press, 1945), p. 99.

63. Peel, Inevitable Congregationalism., p. 74.

64. Ibid., p. 79.

Two points of emphasis are evident here. Inasmuch as the local church is autonomous (with its own officers and a functioning body of believers) and competent within itself to make its own final decisions on its own matters, it is a microcosm of the greater Church of Christ. But this autonomy and self-competence are recognized to be relative and not absolute, to be derived from the grace of God and not self-generated.⁶⁵ This first point is complemented by the second: The autonomy of the local church, and its resultant local initiative, is given by the presence and power of the Holy Spirit, for the purpose of service in "the one household of faith and fellowship".⁶⁶

The congregational polity, it may thus be seen, is based upon Spirit-initiated autonomy for service, upon God acting through local initiative for the fulfilment of God's purpose in reconciling the world to himself through Christ and his Church.

4) United in principle

This study of the role of church government in the fulfilment of the mission of the Ekklesia has shown that Protestants are united about the scriptural principles brought to the fore by the Reformation, that the government of Christ's Church is an instrument for the salvation of sinners and the perfection of saints. This instrument must always be a tool for service rather than a self-perpetuating machine; a means and never an end. Within the framework of this

65. Forsyth, P.T., Congregationalism and Reunion. (London: Independent Press, 1952), p. 51.

66. Ibid., p. 51.

Protestant principle there are three major forms of expression...the instrument molded in different shapes for the same service. The episcopally-governed churches express and fulfil their concern for the mission of the Church through authority. The obedience to Christ's command to preach, baptize and disciple is expressed by presbyterians through the order inherent in the eldership and the Presbytery. Congregational polity emphasizes the local initiative of the local church for the service of the universal Church whose head is the universal Christ. The Protestant churches are divided in the expression which is given through their polity, but far more important, the Protestant churches are united in the fundamental principle that polity is a means to serve Christ and fulfil his commission to his Church.

c. The esse of the Ekklesia

The role of church government in forming, shaping and perpetuating the esse of the Church is the third of the theological bases of church government to be considered. The fundamental question is whether the Ekklesia is the source of the polity or whether the polity and government is the force which maintains and shapes the Ekklesia as a basic constitutive factor.

1) The episcopal view

The episcopal churches which are truly Protestant take a very clear position on this question. Article XIX of the Anglican Church defines the visible church in terms of a worshipping congregation.⁶⁷ This is echoed by

67. Knox, Op.cit., p. 41.

Article XVI of the Free Methodist Church. "The visible Church of Christ is a congregation of faithful men, in which the pure Word of God is preached, and the sacraments are duly administered, according to Christ's ordinance, in all those things that of necessity are requisite to the same."⁶⁸

Flew quotes:

"Since the Gospel brings victory over sin and death, God has knit together the whole family of the Church in heaven and on earth in the communion of saints, united in the fellowship of service, of prayer and of praise; and the Church on earth looks forward to the vision of God, the perfect consummation of its present fellowship in the life of heaven."⁶⁹

These statements are in sharp contrast to the Catholic position, which has been shown to make the Church dependent upon the ministry and especially upon the hierarchy.⁷⁰ It is necessary to emphasize that the episcopal view, when stated properly and with clear understanding of the official position, would give full recognition to the place of other polities in the life of the Ekklesia, while reserving the right to follow the episcopal polity as the one which is felt to best express the bene esse of the Ekklesia.

2) The presbyterian view

The presbyterian view of the role of church government in relation to the nature of the Church Universal may be seen to correspond with the episcopal in all major points. Hodge states:

"The Protestant doctrine which makes the profession of the true religion the only essential of the

68. Kendall, W.S., ed. Book of Discipline. (Winona Lake, Ind.: Free Methodist Publishing House, 1964), p. 13.

69. Flew, Op.cit., p. 261.

70. Knox, Op.cit., p. 41.

Church is neither arbitrary nor optional. It is necessary and obligatory. We must hold it and must act upon it, or set ourselves in direct opposition to the Word of God. It arises necessarily out of the undeniable scriptural principle, that nothing can be essential to the Church but what is necessary to salvation."⁷¹

Two points should be stressed in this. First, the esse of the Ekklesia is not equated with polity; it is equated with the necessities for salvation. Second, this statement is based upon the authority of the Scriptures, which have already been shown to be determinative for presbyterian polity.

It may be said that presbyterians have, both on the basis of their traditions and as a result of their essential understanding of the Christian faith, possessed a very exalted view of the Church Universal. Inasmuch as it is the product of the activity of the Holy Spirit, it is radically and essentially different than any human organization. The Ekklesia is the Body of Christ, Christ's appointed means of salvation, the fellowship of the saints...but the Ekklesia is never to be equated with any one institution, either in the sense that the Ekklesia and the institutions are co-extensive or in the sense that the Ekklesia is co-determinous with that institution's privileges, claims or powers.⁷² This is borne out in practice by presbyterian recognition of other denominations, the acceptance of certificates of baptism and transfer of membership through letter.⁷³

71. Hodge, Op.cit., p. 139.

72. Bryden, Op.cit., pp. 141, 142.

73. Gettys, Op.cit., p. 81.

In all of this, presbyterians are in the mainline of Protestant belief and practice. The presbyterian polity is an expression of the life of the Ekklesia, but it is never held to be the sine qua non for the shaping, forming or perpetuating of the nature of the Church.

3) The congregational view

Congregational principles for polity and government, in their effect of localizing the Church, have resulted in the rejection of congregationalism by many who would be willing to recognize the merits of other polities. Thus, Bishop Henson wrote to a junior priest of his own church, "Avoid congregationalism like the plague."⁷⁴ The Assembled Church movement is classed by Troeltsch as belonging to the "sect-type" of Christianity. This is because organization is minimized in favour of personal experience and because of the principle of voluntarism as opposed to state support.⁷⁵ Institutionalism is replaced by the necessity of a person-to-person confrontation with God, which in turn makes church government an expression of church life rather than the source of church life.⁷⁶ Early congregationalists rejected the episcopacy of their time and replaced it with the concept of "government through friendship."⁷⁷ To them, the Ekklesia was founded simply on the living presence of Christ

74. Routley, Erik, Congregationalists and Unity. (London: A.R. Mowbray & Co. Ltd.), p. 10.

75. Troeltsch, E.E., The Social Teaching of the Christian Churches. (London: MacMillan & Co., 1931), Vol. II, pp. 694f.

76. Torbert, Op.cit., p. 17.

77. Routley, Op.cit., p. 10.

with his people. And as these people met in Christ's name and were led by the Holy Spirit, the concept of self-government by redeemed Christians became the governing principle of their polity.⁷⁸ The cry of the French revolution emphasized the very things held dear by the early congregationalists..."Liberty, Fraternity, Equality". But the thing which kept the congregational movement from the anarchy which degraded the French Revolution was the balancing and corrective emphasis upon the presence of Christ and the leadership of the Holy Spirit. "Ubi Christus ibi ecclesia" is the guiding principle of congregationalists in any discussion of the effect of polity upon the nature of the Church.⁷⁹ Because Christ is present in their churches, congregationalists claim validity for their polity as an expression of Christian life. And it would be at the same time conceded that other churches have valid government as they have the presence of Christ.⁸⁰

4) United in principle

A comparison of the episcopal, presbyterian and congregational views of the place of church government in forming, shaping and perpetuating the nature of the Church shows a fundamental agreement that polity and government are of the bene esse, not the esse of the Church Universal.

78. Selbie, Op.cit., pp. 2-4.

79. Ibid., p. 3.

80. Brent, Charles, H., ed., Can the Churches Unite? (London: The Century Co., 1927), Wm. Barton, "The Congregational Churches and the Lausanne Conference", pp.44ff. For a full statement on this, consult especially the "Declaration on Unity" embodied in this article, pp.61-65.

There are differences in polity, but these differences emerge as differences in expression of church life, which is agreed to be life in Christ.

d. Relationships within the Ekklesia

Perhaps the most difficult area in which to find a basic theological unity for Protestant forms of government is that of relationships within the Ekklesia. It is at this point that the episcopal, presbyterian and congregational polities would seem to be truly antithetical. The episcopal polity would seem to lead only to vertical and linear relationships, while presbyterian and congregational polities would seem to make a triangular relationship, balancing to varying degrees the vertical and horizontal.

1) The episcopal view

The ideal in the relationships of the churches, according to Lightfoot, is based in the priesthood of the believer. Other organizations, whether religious or secular, have restrictions on their members; in the ideal Ekklesia the individual believer has at all times direct access to the Head himself.⁸¹ However, even with this ideal before Christians, it must still be admitted that there is a need for organization within the Church. In actual fact, no society of men could hold together without officers, without rules, without institutions of any kind, and the Church of Christ is not exempt from this universal law. "The ideal cannot supersede the necessary wants of human

81. Lightfoot, Op.cit., p. 1.

society, and if crudely and hastily applied, will lead only to failure."⁸²

Thus, even within the early Ekklesia, there was a structure, an organization, not to debar the individual believer from his rights of access to Christ, but to hold together the entire society and thus facilitate the believer's access to God. Within the episcopal forms of government, this structure takes the form of a hierarchy. Modified episcopal churches work through a modified hierarchy, but the bishop is the unifying figure in all episcopal churches.

The role of the bishop is one of great authority which places him in a unique relationship to the ministry and the laity. It is easy to confuse religious authority with civil authority. Civil authority exists to enforce obedience to the laws of the state; religious authority exists as a power to influence belief or conduct.⁸³ The general view of the episcopal churchmen concerning the role of authority as a bishop should wield it, and as it has been distorted at various times, may be seen in the following statements. Authority, "as inherited by the Anglican Communion from the undivided Church of the early centuries of the Christian era is single in that it is derived from a single divine source..."⁸⁴ It is then shown that this divine source is single in nature but diverse in expression.

82. *Ibid.*, p. 2.

83. Simon, Glyn, ed., *Bishops*. (London: Faith Press, 1961), p. 18. "The Office and Work of a Bishop" by E.R. Morgan.

84. Fisher, G., *Report on Lambeth Conference, 1948*. (London: S.P.C.K., 1948), pp. 84-85.

Upon this diversity of expression, "the authority of the bishop may be seen to stem from and express itself in a dispersed rather than a centralized authority, having many elements which combine, interact with, and check one another."⁸⁵

The distortion of episcopal authority may be seen in the contrast between "the highly centralized authority of the Roman Catholic Church and that of the undivided Church of the early Christian centuries."⁸⁶ The distortion of the episcopal relationships makes it impossible to avoid a completely vertical and linear relationship within the Body of Christ. However, the Protestant episcopal view of relationships corrects this in these terms:

"God, who is our ultimate personal authority, demands of all his children entire and unconditional obedience. As in human families the father is the mediator of the divine authority, so in the family of the Church is the bishop, the Father-in-God, wielding his authority by virtue of his divine commission and in synodical association with his clergy and laity, and exercising it in humble submission, as himself under authority."⁸⁷

The obedience expected and given to the episcopacy in this type of relationship is not based upon fear of punishment but upon Christian love. Canon law, as with all forms of church constitutions, provides a standard for the exercise of authority, but the loyalty commanded shows itself only in voluntary obedience.⁸⁸

85. Ibid., p. 85.

86. Simon, Op.cit., p. 19.

87. Ibid., p. 19.

88. Ibid., p. 20.

2) The presbyterian view

The Protestant rejection of the corrupted episcopacy which replaced rather than reformed the hierarchy has resulted in two distinctive expressions of church life, the presbyterian and the congregational. An examination of the presbyterian principles shows that relationships within the Ekklesia was an important theological basis of church government. In the previous discussion of fundamental presbyterian principles, it was shown that the priesthood of the believer, the rights of the people, and the parity of the clergy all bear to a distinct degree upon this. Equality in Christ and under him was the new emphasis, as may be seen in Campbell's statement that in all meetings of the church "the vote of the layman from the remote township is equal to that of the great city preacher."⁸⁹ Gettys would make a part of any basic definition of a presbyterian church the fact that there is government by elders elected by the congregation. He emphasizes that even in the higher church bodies both the layman and the clergy have equal representation and equal vote.⁹⁰

But this emphasis upon equality in Christ is balanced by an emphasis upon equality under Christ. It is this principle that whether in the church or in the state all men are equal before Christ and as such are equally subordinate to Christ which is embodied in Melville's statement to James VI:

89. Campbell, T.G., Op.cit., p. 12.

90. Gettys, Op.cit., pp. 9-10.

"And therefore, Sir, as divers times before, so now again, I must tell you, there are two Kings and two kingdoms in Scotland. There is Christ Jesus the King, and His kingdom the Kirk, whose subject King James the Sixth is, and of whose kingdom not a king nor a lord, but a member."⁹¹

This emphasis upon the Kingship of Christ also bears a presbyterian theme which cannot be overlooked, the theme of discipline. Equality in privilege also brings equality in responsibility, which is seen in the emphasis upon discipline traceable to the time of Calvin. This is not only discipline in the sense of regulation of conduct and life, but also in the broader sense of church polity.⁹² The relationships within churches with presbyterian polity are carefully regulated and guaranteed by written documents. This is to ensure, within the limits of legislation, that is to say, dependent upon general observation of the regulations, that the basic relationships of disciplined equality are maintained within the life of the church.

3) The Congregational view

As the presbyterian expression of church life was a rejection of the undesirable extremes to which episcopal authority had been carried, so the congregational churches also placed new emphasis upon the place of the individual believer within the church. This emphasis upon the individual Christian is felt to be the "form to which Church life naturally and inevitably reverts when Christian men and women, finding either civil or ecclesiastical rule intolerable

91. Peel, Op.cit., p. 41.

92. Book of Church Order, 1964, p. 5.

to conscience, come together in societies for mutual edification."⁹³

Two things may be emphasized from this statement. First, the people who came together were Christian. The congregational ideal was founded upon the New Testament teaching that members of the Ekklesia should be Christian, both in their relationship of salvation in Christ, and their freedom from worldly association which would compromise this saving relationship.⁹⁴ Second, the New Testament Church was based upon Christian fellowship, the concept of koinonia as worked out in daily life. Congregationalism tried to recapture this primitive fellowship, which included the fullest emphasis upon equality.⁹⁵ The equality of all is based upon a common experience of personal relationship to Christ, equality of the saints based upon the communion of the saints.

"And the members of the same hold a happy fellowship as the members of the one body, serving one another by their gifts and graces and sustaining one another's needs in mutual charity. And this is called the communion of saints."⁹⁶

Inasmuch as there was this emphasis upon equality in Christ, two things were emphasized. The first emphasis is negative: No one is greater than his brother. Office in the Ekklesia conveys responsibility rather than privilege, duty rather than rank. Moderators have come into being within the Congregational Church, and other congregational

93. MacKinnal, Op.cit., p. 47.

94. Selbie, Op.cit., p. 2.

95. Ibid., pp. 3,4.

96. Peel, Op.cit., p. 18.

bodies have developed varying forms of superintendence.

However, the puritan and congregational standard that "all power in ordained persons is 'ministerial, not magisterial'" still effectively operates to circumscribe actual power.⁹⁷

But this negative emphasis stems from a positive emphasis which is found at the heart of the Protestant ethic: The sole ruler of the Ekklesia is Jesus Christ and there can be no compromise of his crown rights.⁹⁸

It is now possible to state that the congregational concept of the role of government in the relationships within the Ekklesia is distinctive in its emphasis upon individuality as the basis of equality and fellowship. But this is not a contradiction of the Protestant spirit; this is an emphasis of degree which is yet true to the Protestant recovery of the priesthood of the believer. As such, there is ground for unity rather than division.

4) United in principle

This is true of all three Protestant polities. Relationships are all referred to the ultimate government of God. The episcopal churchman emphasizes the role of the bishop as a Father-in-God; this need not obscure the fact that God is the Father, the final authority in the family of God, and that all men in Christ are brothers. The presbyterian churchman emphasizes equality in Christ through subordination to Christ, and endeavours to maintain this

97. Routley, Op.cit., p. 20.

98. Selbie, Op.cit., p. 3.

through legislation, based upon the activity of the Holy Spirit within the Church. The congregational churchman bypasses definitive legislation and depends upon the Holy Spirit as the guarantee for koinonia and equality.

3. Catholic and Protestant polities theologically exclusive.

This portion of the study has shown thus far that Catholics and Protestants have basically different positions on those fundamental necessities integral to the theology of church government. The distinction between Catholics and Protestants is seen, not in denominational labels, but in these theological distinctives which may be summarized as acceptance or rejection of the Historic Episcopate. Catholics agree that the Historic Episcopate is a fundamental necessity integral to the authority for church government, the completion of the mission of the Church, the maintenance of correct relationships within the Church, and for the very preservation of the esse of the Church. Protestants agree together that the Scriptures are the primary source of authority for any polity. They would also agree that government must necessarily spring from the life of the Ekklesia as an expression of that life, and that government is a tool for the fulfilment of the mission of the Ekklesia. Finally, Protestants agree that relationships within the Ekklesia are all referred to the ultimate government of God, who is the final authority and source of equality. This basic dichotomy between Catholic and Protestants may be further shown through an analogical analysis of the dividing

unifying factors involved in the theological bases of church government.

B. An Analogical Analysis of Governmental Philosophy

Once again, it is possible to use the corresponding relationships between political government and church government as a basis for this analogy.

1. Antithetical governmental philosophies

Political government may be divided into distinct types. This division is based upon a basic polarity of governmental philosophy which expresses itself in two fundamentally antithetical political systems. There is the political concept of monarchy and the political concept of democracy. It must be stressed that there are forms of monarchy and forms of democracy; nevertheless, the two types are of such a nature that the monarchy and democracy are antithetical. This antithesis may also be found in the two basic forms of church government. The Catholic form of government is based upon the monarchy. The Protestant form of government is based upon democracy.

a. Philosophy of authority.

The first difference is seen in the philosophy of authority to govern.

1) The catholic/monarchical philosophy

The classical theory of the monarchy would insist that the king ruled by divine right. The king was ultimately the representative of the gods or God. This may be seen in David's punishment of the Amalekite who killed Saul,⁹⁹

99. II Samuel 1:1-16.

or in the ideas expressed in the Royal Psalms.¹⁰⁰ Alexander, in like manner, executed the regicides who had hoped to gain favour by killing Darius, saying that only a king had the divine authority to kill another king. The authority to rule was based on divine appointment which could be withdrawn only by God. In effect, the king was the regent of God and the people are placed under his authority, to follow without question, for to question the king was to question God.¹⁰¹

The Catholic theory of the basis of church government closely parallels this. The divine right of kings would here be transmuted into the divine right of bishops.¹⁰² The Catholic agreement upon the necessity of apostolic succession as the only source of divine commission, and most particularly, the Roman interpretation of Matthew 16:18, places the source of authority for church government as Christ's establishment of the episcopacy.¹⁰³ Pius X, in the encyclical Vehementer Nos (1906) said, "as for the masses, they have no other right than that of letting themselves be led, and of following their pastors as a docile flock." Leo XIII stated in Denzinger 1936c (1890) that the

100. Gunn, George S., Singers of Israel. (London: Lutterworth Press, 1963), p. 31.

101. Grigson, Geoffrey, ed., Ideas. (London: Grosvenor Press, 1956), pp. 116-117.

102. It should be noted that the argument here is not concerned with the possible identification of misuse of this divine right. Historical misuse, whether in political or ecclesiastical government, is incidental to this study; the emphasis is upon the fact of the theory as a basis for government.

103. Skydsgaard, Op.cit., pp.96ff.

duty of the laity is that of "echoing image-like the voices of their masters."¹⁰⁴ If the source of authority for church government does lie in Christ's commission of the historic episcopate, this is logically correct.

2) The protestant/democratic philosophy

However, the Protestant view of authority for church government rejects the "divine right" theory as thoroughly as does the democratic view of political government. In the political sense of government, democracy insists that authority to govern rests upon the will of the governed. This theory of governmental authority takes diverse forms of expression, ranging from constitutional monarchy to representative democracy and even to the city-states of ancient Greece. The unifying factor is the insistence that power lies with the people, that government depends upon the consent of the governed.

In Protestant churches, the authority of government rests ultimately in God's revelation, which in turn is interpreted to show the priesthood of the believers. It is in the priesthood of the believers that Protestants find ground for the democratic concept that the power for government rests upon the consent of the governed. This

104. Knox, Op.cit., p. 41. It may be objected that these statements are not representative of the changed climate in Roman Catholicism, and that those who do not accept the Bishop of Rome will not accept this idea at any time. It is not a question of who said this, although Roman Catholics would submit as to any Ex Cathedra statement; the important thing is the logical outcome of the presupposition of "divine right" based on apostolic succession.

forms the human side of Protestant authority for government. The principle of the priesthood of the believers is one of the fundamental expressions of the Reformation spirit. The establishment of the liberty of the Christian man and the abolishment of the rule of the clergy were continuing expressions of this. With the democratic concept of equality before God came the insistence upon self-rule under God. This Protestant emphasis upon authority for government on the human side as resident in the people of God has taken as many forms of expression as have the differing political expressions of democracy.

a) The episcopal expression

The episcopal system may be likened to a constitutional monarchy. The Anglican Communion embraces many Churches, of which the Church of England is only one. As an established Church, the Church of England has more non-democratic features than do most episcopal churches.¹⁰⁵ But within the non-established Churches of the Anglican Communion, episcopal elections are generally made by an electoral body, composed of representatives of the bishops of the province, of members of the subordinate clergy, and of representatives of the diocesan laity.¹⁰⁶

105. This is not to say that the Church of England is fundamentally undemocratic. For a full discussion of the democratic elements within its episcopal government, cf. Neill, Anglicanism, pp. 435-440.

106. Simon, ed., Op.cit., "The Election of a Bishop" by N. Sykes, p. 64.

"Thus, the three elements observed in the early centuries of the history of the Church have been restored; the faithful laity, the clergy and the episcopate, presenting a due balance of diocesan and provincial interests and of people and clergy."¹⁰⁷

The modified episcopal bodies are even more democratic, in the sense of greater parity between clergy and laity, and developed checks and balances. British Methodism is based upon mutual checks and compromises.

"From its earliest legislation after the death of Wesley, in which it recognized and adjusted the rights of ministers and lay-officers and members, of Circuits, of Societies, and also the Conference, it has worked on this principle."¹⁰⁸

Smaller Methodist bodies in America, such as the Free Methodist Church, have led the way to full recognition of the spiritual and administrative authority of the episcopacy within the limits of constitutional government by the laity and the clergy.¹⁰⁹

b) The congregational expression.

Congregational polity stands at the other end of the democratic spectrum. Selbie points out that the right of each member to give expression by voice and vote to what he believes to be the will of Christ shows the democratic ideal within the congregational movement.¹¹⁰

The principle of consensus within the congregational meeting for the ordering of the common life and refusal to accede to pressures from without the local congregation is a true

107. Ibid., p. 64.

108. Rigg, Op.cit., p. 235.

109. Kendall, ed., Op.cit., pp. 144-147.

110. Selbie, Op.cit., p. 104.

mark of congregational churches.¹¹¹ However, this insistence upon unitary government was founded upon the belief that the Ekklesia is a body of believers consecrated to the service of Christ, i.e., the expression of the priesthood of the believers on the local level, recognizing their authority for self-government through the indwelling Christ.¹¹²

c) The presbyterian expression

In turning to the presbyterian polity, one is surprised to find Henderson referring to the institution of the eldership as an aristocratic body.¹¹³ The very structure of the presbyterian churches would preclude an aristocracy in the sense of a dominant body which proceeds without regard to the wishes of the governed. Gettys emphasizes that authority to govern does not come from the top downward, as in the Catholic Church, nor does it reside only in the congregation, but that the local church is governed by elders elected by the congregation, with organic relationship to other churches. The organic relationships of presbyterian congregations reside in the duly elected representatives of the congregation in the appointed church courts.¹¹⁴ On the basis of this location of authority, it seems legitimate to designate presbyterianism as church government through representative democracy. Here again,

111. Torbet, Op.cit., pp. 29-30.

112. Selbie, Op.cit., p. 104.

113. Henderson, Presbyterianism, p. 62.

114. Gettys, loc.cit., pp. 9-10.

the representation of all the people by the elected eldership is an expression of the authority for church government as seen to reside, on the human level, in the people as part of the complete expression of the priesthood of the believers.¹¹⁵

d) Protestant unity of philosophy

In summary, then, it may be seen that Protestantism bases the authority for church government, on the human level, upon the scriptural teaching of the priesthood of the believers. This has led to democratic forms of polity, as opposed to the monarchical polity of Catholic Christianity. However, the democratic ideal within Protestant churches has expressed itself in varying ways, even as there are different political expressions of the democratic ideal within the nations. These Protestant expressions are seen in three basic forms. There is democracy as represented by constitutional monarchy; the episcopal polity reflects this form of democracy. There is also democracy by representative government; this is seen in the presbyterian churches. Finally, direct democracy, such as was present in the city-states of ancient Greece, is found in congregational polity. Whichever form of these democratic polities is followed, there is unity to be found in the Protestant emphasis upon the priesthood of the believer as the source of human authority for church government.

115. Henderson, The Scottish Ruling Elder, p. 12.

b. Philosophy of relationships

There is not only a correspondence in the concept of the source of authority, there is also a correspondence in the concept of relationships.

1) The Catholic/monarchical philosophy

The concept of fundamental distinction in the society to be governed is essential to both the monarchy and the Catholic polity.

This may be seen in the very nature of the authority of the monarchy. Inasmuch as the king derives his authority by divine right, only God is above him. He is elevated and above, separated and distinct from his people. He rules, they are the ruled. The king exercises his authority, the people are the object of this exercised power. Even so, if the bishops are held to have "divine right" as the source of their authority, they exercise their authority upon the people, who are thus set off from them and subject to them. Furthermore, as shown above in the discussion on the relationships within the Church which are the necessary result of the Historic Episcopate, the relationships are consistently vertical and linear. The result of this is a hierarchy of distinction, based first of all on the concept of divine right and then worked out in practice by the establishment of a graded nobility, the ecclesiastical parallel of the political institution.

2) The Protestant/democratic philosophy

The concept of relationships held by democrats and Protestants is diametrically opposite to this. The concept

of fundamental equality in the society to be governed is essential to democracy and Protestant polity. The concept of self-government is dependent upon equality. In a democracy, the governed are the source of governmental authority, and this prevents those who govern from claiming an autocratic distinction. The only distinction is that distinction of ability which is founded in, and validated by, the choice of the people in election to office. In the Protestant polity, the same principle is operative, whether in the constitutional monarchy of the episcopacy, the representative democracy of presbyterian polity, or the direct democracy of congregationalism. Neill speaks of this in discussing the inherent equality which precludes a relationship of privileged distinction within the Church of England. The bishop has the privilege to "guide, to counsel, to warn; but the last thing that he can be is an autocrat or a dictator..." Those Protestants "who fear prelacy would be much consoled if they could realize how little it is within the power of the English bishop to be prelatical."¹¹⁶ If this be true of the Church of England, it is surely true of other Protestant churches.

c. Philosophy of mutual effect

In this consideration of these comparisons between governmental forms, political and ecclesiastical, one must also ask if there is a correspondence in the concept of the effect of government upon the society to be governed.

116. Neill, Op.cit., p. 440.

1) The catholic/monarchical philosophy

The concept that the nature of society is dependent upon the nature of government is essential to both the monarchy and the Catholic polity. The essential nature of the monarchy demands that there be a monarch. Without a monarch, society must inevitably take some other form.

The same is true of the Catholic concept of the Church as a visible society. It has already been discussed above that the nature of the Ekklesia is dependent upon the Historic Episcopate for its very constitution as the Ekklesia. Thus, the parallel holds true. Without a monarch, there is no monarchy; without a bishop, there is no Ekklesia.

2) The Protestant/democratic philosophy

It was this very concept which was rejected in the Reformation. The concept that the nature of the government is determined through the nature of society is essential to democracy and it is this concept which is also found in Protestant polity. Democracy may be said to spring from two sources. First, there is the philosophical concept that all men are created equal. The second is a corollary of the first; inasmuch as all men are created equal, the authority for government is residual in the people. Thus, in a democracy, there is room for the creation of great variations in political format. But it is the people who determine the nature of the government rather than the government determining the nature of society. The Protestant philosophy of polity is closely correspondent to this, with one necessary exception. It is recognized that Christ is the

Head of the Church and that the Scriptures are his revealed constitution for the Church's government.¹¹⁷

Thus, there is necessarily a divine aspect to the formation of polity which is not necessarily observed in the formation of a government in a political democracy. The parallel thus must be shown on the human side.

The concept of, first of all, fundamental equality, and secondly, the concept that governmental authority is resident in the people gives rise to the various forms of democracy. In a democracy, based of necessity on these concepts, there may be a prime minister or a president, there may be a bi-cameral legislative body or a uni-cameral; all are forms of democracy.

On the basis of these same concepts, expressed in the Protestant doctrine of the priesthood of the believers, Protestants can determine for themselves if they wish to be overned by bishops, ruled by elders, or operate as congregations. Whichever polity they choose, they are still societies within the Society, churches within the Church.

d. Philosophy of governmental purpose

Finally, it may be shown that there is a correspondence

117. The Protestant position is summarized by Hodge.

"There are fixed laws in the Bible, according to which all healthful development and action of the external Church are determined. But...it is not tied down to one particular mode of organization and action, at all times and under all circumstances...There are certain things prescribed, to which every church ought to conform, and many things in which she is at liberty to act as she deems best for the glory of God and the advancement of his kingdom...everything is not prescribed...every mode of organization is not either commanded or forbidden." Hodge, Op.cit., p. 122.

in the concept of the role of government in the purposes of society.

1) The Catholic/monarchical philosophy

The concept that attainment of the purposes of society is dependent upon the government is essential to both the monarchy and the Catholic polity.

The purposes of the monarchy may include liberal ideals for the benefit of the people who are governed. Not all monarchs would agree with the absolutist concept expressed by Louis XIV, "I am the State."¹¹⁸ However, a fundamental purpose of any monarchy is the preservation of the monarchy. This cannot be done apart from the royalty itself. The intrigues and marriages of Henry the Eighth are a classic example of this.¹¹⁹ The parallel between kings and bishops lies not in histories of intrigue to maintain position but in the concept that as the monarchy must depend upon a royal heir for continued existence, so the Ekklesia must depend upon the Historic Episcopate for the salvation of souls and the perfection of the saints. In both cases, the government is essential to the purposes of the society.

2) The Protestant/democratic philosophy

The Reformers rejected this aspect of the necessity of the Historic Episcopate, even as the early democrats rejected the entire concept of monarchy. Government as a means rather than an end is a concept essential to both

118. Nault, Wm. H., ed., The World Book Encyclopaedia. (Chicago: Field Enterprises Educational Corp., 1966), Vol. I, p. 16.

119. Hackett, Francis, Henry the Eighth. (London: Reprint Society, 1929), pp. 9-12.

democracy and the Protestant polity. Political parties in a democracy operate as an expression of the differences in political philosophy, but these differences are subordinate to the democratic concepts of freedom and equality. They are a means to the realization of the goals of democracy rather than those goals themselves. In the same way, episcopal, presbyterian, and congregational polities operate as expressions of differences of Christian opinion as to the best way to advance the cause of Christ. But these differences are subordinate to the Headship of Christ and the leadership of the Holy Spirit. In this way, polity is always a means to the realization of the Great Commission rather than a purpose in itself.

2. Governmental philosophy as a source of identity

Monarchy and Catholic polity have been shown to be parallel in their concepts of authority for government, relationships, the nature of society as affected by government, and the role of government in the purposes of society. It has also been seen that there is a parallel in these concepts between democratic philosophy and Protestant polity. It may thus be said that there is a correspondence between antithetical political systems which serves to distinguish and identify Catholic and Protestant polities. There are obvious differences in Protestant polities, but these differences are put into proper perspective by the consideration of these differences as compared to those factors which unite all Protestants. It is these unifying factors which are the fundamental necessities integral to the theological bases of church government.

III. THE PRAGMATIC ADAPTATION OF PROTESTANT POLITY

Inasmuch as the three forms of Protestant polity are united in the fundamental necessities integral to the theological bases of church government and differ only in expression of that which is necessary, it may be seen that there is no theological barrier to pragmatic adaptation of expression in polity. In speaking of "pragmatic" adaptation, it is necessary to set forth two limitations. First, the pragmatism used here is not an expression of relativism, such as is expressed in Protagoras' maxim, "Man is the measure of all things; of what is, that it is; and of what is not, that it is not."¹²⁰ Second, it is not a rejection of absolute values, such as is implied in Jamesian Utilitarian Pragmatism. This would establish effectiveness as the test of truth.¹²¹ The pragmatism advocated here is the use of practical effectiveness as the test of desirability, within the conditioning and limiting sphere of the activity of the Holy Spirit.

A. Two Basic Factors in Pragmatic Adaptation.

Within this limitation, there are two basic factors which are of importance.

1. The historical factor.

The first of these is the historical factor, which would include those religious, economic and political factors which have helped shape Protestant polity. Historical factors are of importance to polity and the introduction of

120. Grigson, ed., Op.cit., p. 302.

121. Ibid., p. 302.

differing historical factors may be a causative agent for the pragmatic adaptation of the polity of Protestant churches. It may be shown that this has been the case in the past.

a. The primitive church

The first obvious example of historical factors as they affected polity may be seen in the picture of the primitive church in its operation within the Roman Empire. The governmental philosophy was absolutism, Caesar was to be worshipped as a god, the early Christians were largely of the lower classes...these were three determinative factors. The persecution of Christians by Jews and Romans led to the formation of "cellular" churches, each independent and localized.¹²² This was a product of the historical factors, and was emphasized by the economic conditions which made it impossible to have large temples or similar buildings. Peel suggests that there was yet another factor in the historical milieu which caused the formation of the congregational-type churches. This was the religious factor of the expectation of the imminent parousia...there was no need for a more developed polity if Christ were coming soon.¹²³

b. The Reformation churches

Turning from the primitive church to Reformation churches, it is also clear that historical factors were at work in the formation of polity.

122. McKennal, Op.cit., p. 47.

123. Peel, Inevitable Congregationalism, p. 42.

1) Rejection of the episcopate

The state-church relationships of Lutheran countries, such as Sweden, Norway and Denmark, stem from the Reformation rejection of the episcopate. The bishops were replaced with consistories, which have both civil and ecclesiastical functions. Since the king of the countries appoints the members of the consistories, he has great influence, if not final power, in their activities. Here is history at work within the polity of the Lutheran churches.¹²⁴ Polity was also influenced in Geneva by just such historical considerations, as Calvin and the other reformers rejected the power of the bishops.¹²⁵

2) Congregational development

The congregational churches came into being not only from spiritual motives but also as a result of historical circumstances. Forsyth states:

"Our protests arose in a stormy time. And the protesters shared many grave errors with their opponents, which are now outgrown all around. Our plea and protest naturally took at first an extreme form, since it faced a very thorough antagonist. We claimed the entire autonomy of the local Church."¹²⁶

Notice Forsyth's emphasis upon both the historical element and the fact that there has been a change in present circumstances.

It was this historical element of persecution which caused many of the Independents and Dissenters to flee to

124. Hodge, Op.cit., p. 113.

125. Ibid., p. 114.

126. Forsyth, Op.cit., p. 47.

America. Their emphasis upon what they had endured for their convictions within their historical milieu is a challenge to modern Christians. Higginson said, in a sermon preached on May 27, 1663:

"Our Fathers fled into this Wilderness from the face of a Lording Episcopacy and Human Injunctions in the worship of God. Now, if any of us their children should yield unto, or be instrumental to set up in this Country, any of the Ways of Men's Inventions, such as Prelacy, imposed Liturgies, Human ceremonies in the Worship of God, or to admit Ignorant and Scandalous Persons to the Lord's Table, This would be a backsliding indeed!"¹²⁷

Increase Mather speaks of the regard for polity which comes from persecution:

"There ought to be a singular Regard unto Truths of this Nature by us in New England, above what may be affirmed of men in any other Part of the World, since our Fathers were persecuted out of their Native Land, and fain to fly into the Wilderness, for their testimony thereunto...that they might enjoy a 'pure discipline and Church State', exactly conformable to the Mind of Christ, revealed in the Holy Scriptures."¹²⁸

Cotton Mather emphasized:

"It was with regard unto Church Order and Discipline that our pious Ancestors, the Good old Puritan Non-conformists, transported themselves and their Families, over the vast Ocean to these goings down of the Sun. On which account, a Degeneracy from the Principles of pure Scriptural worship and Order in the Church, would be more Evil in the Children of New England, than any other People in the World."¹²⁹

Oakes reviewed the formation of congregational polity in the following statement from his election sermon of 1673:

127. Dexter, Op.cit., p. v.

128. Dexter, Op.cit., p. v.

129. Ibid., p. vi.

"The Church of God hath been recovered by degrees from out of the anti-Christian apostacy. The Reformation in King Edward's days was then a blessed work; and the Reformation of Geneva and Scotland was a larger step, and in many respects purer than the other; and for my part I fully believe that the Congregational way far exceeds both, and is the highest step taken toward reformation, and for the substance of it, is the very way that was established and practiced in the primitive times, according to the Institution of Jesus Christ."¹³⁰

It was this combination of historical factors as well as religious convictions which was instrumental in shaping the sentiment expressed in the Congregational hymn:

"And still their spirit, in their sons, with freedom
walks abroad,
The Bible is our only creed; our only monarch, God!
Therhand is raised, the word is spoke, the solemn
pledge is given,
And boldly on our banner floats, in the free air
of heaven,
The motto of our sainted sires...and loud we'll
make it ring...
A CHURCH WITHOUT A BISHOP, AND A STATE WITHOUT A
KING!"¹³¹

But when these factors are no longer operative, is there a special sanctity about the polity per se? If the bishops no longer have the power to be prelatical and if the monarchy has changed in form and intent, is the polity of identical urgency? Even more important, what of Asian countries without this background of historical factors?

3) Presbyterian development

The same operation of historical factors may be traced in the development of presbyterian polity in the Church of Scotland. Much of the controversy centered about Erastian claims and Scottish rejection of these claims.¹³²

130. Ibid., p. vi.

131. Ibid., p. vi.

132. Cunningham, loc. cit., pp. 290ff, pp. 470ff.

It was the monarchical ideal of one nation and one church which was put in danger by rejection of the Reformers on doctrinal grounds. The kings were interested in politics; the Reformers were interested in spiritual life. The result was controversy.¹³³ If the controversy in the political realm has been decided, what are the grounds for continued rejection of the ecclesiastical polity involved? It would seem that the episcopacy, apart from what has been termed the Historic Episcopate, is no longer the bete noire of former days.¹³⁴ With the passing of the limiting historical factors, there is room for new consideration of pragmatic and theological factors.

4) Historical hermeneutics

There is an historical factor at work in the present time which is an influential corrective to many of the errors of the past. This factor is the development of a newly-historical hermeneutic. Forsyth says, in contemplation of reunion between Anglican and Congregational churches, and speaking specifically to the problem of special claims made for the episcopacy, "...there is a great change in the claim that is made...the change of prerogative prelacy to constitutional, and almost republican, episcopacy."¹³⁵ He then emphasizes that this is of great importance to congregationalists, for it deals directly with their conviction that polity and the ministry arise from the Ekklesia as a matter

133. George, Op.cit., p. 309.

134. Torrance, T.F., Royal Priesthood. (Edinburgh: Oliver and Boyd, Ltd., 1955). pp. 103-108.

135. Forsyth, Op.cit., p. 56.

of order and not of grace. The credit for this is given to the "new habit of treating history neither ecclesiastically nor anti-ecclesiastically but historically. It is due to the growth of a scientific knowledge of the New Testament and of Church History...".¹³⁶

The development of this new hermeneutics, based upon the best of current scholarship and fed by the vast range of new factual discoveries as to the development of the scriptures, must have its effect upon the approach of all churches to the questions involved in polity. Would the interpretation of modern presbyterians be the same as that of those Reformers who stated in the Gallican Confession of 1559, "We believe that this true Church ought to be governed by that Discipline which our Lord hath established, so that there should be in the Church, pastors, elders and

136. Ibid., p. 56. It would seem that this historical hermeneutic would meet the objection of Margull to what is termed as "structural fundamentalism." In an article in the International Review of Missions for October, 1963, "structural fundamentalism" is described as the overemphasis upon the morphe or body of organization with the resultant neglect of the underlying principles, and the failure to make allowances for the effect of history and historical understanding. The result of this is said to be the formation of an immutable congregational structure, one which is not subject to the corrective effects of historical questioning and consideration. Thus, the form itself would become sacrosanct, and change or alteration of the historical structure would be equated with a violation of the nature of the Ekklesia.

One may agree with the thrust of Margull's argument on the structure of the congregation, but at the same time regret the unfortunate use of the term "fundamentalism", with its pejorative connotations. A more positive and rewarding emphasis is upon the historical hermeneutic which is advanced by Forsyth.

deacons"? How much agreement is there today with the statement of the Scots Confession, 1560, "Ecclesiastical discipline uprightly ministered" is one of the notes of the true Church?¹³⁷

5) Historical continuity

Yet another historical factor which must be considered is to be found in the question of historical continuity. There is a very real danger that continuity may be enshrined, that because practices have the patina of age they then become endued with the glow of divine institution. Conservatism may be a necessary and beneficial characteristic or attitude, but it must never be allowed to degenerate into a reactionary reverence for practices which may be recommended only by tradition. On the other hand, an extreme attention to new attitudes and practices can be equally unprofitable; change should not be advocated for the sake of change.

The development of the three distinct forms of church polity is linked together, in each case, by what Hatch calls the "strong bonds of historical continuity", and consists of phases which merge with each other in almost imperceptible transition.¹³⁸ There is justification for each change based upon historical circumstances which forced modification of past practices by the exigencies of a new age.¹³⁹ Having

137. Ibid.

138. Hatch, Edwin, The Growth of Church Institutions. (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1887). p.5.

139. Ibid., p. 5.

stated this principle of historical continuity, Hatch then sounds a note of caution. "The ecclesiastical institutions which have come down to us are, even more than the political institutions, a sacred inheritance which we may legitimately endeavour to improve, but which we cannot lightly abandon."¹⁴⁰ This may be complemented by a realization that "polity is a matter of...sacred utility, the ability to serve the Kingdom of God and not a revealed constitution."¹⁴¹

The factor of historical continuity calls the attention of the Ekklesia to three things. First, all polity is a product of continuous development. Second, it is unwise to lightly abandon the developments of the past, for they have served the Ekklesia well in their time. Third, our institutions constitute a "sacred inheritance", but this is to be regarded as a matter of "sacred utility", not given as a revealed constitution but concerned with the ability to serve the Kingdom of God. Our "sacred inheritance" has come down to Christians in the West; these Western, historically and socially-conditioned ecclesiastical institutions have not come down to the Asian churches as they have to the Western. Would it not be wise, for the sake of the Kingdom of God, to determine what is Western and what is Christian?

¹⁴⁰. Ibid., p. 6.

¹⁴¹. Forsyth, Op.cit., p. 27.

2. The social factor.

Recognition of social factors must be included in any re-examination of polity.

"Since church growth takes place in the multitudinous societies of mankind, essential to understanding (church growth) is an understanding of their structures. Men exist, not as discrete individuals, but as interconnected members of some society. Innovation and social change, operating in particular structures, play a significant part in determining the direction, speed and size of the move to the Christian religion."¹⁴²

The structure of Western and Asian society is filled with antitheses. Western society has been conditioned by many centuries of Christian thought and practice. As a result, the Ekklesia is a basic and constitutional social factor. The same is not true of Asia. There, Christianity is not an indigenous religion; it is an exotic innovation. Innovation and social change, and the interaction of Christian Gospel and non-Christian society, are important to the advance of the Kingdom of God.

a. The Apostolic Church

This may be seen in the history of the Apostolic Church. Christianity at that time was not organized with a view to the conditions through which it had to live during the centuries. The immediate was the concern, for it seems to have been the expectation of those early Christians that the imminent return of Christ precluded planning for more than a few generations at most. But the

¹⁴². MacGavran, Donald, Understanding Church Growth. (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans Press, 1970), p. 183.

Ekklesia had to live on when the Apostles were dead, it was left to expand throughout the Roman world, and it exists as a missionary force in the world today. Peel suggests that its "continued life was contingent upon its power to adapt itself to the varying situations in which it was placed."¹⁴³

But even during the Apostolic Age, the Ekklesia had to adapt itself to the pressures of social change through the development of polity and administration to meet particular needs. The Jerusalem Church was faced with a religious problem based upon the conflict of two social groups, the Jews and the Greeks, within the one Church. The solution of this crisis was the appointment of the seven deacons (Acts 6:1-7), which "may be regarded as an innovation sanctioned by the Spirit to meet a particular need."¹⁴⁴ Social pressures continued to operate as a factor in the development of the Ekklesia even after the death of the Apostles.

Lightfoot states that there were three basic reasons found in the social structure of second and third century civilization and Christianity which caused the development of an authoritarian polity such as the episcopacy. These were: 1) Confusion of speculative opinion; 2) Distracting effects of persecution; 3) The growing anarchy of social life.¹⁴⁵ It is held that the development of the

¹⁴³. Peel, Inevitable Congregationalism, p. 42.

¹⁴⁴. Thornton, Op.cit., p. 60.

¹⁴⁵. Lightfoot, Op.cit., p. 83.

episcopacy was progressive but uneven, hindered or accelerated "according to national temper or characteristics,"¹⁴⁶ that is, by the interaction of social factors. The later development of the diocesan bishop was also a result of social factors.

The force of circumstances was such that at the time of the evolution of this institution there was no other option. It was the only system possible. The clergy was saved from Arianism and the laity from paganism because this system was instituted to meet the peculiar needs of the time.¹⁴⁷

b. Post-Reformation churches.

It is also possible to trace the influence of social factors upon the growth of later churches, and to show that these social factors were closely related to the question of polity and church growth.

1) Methodism in Scotland.

Campbell examines the work of Wesley in Scotland and the growth of Methodism, and comes to the conclusion that Methodism did not grow in Scotland because "Presbyterianism, as a system, is evidently that which suits the genius of the people of Scotland as a whole."¹⁴⁸ He further traces the factor in Methodist polity which was the great detriment in the Scottish social milieu. "The itineracy is largely responsible for the slow growth of the cause in Scotland."¹⁴⁹

146. Ibid., p. 73.

147. Hatch, Op.cit., p. 40.

148. Campbell, Relations, p. 136.

149. Ibid., p. 135.

But the opposite effect of the itineracy may be observed in a study of the American frontier.

2) Presbyterians in frontier America

Reference has already been made to the problems of presbyterian churches in the American frontier society.

MacGavran analyzes this, and concludes that:

"The rugged individualism of the American people a hundred years ago was developed by the frontier. Baptist, Methodist and Christian (Disciples of Christ) churches, because of their system of creating leaders and certain other traits fitted the frontier temperament, grew better than Episcopal and Presbyterian Churches."¹⁵⁰

c. The unique self-image.

The contrast between the success of the presbyterian system in Scotland at the expense of the Methodist and other churches, and the opposite results on the frontier, may be explained in terms of what MacGavran designates as "the unique self-image".¹⁵¹

"Each society, finding itself in certain physical, economic, and political circumstances, develops a characteristic culture and self-image...which makes it different from every other society."¹⁵² There are three basic factors to note in the development of this self-image...physical, economic, political. Where these factors combined to form a self-image suitable to presbyterian polity in Scotland, different combinations of these factors formed a self-image which found other polities more acceptable in the American frontier society.

150. MacGavran, Understanding Church Growth, p. 184.

151. Ibid., pp. 183, 184.

152. Ibid., p. 183.

Time inevitably makes a change in this unique self-image, which will in turn affect the suitability of any particular polity. It is now being recognized that the self-image in America has been conditioned by so many new social factors that churches are forced to re-evaluate their entire approach.¹⁵³ This re-evaluation will necessarily include the validity of forms of polity within the new social environment.

1) Operative in English Reformation

Yet another facet of this question may be illustrated through a reference to the Reformation in England. The development of the Church of England was not merely, nor even primarily, instituted for religious reasons. Apart from Queen Mary, the monarchs of England from Henry VIII through Charles I were individuals of moderate religiosity at most, and their primary interest in the Church was "the better securing and maintaining of the political unity and stability of their domain."¹⁵⁴ Thus, the hierarchical polity of the Church of England was connected with national politics. The primary advocates of this particular church were in the upper strata of society. At the same time, the development of the Assembled Church movement was in progress among what were generally the lower classes of English society. Congregationalist strength was found among the poor, and the rise of Independency was among the lower classes.¹⁵⁵ Baptists were among the early supporters of

153. Ibid., p. 184.

154. George, Op.cit., p. 309.

155. Dale, Op.cit., pp. 79, 222-227.

Cromwell,¹⁵⁶ and it was, in general "the inspired common folk" who fought in Cromwell's army.¹⁵⁷ In the struggle between the Establishment and the common folks, it is possible to trace, not only political opposition between the classes, but also affinity to forms of polity, as influenced by social factors. The rich, educated, and socially-privileged saw episcopacy as a desirable polity; the poor, uneducated, and disfranchised saw congregationalism as a desirable polity. What is of significance for this study is not the social rights and wrongs involved in this conflict; it is necessary only to observe that within the one society there were two disparate social levels which found satisfaction in churches characterized, among other things, by great differences in the forms of polity. Why should this be so?

There are, simply speaking, different societies within a national society which respond to the Gospel within the totality of their social milieu.

"The normal man is not an isolated unit but part of the whole which makes him what he is...society either determines or strongly influences every aspect of what he says, things or does. Consequently, when we comprehend the social structure of a particular segment of a total population, we know better how churches are likely to increase and ramify through it."¹⁵⁸

156. Torbet, Op.cit., p. 46.

157. George, Op.cit., p. 17.

158. MacGavran, Understanding Church Growth, p. 183.

B. Pragmatic Adaptation and the Holy Spirit

There are these obvious differences within the societies, differences with both historical and social origins. These historical and social factors have always had their effect upon the Ekklesia. The differences within Christianity, its historical evolution, and its present forms may be traced to the "nature of Christianity itself," for God intended Christianity to be both "universal and permanent, to spread through the entire world and be limited by neither time nor locale".¹⁵⁹ Inasmuch as this was God's plan and design,

"It was also designed to adapt its outward forms to the inevitable changes of human society, and... its institutions were meant to be modified when it gathered new races of men into its fold, and came into close contact with new elements of human life."¹⁶⁰

This is the pragmatic adaptation urged in this study, practical effectiveness within the particular historical and social milieu as the test of desirability, within the sphere of the conditioning and limiting activity of the Holy Spirit. When speaking of pragmatic adaptation, it is this definition which must be kept to the fore.

It is in connection with this question of adaptation of church structures that the World Council of Churches has been holding a series of studies on the theme, "The Missionary Structure of the Congregation". Margull reports on these studies, not in the sense of presenting finished

159. Hatch, Op.cit., p. 4.

160. Ibid., p. 4.

conclusions, but rather, to show some of the problems which have been encountered. One of these problems is that which is termed "heretical structures".¹⁶¹

"Heretical structures" are described as having characteristics which tend to prevent the fulfilment of the intended goal of the Gospel. "Structures are heretical when they prevent the congregation from penetrating every geographic and social realm, thus standing between the Gospel and the world."¹⁶² It is said that heresy lies in the threat to the Gospel. Thus, there may be theological threats to the Gospel, and there may also be structural (practical) threats to the Gospel. Among those "heretical" structures described by Margull are the following:

- 1) Structures which isolate the congregation from the world rather than keep it open to the direction of the Holy Spirit;
- 2) Structures which promote the congregation as an end in itself;
- 3) Structures which concentrate the charismata upon the pastor rather than strengthening these in all their bearers.¹⁶³

All of these have direct relevance to any discussion of church structures as they affect church growth. Nevertheless, the concept of "heretical" structures brings to mind

161. Newbiggin, Lesslie, ed., The International Review of Missions. Vol. 52, 1963. "Structures for Missionary Congregations", by J.H. Margull, pp. 433-446, 440.

162. Ibid., p. 440.

163. Ibid., p. 440.

questions which are not satisfactorily answered within the body of the study report by Margull. These would seem to demand further thought and discussion before one accepts the idea of church structures as "heretical" because they retard or prevent church growth.

First, the use of "heretical" to describe church structures must be questioned on semantic grounds. Heresy is "religious opinion opposed to the authorized doctrinal standards of any particular church, and tending to promote schism". It is also defined as "an opinion held in opposition to the commonly received doctrine, and tending to promote division or dissension."¹⁶⁴ On the broader scale, heresy is further defined as "an opinion or idea that contradicts the beliefs of...a closely-knit organization."¹⁶⁵

In reading the study reported by Margull, one is struck by the close identity of purpose between research on missionary structures and the present study. Therefore, the use of "heretical" in describing structures is felt to be an unfortunate choice of terminology. The emphasis of this present study is upon the fact that church structures are adaptable according to different situations and different demands simply because church structures are based upon theological principles rather than upon theological dogma. If one were to inject such theological content into the structures of the churches that one could label any given structure as "heretical", the purpose and arguments advanced

164. Bethel, ed., Op.cit., p. 387.

165. Nault, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 9, p. 197.

in both these studies would be seriously jeopardized. Unless one were to completely re-define "heretical", proper semantic usage would seem to preclude the concept of "heretical" structures.

Closely connected to the semantic problem raised by such usage is the practical problem of determining the standard of truth for the judgment of church structures. If heresy, as traditionally defined, is the contradiction of accepted standards of truth, especially as held within religious circles, to label structures as "heretical" or "non-heretical" on the basis of their relationship to church growth is to make church growth the standard of truth. Would this not come very close to Jamesian Utilitarian Pragmatism, already rejected above, for this would seem to say, in effect, that if any church structure causes church growth, it is therefore "true"?

A practical illustration of this will perhaps show why such a standard is unacceptable. It has been shown that Methodism has not flourished in Scotland whereas presbyterian bodies form the largest denomination within the country. However, Methodism flourished on the American frontier while the presbyterian churches did not. If structures are heretical because they retard or prevent church growth, one could only say that Methodism was heretical in Scotland, for its modified episcopal polity and structure was a factor in the slow growth of the Methodist denomination. On the other hand, the presbyterian polity, with its previously discussed effect upon church growth,

would be heretical on the American frontier, while Methodist structures would be "true". This is the logical outcome of elevating practical results as the final standard of truth. "If it produces results, it must be true" is an unacceptable dictum.

It would seem far more acceptable to adopt a policy which would accept results as the test of desirability, rather than as the measure of truth.

Utilitarian effectiveness does not supersede spiritual demands or Biblical standards. The danger of pure pragmatism is seen in the Roman Catholic Church in the years of ante-Reformation monopoly or in such features as the Inquisition... efficiency without reference to spiritual values can lead to increasing corruption. The Christian test of pragmatism is not mere success in the human sense. Nor may it be said that pragmatically achieved ends justify the use of any means, in this case, the adaptation of polity, church government and administration. The Christian test of pragmatic truth is the resultant display of what Cole calls "characteristically Christian qualities".¹⁶⁶ These are the fruits of the Spirit, in New Testament Language, and these fruits include not only characteristically Christian qualities but also characteristically Christian results. "The great test that the Lord gave was, 'By their fruits ye shall know them'. (Matthew 7:20)".¹⁶⁷

166. Cole, Op.cit., p. 15.

167. Ibid., p. 15.

The work of the Holy Spirit in the modern age, as in all ages, is to guide both Christians and the entire Ekklesia. Cole feels that the modern emphasis upon the "Body of Christ" as the scriptural metaphor to describe the Church is clearly influenced by the theological and sociological climate of the times..."specifically, by the concern of the Christian community that has grown up in the face of modern secularism, Communism, and the breakdown of long-established social units."¹⁶⁸ (One may legitimately add that the related crisis in missions is also an influence.) It is the Holy Spirit who has directed the mind of the Church to this particular metaphor in this particular age; for the very work of the Holy Spirit is to stand by us as our Advocate in hours of need. (John 14:26, Matthew 10:19ff).¹⁶⁹

It is in this sense of the Holy Spirit's direction to a new consideration of the place of polity as an expression of the life force of the Body of Christ that Forsyth speaks of the three great Protestant polities, and urges Christians to "realize that all these three polities are members one of another. They make good for each other. They are all contributory to the fitness of the Body of Christ, and complementary in its glory."¹⁷⁰ The polities are not meant to be as rivals; rather, they are meant to "fill each other out in the economy of faith".¹⁷¹

¹⁶⁸. Ibid., p. 14.

¹⁶⁹. Ibid., p. 14.

¹⁷⁰. Forsyth, Op.cit., p. 53.

¹⁷¹. Ibid., p. 53.

IV. A SUMMARY STATEMENT

It has been the purpose of this chapter to examine the broadly inclusive theological bases of church governmental structures which were discussed in the previous chapter in order to determine what are the fundamental necessities integral to these theological bases of ecclesiastical polity.

This has been done through the consideration of the contention of this chapter that the doctrine of apostolic succession is of fundamental importance to the purposes of this study. It is held that the position taken concerning this doctrine is determinative of all other matters involved in the formation of theological bases for church government. The consideration of this doctrine of apostolic succession and its importance for church government has been approached in two separate studies.

The first approach was the use of a comparative analysis of the dividing and unifying factors involved in the theological bases of church government. This has shown that the Anglo-Catholics and the Roman Catholics are united on the necessity of the Historic Episcopate. Without the Historic Episcopate the Ekklesia cannot fulfill its mission nor can it maintain the proper relationships within the Body of Christ. Authority for church government is residual in the Historic Episcopate, and the very nature of the Ekklesia is dependent upon the maintenance of the apostolic succession as the basis of the episcopacy. Conversely, Protestants are seen to differ in the forms of expression

of church life as reflected in polity, but they do share a fundamental agreement on those elements which are fundamental, necessary and integral to the theological bases of church government. The Scriptures are seen as the necessary authority for any form of church government, while all forms of polity are regarded as merely means for the achievement of the great end toward which all Protestants work, the fulfilment of the mission of the Church. Protestants agree together that church government is an external expression of the internal life of the Ekklesia; the Ekklesia is the source of polity rather than polity acting as the source of the Ekklesia. Finally, Protestants agree on the relationships within the Church Universal, for all relationships are referred to the ultimate authority of God.

The second approach was the use of an analogical analysis of the dividing and unifying factors involved in the theological bases of church government. The basis of the analogy was found in the corresponding relationships between political and church government, as seen in two equally antithetical systems. The first correspondence between systems was found in a comparison of the monarchy and the Catholic polity. Authority for government is indivisible from the concept of "divine right". The concept of relationships is based upon the maintenance of fundamental distinctions within the society. The government is held to be fundamental and necessary to the nature of the society, and it is further held that without the government there can be no fulfilment of the purposes of society.

The second correspondence between systems was found between democracy and the Protestant polity. The concept of government through consent of the governed is essential to both democracy and Protestant polity. Fundamental equality is a concept which is essential to both democracy and Protestant polity, and the concept that the nature of the government is an expression of the nature of society is fundamental to Protestant polity and democracy. Finally, government is seen as a means for achieving the purposes of society rather than as an end in itself. It may thus be said that there is a correspondence between antithetical political systems which serves to distinguish and identify Catholic and Protestant polities. There are obvious differences in Protestant polities, but these differences are seen in proper perspective when considered in relation to those factors which unite all Protestants. It is these unifying factors which are the fundamental necessities integral to the theological bases of church government.

Inasmuch as the three forms of Protestant polity are united in the fundamental necessities to the theological bases of church government and differ only in the expression of that which is necessary, there is no theological barrier to pragmatic adaptation of expression in polity. Pragmatic adaptation was adopted as a test of desirability rather than of truth, and was seen to be the following of that course which was most effective in practice within a particular social and historical milieu. This was further safeguarded by the limitation that this pragmatic adaptation

must be initiated, conditioned and controlled by the Holy Spirit. The purpose of such undertakings must be for the advancement of the Kingdom of God.

It is now possible to draw three conclusions from this part of the study. First, there are basically only two theologically differentiated forms of church government, the Catholic and the Protestant. The point of division lies in the acceptance or rejection of the doctrine of apostolic succession. Second, Protestant churches differ in forms of polity, but these differences are expressions of an underlying agreement in the fundamental necessities integral to the theological bases of church government. Third, dependent upon the activity of the Holy Spirit, Protestants may undertake the pragmatic adaptation of their forms of polity, based upon the theological unities now seen to exist, and for the advancement of the Kingdom of God. This Christian pragmatism may be applied to the polity of the historic Western Churches, but it is even more important in the formation of the polities of the emerging Younger Churches of Asia.

CHAPTER THREE

PATERNALISM DEFINED AND ILLUSTRATED

I. PATERNALISM DEFINED

A. The Living Church

With the advent of the ecumenical movement, many Christians would feel that the concept of denominationalism as an exclusive channel for the life of the Church Universal must, at the very least, be reconsidered. How many Christians today would say, either in theory or practice, that their denomination is equivalent to the Church Universal?

Nevertheless, the question of the life of the Church Universal, its extent and its reality, is closely connected to the concept of church growth, whether in Asia or in any other part of the world. At the risk of creating a questionable dichotomy, one may ask, "Is church growth an extension of the denomination or is it an extension of the Church Universal?"

It is in this context that Whale asks, "What is a living church?"¹ This question is answered, at least in part, by Kirkpatrick, who holds that a living church is one which has sufficient resources in itself to maintain and expand its own life.² Or, in other words, a living church is one which has attained "self-hood".

-
1. Whale, J.S., What is a Living Church? (London: Edinburgh House Press, 1938), Title page.
 2. Letter from C.D. Kirkpatrick, General Secretary of the Mission Board, Free Methodist Church, written to the Executive Committee of the Hong Kong Free Methodist Church) October 18, 1968.

The concept of self-hood encompasses, and to some extent transcends, such concepts as Older and Younger Churches or Mission and Indigenous Churches. The emphasis shifts from chronology or organization to the particulars of the nature of the Church itself. Following Whale again, one may discern five features of the living church, the church which possesses inner resources for life.³

1. A church in action.

One may say that a primary characteristic of a living church is that it is a church in action. This encompasses two important meanings, only one of which is given by Whale. This first meaning defines a living church as an active church.⁴ Thus, a church which has potential for action, evangelistic or social, but which remains passive, would not be a living church, one which has attained self-hood. But underlying this is a concept which Whale fails to discuss, i.e., that a living church is necessarily a church in its activity...it acts as a microcosm of the Church Universal.

2. A believing church.

The activity of the church arises from the fact that it is a believing church.⁵ This is the second characteristic of a living church; first, it knows its beliefs and second, it has vital faith. There is a body of doctrine for its theological life; there is a spirit of

3. Whale, Op.cit., cf. chapter headings.

4. Ibid., pp. 73ff.

5. Ibid., pp. 26ff.

faith for its existential life. The first deals with Christian distinctives, while the second deals with Christian practice in such mundane areas as business ethics and responsibility for the pastor's salary.

3. A worshipping church.

The third characteristic of a living church is that it is a worshipping church.⁶ There is a direct communion with God, one in which the spirit and practice of worship spring immediately from the church itself. Thus, the church in the Philippines is not dependent for its worship upon the founding church in the West.

4. A witnessing church.

It is this possibility of partnership without dependence which distinguishes the witnessing activity of a church which has attained self-hood. Thus, the fourth characteristic of a church able to support itself from its own resources would be an independent witness.⁷ As in worship, the living church may well cooperate in this joint activity, but it is cooperation on the basis of maturity and equality rather than in the role of a satellite.

5. A world-wide church.

Action, belief, worship, witness...these all point to the fifth characteristic of a church which has within itself the resources for life. The living church is one which is a world-wide church.⁸ This would not be mere participation in a world-wide denominational or confessional

6. Ibid., pp. 41ff.

7. Ibid., pp. 58ff.

8. Ibid., pp. 15ff.

fellowship, with its inevitable questions of polity or historic confessions. Nor would it be a church conceived of in solely geographical terms. The emphasis is upon a geographical Church among the Churches which comprise the Church Universal. The Church in Japan and the Church in England would thus be Churches within themselves, mature and equal, living their lives as expressions of the varied life of the Church Universal.

It is beyond the scope of this study to examine all the barriers which must be overcome before a church does attain self-hood, before it possesses and exhibits these five characteristics. However, within the scope of this study of church government and administration, there is one barrier which may be studied at this time. This barrier is paternalism within the Mission Church.

B. The Living Church and Paternalism

1. Paternalism defined.

Paternalism may be defined as a relationship between parties involving care and control suggestive of that practiced by a father. This may also refer to the principles or practices so involved.⁹ Thus, in thinking of a living Church and paternalism, one must bear in mind a relationship, underlying principles, and resultant practices. These must be examined, either in part or as a whole, in considering the relationship between paternalism within the Mission Church and a living Church.

The most important point for immediate consideration

9. Bethel, ed., loc. cit.

is that of paternalism as a principle, or perhaps more accurately, as an attitude. In the Mission Churches, the attitude of both parties, the Mission and the Church, is involved to varying degrees. It is possible to have a paternalistic Mission organization and a Church which rejects paternalism; the converse is also true. But for the purposes of this discussion, in the interest of brevity, a dualism of attitudes will be assumed. The Mission takes the attitude that the immaturity of the Church makes it necessary for the Mission to act as a father. The Church takes the attitude that it is incapable of mature activity and thus accepts the Mission as its father. It is necessary to state this basic attitude in these rather simplistic terms, not because this attitude is characteristic of all Missions and all Mission Churches, but because paternalism blossoms in multitudinous hues but at all times grows from a common root.

2. Paternalism as a force for distortion.

Just as paternalism signifies a distortion of the parent-child relationship in all other phases of life to which it is applied, so it is used to describe the distortion of church life in the Mission Church. The relation of the Mission Society to the Mission Church and the relation of the missionary to the Christians with whom he works are included in this distortion.

Thus, there would be a belief, generally mutual on the part of the Mission and the Church, that immaturity would prevent the Church from assuming self-support. The father-

child relationship would also perpetuate Mission control of policy and practices, including control of, and responsibility for, the completion of the mission of the Church. Evangelism and nurture remain the concern and responsibility of the Mission rather than the Church.

The living Church, as discussed above, is a Church which has achieved self-hood. But paternalism distorts the relationships between the Mission Society and the Mission Church so that the Mission Church is hindered or prevented from achieving self-hood and becoming a living Church. This may be seen in the distortion of church structures through paternalistic practices and policies. Prior to this examination of the effects of paternalism upon the church structures of Mission Churches, however, it is necessary to show paternalism as a past and present problem in the life of the churches of Asia.

II. THE FACT OF PATERNALISM

A. Paternalism As An Attitude

It has been stated above that paternalism is an expression of an underlying attitude. It is felt that in actual fact, this attitude is generally dualistic. Paternalism exists where the missionary and the converts, or either party, have the necessary attitudes and express them in practice, either overtly or implicitly. The necessary attitude of the missionary is a feeling of superiority; on the part of the converts, this attitude is one of inferiority. This may be shown to be a true generalization.

1. Western feelings of superiority.

Missionaries came to Asia as a part of the wave of Western expansionism which marked the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. The relationship between the missionary enterprise and the cultural, economic and political expansion of the West, and the effect of this expansion upon missions, will be discussed below. It is sufficient at present to point out that many missionaries, when faced with the contrast between Western and Asian culture, especially when measured in terms of materialistic excellence, were tempted to view the culture of the East with condescension, if not with contempt.

Kraemer points out that in Indonesia, (and the same holds true for the rest of Asia) the people often do not understand a great deal of what is presented by the missionary, but that they do understand attitudes. What is demanded is a total surrender, "completely doing away with any actual or supposed superiority, whether cultural, intellectual, religious, moral or innate." He then goes on to say:

"To us Europeans, who always have a feeling of superiority, either deep down or visible at the surface, this is the condition hardest to fulfil. As long as I am in the Orient, this will be my daily struggle, and it will remain so until my death. With ever greater clarity I discover in myself a hidden pride and obstinacy which prevent my radical self-surrender."¹⁰

The descriptions of Chinese customs which are to be found in the letters and journals of earlier missionaries

10. Kraemer, Hendrik, From Mission Field to Independent Church. (London: SCM Press, 1958), p. 111.

to China are often filled with unfair emphases upon the evils of Chinese society. These unflattering estimates of Chinese life are typical products of the superiority feelings which are a constant temptation to missionaries.¹¹

It is just this type of superiority which caused the Dutch ministers of the Protestant Church to write to their Indonesian assistants, using "I command you,..." as the common preface for instructions in church matters.¹²

It would be this feeling of superiority which caused a missionary to remark, when an Indian pastor offered to shake hands with him, "This man thinks, that because he is a graduate and has put on European costume, I must shake hands with him!"¹³

Kraemer's confession to the constant temptation to feelings of superiority, and the examples cited above, are best viewed in perspective. While typical, they are neither the general state of affairs nor are they isolated instances.¹⁴ These overt expressions of superiority are not to be found in the profusion in which implicit expressions may be seen. Missionaries, with genuine fatherly concern, are convinced that national Christians are simply incapable of making the proper decisions, of providing the proper leadership, of giving the proper stability and aggressive outreach which is required. It was in this spirit that a

-
1. Lin, Shao-yang, A Chinese Appeal to Christendom Concerning Christian Missions. (London: Watts & Co., 1911), p. 60.
 2. Kraemer, Op.cit., p. 35.
 3. Edinburgh Conference, 1910, History Records and Addresses. (London: Oliphant, Anderson & Ferrier, 1910), Vol. IX, p. 311.
 4. Edinburgh, 1910, Vol. IX, Op.cit., p. 311.

missionary remarked to Bishop Azariah, upon the occasion of his consecration in 1912, "I only hope you do as little harm to the Church of India as you can!"¹⁵ There is also the problem of poverty, the problem of persecution, and the problem of lack of experience in self-government which are seen to make necessary the guidance of the missionary.¹⁶

Niles points out that missionary work is divided into three phases, recognizable by the relationship of the missionary and the church. In the pioneer stage, there is full control by the missionary. In the second stage, the missionary initiates a policy of devolution, in which the leadership and authority is gradually turned over to the converts. Finally, the Church is constituted as a self-sufficient body.¹⁷ The basic problem, which results in paternalistic structures, is in the difficulty in progressing beyond the pioneer stage. It was the observation of the Lord Bishop of Lahore that most missionaries, with the exception of the exceptional few, "fail very largely in getting rid of an air of patronage and condescension."¹⁸ Where the missionary wishes to be treated as a "father" and the converts wish to be treated as "children", there is little problem in maintaining a stable church program, but this program will be marked by paternalistic structures.

-
5. Graham, Carol, Azariah of Dornakal. (London: SCM Press, 1964), p. 39.
 6. Thompson, R.W., and Johnson, A.N., British Foreign Missions, 1837-1897. (London: Blackie & Son, Ltd., 1899), p. 214.
 7. Niles, D.T., Upon the Earth. (London: Lutterworth Press, 1962), p. 177.
 8. Edinburgh, 1910, Vol. IX, Op.cit., p. 309.

2. Asian feelings of inferiority.

Paternalistic structures are slowest to change when the converts accept them as necessary and desirable. If the converts feel that they are incapable of selfhood, the missionary is accepted as the necessary prerequisite for the life of the church. India has traditionally been the area in which feelings of inferiority and subservience in the church have encouraged paternalism. In South India, the psychology of the people is traditionally that of a suppressed people, for Christian churches have been built up from among the under-privileged sections of Hindu society. Thus, even the best-intentioned missionaries were looked upon as the equivalent of a foreign raj by the first South Indian Christians.¹⁹ The South Indian ministry was developed largely through the ordination of elderly men, considered a reward for years of faithful service in the role of teachers or catechists. They were naturally prone to dependence and subordination. Traditional group life, the strong personalities of the missionaries, and the mission machinery combined to form a dependent church.²⁰ When the union of churches into the South India United Church was being consummated in 1905, a missionary wrote, "The laymen are more keen on the Union business than the pastors. The latter, dear good slow old souls, love the old system where the pastor brought all his woes to the District missionary and prayed for an 'Order' to settle the dispute

19. Hollis, M., Paternalism and the Church. (London: Oxford University Press, 1962), pp. 40ff.

20. Ibid., p. 87.

(and his opponent) for ever."²¹

This feeling of inferiority is not merely an historical phenomenon. The President of a large Indian church, fully indigenous, but with a history of paternalism, wrote to his pastors:

"After becoming president in June of 1969, I was shocked to hear in meeting after meeting speakers rejoicing that once again there was a "white" president after twenty-five years of "black" regime. The frequent self-deprecating remarks about color and the repeated inferences that more can be expected of a Western leader than an Indian leader really disturbed me. It dawned upon me that what our church needs most is for our people to throw off their age-old feelings of inferiority (one of the worst aspects of the caste system), and to believe that as children of God they are just as able and capable of the highest ideals and attainments as are persons from the West."²²

He then goes on to say that the fact of the dwindling missionary presence is healthy, and to urge his pastors not to yearn after "the good old days".²³

3. Paternalism in Missions as an Historic Problem

1. Nineteenth century paternalism.

The nineteenth century was an age of paternalism in many areas of life, only one of which was that of missions. There was the paternalism of the industrial revolution, in which the well-intentioned industrialist treated his employees as children to be cared for.²⁴ Harriet Beecher

21. Sundkler, Bengt, The Church of South India: The Movement Towards Union, 1900-1947. (London: Lutterworth Press, 1954), p. 354.

22. A circular letter from Rev. W. Schmitthenner, President of the Andhra Evangelical Lutheran Church, distributed to his pastors, April, 1970.

23. Ibid.

24. Bethel, ed., "Paternalism", loc. cit.

Stowe's famous book, Uncle Tom's Cabin not only depicted the cruelties of Simon Legree but also reflected the liberal racism of plantation owners and other paternalistic slave holders. Paternalism did not bear the stigma now attached to such practices, and it is not surprising to find that paternalistic structures were very common to missions in Asia. A survey of churches in three countries will give a cross-section of these structures and practices.

a. Paternalism in China

Looking first at China, it is possible to note the presence of paternalistic structures in many missions. The work of British foreign missionary societies is said to have been pursued with the intention of establishing an indigenous church, but two trends are noticeable. First, generally speaking, the indigenous church was theoretically accepted, but "societies...have moved in the same direction...on their own lines of organization in various parts of the Empire." Second, the missionary has consistently played a paternalistic role, with few generalized exceptions.²⁵ Murray states that the Church in China is so extensively westernized, not because the Chinese wish it that way, but simply because the missionary takes it for granted that a Church should have these (western) things."²⁶ The Church Missionary Society endeavoured to build the church in two stages. In the first stage, the missionary was in control, but in the

²⁵ Thompson and Johnson, Op.cit., pp. 213-215.

²⁶ Jerusalem Meeting Record, Vol. III, p. 42.

second stage, there were District Committees of missionaries and Chinese, with the emphasis upon placing the life of the church in the hands of the Christians. However, the missionary was generally the chairman, and it was up to him to determine the constituency of the Council.²⁷ James recorded of the London Missionary Society that self-government and self-support have been steadily pursued, and by 1921, some parts of the country had workers who were equals to missionaries, who had previously acted as bishops.²⁸ Two things are noteworthy. First, the elevation of some workers to positions of equality with the missionaries, viewed as an accomplishment, was accomplished better than 100 years after the society had first entered China. Second, the position of the missionary as an acting bishop was taken for granted. C.T. Wang, one of the leading Christians of China in 1915, declared in view of the subordinate role of Chinese and the dominant role of missionaries in Church affairs, "the general public can hardly help believing... that the Chinese workers are mere employees of the foreigners."²⁹ In many ways, the missionary exercised a paternalistic episcopacy, in that he started the church on the local level, gave the work of the congregation over to the pastor (whom he appointed and paid) and the local

27. Goodall, Norman, A History of the London Missionary Society, 1895-1945. (London: Oxford, 1954), pp. 214, 215.

28. James, A.T.S., Twenty-Five Years of the L.M.S. - 1895-1920. (London: London Missionary Society, 1923), p. 21.

29. Oldham, J.H., ed., The International Review of Missions, 1916, Vol. V, C.T. Wang "Making Christianity Indigenous", pp. 75-86, p. 85.

office-bearers (whose election he supervised), and then returned for periodic visits. It was at these times that he administered baptism, took care of discipline, and corrected any mistakes which had been made.³⁰ Where there was an actual bishop, he acted exactly as he would in a European diocese. He had under him a number of white priests (the missionaries), who governed their parishes as they would at home. Paternalism might be seen in the relation of the workers to these missionaries. They stood in the same relationship to the white priest as would the curates or the layreaders at home.³¹ Methodist policy in South China reflected the unconscious paternalism of missionaries. The missionary was in charge of the circuits, which were composed of congregations taken care of by catechists.³² Thus, the office of missionary made him equivalent to a district or conference superintendent. At the turn of the century, the annual synod met in conclave and passed their decisions on to the Chinese workers. But this was "practically non-existent" as a representative body; it consisted only of the men missionaries. Later, the ministers in the local connection were recognized and they were able to take a small share in the business. By 1930, there was parity in number between foreigners and Chinese in the church boards, but the ordained ministry was

30. Gibson, J. Campbell, Mission Problems and Mission Methods In South China, (Edinburgh: Oliphant, Anderson & Ferrier, 1902), pp. 199-200.

31. Allen, Op.cit., p. 175.

32. Rose, J., A Church Born to Suffer. (London: Corgate Press, 1951), pp. 41-42.

represented largely by the foreigners. Among the Chinese, the laymen were most numerous.³³

b. Paternalism in India

Returning to the practice of paternalism in India, it may be seen that this has been both wide-spread and of long duration. Here, as in China, the missionary acted as a father to his children, thus occupying the role of a bishop if not the actual office. For example, it was regretted in a report to the Free Church of Scotland in 1860, that an important station in Madras District had never enjoyed the "benefit of a missionary's constant oversight."³⁴ This was remedied when the Madras District of the Free Church was reorganized in 1879, and what was virtually diocesan activity took shape under the direction of the new missionary.³⁵ A Free Church Mission in West Bengal, at the end of the nineteenth century, was led by a missionary with a great genius for organization, and so "felt the advantage of one who was practically, though not in name, the bishop of a diocese."³⁶ Whatever the denomination might be, in practice the foreign missionary dominated the scene with an almost patriarchal authority. The Christians called themselves by the name of some mission rather than by a denominational name. Thus, there were London Missionary Society Christians, Church Mission Society Christians, etc.,

33. Ibid., p. 71.

34. Hewat, E.K.G., Vision and Achievement, 1796-1956. (Edinburgh: Thomas Nelson and Sons Ltd., 1960), p. 95.

35. Ibid., p. 92.

36. Ibid., p. 76.

rather than Anglicans, Congregationalists, or Presbyterians.³⁷ Outstanding Indian Christians were taken into leadership and authority, but ranked as "assistant missionaries", thus becoming organs of the foreign missionary society rather than of the Indian Church.³⁸

Churches with congregational polity had often followed their traditional policy of local self-government in theory or principle, but seldom in practice. Speaking of the London Missionary Society, James says that the missionary occupied the position of an acting bishop at the turn of the century. The formation of a Mission Council with jurisdiction over the activities of the Mission was aimed to entrust a "large measure of power to the local churches as they grew to maturity." However, until at least 1920, the missionary was in the majority in the Mission Council by about two to one, and the Church Council had no control over two exceptions in the activity of the Mission...elementary education and church work.³⁹

The Anglicans also introduced machinery to build the authority of the Indian Church, but the missionary was the ex-officio chairman of these committees, and little was done to effectively "limit missionary autocracy."⁴⁰ Hollis points out that "the general pattern of colonial administration was that of a white autocracy and the missionaries followed it."⁴¹ For example, The Church Missionary Society

37. Firth, C.B., Introduction to Indian Church History. (Madras: Christian Literature Society, 1961), pp.252-253.

38. Ibid., p. 253.

39. James, Op.cit., p. 35.

40. Firth, Op.cit., p. 251.

41. Hollis, Mission, Unity and Truth, p. 90.

set up pastorates, with the pastor as the chairman of the church committee composed of an elected membership. These were to take care of all congregational needs. District Church Councils and a Central Council were also established, but the work was to be deliberative and consultative rather than executive in nature. The Society made grants to the Central Council but protected these by the retention of a veto. The work which this Council did was primarily referred to it through the Bishop and the Mission.⁴²

Methodists in Delhi established an annual conference to give equal voice and vote, seeking to make the pastors responsible to the conference, not to the mission. However, there was a dualism in the actual pattern of church administration. There was strong control by the missionary district superintendent and even more important, the Executive Board exercised strongly centralized financial authority, and thus effectively controlled the conference.⁴³

The tendency for the missionary to be an unofficial bishop (in the sense of oversight) was much more noticeable to the villager and to the workers than to the missionary. To the villager, any limitations upon the power of the missionary were vague or minimal, and the missionary occupied the place of "limitless" authority equivalent to the District Collector, who was rumoured at times to be responsible to someone else in a far-off place in the

42. Thompson and Johnson, *Op.cit.*, pp. 214, 215.

43. Hayward, V.E.W., ed., The Church as Christian Community. (London: Lutterworth, 1969), pp. 49-50.

government. All machinery remained hidden from the ordinary Christian; the missionary gave or refused. Thus, an Indian pastor in the Church of South India could lecture his congregation on the hierarchy of Christianity. First, there was the teacher, followed by the catechist, both of whom are responsible to the pastor, who is responsible to the missionary. Now that the Church of South India is in existence (since 1947), the bishop comes next, and only God is above him. Hollis comments on this story, pointing out that previously the bishop would have been omitted, and there would have been no effective method by which the Indian Christian could question the right of the missionary to speak for God.⁴⁴

The work of missionaries in China was an independent effort by concerned Christians in a land governed by its own people, although there were many concessions demanded and received by European powers. India differed from China in that it was under the authority of the British Empire; although the country was a colony, the work of missionaries was not directed, or even subsidized, by the government. It has been seen, however, that paternalistic practices were common to both these countries. It is now necessary to examine paternalism as it occurred in a different milieu.

c. Paternalism in Indonesia

Indonesia was brought under the control of the

⁴⁴. Hollis, Paternalism, pp. 47-48.

Netherlands in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries.

The Church entered Indonesia in alliance with the colonizing power which at that time was the Dutch East India Company.⁴⁵

Because of this unfortunately necessary alliance, the Church in Indonesia was Erastian and commercial in its orientation.

Mission work was dependent upon the Company for support,

for personnel, even for permission to operate. It is not surprising that results were unsatisfactory...less than one-tenth of the "Christians" were ever admitted to Holy

Communion.⁴⁶ Under the Constitution of 1830, the Dutch King

was given autocratic powers as head of all churches in his

dominion. This led to the uniting of the congregations of

the Lutheran and Reformed churches.⁴⁷ Under this system,

all Protestants were under the authority of the King, and

the Dutch ministers became civil servants. Thus, they

were responsible to the government as employees of the

colonial power, while at the same time, they were also

responsible for the spread of the Gospel. This tension

between their two roles fostered paternalism which led to

real tension in the Church. Their Indonesian assistant

ministers might often individually appreciate a superior

in the Church, but Kraemer does not believe that it is

"exaggerated to say that they (saw) their arch-enemy in the genus minister."⁴⁸

45. Neill, Stephen, Colonialism and Christian Missions.
(London: Lutterworth Press, 1966), p. 179.

46. Ibid., p. 179.

47. Ibid., p. 188.

48. Kraemer, From Missionfield, Op.cit., p. 35.

The Dutch Reformed Church, however, was not alone in the practice of paternalism. The German missionaries working among the Bataks also followed a program in which the presence of both mission and colonial power were taken for granted as a permanent presence. There was given no serious thought of the day when the Batak Church would claim its independence.⁴⁹

However, the day did come when the churches were no longer willing to accept the secondary role in which they were placed by paternalism and colonialism. This process of becoming independent began with the consideration in 1910 and 1919 of a constitution for the Dutch Reformed Church (The Protestant Church of Indonesia) which would separate Church and State. A Commission was appointed in 1921 to give further consideration to this question, and a Great Assembly considered its proposals in 1933. Thus, in 1935, a Constitution was ratified, and the Protestant Church in the Netherlands Indies became an independent Christian Church.⁵⁰

At the same time, the Batak Church was demanding greater freedom from the control of the missionaries. Although the Rhenish missionaries had done much more to grant independence to the Bataks than had the Dutch in the Reformed Church, in fact, both under the Church Constitution and in actual practice, the foreign missionary was found in every position of importance.⁵¹ A new constitution was

49. Neil, Colonialism, p. 193.

50. Ibid., p. 196.

51. Ibid., p. 197.

drawn up for the Batak Church in 1930, but this did not truly meet the need. Kraemer states that the major concern of the missions was to raise a strong Christian community; the church had become an isolated end in itself. It was also apparent to Kraemer during his visit that the Bataks sensed an "attitude of depreciation, a hidden criticism, even a veiled mockery."⁵² One of the most highly-educated Bataks expressed his conviction that the missionaries behaved like officials, a state of affairs intolerable because "what is accepted from an official is not accepted from or condoned in a missionary."⁵³ This same Christian recognized the basic paternalism of the missionaries in these words, "We recognize that they are ready to do anything for the Bataks, but we also suspect that they do this on the condition that the Bataks retain second place."⁵⁴ Under the system practiced by the missionaries, the Indonesian pastors and teachers were never allowed to rise above the level of "tools of the missionaries", both in the estimation of their own people and in actual fact.⁵⁵

The struggle for political independence in which the Dutch were expelled was also accompanied by the struggle of the churches for independence from the missionaries. Colonialism and paternalism were so closely linked that Indonesian Christians, while not forgetting the sacrifice of the missionaries, were almost universally glad to see

52. Kraemer, From Missionfield, p. 69.

53. Ibid., p. 69.

54. Ibid., p. 69.

55. Ibid., p. 71.

them go.⁵⁶ Typical of this is the fact that the greatest festival in the calendar of the Batak Church, after Christmas and Easter, is the "Liberation of the Batak Church", not from the Dutch or even from the Japanese, but from the missionaries.⁵⁷

2. Efforts to eliminate paternalism.

It should not be thought that there is only recent recognition of the problems created by paternalistic structures in the Mission Church. Efforts to eliminate paternalism have been widespread, even general, and have been the result of cooperation between missionaries and nationals. The themes of the great Missionary Conferences of the present century bear witness to the sincere desire and strenuous effort to bring the younger churches to the realization of selfhood. A brief survey of these conferences provides illustration of this fact and shows their potential effect upon the churches of Asia.

a. Edinburgh, 1910.

In Edinburgh in 1910, V.S. Azariah, upon the urging of John R. Mott, gave a scathing critique of paternalism in missions. He called for friendship and a sharing of responsibility on terms of complete equality. It was necessary that there be outward proofs "of a real willingness on the part of the foreign missionary to show he is in the midst of the people to be to them, not a lord and master, but a brother and a friend."⁵⁸ As Graham says,

56. Neill, Colonialism, p. 199.

57. Ibid., p. 199.

58. Edinburgh, 1910, Vol. IX, p. 311.

this was "throwing the cat among the pigeons with a vengeance", and it caused deep and serious thought on the part of many.⁵⁹ There was a necessity for such thought, for while there was an awareness of the Younger Churches, there was an emphasis upon their existence as a result of, and as a purpose for, western missionary activity. They were not yet recognized as Churches per se, with an active part in the Mission of the Universal Church.⁶⁰ This can be seen in the fact that among the almost 1,400 delegates, there were only seventeen who were nationals rather than Europeans or Americans. But even these seventeen did not come as representatives of their own churches; they had been sent to represent mission bodies.⁶¹

b. Jerusalem, 1928.

At Jerusalem in 1928, there was a new emphasis upon the role of the Younger Churches. One-fifth of the delegates were nationals. They participated as equals, serving on committees and taking an active part in the discussions and planning. The theme which emerged as dominant in this conference was the new relationship of Church and Mission.⁶² The conference adopted statements dealing with such subjects as the "Secret of a Living, Indigenous Church" and the "Relations of Missions and the Younger Churches." It was recognized that in "many

59. Graham, Op.cit., p. 39.

60. Anderson, Wilhelm, Towards a Theology of Mission. (London: SCM Press Ltd., 1955), p. 18.

61. Anderson, Op.cit., p. 18.

62. Ibid., p. 19.

countries there are churches in various stages of development, younger bodies less dependent than heretofore upon missionary initiative, direction and control, with which the older churches can cooperate." It was also stressed that there was also now the possibility of a "true partnership enabling the older churches in an ever-increasing degree to work with, through or in the younger."⁶³

c. Tambaram, 1938.

Tambaram, 1938, speaks emphatically and deliberately of the world mission of the Church. The emphasis was upon the Church, the community of God in the World. From this was first a stress upon the unity of all Churches as part of the Universal Church. This unity became more important than East and West, than Mission and Church. From this was also a stress upon the all-important task of the Universal Church, in which older and younger churches, sending and emerging churches, participate in the all-important task of evangelization, and participate on an equal basis.⁶⁴

d. Willingen, 1952.

At Willingen in 1952, this emphasis upon the Church was carried forward and made more explicit. The Indigenous Church was spoken of as the Universal Church in its local setting. From this come two emphases of significance for this study. First, there was stressed the mission of the

63. Jerusalem Report, Vol. III, pp. 208-209.

64. Anderson, Op.cit., p. 21.

Church in relationship to the nature and future of the Church. "There was a strong conviction that the future of the Christian Church depends on 'the Church being the Church', on its being a redeemed fellowship and a channel of God's redeeming grace, in the place and country where it is."⁶⁵ Second, there was a clear, definite statement of the concern of the younger church delegates that there continue to be the transmission from the older churches of a vital Christian life, but it was recognized by the conference that every church "has an inherent authority under Christ which is not dependent on any transfer of responsibility by a missionary agency."⁶⁶

C. Paternalism a Continuing Concern.

Inasmuch as there is now this recognition of paternalism as an undesirable feature of government and administration within the Mission Church, and inasmuch as there is now a general effort to correct paternalistic practices, one may well ask if it is either profitable or necessary to study paternalistic structures in any detail. It is the contention of this study that there is real profit to be gained in paying close attention to the effects of paternalistic church government and administration.

1. A continuing threat to church life.

First, despite the widespread recognition of the need to avoid paternalism, and the widespread efforts to

65. Minutes of the International Missionary Council, Willingen, Germany, 1952. (London: International Missionary Council, 1952), p. 59.

66. Ibid., p. 66.

eliminate it, paternalistic structures continue to pose a threat to the life of the churches in Asia. This may be seen by using the Church of South India as an example of a church which has become "the Universal Church in its local setting", but which still suffers from its paternalistic past. First of all, the continued existence of the church is called into question by its paternalistic heritage. "If the Indian Church, as it is organized today, had to depend entirely upon its own resources, it would inevitably see a large amount of its work collapse extremely quickly. It is hard to see how it could continue even as a closed community simply concerned with its own survival."⁶⁷ Secondly, there is the even more important question of the completion of its mission. If the Indian Church is to be the Church, if it is to be a redeemed fellowship and a channel of God's redeeming grace, there is need for reform from within the church. "A new mission paternalism is no cure for the ills in considerable measure brought about by the mission paternalism of the past."⁶⁸ This has vital urgency for the church in modern India, for "unless it can rethink its structure from the bottom up, it can never hope to see India Christian...The accepted pattern of the Indian Church must be drastically changed if it is to bear effective witness to Christ."⁶⁹

67. Hollis, Paternalism, p. 70.

68. Ibid., p. 71.

69. Ibid., p. 70.

2. A continuing problem in relationships.

Second, paternalistic structures are by no means eliminated in missionary agencies and the churches which they have founded in Asia. The role of the missionary, both in his relationship to the indigenous church and in his relationship to his task as a missionary, is called into question by the continued existence of paternalistic structures. The extent of this survival will be shown in depth in the next chapter. However, it is an important problem, as Neill emphasizes that if the missionary is a paid ambassador upwards, and a paymaster downwards,

"What is going to be the reaction of the thoughtful younger churchmen to the missionary society which directs, to the mission which is organized in separation from the Church, and to the missionary who stands aloof (to varying degrees) from the Church?"⁷⁰

3. A source of valuable information.

Finally, the question of church structures cannot be conveniently separated into compartments neatly labelled "East" and "West". If a form of church government, a type of policy, a pattern of church administration proves detrimental to the life of the churches in Asia, does not this have a lesson to teach to the churches of Europe and America?

For these reasons, this study will now examine the effects of paternalism upon the churches in Asia.

70. Neill, Stephen, Creative Tension. (London: Edinburgh House Press, 1959), p. 89.

CHAPTER FOUR

THE EFFECTS OF PATERNALISM UPON THE POLITY AND
ADMINISTRATION OF MISSION CHURCHES

I. THE PURPOSE OF THIS CHAPTER

Paternalism as used in this study is descriptive of much of missionary policy as it was practiced in the majority of mission fields, including those of Asia, during the nineteenth century and is practiced to varying degrees even today. This chapter is not an examination of paternalistic mission policies per se; rather it is an examination of the effects of such policy upon the polity and administration of the Mission Churches of Asia.

While it is not the purpose of this chapter to accentuate the negative or to be destructive in criticism, the remarks upon the policies of paternalism and the resultant effects upon church structures in Asia must include much criticism. This is not to say that these criticisms are applicable to all missionary work in all of Asia, either past or present. The picture is composite, completely true of no one country or Mission Society, but as accurate as possible in the broad sense. These negative remarks may best be viewed as a preparation for what is hoped will be a more positive presentation of present-day church structures throughout Asia.

II. THE EFFECTS OF PATERNALISTIC POLICIES UPON ASIAN CHURCH STRUCTURES.

The effects of paternalistic mission policy upon the polity and administration of Mission Churches may be said to be open to four general criticisms. First, the church structures of the paternalistic Mission Church have been developed in such a way that they are not suitable for fulfilling the mission of the Ekklesia. Second, the church structures of the paternalistic Mission Church have been developed in such a way that they are unsuitable for the establishment of proper relationships within the Ekklesia. Third, the church structures may be criticized because they are not an expression of the nature of the Ekklesia. Finally, the church structures of the paternalistic Mission Church may be criticized because it is based upon the authority of Western Church history and practice rather than upon the authority of the Bible. It must be emphasized that these criticisms are true in degree and true in the overall effect of paternalism. Not all polities, not all administrative practices are represented at any given point in this composite picture of the effects of paternalism.

It may be seen that these four criticisms arise from the four theological bases of church government discussed in the previous two chapters. To the extent that these criticisms are shown to be justified, it may be said that paternalism has resulted in the development of an unsatisfactory church government for the Mission Church in Asia.

A. An Expression of Western Church Genius

The polity and administration of the Mission Church in Asia is subject to criticism because they are not an expression of the natural life of the Asian Ekklesia. It may be shown that they do not arise from the cultural and social genius of the people of Asia; rather, they are an expression of the genius of Western Protestantism transposed into the Asian situation.

1. Necessary to recognize the Asian genius

It is necessary to recognize the cultural and social genius of the people who form a Church if the polity and administrative practices of the Church are to be an expression of the life of those people in Christ. The Lambeth Conference of Bishops in 1920 stated, "A foreign missionary must....leave to the converts the task of finding out their own national response to the revelation of God in Christ and their national way of walking in the fellowship of the saints, by the help of the One Spirit."¹ This principle is based upon the relation of the new Christian and the new Church to the social and cultural milieu in which they are found.

a. The problem of irrelevance

There are some features of Western polity which are irrelevant for the Church in Asia. The Church Missionary Society recognized this in the setting forth of missionary

1. Jerusalem Meeting Report, Vol. III. (London: Oxford University Press, 1928), p. 37.

polity.² Among the principles set out were: 1) No purely local or historical features would be introduced into the constitution of the new churches; 2) All polity was to be tentative and temporary. The Church should be allowed to mature and form its own polity; 3) Loyalty to Christ and simplicity in doctrine and practice were to be used as standards.³ In the practice of missionary work, an ever-present danger is over-emphasis upon organization as such. Varieties of circumstances may well bring about "differences of administration" which in turn will negate the relevance of a "reduced copy of the forms in which the course of history has moulded the (Western) Churches..."⁴ The fact that life and circumstances in Asia give new perspective to Western problems and new insight into Christian values can make it possible that these differences "may appear as obsolete and meaningless to the Christians of the future as some of the controversies of the Early Church appear to us now."⁵ As one Anglican missionary has described his experiences:

"A residence of thirty-five years as a missionary of the Church Missionary Society in the Punjab and Persia has naturally taught me to regard the differences of ecclesiastical organization between various Christian churches as of trifling importance, compared with the gulf which separates Christendom from Heathendom."⁶

-
1. There was often a great disparity between these ideals and actual practice.
 2. Lawrence, E.A., Modern Missions in the East. (New York: Fleming H. Revell, 1894), pp. 243ff.
 3. Gibson, J.G., Mission Problems and Mission Methods in South China. (Edinburgh: Oliphant, Anderson & Ferrier, 1902), p. 232.
 4. Carus-Wilson, Mary, The Expansion of Christendom, (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1913), p. 254.
 5. Bruce, Op.cit., p. vii.

b. The problem of harm to the Asian churches

Even worse than the possible irrelevance of some forms of polity and administration is the positive harm potential in the introduction of Western ecclesiastical distinctives. This harm may be done through too precipitate formation of polity and administration. Allen states, "To introduce the fully developed systems in which...truth is expressed among us is to attempt to ignore differences of race and clime and to omit necessary stages of growth."⁷ Church life is acknowledged to be historically conditioned and the attempt to transfer a Western Church to a new setting through missionary work "inevitably raises problems, because the new historical and cultural setting cannot be the same as the old."⁸ The introduction of European forms as necessary and mandatory would denationalize and occidentalize the Asian Church, which would thus find these forms alien and destructive.⁹ The harm done in this way may be summarized by the three reactions of Asians to the resulting foreignness of the Mission Church.

1) The affront to nationalism

The foreignness of the Mission Church is an affront to the nationalism of Asian peoples. There are two problems implicit in this. First, this affront may be used as a weapon in the fight of Communism in Asia against the Church. Second, this affront may be used as a weapon as

7. Allen, Op.cit., p. 189.

8. Hollis, M., Mission, Unity and Truth (London: Lutterworth Press, 1967), p. 38.

9. Lawrence, Op.cit., p. 245.

sincere nationalists seek to preserve their own culture against what is felt to be the Europeanizing effects of Christianity.

a) Communist propaganda

The accusation continually made by Communist propaganda against Christianity is that it is the tool of Western imperialism. One need not agree with the conclusions to which these charges lead to realize the potential for harm in Asia. Three statements by Chinese leaders will show the form this propaganda takes.

Lu Ting-Yi spoke at a conference for Christian leaders, held in Shanghai during April of 1951. Among other things, he stated:

"It is an important part of the aggressive policy of American imperialism to utilize Christianity to carry forward cultural aggression. Behind the so-called Christian slogans, 'ecumenical' and 'world-wide', is the blood-soaked demonic hand of American imperialism preparing an aggressive war against the New China and further preparing for an 'ecumenical' mass butchery."¹⁰

Isaac Wei, in an article in Tien Feng, the leading Christian publication of China, confessed:

"I wish to admit frankly and without regard to face that the 'Three-Self' Church which I preached was not thorough-going, it was only an unconscious tool of imperialism and feudalism and bureaucratic capitalism."¹¹

-
10. Jones, F.P., ed., Documents of the Three-Self Movement. (New York: National Council of Churches of Christ in U.S.A., 1963), p. 32. Lu Ting-Yi is the chairman of the Administrative Yuan's Committee on Culture and Education.
 11. Ibid., p. 63. Isaac Wei was the leader of the True-Jesus Church, an indigenous sect.

Liu Liang-Mo was active in the promotion of accusation meetings among Christians. He urged:

"One of the central tasks at present for Christian churches and groups across the nation is to hold successful accusation meetings. Why do we want to accuse? Because for more than a hundred years imperialism has utilized Christianity to attack China, therefore we want to accuse it of its sins... Accuse what? We must accuse imperialist elements and their helpers as well as other bad elements hidden in the churches. We want to expose their sin of utilizing the churches to attack China and deceive believers."¹²

To dismiss these statements as mere Communist propaganda would be to miss the point that imperialism is a charge laid against the Church by Communism in its attempts to subvert Christian influence in Asia. The Mission Church, because of its foreignness is particularly vulnerable to these charges. History explains this. The case of China is typical in fact and result if not in degree and instance.

One of the provisions of the "unequal treaties" (a term coined by the Chinese) of the nineteenth century was the readmission of the Christian missions and missionaries into China. The colonial powers became the official protectors of the missionaries and enabled them to take the Gospel to the Chinese under the protection of the gunboats. This confusion of national authority and religion was of great harm to the cause of Christianity. The Chinese, already traditionally distrustful of any religious teaching from abroad, now had ample grounds to regard Christianity as primarily a tool of political interests in the West, and

12. Ibid., p. 49. Liu Liang-Mo was the Secretary of the YMCA in China.

not as a religious faith. This feeling was more or less wide-spread among the Chinese people, and the association of Christianity with "imperialism" was the greatest handicap faced in mission work in China.¹³ It was a common belief that opium and Christianity were two evils introduced by foreigners, through trickery and force, into China.¹⁴

b) The cultural offense of foreignness

Apart from the opening given to Communist propaganda, the foreignness of the Mission Church is used as a weapon by sincere nationalists in their fight against the cultural influences of the West. The totality of the concepts expressed in the phrase, "the white man's burden", sees the upplantation of Asian culture by colonial practices which could introduce European culture as a substitute. This is the view held by sincere Asians who fear the influence of the West. "Only within the (Mission) Church do the vestiges of the old colonial relation remain. Only among missionaries do we find traces of the old...authority. Missions are the most conspicuous reminder of the white man's burden."¹⁵ The past and present practice of missionary domination within the Mission Church is a factor in church government which is an affront to this nationalist feeling.

It has been said that the first cause of disquiet and

-
3. Oldham, J.H., ed., International Review of Missions. Vol. 15, 1926, "Religion and Renaissance in China", Ph. de Vargas, pp. 4-20, p. 13.
 4. Franke, W., China and the West. (Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1967), p. 76ff.
 5. Abrecht, Paul, The Churches and Rapid Social Change. (London: SCM Press, 1961), p. 59.

discontent in the Churches in Asia is missionary domination.¹⁶ The connection in the mind of the Asian nationalist between colonialism and the Mission Church in supplanting Asian cultural and social patterns may be understood, if not fully accepted as the nature of colonialism is examined. It may be said that a "colonial" country is one where the foreigner is responsible for economic activity, supplies foreign funds, gives foreign control, the spirit of the enterprise is foreign, and the interests are also foreign. The purposes and goals are foreign in origin and result and the destiny of the people is determined by foreign decisions.¹⁷ Substitute "church government" for "political government" and the resentment against the Mission Church as colonial in nature and de-culturizing in purpose is more understandable. It is said that the practices and organization of the Mission Churches prove that they are a foreign organization, ruled and financed by foreigners, whose purpose it is to overthrow the Asian social structure, customs and religion in order to replace them with something European.¹⁸

One must understand that Asians have been dominated by their fellow-Asians throughout their history. In many cases, as in China and India, the nations with cultural superiority were successful in absorbing the conquerors who could only boast of military might. But when the West came

16. Paton, Wm., A Faith for the World. (Edinburgh: United Free Church of Scotland, 1929), p. 112.

17. Kraemer, Hendrik, World Cultures and World Religions. (London: Lutterworth Press, 1960), p. 65.

18. Oldham, J.H., The World and the Gospel. (Edinburgh: United Free Church of Scotland, 1916), p. 144.

to Asia, the result was the first totally alien dominance in their national memory. It was total assault and conquest...military, political and cultural. "Foreign Devil" and similar expressions were not caused so much by basic personal hatred as much as rebellion against the alien nature of the domination.¹⁹ The frequent usage of these epithets against missionaries is suggestive of the relationship in the mind of nationalists between the alien culture and the Mission Church. Pannikar states, "It is necessary to keep in mind the unbroken religious urge of European expansion, and take into consideration the immense non-official and voluntary effort that it represented."²⁰

Thus, it may be seen that the first harm that is done to the Mission Church by its more or less foreign character is found in the reaction of Asian nationalism. The second harm is closely related. The difference lies in the fact that nationalism reacts in the first instance against the Mission Church as a visible reminder of alien domination; nationalism reacts in the second instance against the Mission Church because of its essentially foreign character.

2) Christian or Western?

The Mission Church is vulnerable to this second harmful reaction by Asians because it has failed to distinguish between what is essentially Christian and what is essentially foreign. Whereas the nationalistic reaction against the Mission Church is based to a large degree upon an historically-

19. Kraemer, Op.Cit., p. 62.

20. Pannikar, K.M., Asia and Western Dominance. (London: Lutterworth, 1953), p. 481.

conditioned emotional response, the essentially foreign nature of the Church is an affront to the cultural and aesthetic sensibilities of many Asians.

It is felt in Asia today that Christianity is a Western religion because the ecclesiastical forms of the Christian faith in the world today are largely the result of the history of the Churches of the West.²¹ This foreign (non-Asian) character of the Mission Church, as typified by the Western ecclesiastical forms, is a stumbling-block in Asia.

This is not to say that missionaries who use ecclesiastical forms from the West are deliberately using an unacceptable form. Missionaries naturally propagate their faith in the form in which they received it, and unless they consciously sort out the essentials and discard the non-essentials in a mission situation, they feel that only thus can it be transmitted.²² Even more pertinent to the problem is the position of the ecclesiastical authorities who are responsible for sending the missionary. "Missionary committees in the West...have often been insufficiently aware of the inescapable effect of the fundamentally different cultural patterns" of the West and Asia.²³ The result has been that these authorities "conscientiously insist upon the maintenance of the traditional system."²⁴ This burdens

21. Niles, D.T., Upon the Earth. (London: Lutterworth Press, 1962), p. 208.

22. Latourette, K.S., A History of Christian Missions in China. (London: SPCK, 1928), p. 423.

23. Hollis, Paternalism, p. 36.

24. Latourette, Missions in China, p. 43.

Christianity with "an enormous amount of baggage that is Graeco-Roman, Russian, British, German or American", which is inescapably foreign, and therefore must be discarded if Christianity is ever to be at home.²⁵ There is substantial justification for labelling Christianity as European, for even today Christianity is generally found in European dress. But the "world is changing so rapidly, away from Europe and against it, that, in human terms, there is just barely time to convince the world that Christianity is as much Asiatic as it is European."²⁶

Inasmuch as the Gospel is necessarily related to time and place, people and civilization, and expressed in conditioned forms and institutions, "what is wrong is not that Christ came to Asia in European dress, for it was Europeans who brought Him." The problem lies in the fact that "they so tied Him up in European dress to such an extent that Christ has for many Asians remained a European figure."²⁷

It is this pervasive foreign character of the Church which is a basic cause of disquiet and discontent in the Asian Churches. Paton points out that,

"There is a widespread feeling that the kind of institution which has been created is not a fellowship in which they (the Asians) would normally and readily express themselves, and is not, therefore, for them what the Church of Christ ought to be, a loved spiritual home."²⁸

Speaking of the Asian churches, Murray says that there must

5. Ibid., p. 43.

6. Warren, Max, Perspective in Mission. (London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1964), p. 89.

7. Hollis, Mission, Unity and Truth, pp. 53, 54.

8. Paton, Op.cit., p. 112.

be "set forms of ecclesiastical organization, Church buildings, pastors, orders of service, etc., (all of our Western pattern)", and this is not from Asian preference but because of Western dominance in the Mission Church, and, "consequently, from its birth the Church is not a spiritual organism but an exotic religious institution, organized by the foreign missionary."²⁹

It may be that the Christians will try to work within the ecclesiastical forms as introduced by the missionary. The complaint is then sometimes heard that it is difficult to find national leadership capable of operating the machinery. Two things should be remembered at this point. The Western pattern may be just as great a source of frustration to the Asian as his inability to operate it is to the missionary. Secondly, the difficulty is not necessarily the fault of the Asian. It could be with the system, which has been built up by the foreigner. "The suit has to fit the customer, not the customer the suit."³⁰

Another reaction to the European suit which the Church is asked to wear may be seen in Japan, as well as in other Asian countries. The Japanese are unable to see the beauty of the Western culture which is felt to be so obvious by the Westerner; they have a term, "batkusai", the "foreign stink of butter", which they use to describe the aesthetic offensiveness of the "butter-eating" West to the "rice-eating" Asian, particularly the Japanese.³¹ The Japanese Church

29. Murray, H. Jowett, JMR, Vol.III, Op.cit., p. 42.

30. Hollis, Paternalism, p. 66.

31. Lee, Robert, Stranger in the Land. (London: Lutterworth Press, 1967), p. 25.

has traditionally been one of the most independent of Asian Churches. This comes from a refusal to be dependent upon the foreigner for education, finances, propagation and government. This is not only a matter of principle, but also of pragmatism in the anti-foreign culture.³² By making their Church truly Japanese, it is hoped that the offense of the cross will not be confused with the offense of "batkusai".³³

3) Questionable motives

A third stigma attached to the Mission Church is that of questionable motives in conversion to Christianity. From the great famines of China came the term, "rice-Christian", used first to describe those who professed conversion in order to gain access to relief, and then, more generally, to describe those who professed conversion as an entrance to the more diverse benefits bestowed by the Mission Church. It is hard for the average Asian who is not attracted to Christianity because of spiritual hunger to impute worthy motives to anyone else who does become a Christian. The acceptance of Christianity with its Western arapace has resulted in the use of the contemptuous "secondary foreign-devil" toward Christians whose sincerity is questioned because they have been taught to follow Western ways.³⁴ This problem of motives in conversion and the resulting attitude of the community toward the convert is a result of the essentially foreign nature of the Mission Church.

2. Latourette, Missions Tomorrow, p. 18.

3. Lee, Op.cit., p. 25.

4. Bitton, Nelson, The Regeneration of New China. (Edinburgh: The Church of Scotland, 1914), p. 153.

It may thus be seen that it is necessary to recognize the cultural and social genius of the people who form a Church if the polity and administrative practices of the Church are to be an expression of the life of those people in Christ. Failure to do this results in the introduction of features of Western polity which are irrelevant to the Asian situation in which the Church must live. Even more regrettable, there is positive harm done to the Mission Church as it seeks to live its life within the immediately larger context of community life. Charges of imperialism and the adverse reaction of sincere nationalists, the cultural reaction against the "foreignness" of the Mission Church and the association of unworthy motives with conversion are three harmful results of this situation.

2. Desirable to recognize the Asian genius

Apart from the necessity to recognize the principle that Asian Churches should have polity and administrative practices which spring from their own national life, it may be shown that this is a desirable goal. Positive benefits will accrue to the Mission Church and to the Church Universal if the church government of the Asian Church is formed in accord with the Protestant principle that church government should be an expression of the life of the people in Christ.

a. Benefits to the Mission Churches

The Mission Churches will benefit from this recognition of self-life through becoming a church more suitable to the cultural surroundings in which it must live. The purpose of the Mission Church is to bring Christianity to

sia and to build an Asian Church. Asian Christians ask if it is necessary to have substantial identity of organization or if they are to be free to work out the forms which seem to them to be most harmonious with their own history, their own culture and their own witness to their own people.

1) Builds Asian churches

Asian Christians want to have an Asian Church. Western developments in polity are intimately related to social, cultural and economic patterns in the West; refusal to recognize this as an operative factor in Asia can rightly be viewed as a double standard.³⁵ The importance of social and cultural factors is seen when it is realized that ecclesiastical divisions have theological reference but are often either caused or perpetuated by them. "The lines of religious cleavage often coincide with the lines of social stratification."³⁶ MacGavran insists that one of the things which must be rejected for the achievement of church growth is the European/American "cultural overhang", the rejection of what seems to be desirable by Americans and Europeans and those who have been trained by them. The task is not to make the Asian Christians unified with the West in pattern, but to disciple them and to preserve their own cultural heritage as a rich resource for Christ.³⁷

5. Hollis, Mission, Unity and Truth, p. 84.

6. Cragg, G.R., Social and Cultural Factors in Church Divisions. (London: SCM Press Ltd., 1952), p. 12. (pamphlet).

7. Newbiggin, ed., Op.cit., "Church Growth Continued" by D. MacGavran, Vol. 57, pp. 335-343, p. 337.

2) Makes possible a truly indigenous churches

It is only when there is recognition of the cultural and social differences in any given place that the Indigenous Church can be thoroughly established. The simple, slavish adherence to the slogan of the "Three-Selfs" is inadequate without the extension of this to include the Asian expression of doctrine, forms of worship and forms of organization; the local tradition rather than the Occidental must be the operative factor in this.³⁸ Any church organization, if it takes root, must grow from the soil in which it is planted.³⁹ It may be said that the first mark which the Church must exhibit in any locale, age, ecclesiastical tradition or stage of development is the possession of deep roots, first of all in Christ, and also in the soil of its own cultural milieu.⁴⁰ The positive duties of church-planting must come first above all; conversion and edification are fundamental. But the edification, including the formation of polity and organization, must be Christian in principle, rather than Western in essence. It must be worked out to meet the local cultures.⁴¹ It is at this point of meeting the local cultures that there is a great need for adaptation of the structure of the Church to form a profitable relationship to the social environment. The Indigenous Church must take into account the body of customary law, the moral and

38. Latourette, Christian Missions in China, p. 801.

39. Hollis, Mission, Unity and Truth, p. 38.

40. Goodall, Norman, ed., Missions Under the Cross. (London: Edinburgh House Press, 1953), p. 196.

41. Greenslade, S.L., Shepherding the Flock. (London: SCM Press Ltd., 1967), p. 104.

religious sanctions, and the framework of social and human relationships.⁴² Insistence upon Western forms in its predecessor, the Mission Church, is a practical denial of this. The human church must be, insofar as it is an organization and a body with forms, determined at least in part by the nature of its members. The Word operates in the total sphere of a man's life, and thus the forms of the Indian, the Chinese, the Japanese and Philippine Church must have the potential variety of the language, the spiritual tradition and the conditions of the life of their members.⁴³

"Forms of organization or of baptism, presence or absence of ritual in church services, whether each church should be a unit by itself or rather a component part of a larger whole, are all secondary questions.... Inasmuch as God has made us divergent in temperament and conviction, let us enjoy the liberty of maintaining this or that form of government.... The fundamental point to which we must rigidly adhere is: Are we Christian; are we living as Christ would have us live?"⁴⁴

b. Benefits the Church Universal

It is as the Mission Church builds the indigenous church in Asia that the entire Church Universal will benefit. It is as each member of the Body of Christ is strengthened and benefitted that the entire Body is strongest. Hollis is concerned that the mission pattern has generally accepted Western standards as correct, all within the framework of "the particular Western ecclesiastical order of which the Mission (Society) approved."⁴⁵ Greater freedom might have led to churches substantially different than

2. Abrecht, Op.cit., p. 58.

3. Freytag, Walter. Spiritual Revolution in the East. (London: Lutterworth Press, 1940), pp. 204, 205.

4. Bitton, Op.cit., pp. 174.

5. Hollis, Paternalism, p. 35.

Western Churches. But this would not necessarily have been a loss, if the polity were in agreement with the Scriptures and had led to greater responsibility, a more truly national and more truly Christian Church.⁴⁶ In speaking of agreement with the Scriptures, it has been shown that it is not possible to determine an exclusive "scriptural polity", in the sense of a revealed church constitution. But it is possible to find a stated purpose for the existence of the Church. "We can then ask ourselves how far the present pattern is well calculated for the performing of those functions here and now."⁴⁷ While there are no normative structures which are eternally valid, there is a norm for the measurement of all structures; that is, their suitability for the work of the Church.⁴⁸ When churches in Asia seek the most effective instrument for the advance of the Christian cause in the particular circumstances of a particular racial and social situation, it should be recognized that this is for their benefit, and ultimately for the benefit of the Church Universal, for that is precisely what the Western Churches are seeking in their own case.⁴⁹

The positive effects of this principle may thus be seen to make its implementation a desirable goal. The Mission Church will benefit in its work of building a truly Asian, truly Indigenous Church; this will, in turn, benefit the Church Universal.

46. Ibid., p. 36.

47. Ibid., pp. 94-95.

48. Neve, Op.cit., p. 51.

49. Henderson, Presbyterianism, p. 149.

3. Historical recognition of this principle

This is a principle which has been followed to some degree in the past. Although there were some individual missionaries, and even some Mission Societies who recognized this fact, the history of modern missions would seem to make the Edinburgh Conference of 1910 pivotal in the implementation of cultural and social factors in the determination of church polity and practices.

a. International Missionary Conferences

Starting with the Edinburgh Conference, it was generally recognized that the missionary should not let his personal loyalties to denomination or to polity and discipline obstruct the free flow of spiritual life and its indigenous expression in the Church. The Jerusalem Conference of 1928, the Tambaram Conference of 1938 and the Willingen Conference of 1952 all amplified this application of cultural principles in the life of the Church in mission lands. It was urged that the Church should be allowed to decide the forms of life-expression; it was seen that this is not a matter for the missionary, for the missionaries, or for the Mission boards. The missionary should educate the Church through the New Testament teachings and also through the lessons of ecclesiastical history, and then allow the Spirit-led Church to settle the problems of Churchmanship.⁵⁰ However, it is necessary at this point to refer briefly to events in the years preceding 1910.

O. Bitton, Op.cit., p. 178.

Inasmuch as so much of this portion of the study is critical of the effects of paternalistic mission policy upon the polity and practice of the Mission Church, it is only proper to balance the indictment with the recognition of some missionaries and their sponsoring agencies during the nineteenth century.

b. The leadership of independent societies

The ideal of cultural adaptation was more easily followed by the independent, non-denominational missionary societies, such as the London Missionary Society. The "Fundamental Principle" of the London Missionary Society was that "its design is not to send Presbyterianism, Independency, Episcopacy, or any other form of Church Order and Government" to the mission field, but rather to send "the glorious Gospel of the blessed God to the heathen..." It was then proposed that "it shall be left (as it ought to be left) to the minds of the persons whom God may call into the fellowship of His Son from among them to assume for themselves such form of Church Government as to them shall appear most agreeable to the Word of God."⁵¹ In speaking of the work of the L.M.S. in India, and the practical outworking of this policy, it was said:

"The aim...is to give freedom to the Indian Church to shape its own life and institutions on the ground that Christianity must take root in the native soil of India and become indigenous and not exist as a temporary or sojourning Western organization."⁵²

51. Goodall, Norman, A History of the London Missionary Society, 1895-1945. (London: Oxford University Press, 1954), p. 3.

52. James, A.T.S., Twenty-Five Years of the L.M.S., 1895-1920. (London: L.M.S., 1923), pp. 21, 22.

he development of this policy in practical terms may be seen in the history of the L.M.S. in its two largest fields, India and China. In these fields, there were developed strong local churches, which at first exercised the full local self-government of congregational churches. These later accepted some modification of their local independence through the establishment of church councils and synods. Finally, the church courts of the L.M.S. churches became constituent councils of the South India United Church or synods in the Church of Christ in China.⁵³

c. The evolution of denominational practice

The situation of the mission field imposes a certain amount of catholicity upon any denomination. Change inevitably comes because the situation is so changed from the situation of the home base.

1) Congregational missions

This may be seen among congregational missions. Congregationalists who in England appear to have no concern for the Great Church build up a centralized church organization in India.⁵⁴ This influence is seen at work in the report of the Baptist Missionary Society in 1898:

"It seems possible to establish an aggressive self-supporting cause, but it must be organized according to (indigenous) ideals. Without compromising in the least Scriptural principles, the Church here must be oriental in form of government, method of support and extension."⁵⁵

3. Goodall, L.M.S., p. 451.

4. Hanson, A.T., Beyond Anglicanism. (London: Darton, Longman & Todd, 1965), p. 139.

5. Thompson and Johnson, Op.cit., p. 217.

2) Presbyterian Missions

This principle was also recognized by some Presbyterian missionaries. In Formosa, it was realized from the first that polity was subject to adaptation. MacKay states:

"The man or the mission that supposes a good theory must be capable of universal application, and that social forces, hereditary customs, or even climatic influences need not to be taken into account, makes a grievous mistake."⁵⁶

The Presbyterian Church in Formosa started out with a polity that was not truly Presbyterian. Apart from eldership and deacons, the meetings were more congregational. The Presbytery was not formally constituted, but acted through general discussion meetings held for the office-bearers in the several churches. Another feature was the uniting of several congregations under the direction of one Session.⁵⁷ Presbyterian missionaries in South China also modified their polity according to the local conditions. It was their practice when dealing with a young church recently planted in a non-Christian society to avoid the establishment on theoretical grounds of a form of Church order and organization which was a reflection in all its details of the organization of the Church at home. Rather, in view of the practical needs which were to be met, or the practical evils which were to be avoided, an organization was formed making the best use of the material at hand.⁵⁸

56. MacKay, G.L., From Far Formosa. (Edinburgh: Oliphant, Anderson & Ferrier, 1895), p. 285.

57. Campbell, Wm., Missionary Success in Formosa. (London: Trubner & Co., 1889), Vol. II, pp. 544, 565.

58. Gibson, Op.cit., p. 198.

The pertinent comment is made that the New Testament does not represent the apostles as men who were infallible in church administration. God taught them, as is the case today, causing them to profit by failure as well as by success. The New Testament sets them out in their administrative functions, with the growth and its results, as "subject to scrutiny in the light of the Lord's rule: 'By their fruits ye shall know them'".⁵⁹

3) Episcopal missions

Episcopal churchmen involved in missionary work were often far-sighted and liberal in their policies, as were the men and missions cited above. Even in the nineteenth century, there was a consensus of opinion among many Anglicans that Churches in other lands should not be exact reproductions of Western Church organization. Bishop Westcott states:

"If we could establish the loftiest type of Western Christianity in India as the paramount religion... our triumph would be in the end a loss to Christendom. We should lose the very lessons which, in the providence of God, India has to teach us."⁶⁰

4. Summary statement

This examination of the polity and administration of the Mission Church in Asia has shown that they are not an expression of the natural life of the Church. It has been seen that it is necessary to recognize the principle of cultural influence upon the polity and administration of the Church. To the extent that the Mission Church has failed

⁵⁹ Ibid., p. 203.

⁶⁰ Thompson and Johnson, Op.cit., p. 206.

to do this, irrelevant and harmful practises and forms of organization have been introduced. On the other hand, the desirability of recognizing this principle in the formation of polity and administrative practices is seen in the benefit to the Mission Church and the Church Universal. In the nineteen century, independent missionary societies and some denominational missionaries and mission societies proposed to follow cultural influence in the formation of polity and administration of Mission Churches. That they were in advance of their time is seen by the history of International Missionary Conferences in the present century. To the extent that Mission Churches have been paternalistic and prevented the necessary and desirable influence of cultural and social factors to take their part in the formation of church government and administration, there is justifiable criticism of the effects of paternalism upon the Mission Church.

B. A Hindrance to the Mission of the Church Universal

The polity and administration of the Mission Church in Asia is subject to criticism because they act as a deterrent to the fulfilment of the mission of the Church. To understand this more fully, it is necessary to consider the relation of the Mission Church as a component member of the Church Universal.

1. The Mission Church and the Church Universal.

It must not be overlooked that the Mission Church is not a separate entity in itself; rather, it is an expression

the life-force of the Church Universal. The modern missionary movement should never be considered simply as a discrete form of life. It exists in the world because the Church exists in the world. As such, it cannot be separated from the spiritual or profane aspects of the world.

There are two things which underly any great missionary movement. The first is the stimulus of geographical discovery, political extension on the part of Christian nations, or political developments on the part of non-Christian nations. The second is spiritual awakening, either individually or corporately.⁶¹ The nineteenth century saw a great spiritual awakening which was to change Protestantism from a Church concerned with politics into a Church concerned with spiritual expansion. The second great factor in the modern missionary movement was the expansion of the political dominion of the West over almost all the globe, carrying with it Occidental culture, and creating an opportunity for missions to reach these uttermost parts of the world.⁶²

Furthermore, it must be emphasized that the modern missionary movement, as a part of the activity of the Church, is not simply of human origin. This is necessarily true, for the Church is not simply an instrument pragmatically developed by men who saw the need for such an organization; rather, it is the continuation of the expression of God's

1. Paton, Wm., ed., The Missionary Motive. (London: SCM Press, 1913) "The Missionary Motive in the Last Two Centuries", Ruth Rouse, pp. 146-178, p. 148.

2. Latourette, Missions Tomorrow (New York: Harper & Bros., 1936), pp. 5-8.

nature found in the Incarnation. This is extremely important to the total fact of world missions. "Christian missions indeed are nothing more or less than the expansion of the Church."⁶³ Torrance has expressed this truth thus:

"...the Church is so concerned with world-mission, for her very foundations rest upon it. She draws her life from the new humanity in Christ. She is in faith what one day she will be, and now her life-movement consists in becoming what she actually is in Christ. No doubt it is always a temptation of the Church to conquer a certain region and settle in on it and become self-contained, but that would be to forget that she can save her life only as she loses it for Christ's sake and the Gospel."⁶⁴

The International Missionary Conference at Willingen proposed that it is impossible to speak of 'missions' without speaking simultaneously of the 'Church', both in terms of activity and in relation to the Universal Body from which such activity springs.⁶⁵

a. A shared motive

The Church's expression of this life-force rises from a three-fold motive.

First, in any consideration of the missionary motive, the will of Christ is the necessary starting point. If Christ willed the evangelization of the world, this is the goal of those who seek to do His will.⁶⁶

63. Paton, Wm., A Faith for the World. p. 107.

64. Torrance, T.F., "Concerning Amsterdam, The Nature and Mission of the Church." The Scottish Journal of Theology, Vol. 2, No. 3, p. 267.

65. Anderson, W., Towards a Theology of Mission. (London: SCM Press, 1955), pp. 20, 21 (pamphlet).

66. Paton, ed., Op.cit., "The Will of Christ", J.H. Oldham, pp. 11-35, p. 12.

Second, the nature of God must be considered as a motive. "Our true and compelling motive lies in the very nature of the God to whom we have given our hearts."⁶⁷ The nature of God is seen to be love, and Christ is "the expression in time of the eternal self-giving of the Father." Those who come into fellowship with Christ find in themselves "an overmastering impulse to share Him with others...He has become life to us. We would share that life."⁶⁸ The love of God, as His basic nature, is described as the "well-head of missions" and the "inexhaustible and perennial spring of missionary devotion."⁶⁹

The third consideration of the missionary motive must involve the place of the Church in glorifying Christ. Hewat points out that one of the basic motivations of the missionary movement in Scotland was "its deep-seated attachment to the Church and its central place in Christian life," which led to a concern for "the glory and advancement of Christ's Church" as this would in turn glorify Christ.⁷⁰ Many would feel that this recognition of the role of the Church in God's plan is to be found in any adequate analysis of the missionary motive.

7. Jerusalem Report, Op.cit., Vol. I, p. 485.

8. Ibid., p. 485.

9. Oldham, World and Gospel, pp. 74, 75.

10. Hewat, Elizabeth, Vision and Achievement. (London: Thomas Nelson & Sons, 1960), p. 13. This refers to the Church of Scotland, and is taken as representative of Church-sponsored mission activity. Others, apart from the Church organizations, went for other reasons.

A desire to do the will of Christ, a recognition of God's nature, and a serious view of the Church in glorifying Christ; these are the three streams from which rise the missionary motive.

b. A shared aim

The Church's missionary motive finds expression in the achievement of two complementary tasks. The Church in the earliest times spread through adjacent territories among people similar in ideas, culture and language to those who composed the Church. Today, the Church sends missionaries out to people who live on opposite sides of the globe, and who are totally different in all aspects of their life. The purpose has not changed, however; it is still to preach the Gospel, gather together a Christian fellowship and raise up a new branch of the Church.⁷¹

1) Evangelism

The first aim of missions is thus to preach the Gospel to those who do not yet know of Christ. As previously stated, the London Missionary Society incorporated into their Fundamental Principle that the "sole object is to spread the knowledge of Christ among the heathen and other unenlightened nations...".⁷² But the missionary movement and the Mission Church are not isolated forms apart from the life-stream of the Church Universal. While the conversion of sinners through the preaching of the Gospel is an aim, this is also the aim of the Church Universal, and not an

71. Paton, Faith for World, p. 107.

72. Goodall, ed., L.M.S., loc. cit.

xclusive characteristic of this part of the Church.⁷³
 missionary zeal is implicit in the constitution of the
 church, as seen in the Scots Confession of 1560, which is
 reflexed by the text, "And this Gospel must be preached in
 all the world for a witness unto all nations, and then shall
 the end come." At the end of the Confession is the prayer,
 "Let all the nations come to Thy true knowledge."⁷⁴

2) Edification

Even as it must be realized that the conversion of
 sinners through the preaching of the Gospel is not an aim
 exclusive to the Mission Church, so it must be understood
 that the conversion of the world is too narrow an aim. The
 true goal must be conversion and edification, leading to a
 Christian society through the instrumentation of the
 Christian Ekklesia.⁷⁵ The distinction between the two
 aims is seen when it is realized that "evangelization" is
 the conversion of the individual, while "Christianization"
 is the conversion of the total milieu by the founding of
 vital indigenous Churches.⁷⁶ That these are both inseparable
 and complementary was recognized by Carey, when he outlined
 in 1806 the principles whereby his newly-founded missionary
 society were to be governed. These included the founding
 of churches, the translation of Scripture, and the founding
 of schools.⁷⁷ The basic importance of the Church as a body

3. Lawrence, Op.cit., p. 31.

4. Hewat, Op.cit., p. 1.

5. Lawrence, Op.cit., p. 31.

6. Hallencreutz, C.F., Kraemer towards Tambaram. (Upsalla:
 Gleerup, 1966), p. 39.

7. Paton, Faith for World, p. 108.

was recognized by some missionary-statesmen in the nineteenth century. The goal of Henry Venn, of the Church Missionary Society, was the realization that the ultimate object of a Mission lies in the achievement of an established ekklesia. This included the founding of a geographical Church, living under the guidance of national pastors, and operating under a self-supporting system.⁷⁸ Hewat underlines the concern of Scottish churches for the Church, pointing out that the main concern of the Scottish churches, in 1823 in India, was the establishment and upbuilding of the Church.⁷⁹

2. Self-hood as a final goal

However, this concern for the establishment of Churches as the natural and proper result of individual conversion was not the general concern of the nineteenth century missionary movement. It was not until the turn of the century that this became an increasing concern which could cause the acceptance of the fact that "our part is to organize individuals whom we may convert into an indigenous, independent and expansive Church, which shall be the type of a native and reproductive Christianity."⁸⁰ The concept that the Church expresses its life in missionary activity, that missionary activity leads to the Church, and that the new Church then reproduces through missionary activity did not reach full recognition until the great international Missionary Conferences of this century. Thus, Warneck

78. Jerusalem Report, Op.cit., Vol. III, p. 31.

79. Hewat, Op.cit., p. 44.

80. Lawrence, Op.cit., p. 33.

ould say at Jerusalem that the aim of missions is "The founding of such independent native churches as shall support themselves out of their own resources, edify and govern themselves by their own powers, and carry forward mission work of their own accord."⁸¹ Oldham, with the experiences and lessons of the Edinburgh Conference in mind, wrote, "The proper aim of foreign missions is to establish in non-Christian lands an indigenous, self-propagating church as a means to their evangelization."⁸²

a. "Indigenous" as self-maintaining.

The concern for the indigenous Church as a full part of the Church Universal may be expressed in two ways. First of all, there is a concern that the Indigenous Church should be able to maintain itself. This would include, as a very basic consideration, the ability to govern itself and to support itself. Less than this is an indication of a problem in the life of the Church. Bishop Howells said, speaking of the relationship of the European Churches to the Mission Churches, that the time must come when "their children would be able to stand upon their own two feet. There is something wrong if a mother has to look after her child all through life; something wrong with the child."⁸³ It is on this basis that a solemn charge is set forth by the Lambeth Conference of 1920 for the observance of the Church in all missionary activity: "Foreign missionaries should set before themselves one ideal only; to plant the

1. Jerusalem Report, Op.cit., Vol. III, p. 32f.

2. Oldham, World and Gospel, p. 139.

3. Jerusalem Report, Op.cit., Vol. III, p. 176.

Catholic Church in every land...They must long to see national life putting on Christ and national thought interpreting his truth."⁸⁴

b. "Indigenous" as self-expanding

Secondly, there is a concern that the Indigenous Church should be able to do more than merely maintain itself; it should be able to propagate itself, first of all in its own locale, and then in the larger world, thus joining in the expression of the life-force of the Church Universal. The bringing of the Gospel to all mankind is the goal which is always before the Church but it is not the ultimate aim of foreign missions. Foreign missions in themselves can never achieve this goal. "The aim of foreign missions must be to plant the Church in every part of the non-Christian world, in order that this planted church may bring about the evangelization of every part of the non-Christian world."⁸⁵ A mission (in the broad rather than the ecclesiastical sense) is presumably charged with a specific undertaking. That undertaking may be accomplished, the work finished. In the case of foreign missions, the Gospel may be proclaimed, its centres of religious life established. It is then that the time comes when these centres must be left to develop according to the genius of the place.⁸⁶ If the object of the mission should be considered as the total conversion of Asia, there would be no possible point

84. Ibid., pp. 36-37.

85. Oldham, World and Gospel, p. 141.

86. Latourette, K.S. Missions Tomorrow. p. 158.

termination. But as Lord Cecil states, Australia became populated with rabbits because someone introduced self-propagating rabbits. Just so, a self-propagating Church is the way to populate Asia with Christians.⁸⁷

It may thus be seen that the Mission Church, as a product of the missionary movement, is a genuine expression of the life force of the Church Universal. This is seen by the concern for obedience to the will of God, the constraint for mission found in love as the nature of God, and the recognition of the place of the Church in glorifying Christ. These motives underly the aim of the missionary movement which has produced the Mission Church. There is the goal to establish Churches which are self-sufficient in that they are able to live on their own resources and produce their own leadership. There is also the goal to establish these self-sufficient Churches with a "congenital" desire and ability to propagate themselves, both locally and globally. Attention must now be given to the success or failure of the Mission Church in realizing the aims which are shared by the missionary movement and the Church Universal.

3. The frustration of these goals

The Mission Church, to the degree that it has failed and is failing to achieve the goals which have been discussed, may be said to be more of a victim rather than a culprit. It has been shown that the Mission Church is not a separate entity, essentially different than the Church Universal in either nature or aim. To indict the Mission

87. Oldham, J.H., ed., *Op.cit.*, Vol. 2, 1913, "Indigenous Christianity" by William Gascoyne-Cecil, pp. 722-732, pp. 727-728. This classic illustration is best understood when read in full. However, space precludes more than passing reference at this point.

Church on either of these matters as a cause for any failure would therefore also be to indict the Church Universal. If the Church Universal has been successful to the extent that it has produced the missionary movement, which has in turn produced the Mission Church, any failure of the Mission Church must lie in a cause alien to the nature and aim of the Mission Church. This alien cause is paternalism. The effect of paternalism upon the Mission Church has been the frustration of the inherent spiritual life in Christ shared with the Church Universal.

a. Frustration through stifling the Holy Spirit

The inherent spiritual life of the Mission Church has been frustrated because the activity of the Holy Spirit is stifled through the imposition of paternalistic polity and administrative practices. It is to be regretted that the Church in Asia has not been able to fulfil the potential implicit in the great work which has been accomplished in the countries of the East. There is no denying that the Church in Asia, through its primary agency, the Mission Church, has been "both salt and light in the world where it exists."⁸⁸ But the creative power has been diffused, the transforming force dissipated, by practices which hindsight could too glibly denounce. Without any desire to do this, it cannot be denied that one of the effects of paternalism upon the Mission Church was the emphasis upon organization and the Church as a formed institution, especially as this is too often accompanied by a relegation of the spirit of Christ and his way of life to a secondary position.⁸⁹

88. Hocking, ed., Op.cit., p. 82.

89. Ibid., p. 82.

The result has been the establishment of ecclesiastical machinery at the expense of the freedom of the Spirit. Maternal concern on the part of the missionary resulted in the erection of a "pre-fabricated" church, sincerely designed to provide the necessary shelter from pagan influences. In this concern to protect the new Christian, sincere confusion between pagan and non-Western practices may be detected. Pagan practices are those which are antithetical to the spirit and pattern of the Gospel; as such, they are to be guarded against as degrading in influence. But the failure to distinguish between non-Western practices and those that are pagan resulted in a failure to build a church which could act as a channel for the Spirit in the Asian situation. "It is as the Holy Spirit has opportunity for his work that this can be accomplished and something new and original created."⁹⁰ However, it is precisely at this point that the operation of the Holy Spirit is frustrated.

1) A practical denial of the Holy Spirit

Paternalism in the administration of the Mission Church effectively frustrates the work of the Holy Spirit through the fact that foreign rather than national administrative practices and personnel are both an initial and continuing fact. The church is too often made passive by the view that it is incapable of self-life. This is not true except in the church which is indoctrinated to this view. The development of church life is dependent upon the activity of the Holy Spirit in the lives of the membership; this is made improbable if not impossible under any organization which

O. Freytag, Spiritual Revolution, p. 202, cf. pp. 202-206.

assumes that the members are incapable of self-life and thus, for practical purposes omits the Holy Spirit.⁹¹

2) Two misapprehensions

This practical denial of the Holy Spirit is based upon two misapprehensions. That they are sincere does not mitigate the fact of the effect upon church government and administration and its effect upon church life.

a) Spiritual weakness a barrier

On the one hand, there is the feeling that the proper polity and worship cannot be instituted because of the spiritual weakness of the new Christians. This fails to take into consideration the tremendous work of the Spirit at Pentecost, which changed the Old Testament sacerdotal (kahal) into the witnessing Ekklesia of the New Testament.⁹² As a result, it is mistakenly but widely held that there are three necessary stages in the planting of the Church. First, the missionary introduces his system, doing everything for the convert. Second, the converts learn and understand the missionary's system and can practice it. Three, they may then conceivably modify it.⁹³

91. Hollis, Paternalism, p. 68.

92. Boer Harry R., Pentecost and Missions. (London: Lutterworth Press, 1964), p. 113. Dr. Harry R. Boer writes on this subject with a background of personal experience as a missionary of the Christian Reformed Church of the United States working with the Sudan United Mission at its important centre in Gindiri in Northern Nigeria. His emphasis upon the work of the Holy Spirit is made on the basis of his work with the African Church.

93. Allen, Op.cit., p. 188. Neill, Anderson and Goodwin, eds., Concise Dictionary of the Christian World Mission. London: Lutterworth Press, 1970, pp. 14, 15. Allen, Roland (1868-1947). An ordained Anglican priest, Allen served both as a missionary to China and a parish priest in England. He also served as an advisor to

b) Need for safeguards against practical evils

While on the one hand, the missionary is faced with the question of polity and worship, on the other hand, he is faced with the problem of major practical evils. Paternalism uses this three-stage system to prevent schism, heresy, ethical failure and lack of leadership. Allen would contend that a system such as this cannot and does not succeed; the Holy Spirit at work in the life of the Church is the best safeguard. The major practical problems are seen as coming through the frustration of the operation of the Holy Spirit. These include lack of prophetic zeal, self-realization, development of real leadership, native theology, and great advance through the release of spontaneous life.⁹⁴

The three-stage system of paternalism introduces weaknesses in polity and worship into the life of the Church. It fails to overcome or prevent the major practical problems which fall within the province of church government and

contd.]

churches and missionary organizations in various parts of the world, including Africa, where he died in Kenya in 1947. Two things marked his revolutionary concept of missionary work, concerning which he wrote many letters and books: 1) an emphasis upon the person and work of the Holy Spirit in the Ekklesia, giving a far greater emphasis upon the abilities of converts for self-hood than had been conceived in modern times; 2) Practical application of this thought in every-day situations. To him, the Holy Spirit, his initiative and power, made it imperative that we "bring all men to Christ, not...make them copy us and our institutions."

.. Ibid., p. 177.

administration. As a result, this three-stage system, in its prevention or hindrance of the free operation of the Holy Spirit, may be described as untrue in theory and pernicious in practice.⁹⁵

b. Frustration through retarded sense of responsibility

The inherent spiritual life of the Mission Church has been further frustrated through paternalistic practices which hinder or prevent the Christians from developing a sense of true spiritual responsibility. Paternalistic practices are false in the sense that their basic premise, as discussed above, is false. Therefore, false practices can only produce false results, including any sense of responsibility which may be developed. A true sense of responsibility can be developed only to the degree that the Holy Spirit is not hindered in his operation. A false sense of responsibility is developed to the degree that paternalistic practices hinder the operation of the Spirit. This is seen in three areas of church life which call for true responsibility.

1) No sense of responsibility for self-government

Christians fail to develop a true sense of responsibility for self-government when paternalistic practices hinder the operation of the Holy Spirit in church life. On the basis of the above discussion, one may question the validity of Greenslade's belief that "paternal care...has been inevitable and right",⁹⁶ but he makes a valid emphasis that the motives behind paternalism are sincere concern for

5. Ibid., p. 188.

6. Greenslade, Op.cit., p. 47.

the well-being of the converts and a desire to assist them avoid pitfalls.⁹⁷ Greenslade makes a further valid point: But if a church is to develop healthily, men must be trained to accept real responsibility and exercise it in some relation to the principles of authority natural to the society."⁹⁸ Notice first the emphasis upon training.

a) A lack of proper training

There are two extremes to which it is possible to go in the training of Christians. The first is seen in the work of Gutzlaff, who sent out bands of paid workers with very little if any training. Their own conversion was in doubt, as well. This extreme rejection of training cannot be successful, as was seen in the case of Gutzlaff.⁹⁹ The second is seen in paternalism, which is a far more common mistake. Training in church government and administration, which is the concern of this examination of the effects of paternalism, is often done through the establishment of synods or councils on which the national Christians are represented. The theory of "learn by doing" is not necessarily false, but the failure to depend upon the Holy Spirit makes missionaries over-cautious and no real control or authority is placed in the hands of the Church. The business is accomplished, the agenda is cleared, but time after time, decisions are actually directions, for real authority and responsibility remain in the hands of the foreigner. The result is agreement without harmony, the

7. Ibid., p. 48.

8. Ibid., p. 48.

9. Latourette, Missions in China, pp. 253-255.

activity of the national Christians without a sense of personal responsibility.¹⁰⁰ This is true of both the ministry and the congregational leadership.

b) A lack of cultural understanding

Greenslade's dual emphasis upon the need to train men to accept authority and also to exercise it in some relation to "the principles of authority natural to the society in which they live"¹⁰¹ is very necessary. Paternalism prevents the development of a true sense of responsibility or self-government because it is felt that there is no way in which the cultural patterns of government are suited to the Church. The confusion, mentioned previously, is the confusion of pre-Christian culture with pagan culture. Two things are overlooked. First, the cultural pattern forms are not necessarily unsuitable because of inefficiency; the people govern themselves in their daily life according to this or that pattern. Second, the cultural pattern forms are not necessarily unsuitable because of intrinsic unfitness. For example, tribal government is traditionally oriented to consensus leadership. This does not mean that it is sinful; what may be seen is that a more authoritarian form of government, such as episcopacy, cuts across the long-established cultural patterns. If the ecclesiastical forms and administrative practices are Western rather than African, rooted in the history of the West rather than the culture of the people, the correspondence with the

100. Allen, Op.cit., pp. 185, 186.

101. Greenslade, loc. cit.

principles of authority natural to the particular society will be more a result of good fortune than good judgment. This will be discussed more fully below; it must suffice for now to show that when men are not trained properly nor allowed to use their own forms of responsibility and authority, there will be a negative reaction toward the assumption of authority and self-government in the Church.

"It comes as a shock to the visitor to discover that indigenization often seems to be mainly a missionary concern."¹⁰² That it should not come as a shock, for the church which has no interest in becoming indigenous is only responding to the conditioning which it has received. Christians in Asia will act responsibly when given freedom; they act unwillingly without responsibility when given direction. They do nothing many times, because they feel the responsibility is the missionary's.¹⁰³ It is recorded, for example that the main concern of the Scottish Churches in eastern India in 1823 was the establishment and upbuilding of the Church.¹⁰⁴ But after one hundred years, when the mission tried "devolution" in the 1920's, it had to be abandoned after two years, because the Christians did not show a sense of responsibility.¹⁰⁵ In another situation, the mission body of another Western church sent a question to the assembly of the Church, composed of national pastors and Christians, with a request for an opinion. The reply

102. Abrecht, Op.cit., p. 59.

103. Allen, Op.cit., p. 186.

104. Hewat, loc. cit.

105. Hewat, Op.cit., p. 59.

ame back, "Why do you bother to consult us? We know that at the end you will make the decision exactly as it pleases you."¹⁰⁶

2) No sense of responsibility for self-support

There is a definite link between no true sense of responsibility for self-government and the failure to develop a true sense of responsibility for self-support. It is doubtful whether any single thing has brought weakness in life and morale to the (Mission) Church to the same extent as has the payment of foreign subsidies."¹⁰⁷ At, once again, the motives behind paternalistic subsidy are of the best. The poverty of the people, the wealth of the West and the need to establish the Church are undisputable; nevertheless, it is said that this system produces commercialism, parasites, stifled initiative and false centres of power.

a) A result of paternalistic subsidies

This may be seen in the experience of a missionary in Hong Kong. The Mission Church to which he had been assigned had been founded and operated by a paternalistic missionary. When this missionary left suddenly, it was the task of the newly assigned missionary to try to initiate a viable programme of self-support. The feelings of many of the older Christians were expressed by one old lady when the programme was explained by the missionary: "When I joined the Church, I was given food and clothing. The

¹⁰⁶ Neill, Stephen, Creative Tension, p. 89.

¹⁰⁷ Hocking, Op.cit., p. 108.

and missionary paid for my medicine when I was sick, and the pastor was paid from America. Why should I start to give to the Church now, when the Church has given to me for ten years?"¹⁰⁸ The stifled initiative and establishment of false centres of power may be seen in the discussion held in this same Mission Church about the payment of salaries to the workers. The missionary was not willing to act as laymaster, insisting that there should be a Chinese to act as treasurer for the Church and issue the checks. The objection was raised by some pastors that if the missionary did not hold the checkbook, the layman who had been elected as treasurer would use his position to exert undue influence upon the pastors and other mission employees.¹⁰⁹

b) A result of paternalistic financial practices

The way in which paternalism thus affects the sense of true responsibility for self-support is in the relation between finances and the power structure of the Church. Hollis shows that in at least five ways, finances remain the key to the power structure in the Mission Church.¹¹⁰ First, the financial facts in the life of the Church are not revealed to the early Christians, and even when a national Christian or group of Christians share in the administration of finances, these facts are not fully revealed by the missionary. Second, audited accounts may be either partially revealed or manipulated to conceal funds at the disposal of the mission treasurer for favoured

8. Unpublished records of China Free Methodist Mission. Hong Kong Field.

9. Ibid.

10. Hollis, Paternalism, pp. 64, 65.

projects. Third, there is a general reluctance to hand over the true financial control to the national church. Fourth, sponsoring societies show a conscious or unconscious reference for the report of senior missionaries over that of the proper national body. Fifth, dispersal of private funds by missionaries contributes to two problems. There is an unwillingness to expand, for this would mean more to share the bounty. There is also the difficulty entailed in the change from mission national control. When the national church takes control of finances, private funds are not given over with mission funds. This withdrawal of private resources leads to resentment, both between the national Christians within their own group, and against the individual missionary for withdrawing these funds. It can even lead, in extreme cases, to charges against the nationals responsible for administration, for the difference between private funds and mission funds is not easily understood.

It is in these ways that the paternalistic church government and administrative practices of the Mission Church prevent the national Christians from feeling true responsibility for self-support, but "no church in any land will be robust and virile until it supports itself out of its own resources through its own endeavours."¹¹¹

3) No sense of responsibility for self-propagation

It may also be shown that there is no development of true sense of responsibility for self-propagation, for

11. Hocking, Op.cit., p. 108.

his is stifled by paternalistic ecclesiastical and administrative structures in the Mission Church. These structures are often felt to be necessary to promote evangelism and outreach because the national Christians are inexperienced and untrained.

a) New converts held incapable

Once again, this overlooks the power and presence of the Holy Spirit in the life of the Church. The missionary witness of the Church begins "at the precise moment" of the descent of the Holy Spirit, and this is the theme and development of the Book of Acts. The Holy Spirit was, and is, the genesis and dynamic of the expansion of Christianity.¹¹²

b) Converts made incapable

While these structures are intended for the good of the Church, by their practical denial of the Holy Spirit, the possible good which they might achieve is negated by the failure to allow the Church to be truly evangelistic. The true mission society is the Church itself,...for both the expression and the creation of the mission sentiment in the Church...one of the most important wants is that the church should representatively be its own administrator."¹¹³ The example from among many possible will suffice to illustrate the truth of this. A Mission Church in Delhi was the subject of a survey in 1910 and it was found that there was almost no evangelism. The church had become an

2. Boer, Op.cit., p. 109.

3. Lawrence, Op.cit., p. 253.

incapsulated social unit, indifferent to the needs of others outside and unable to open the gates to Christianity to those outside the quam. Examination of the organizational forms shows the debilitating pattern described above. The missionaries were acting as supervisors, the pastors were responsible to the missionaries, and, concerned only with their own flocks, did no real evangelism. The people had neither initiative nor incentive to do evangelistic work.¹¹⁴ This is not to say that these Christians could not have done the work of evangelism. Even Christians who are new converts can be effective witnesses. They can from "the beginning be the Body of Christ in that place and start to manifest the diversity of gifts which the Spirit provides to each man severally as he will."¹¹⁵ One Mission Church is holding discussions on how many village congregations could carry on simple weekly worship and preaching without the presence of a paid pastor. In one area the pastor was quite certain that such activity was impossible. It was obviously out of the question, for "they had only been Christians for twenty-five years."¹¹⁶

c. Summary statement

Ecclesiastical organization and administrative practice which is meant to build the Church is thus seen to frustrate the spiritual life of the Mission Church. The operation of the Spirit is hindered and frustrated, and the result is a lack of a true sense of responsibility in

4. Hayward, ed., Op.cit., p. 42.

5. Hollis, Paternalism, p. 68.

6. Ibid., p. 68.

piritual matters. The Christians have no true sense of responsibility for self-government, for self-government or for self-propagation. The Church does not grow properly or mature normally. The problem lies not with the Christians but with the forms and practices which paternalism persists in using within the Mission Church.

In the establishment of a new Church, Christ, through the preached Word, creates a human fellowship, and allows this to take shape in a human organization. Such a human organization intended for divine purposes must consider arrangements for worship, common prayer and the hearing of the Word, the keeping of the Lord's day and the administration of the sacraments. There will thus be created a necessity for the offices of the minister and the church leaders, the service of love towards the members of the Church, and the common Church life. This will include the mutual training of the will in church discipline, offerings and other financial administration, church customs and conventions to be observed in both church and private life. Further aspects of church life must include considerations such as the education of the young, the training of office bearers and missionary work. At this point, it is necessary to discuss the effects of paternalism upon authority for church government and the administration and the relationships within the Church.

C. A False Base for Authority in the Ekklesia

The polity and administrative practices of the Mission Church are subject to criticism because paternalism has

esulted in a false base of authority. It has been seen that Protestants accept the Word of God as the ultimate standard of practice and polity. However, it may be shown that sincere but paternalistic practices have resulted in the substitution of Western politics and administrative procedures as standards for the development of the Church in Asia. Basic Biblical principles have been overlooked which has thus resulted in a real contrast between the development of the Mission Church as it should be and as it is in Asia today.

1. The importance of a proper base for authority.

One must understand the importance of proper authority for church government and administration in the development of a viable organization. This is an issue with real theological significance. Protestants have rejected the Catholic theological basis of authority for church government. It is rightly felt that God is not given his rightful place as the final source of authority; however, it is in the Mission Church that the Protestants have developed organizational forms based upon Western Church history and experience in the application of their interpretation of the Bible to the formation of church government. This may be discussed in detail below. It is necessary at present to consider if this is an important issue, one which should cause concern.

It has already been shown that one of the basic reasons which was given for the establishment of Protestantism at the formation was a very real concern for church structure. In the area of authority for church government, it was felt

that the hierarchy had substituted tradition and their own authority as men for the Word of God and his authority. The result was a pyramidal structure which concentrated power at the apex. Today there is a similar pyramidal authority which is criticized as inefficient and unworkable. The defect may be traced to a lack of proper authority for church government.

Niles states, "A pyramidal administrative structure covering all forms of the church's life with final authority resident at the apex of the pyramid will in reality soon become a mausoleum."¹¹⁷ The reality of such a structure and the place of the paternalistic missionary at the apex will be seen in the discussion on relationships within the Mission Church. But the attention of this study is focused at this point on the importance of structure.

Structure within the Church is of great importance to the adequate fulfilling of the functions of the Church as a human organization intended for divine purposes. "The structure of the Church determines to a large extent whether it will be the living community of God's people or whether it will succumb to clericalism, formalism and conformity to class or group views."¹¹⁸ Events in China, where a communist regime has deprived the Church of its central institutions and administrative machinery and made it totally sever its connections with the West have shown the importance of building up the people of God. Structure is

117. Niles, Op.cit., p. 149.

118. Abrecht, Op.cit., p. 56.

important because it serves as an end to this purpose.¹¹⁹
 This can be done only when church government is based upon
 the proper authority.

2. Paternalism as a false base of authority.

It may be seen that paternalistic structures are not
 based upon proper authority; this becomes clear through an
 examination of the contrast between the New Testament
 standard and the paternalistic organization of the Mission
 Church.

Missionaries in the nineteenth century went out as
 representatives of denominational protestantism, marked both
 by divisions of doctrine and polity. It was their conviction
 that in representing their particular branch of Protestantism
 they were "bearers of a sacred church model."¹²⁰ They went
 into an Asian situation which was without Christ and
 pervasively sinful. An admirable concern for their converts
 led them to unadmirable paternalism. The result was that
 they established a foreign-made system. Note, however, that
 this foreign-made system was based upon the Word of God; as
 such, the system was correct, but only within the conditioning
 social and cultural milieu of the West. The mistake was the
 transportation of this conditioned system from the West to the
 East, and the regard of this Western system as God's plan for
 church government and administration in the East. When
 this system was imposed upon the converts, it ignored in
 large measure the racial habits of the people which it was

19. Firth, Op.cit., p. 257.

20. Hocking, Op.cit., p. 84.

tended to serve. The long stages of development in the ethical and religious culture of the people, their customs of family life and clan life, their traditional proclivities of art and worship and organized group effort were subordinated to the erection of that "sacred model" borne from the homeland.¹²¹

Previous mention has been made of the criticism which Allen makes of the "three-stage" system which missionaries used to erect their own form of church government. Boer would agree with Allen in this analysis of the three stages of development within the Mission Church. He emphasizes that this is not the approach of the New Testament; the stage of mission control as a protracted stage in the life of the Church is a pattern of which the New Testament knows nothing.¹²² But he makes a valid criticism of Allen's thesis that St. Paul should be the model missionary. The problem is not that of failure to follow the Apostles; the problem is the failure to follow the Christian doctrine of life in the Spirit and Liberty in Christ.¹²³ The paternalistic missionaries were following the pattern of church government set for the West by the Reformers; to follow St. Paul is merely to remove dependence upon men from one place to another. Missionary work must always remain Christocentric, and the recognition of the central place of the Spirit of Christ in leading the Church into all truth is a far more scriptural way of procedure than the introduction of even Apostolic patterns. Life in Christ is the

1. Ibid., pp. 84-85.

2. Boer, Op.cit., p. 221.

3. Ibid., p. 222.

promised "life abundant", and this life expresses itself through the Spirit in a multiplicity of ways.

"Where men live in societies with age-old customs and usages the renewal of the individuals will mean a renewal of the social patterns in which they live. But it will be a renewing of existing patterns just as the renewal of the individual is a renewal and purification of the existing individual."¹²⁴

It must be remembered that the Gentile churches had Gentile patterns, not a transposed and imposed Jewish pattern. The form given to the ecclesiastical life of the converts has too often forgotten this very principal significance of the gift of the Spirit."¹²⁵

3. The effects of paternalistic policies.

The effects of paternalistic imposition of church government and administration based upon the authority of the Western Church rather than upon the authority of the principles of Scripture may be seen in at least two ways.

a. The effect on overcoming obstacles to church growth

There is a disparity between the scriptural pattern and the paternalistic pattern in overcoming obstacles to church growth. This has led to real problems within the Mission Church.

1) The New Testament Pattern

There are at least four obstacles to the development of a strong, growing community of God's people. All of them are closely connected to church government and administration. MacGavran traces these obstacles and the New Testament means by which they may be overcome.¹²⁶

4. Ibid., p. 222.

5. Ibid., p. 223.

6. MacGavran, Op.cit., p. 192ff.

First, there is the financial obstacle. The finances of the church must necessarily be tailored to the needs and abilities of the church. This would include the cost of place to worship, as well as the provisions of finance for other aspects of worship. This was solved through the house-church method. Second, there was the problem of cultural differences. Here, the Jews and the Gentiles are separated, literally, if not visibly, by a wall of tradition, history, religion and culture. This was solved by taking into account the factors of people-consciousness, language, and unique self-image as polity and practice was developed. Third, there is the obstacle of introversion. Structures had to be devised which would prevent the encapsulation of the church. This was done by attention to the total cultural and social aspects of the society in which each church was located. As in other matters, this was done without benefit of an honours degree in social anthropology. The Holy Spirit was given freedom to operate within the church and natural structures were found. The fourth obstacle is that of a limited leadership. "Each house-church thrust the responsibilities and prestige of leadership on able men of the new congregation."¹²⁷ This enabled the new congregation to avoid the administrative problems of over-concentration of authority, unwelcome outside leadership, and the problems caused by lack of local knowledge on local problems.

7. Ibid., p. 193.

2) The paternalistic pattern

The paternalistic pattern uses a totally different approach to these four obstacles. First, paternalism supplies the financial needs of the church by the use of subsidies. The needs of the church are considered in terms of the West, and so the building, the furniture and the other aspects of financial consideration are furnished by the missionary by subsidizing the church and supplying that which could and should be supplied by the converts if Asian needs and tastes were taken into consideration. The result is a pauperized church.¹²⁸ The problem of cultural differences is overcome by causing the church to unite in Western polity and practice, under the leadership of the missionary. Third, the problem of introversion is not overcome; as seen above, the paternalistic Mission Church is ineffective in outreach and tends to become an isolated social unit. Fourth, the problem of limited leadership is overcome by supplying pastors trained upon the Western pattern to reproduce the Western pattern. These were chosen, trained and paid by the missionary.¹²⁹

The basing of church government upon the authority of the Western Church rather than the Bible is seen as a readily transplanted of organizational forms which have not been as successful as could be desired in meeting the Western situation.¹³⁰ But Allen goes further in his criticism of the practices of paternalism. He speaks

8. Allen, Op.cit., p. 75.

9. Hollis, Paternalism, p. 49.

10. Allen, Op.cit., pp. 174-175.

austically of the transplantation of the home organization of Judaizing, drawing a close parallel between the struggles of St. Paul in his missionary work with the problems presented by the Christians who wanted to impose the Jewish law upon the non-Jewish churches.¹³¹ Inasmuch as there are theological implications of law and grace, this parallel should not be pressed too far. It is valuable, however, to the extent that it calls attention to the problems involved in church government which continue to have bearing upon present-day matters.

b. The effect on church life

While all church life is primarily concerned with the immediate situation, in the sense that problems which must be solved are primarily of immediate concern, there is at the same time an inescapable relationship to both the past and the future. Thus, within all churches, and especially within a Mission Church if it is encumbered with the pyramidal structure found in paternalism, there is the problem of precedent. There is not only the immediate question of the effects of a given solution upon a given problem; there is the question of precedents which have been set in times past, and the further question of what precedent will be set by decisions taken at the present time. The effect of paternalistic imposition of church government and administration based upon the authority of the Western church rather than upon the authority of Scripture has placed precedent in a false position as an arbiter of activity.

¹³¹ Ibid., p. 177.

Hanson suggests that there are two valid means whereby practice may be determined. Precedent takes its rightful place within this framework. There is first of all Biblical authority. Then, where there is no definitive scriptural authority, the practice of the early church may be taken as a guide.¹³² This would seem agreeable to the general consensus of Protestant opinion, especially if the emphasis were properly placed upon the principle behind the practice. However, Allen points out that ecclesiastical precedent is too often enshrined in the administration of Mission Churches without adequate consideration of these scriptural precepts or principles.

"In our dealings with our native converts we habitually appeal to law. We attempt to administer a code which is alien to the thought of the people with whom we have to deal, we appeal to precedents which are no precedents to them, and we quote decisions of which our hearers do not understand either the history or the reason. Without satisfying their minds or winning the consent of their consciences we settle all questions with a word."¹³³

1) No adequate training for daily life

The result upon the church and the people is bad because there is no adequate training for ordinary daily life. The people are unconvinced, they are uneducated, they are taught unquestioning obedience.¹³⁴ Thus, no satisfactory standard for behaviour is available when a situation which needs solution through principle rather than commandment arises within the life of the individual or the church. Then the missionary, and then the leaders whom he has

2. Hanson, Op.cit., p. 152.

3. Allen, Op.cit., p. 152.

4. Ibid., p. 152.

ained, follow this practice, the people of God are not given the proper instruction for spiritual growth and there is no basis for spiritual maturity through proper spiritual nurture. It is this administrative pattern which prompts me to state, "There is consistent failure on the part of the churches today to teach the people how to cope with the complex issues and problems in the increasing diversity of the daily round of life."¹³⁵ Christians in non-Christian lands have an even more difficult task in living the new life in the old culture. The West may or may not be a post-Christian culture; Asia is without question still a pre-Christian culture.

2) No adequate basis for discipline

What happens when the new Christian fails to live the new life in the old culture? The question of discipline is of great importance in the administrative practices of any church. Even today, many Mission Churches would seem to be failing to meet the needs of church life in this vital area. There is too often a contrast between the practices of the New Testament and the practices of the missionary. The New Testament way was an appeal to the Christian conscience and the congregational conscience rather than reliance upon arbitrary commands. The Holy Spirit was given its rightful place as the leader of the congregation, and this obviated the necessity for external authority to an extent seldom seen on the mission field. The missionary too often appeals to precedent, consults his fellow

¹³⁵ Neve, Op.cit., p. 22.

missionaries, and issues an edict for the church to follow.¹³⁶
 at this too often ignores or incorrectly interprets the
 collectivist way of life which, in one form or another,
 is the social foundation of all non-Christian races."¹³⁷

4. A summary statement

It has been seen, then, that paternalistic church government and administrative practices are subject to criticism because they are based upon the authority of the Western Church rather than upon the proper authority of God in the Bible. The importance of proper authority for church government was shown, and the contrast between paternalistic principles and scriptural practices was examined. It was seen that the effects of church government in overcoming obstacles to church growth were related to the authority upon which church government was based, and it was further seen that paternalism, as it affects church government and administration fails to give the proper guidance for the church or Christian in daily life. There is also the question of proper discipline. Both of these are related to the reliance of paternalism upon precedent and external authority.

A Distortion of Relationships in the Ekklesia

There is a final ground for criticism of the effects of paternalism upon the church government and administration of the Mission Church: The pyramidal structure characteristic of paternalism is not true to the theological basis

16. Allen, Op.cit., pp. 151-152.

17. Goodall, Norman, ed., International Review of Missions. "Mission Strategy in the New Age", Merle J. Davis, July 1946, pp. 303-13, p. 312.

proper relationships within the Church. This may be seen in two ways.

1. Paternalism and decision-making structures.

An examination of the decision-making structures within the Mission Church reveals that paternalism imposes forms upon the church which are alien and unsuited to the life of the church. The result is distortion in the relationships between the members of the Body of Christ.

a. The concept of "people-consciousness"

One of the most important factors in any consideration of the decision-making structures of the church is the concept of "people-consciousness". "A homogenous unit of society may be said to have 'people-consciousness' when they think of themselves as a separate tribe, caste or class."¹³⁸ An example of such a group is found in the Hakkas people of Taiwan. These people are Chinese by nationality and racial characteristics; however, they consider themselves to be a separate group within the Chinese nation.¹³⁹ This people-consciousness is reflected in all aspects of their life, including the meaning of their group name, which may be translated "Guest in the Home". They are extremely conservative, strongly idolatrous, and generally resistant to the Gospel. This people-consciousness poses a problem to the planting of a church; it poses further and perhaps more serious threat in the development of such administrative structures as policy-making and executive bodies within the church. With the low people-

8. MacGavran, Op.cit., p. 190.

9. MacKay, Op.cit., p. 102.

consciousness of the Western background, this may seem a minor problem. But the experience of missionaries on Taiwan shows that if a pastor from the mainland of China is assigned to one of these Hakka congregations, it is an affront to this people-consciousness. He cannot, because of his cultural background, be accepted into the decision-making process of the church. Where paternalistic practices exist that this is a situation where the love of Christ must break down barriers of hostility, real problems may arise. The problem lies so deep within the social fabric that, while Christian unity and the operation of such social factors as common education will eventually lower the level of people-consciousness, this will necessarily take time. At present, it is possible to accommodate the structure of the church to make use of this group-consciousness in decision-making for the building of the church. Where extra-congregational organization refuses to recognize the necessity to have pastors who can lead social units with strong people-consciousness, there will be two results. Either the church will passively accept the pastor and passively place the entire burden of administration upon him, or they will effectively ostracize him. Paternalism cannot force the church to accept alien relationships.

b. The reality of "language-worlds"

Another factor in the decision-making process of church administration which paternalism too often ignores is the existence of the two worlds caused by language differences. There is the first world, that of "our

intimates who speak our own language". This is the world of personal importance; the second world is much less important; and is that world of "a strange tongue in which we trade and work with outsiders".¹⁴⁰ If decision-making is considered of importance to the administrative structure of the church it must be done in the mother tongue. In the Mission Church founded by one of the Lutheran groups in Hong Kong, there are three language groups. Apart from the missionaries, there are those Chinese-Christians who speak Mandarin. The third, and potentially largest group, are the native Cantonese. However, the missionary group is composed of personnel who formerly served on the mainland of China; they speak Mandarin, in common with the minority group of Chinese. Therefore, church councils and other administrative meetings are conducted in Mandarin. This has resulted in a "Mandarin" complexion for this Hong Kong Lutheran church. The potentially larger group of Cantonese people are not being reached in this Lutheran church.¹⁴¹

c. The presence of a cultural power-structure

A third factor in decision-making which is often overlooked in the paternalistic practices of the Mission Church is the power-structure of a people. This is the elite of a given ethne or homogenous group. Each segment of society has its own power structure or aristocracy.

140. MacGavran, Op.cit., p. 193.

141. Conference of Mission leaders, Hong Kong YMCA, June, 1968.

actors in the power structure are: birth into the right family; wealth; skin colour; religious talents; the recognition of wisdom, age and experience.¹⁴² If this power structure is ignored, grave problems can arise in church government and administration. One Methodist group in Taiwan had a flourishing work among the aborigines, led by a brilliant and spiritual young man who was well-accepted by his tribe, although from the lowest social strata of the tribe. However, problems arose when pastors from the highest social strata graduated from Bible school and were ordained. The leadership of the one young man was rejected in favour of those who were members of the power-structure of the tribe. Time and the Christianization of the villages led the aboriginal church to return to the superior leadership of the original pastor, but there could have been grave problems if the existence of the power-structure of the tribe had been ignored by the conference organization of the larger Church. Yet, this is the general practice in Mission Churches, for missionaries are placed in positions of authority with total disregard of natural power-structures.

It has been the assumption that any missionary, however junior, inexperienced or otherwise unqualified, might be assigned to any piece of work. It was equally assumed that he would be in charge, unless there were a senior missionary under whom he would then work.¹⁴³ The reaction

2. MacGavran, Op.cit., p. 185.

3. Hollis, Paternalism, p. 50.

the Christians to this may be seen when they are given voice. One missionary was not allowed to return to Japan from furlough, at the request of the Japanese Church. The reason given was that he was no longer needed. What was really meant was that the pastors resented working under his leadership because he was both a foreigner and not as capable as they.¹⁴⁴ He had been elevated above the natural power-structure by virtue of his status as a missionary; the result was that his abilities, which lay in other lines than administrative leadership, were eventually denied to the Japanese Church.

d. The introduction of Western structures

A fourth factor in decision-making processes in the paternalistic Mission Church is the introduction of Western structures for decision-making into the Asian situation. This also can cause problems for the establishment of viable church government and administrative organization.

1) Made ineffective by non-Western situation

Church structures for decision-making in the West are seen by many as less than effective. Dickinson, in a study for the World Council of Churches, has come to the conclusion that too often the existing church structures are both overly conservative and not conducive to effective decision-making. There is also a tendency to support the status quo.¹⁴⁵ (The relationship to the discussion above concerning the place of

-
4. Conversation with Dr. Charles Kirkpatrick, Missionary Secretary of the Free Methodist Church, Winona Lake, Ind., 1967.
 5. Dickinson, Richard, Line and Plummet. (Geneva: World Council of Churches, 1968), p. 74.

ecedent in paternalistic churches may be seen.) If this granted for the Western situation, the implications for the Mission Church in Asia are of even greater importance. Further study is suggested for areas of importance to the Mission Church. First, in what way is it possible to bring greater diversity and participation into decision-making? Second, how can a broad spectrum of laymen be involved? Third, how can youth be responsible in a way that capitalizes on their unorthodoxy, enthusiasm and questioning of vested interests?¹⁴⁶

2) Procedural differences

A further problem in decision-making in the Mission Church is seen in the very procedures involved. Western nations have a history of parliamentary procedure and democratic (majority decision) activity. Asian nations look more to power structure and consensus for direction. For this reason, the congregational meeting may well be a viable form for many oriental cultures, such as the Chinese, which emphasize the attainment of group consensus rather than majority decision.¹⁴⁷ The frustration of the missionary who acts as chairman of a committee meeting might be lessened or not eliminated by a realization that decision may be reached by consensus, without a public commitment such as a formal vote. In the Philippines, the missionary may often end a meeting to what he considers a successful conclusion, only to have the natural leaders of the committee come the

6. Ibid., p. 74.

7. Peel, Inevitable Congregationalism, p. 43.

xt day and say, "Sir, we have discussed the problem and we
 I feel that the best way is...", generally completely
 fferent than the solution reached by formal vote conducted
 der Robert's Rules of Order.¹⁴⁸

2. The inherent problems of paternalistic structures

This reliance upon Western methods of decision-making
 d the corresponding failure to utilize people-consciousness,
 e world of language, and the power structure, is only one
 pect of the problem of paternalistic polity and admini-
 rative practices in the Asian situation. Missionaries of
 enty-two societies who had work in China before the
 mmunist conquest replied to the question, "What lessons
 ve you learned from missionary experience in China?"
 ong these replies were many such statements as
 hurch organization should be from the bottom up, not from
 e top down."; Too much machinery and organization, too
 ch overhead, too many 'hobbies'"; and "District,
 ovincial and (nation-wide) church organization should not
 set up until there are sufficient national Christians who
 el the need for this, and are of sufficient number to
 rrant it."¹⁴⁹ In other words, missionaries wanted to do
 ay with the pyramidal structure of the paternalistic
 urch and return to a more scriptural standard of relations
 tween the members of the Church. It was recognized that

-
8. Comment in a meeting of Free Methodist missionaries,
 made by John Schlosser, former Mission Superintendent
 in the Philippine Islands. Hong Kong, November, 1969.
 9. Mimeographed material concerning questionnaire on
 China, issued by World Headquarters, Free Methodist
 Church, on July 17, 1961.

church government and organization were wrong to the extent that they prevented this.

a. The ministry placed in false relationships

All that has been said to this point emphasizes the role of the missionary in the administration of the Mission Church and the formation of its polity. But it is just this role which focuses attention on the problem of the relationships of the indigenous worker in the Mission Church. This problem would include the question of the pattern of the ministry, self-support for the churches and their pastors, and the further question of the status and position of the pastor in the church organization. The pattern of the ministry should be considered first.

1) The pattern of the ministry

One of the essential marks of a growing church is an adequate ministry. The question of adequacy raises the further question of the pattern of training and the pattern of the ministry carried on by the trained pastors.

a) Western-style training

Is the pattern of training used in the West, with its issue of a full-time, paid ministry fundamental to the nature of the Christian ministry, or is it an uncritical transplantation to another soil of a form which has been appropriate to the Occident?¹⁵⁰ The pattern of training and resultant nature of the ministry has been determined largely by missionaries, as may be seen in a scrutiny of the curricula found in the Bible schools and seminaries of Asia.

O. Goodall, ed., Missions under the Cross, p. 197.

There is a need for greater flexibility in standards of training, and for their adaptation to the demands of different types of men for the one ministry. Above all, it should be suited to the local requirements rather than be determined by foreign patterns.¹⁵¹

b) Asian conditions

Since the form of the ministry is a result of the training for the ministry, this must also be considered in discussing paternalism and the pattern of the ministry. The Western form of the ministry is one of a paid ministry which is not expected or even permitted to do other work. Self-support has been achieved in many churches, notably the Chinese churches in Malaya, but this has often been possible only because the pastor has served as a part-time paid pastor or through the use of the laity. "Is the whole pattern of church life and the paid ministry imported by the missions irrelevant to oriental conditions, especially as they are shaping now?" The argument has proceeded for decades, but the shadow of China gives it an urgency it has never had quite before.¹⁵²

2) The status of subsidized workers

Where self-support has been achieved through the use of non-Western patterns of ministry, a great source of tension has been removed from the area of relationships within the church. This is a goal which the missionary, with a guaranteed salary from his mission society, finds

1. Ibid., p. 197.

2. Goodall, ed., Op.cit., "The World Mission of the Church: A Survey", by E.J. Bingle, pp. 142-186, p. 156.

ch easier to set before his pastors and their congregations than the pastors and the congregations find easy accept. The problem of paternalism and foreign subsidy has already been discussed, but there is a problem of finances at this point which applies to the status of the pastor and other workers. In those situations where the Mission has paid at least part of their salaries, pastors and other workers tend to regard themselves as employees of the Mission. As employees, they are dependent on the Mission and unwilling to press for self-support.¹⁵³ Sometimes, the Mission has established a salary scale unrelated to the social situation, and self-support, with the possibility of control of the salary scale passing to the congregation, is a risk which the workers are not willing to take.¹⁵⁴ When the churches are striving to become self-supporting, there is also the risk that the full salary will not be paid the pastor if the offerings are insufficient during a given period. The view of the pastor that he is an employee of the Mission is too low a view of the high calling to the ministry. The unwillingness to exercise authority and the resultant reluctant leadership toward self-reliance for the church is understandable but regrettable. These are all intertwined with the effect of paternalism in the distortion of relationships within the church and the ministry.

3. Hollis, Paternalism, p. 69.

4. See Appendix One.

a) Considered a Mission employee

When the pastor considers himself as the employee of the Mission, he is put in a false relationship to his calling as a minister and in a false relationship to the other members of the church. Many times the worker may be put in a position of authority, but this authority is only in relation to the other nationals. He has been neither trained nor encouraged to think independently, and this carries over into almost all areas of his ministry. He is not expected to criticize or innovate; his place is to carry out the tasks assigned to him and to operate the administrative machinery which had been established by his missionary.¹⁵⁵ The worker has been chosen, trained and paid by the missionary; because he was chosen by the missionary, there developed a natural sense of obligation and dependence, especially natural within the framework of Asian culture.¹⁵⁶ Because the worker is paid by the missionary, he is careful not to "break his rice-bowl" by displeasing his superior. The worker who has been chosen and trained in this way, and who receives his salary from the missionary for performing the tasks set by the missionary is also regarded by the other Christians as an agent of the missionary rather than of the church.¹⁵⁷ The result is a debilitating relationship between the congregation and their pastor.

5. Hollis, Paternalism, P. 53.

6. Comment by John H. Schlosser, Op.cit.

7. Hollis, Paternalism, p. 49.

b) Pastor-congregation relationships suffer

The failure of paternalism in the government and administration of the Mission Church centres about this point of this unhealthy relationship between the pastor and the congregation. This relationship is debilitating in three ways.

(1) No mutual responsibility

First, there is no sense of mutual responsibility between the pastor and his people. The pastor is regarded as someone assigned by the missionary, and as such, he is supported by the missionary. There is no natural compulsion to meet responsibility for his needs. On the other hand, the pastor tends to disregard his flock in the sense that his first feeling of responsibility is to the missionary rather than the church. It is a fact recognized by both pastor and people that the missionary is the one man to whom they are all ultimately responsible.

(2) Congregational development retarded

The second problem arises in the context of the first. The congregations in paternalistic Mission Churches do not develop a strong, virile life because they are not really given the opportunity to decide what they sense to be God's purpose for them. The power structure encourages them to let others decide or simply let their responsibility go by default. "Structures need to be developed which encourage Christians to decide freely what God's will is, and to work out in their own place."¹⁵⁸

8. Neve, Op.cit., p. 32.

(3) Reproduces paternalistic pattern

The third feature of the relationship between the pastor and the congregation which is the unfortunate result of paternalistic policies is the reproduction of those policies on the congregational level. It is essentially the whole local congregation which should share responsibility at the local level. But the pastor has neither the example nor the inclination to organize his church in this manner. He tries to organize his own ministry to cover the entire range of needs of the church. This is the pattern which he has learned from working with the missionary, but it is a structural managerial pattern and results in a spiritual managership. It is at best benevolent paternalism and at worst totalitarianism.¹⁵⁹

b. Laity ignored

With this type of missionary-pastor-people vertical relationship, one may see the difficulty, if not the possibility, of achieving the realization of the potential and necessary riches which are found in that church which makes full and wise use of the laity.

"The corporate priesthood of the whole Body involves a membering in the ministry in which every member has a special function to perform, according to the measure of grace given to him, in the life and growth of the Body and its mission in the Evangel."¹⁶⁰

Arrington cites the Encyclical Letter of Bishops, issued from the 1958 Lambeth Conference: "There is a growing recognition today that too sharp a distinction has been made

9. Ibid., p. 33.

10. Torrance, Royal Priesthood, p. 103.

tween clergy and laity...There is a ministry for every member of Christ."¹⁶¹ The distinction between clergy and laity is a luxury which cannot be afforded in the spiritually stilted world of Asia if the Church of Christ is to fulfil its mission. The place of the laity in the Asian Church is one which will need close attention if they are to be restored to a place of spiritual productivity and a relationship which will allow the realization of their potential for spiritual ministry.

3. A summary statement

The structure of paternalistic Mission Churches is thus seen to be subject to criticism because it is a distortion of the proper relationships with the Church as a theological basis for church government and the resulting administration. There is a pyramidal structure in which the missionary at the apex, the pastor as his agent, and the people as the passive base all fail to fulfil their responsibilities as members of the Body of Christ.

This is first seen in the consideration of the decision-making structures within the church. The missionary exerts authority downward, through the pastor and the people. In doing this, the important factors of people-consciousness, language-worlds and the natural power-structure in the decision-making structures are ignored and circumvented. In place of the natural decision-making structures which could be developed in harmony with the total social and cultural pattern, the paternalistic

1. Warren, Op.cit., p. 110.

missionary substitutes Western structures. The weaknesses which have made these structures questioned by many in the West are even more noticeable in the Asian situation. Furthermore, the processes for decision-making in the West are much different than those in Asia, so it is difficult to correlate Asian processes with the Western structures. In these ways, there is a distortion of the natural relationships of the members of the church in their work of decision-making for church government and administration.

Further distortion of the relationships within the church is seen in a consideration of the relationships of the people to the pastor, and of the pastor to the missionary. The ministry should be of a pattern suited to the local needs, but the ministry in paternalistic Mission churches has been trained and formed in the Western pattern. Self-support is imposed on the pastor and the people rather than produced by spiritual impulses. This places the pastor in a false relationship to the congregation, for the pastor has been paid from foreign subsidies and is considered by the people and himself to be a Mission employee. In his own eyes, the pastor is hired by the Mission rather than called by God and this relationship is reflected in the view of the congregation that he is an agent of the missionary.

III. SUMMARY

This study of the effects of paternalism upon the church structures of Mission Churches has endeavoured to show that there are at least four reasons why paternalistic structures are unsatisfactory. These four reasons are directly correlated with the theological bases of church structures which have been discussed above.

Paternalistic structures are held to be unsatisfactory, for they do not express the life of the people of God in the Mission Church. Western elements, whether irrelevant or actually harmful, are carried over into church life, to the ultimate detriment of the Asian churches. Where polity and administration do express the life of the Christians, the Mission Church is benefitted and the Church Universal is then benefitted as a result. While these truths have been recognized in the past, as seen in the discussions and resolutions of the International Missionary Conferences of this century, paternalistic policies have violated the theological basis of church government which finds the root of polity and administration in the life of the people of God.

Closely related to the above criticism is the second area in which the paternalistic policies of many Western Mission Societies are felt to have failed to observe the theological bases of church government. Paternalistic structures are seen to be unsuitable for the fulfilment of the mission of the Ekklesia. The Mission Church is part of the Church Universal, and as such shares both the motives

and aims of the modern missionary movement. It is also intended to become the Indigenous Church in Asia. However, the spiritual life of the Mission Church is hindered and frustrated by paternalism; the work of the Holy Spirit is stifled, and no true sense of spiritual responsibility for self-government, self-support or self-propagation is developed. The Mission Church thus can never fulfil the mission which it shares with the Church Universal.

The third area in which paternalistic structures hinder or prevent the full development of the Mission Church is in structures of authority. Proper authority is an indispensable theological basis for church government but paternalism is seen to ignore true Biblical authority, and thus departs from the truly Protestant position. Paternalism is also seen to produce structures which have an adverse effect upon church life and church growth.

The final area in which paternalism produces inadequate structures because of an inadequate theological basis is that of relationships within the Mission Church. The Western ecclesiastical practices and structures which have been superimposed upon the Asian churches form a pyramidal structure which effectively negates natural decision-making processes. Structures for decision-making are Western rather than Asian. The inherent problem of paternalistic structures is seen in examining the actual relationships which such structures produce. The ministry is placed in a false relationship to the entire Mission Church through the Western pattern of the ministry, the

lated efforts toward self-support, and his relationships with the Mission Society and the congregations. Such relationships also prevent the Mission Church from utilizing the full potential of the laity.

Thus, paternalistic structures are unsatisfactory as seen in the Mission Church. Paternalism is seen to fail as a satisfactory expression of the life of the Asian churches, to fail in establishing a proper basis of authority within the Mission Church, to fail in fulfillment of the mission of the Ekklesia through the Mission Church, and, finally, to fail in establishing and maintaining proper relationships within the Mission Church.

CHAPTER FIVE

CHURCH STRUCTURES AND THE NATURE OF THE CHURCH

I. A STATEMENT IN REVIEW

At this juncture, it might be well to review briefly the development of this study thus far. Four theological bases for church government and administration have been cited: 1) Church structures in relation to the nature of the Ekklesia; 2) Church structures in relation to authority within the Ekklesia; 3) Church structures as they concern the relationships within the Ekklesia; 4) Church structures in their effects upon the purpose and mission of the Ekklesia. From a study of these four bases of church government, it has been shown that there is no theological barrier to the pragmatic adaptation of polity and practice to promote all the functions of the Ekklesia, but most important, to promote the function of church growth.

Turning from this portion of the study, a survey was made of paternalism in the Mission Churches of Asia. Paternalism was first defined and then illustrated; finally, the effects of paternalistic structures and practices were discussed. It was seen that if the four theological bases of church government were used as a standard, the form of church government resulting from paternalism must be viewed as unsatisfactory.

Attention must now be directed toward the churches in Asia, with the purpose of determining, if possible, how unsatisfactory are the polities and practices now in operation.

ce again, the standard of judgment will be the four theological bases of church government. Pragmatic adaptation, within the framework of these four bases, may be seen to be desirable.

II. CHURCH GOVERNMENT IN RELATION TO THE NATURE OF THE CHURCH

As in the previous discussion of the nature of the church, it is impossible to enter into a detailed discussion of ecclesiology. The basis of this portion of the study must be the brief exegetical section on the nature of the church. However, the discussion between the Protestant and Catholic points of view concerning the esse of the church allows a generalization to be made. Protestants would deny that the Church is essentially an organization. It must be understood that in this denial, Protestants would only deny that the Church cannot exist apart from any form of organization; it is fully accepted that the church profits from organized forms designed to benefit the church. In the Protestant view, the life of the Church flows through the channel of organization rather than subsisting in the organization as a life-form.

The study of the Historic Episcopate showed that the Anglo-Catholic and Roman Catholic insistence upon the historic episcopate equated the very life of the Church with the presence of the form of government. The study of paternalism showed a tendency on the part of missionaries to view the Mission Society, the supervision of the missionary, and the adherence to the introduced polity transported from

e West, as essential to life of the Asian churches. The Catholic view was rejected on theological grounds; the legalistic attitude was rejected on both theological and practical grounds. From both of these examples, it becomes clear that the nature of the Church is not dependent upon any particular form of organization.

The Incarnational Nature of the Ekklesia

Protestants today would seem to agree that the Church is a living, God-constituted organism whose nature must be determinative of the organization through which its life is expressed. It may be seen that the nature of the Church is inevitably linked with the structures of the churches...polity, ministry and administrative practices.

Christ's relation to the Church has already been discussed. The Church is the Body of Christ and Christ is the Head of the Church. But it would be well, perhaps, to emphasize at this point that it is this relationship which is so important to a proper understanding of the nature of the Church and the effect of the nature of the Church upon all forms of organization.

Christ's relationship to the Church and to the world is essentially redemptive. Christ established the Church for the benefit of the world.¹ If this is so, then the Church can never be conceived of as simply an instrument pragmatically developed by men who saw the need for such an organization. Rather, the Church is the continuation of the expression of God's nature found in the Incarnation.²

Hoekendijk, J.C., The Church Inside Out. (London: SCM Press Ltd., 1966), p. 38.

Paton, A Faith for the World. p. 106.

1. The Biblical view.

The New Testament emphasis would seem to be positive this point. John 3:16 shows that God loved, so he sent Christ to the object of his love, the world. The purpose is the bestowal of eternal life to all who believed. The same emphasis is found in John 1:12. To all those who received Christ, the privilege was given of becoming the children of God. The Incarnational nature of the Church is seen when the Incarnation is viewed in the light of Christ's words, "As thou didst send me into the world, so I have sent them into the world."³ This relationship is made even clearer when one remembers that God was in Christ, reconciling the world to himself.⁴ On this basis, the incarnation may be said to be God-initiated, God-accomplished and God-centred, in the sense that reconciliation to God was the purpose. But always there was the central figure of Christ, God become man to bring man back to God. He was sent ἀπεστέλλω (apestello), for that purpose, and as he is sent, so is the Christian and the Church sent (apestello). The Incarnational nature of the Church places the Church in the role of reconciliation between man and God.

2. The proper theological order of reference.

It is on this basis that the issue may be taken with Salis' thesis that the truly biblical order of theological reflection is God, world, Church. In this thesis, "God is not concerned primarily with the Church, as His partner

John 17:18.

II Corinthians, 5:19.

a 'joint action' aimed at the world, but rather with the world itself. The Church is a section of the world which recognizes the universally valid Lordship of God in Jesus Christ, and thus is obedient unto God."⁵ Through this section of the world the entire world is shown what it demands of it. There are at least two reasons why this thesis may be unacceptable.

First of all, there would seem to be an unjustified assumption that the Church is generally viewed as primarily body dependent upon organization. The Church seems to be equated with organization rather than with life channelled through many forms of organization. Secondly, this thesis would seem to fail to take into serious account the fact of Christ's commission to all Christians. The Church, composed of all Christians, does not exist merely to bring men into an encounter with God, and show these men in this encounter the demands of God. Rather, the work of reconciliation, far more comprehensive than blunt encounter, is the work of the Church. The original order was God, Christ, world; Christ established a continuing order, regarding the Church as God sent him, and so it is truly biblical to speak of God, Church, world.

The Church and Missionary Activity

The reconciliation of the world to God through the Church thus demands that the nature of the Church be thought

Newbigin, Lesslie, ed., The International Review of Missions. (London: Edinburgh House, Vol. 52, 1963)
 "Structures for Missionary Congregations" by Hans J. Margull, pp. 433-46, p. 445.

in terms of missionary activity.⁶

1. The effect on church structures.

This in turn will determine the structures of the church, as was stated clearly in 1928 at the International Missionary Conference at Willingen.

"Whatever else ought to be said about the structure, life and purpose of the Church, this one thing must be said: that 'mission' is woven into all three and cannot be separated from anyone without destroying it. When God says to the Church: 'Go forth and be my witnesses', he is not giving the Church a commission that is added to its other duties; but a commission that belongs to its royal charter (covenant) to be the Church."⁷

The theological implications of church government are put into proper perspective if this commission is borne in mind. "The Church was constituted as a community sent to the world to continue Christ's work of reconciling men to the Father."⁸ From this it may be inferred that the nature of the Church is dependent upon the purpose of the church, and that both are determinative of structure. If one accepts Hoekendijk's reasoning that the "Church is only a Church to the extent that she lets herself be used as a part of God's dealings with the oikoumene (world)",⁹ then the relative place of purpose, nature and structure are more easily defined.

Takenaka, Op.cit., p. 102.

Goodall, ed., Missions Under the Cross. London: Edinburgh House Press, 1953), p. 241.

Newbiggin, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 52, 1963, "A Tent-making Ministry", pp. 47-59, p. 47.

Hoekindijk, Op.cit., p. 38.

2. Structures not essentially immutable

The historically-conditioned structures of the Western world are increasingly seen as adequate for one era, but without possessing an essential holiness which would cause them to be permanent and immutable.¹⁰ Margull points out that Western society has changed so radically since the Reformation that there is little trace of the society which the Reformers knew. However, the ecclesiastical structures of the Reformation have survived as a witness to a world which has passed away.¹¹

One must be cautious at this point, however. The fact that the civil order may have changed does not automatically prove that the ecclesiastical order should change, nor does it prove that it is necessarily antiquated.

At least theoretically, a given order might possess inherent flexibility which would make it useful for a different social order than the one in which it was originally conceived and constituted. Pragmatic factors rather than change for the sake of change must be the basis for modification.¹²

3. The need for flexibility of structures.

It is on this basis that there may be a legitimate call for greater attention to "the need for flexibility of structure, for imagination and experimentation, if the

. World Council of Churches, ed., Faith and Order Commission Papers, No. 52. "Survey of Church Union Negotiations, 1965-1967", pp. 3,4.

. Newbiggin, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 52, 1963 (Margull), p. 438.

. Examples will be shown how Western polities are at present successful in the Asian situation because of similarity in social structure.

Church is to exist as a reconciling force."¹³ It must be recognized that church "structure" cannot be used as a legitimate term if it implies that there is a final, unified structure which is an eternal "given". The use of "structures" as an alternative to this concept would be more fitting for two reasons. First, the Scriptures give no inclusive "structure"; second, the nature of the Gospel compels the Church to view all polity and administrative structures as answers, "alike in substance though different in form, given in response to the Gospel in varying situations."¹⁴ In speaking of the nature of the Gospel as a compelling force in this continual review of polity and administrative structures, attention is drawn once again to the purpose and nature of the Church. The nature of the Gospel embodies the dual aspect of God's initiative in reconciliation and the commission entrusted to reconcile men, entrusted to the Church.

The Activity of the Churches in Asia

If this be so, what are the churches in Asia doing in their part of the world to which God has commissioned them?

1. "Ecclesiastical schizophrenia".

Asia, as in other parts of the world which have not been counted as a part of the traditional Corpus Christianum, is faced with a problem which might be termed "ecclesiastical schizophrenia". The churches of Asia, to a large extent,

-
- . Faith and Order Papers, No. 52, Op.cit., p. 4.
 - . Newbiggin, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 52, 1963 (Margull), p. 438.

ve been brought into existence by representatives of nessional families.¹⁵ Thus, the Asian churches have a nse of loyalty to their Western confessions, but there is so an insistent challenge for the churches to be truly ian, not in the narrow sense of exclusivism but for the rpose of fulfilling the commission of Christ.

2. Asia in a revolutionary time.

There is a revolution taking place throughout Asia ich is political, social and religious. The Church cannot ore this revolution if it is to be true to its own nature.

"The common life and mission of God's people in Asia today is to know how to serve and witness in this kind of world; to live our lives, in and for Christ, that through us Christ's revolution may be manifested in Asia's revolution."¹⁶

a. The need for missionary mobility

Part of the problem inherent in paternalistic churches the concept of the Church as an institution, fixed and rmanent, forgetting that the nature and purpose of the urch demands a form both mobile and tactically efficient, le to move out into the world. This concept of the Church being replaced in the lands of the younger churches. It being replaced because there is a challenge to enter into new relationship in those places where the organized life the Churches and Christian congregations "has never ally become related, or has lost their relationships, to e real concerns of the community in the midst of which they e set."¹⁷

-
- . Fleming, John, R. ed., One People, One Mission. pp. 3,4.
 - . Fleming, ed. Op.cit., "Gods People in Asia Today" by C.H. Hwang, pp. 5-17, p. 13.
 - . Newbiggin, ed., Op.cit., p. 47.

b. A tension to be resolved

In this revolutionary community of contemporary Asia, two emphases must be made, a natural tension must be resolved.

1) The purity of the faith

Taking confessionalism to have not only theological but structural implications, there is a need for a "pattern and structure through which confessional concern for the purity of the Faith is preserved though kept within its legitimate bounds."¹⁸ Going beyond the particular ecumenical phasis originally made in this statement, one can see that there is a concern for Christianity to maintain a purity of wholeness, as this relates to both theology and structure.

2) The Asian milieu

But the other emphasis which must be made is that the churches of Asia are truly the "Church of Jesus Christ in their own situation...not in any other situation, of another place and another time."¹⁹ As Hwang has stated:

"We are all grateful for our 'mother churches' through whose missionary obedience we came into being. But I am sure that they would be the first to tell us that we are not the first-fruits of the Presbyterian Church or the Methodist Church, but instead the first-fruits of Christ and His Spirit."²⁰

c. Structures for mission

The East Asia Christian Conference of 1962 was met with the necessity to face and solve the "sense of crisis which the modern Christian movement faces."²¹ This sense

. Fleming, ed., Op.cit., Hwang, p. 14.

. Fleming, ed., Op.cit., p. 4.

. Ibid., (Hwang), p. 14a.

. Ibid., "Reports of Situation Conferences", p. 45.

crisis is said to stem from three factors. First, Christians from all over the world are facing all the world in mission. Second, participation in mission is thus raising uncomfortable questions. Third, these questions are often based upon the "discovery made in so many areas that the churches are imprisoned in outmoded structures of administration, inter-church relationships and congregational life, and in irrelevant patterns of institutional life."²²

Inasmuch as the churches of Asia form the Church of Jesus Christ in Asia, and to the extent that they are the first-fruits of Christ and his Spirit, these churches are concerned with mission. But mission is seen as the essence of the Church.²³ Therefore, there cannot be a passive acceptance of "outmoded structures of administration" which negate the nature of the Church.²⁴ Thus, the "experience and the needs of mission must be given due weight, alongside other factors in our understanding of the nature of the Church, in making our decisions on questions of church order and inter-church relations."²⁵ The East Asia Christian Conference emphasized that "organization should be the servant of our obedience to Jesus Christ, not its master."²⁶ On this basis, the churches of Asia are making a continuing re-evaluation of structures as they pertain to mission, and the nature of the Church.

. Ibid., p. 45.

. Orchard, R.K., Out of Every Nation. (London: SCM Press, 1959), p. 65.

. Fleming, ed., Op.cit., p. 45.

. Orchard, Op.cit., p. 65.

. Fleming, ed., Op.cit., p. 51.

3. The "Indigenous" Church and the Universal Church

In the midst of this re-evaluation of confessional structures, what is the relationship between the "indigenous" church and the Universal Church?

a. An integral part of the Universal Church

This question has already been partially answered by pointing out that the Church in Asia is the first-fruits of Christ and his Spirit. It is impossible to divide the church between East and West; geographical divisions are temporal and superficial, while the unity in Christ is eternal and essential. Thus, Motoda has stated, "We are members of the same family of God. The Church we have built in Japan is only a part of the one Universal Church."²⁷ Phillip emphasizes the essential unity of the Universal church, saying that the very nature of the indigenous church leads one to deplore the idea of

"complete independence whereby the Younger Churches, beyond receiving the message of Christ from the older Churches, seek no further help either in the apprehension of the message or in the practical expression of it. This is not in accordance with the conception of the Christian Church as the Body of Christ. Every part of it, however unimportant, is essential to the whole, and each part inter-dependent upon every other."²⁸

While the indigenous church is of an essential unity with the Church Universal, this cannot serve as a reason to make all churches unified in pattern. The unity is of essential nature rather than in accidental structure. Thus, the universal nature of the Church expresses itself

²⁷. Jerusalem Report, Vol. III, Op.cit., p. 49.

²⁸. Ibid., p. 166.

local distinctiveness while maintaining its essentiality. It was on this basis that Cheng could state that one of the characteristics that Chinese want in an indigenous church is to be recognized as an integral part of the Church universal and at the same time to be allowed a distinctiveness in Christ. This was viewed as a natural outgrowth and expression of the corporate religious experience of Chinese Christians. It was held that the indigenous church should bring out the best in the life, culture and environment of the Chinese people.²⁹

b. Potential problems

Attention should be called to some potential problems in the life of the indigenous church. Takenaka points out that there are three dangers in the indigenous movement in Japan. First, there is the danger that nationalism or anti-foreign feeling will cause the church to cut itself off from the Universal Church. Second, syncretism is sometimes equated with indigenization. Third, indigenization might begin or proceed on the purely theological level, without adequate reference to history.³⁰ These all have bearing upon the structures of church government in Asia as they relate to the nature of the Church.

1) A false nationalism

This could isolate the Asian churches from the Church universal, or even from each other. Jocz states, "The tension between Christian universalism and national egotism is an ever present factor in church history."³¹ He goes on

- . Paton, Faith for the World, pp. 115, 116.
- . Takenaka, Op.cit., pp. 120-121.
- . Goodall, Norman, ed., International Review of Missions. (London: Oxford University Press, Vol. 35, 1946), "Foreign Missions as a Theological Corrective", by Jakob Jocz, pp. 256-62, p. 259.

say that it is generally accepted that the Church is universal and claims the whole world for Jesus Christ. The theory of transcended barriers is controverted by the experience of history... "In history we face a divided and to large extent nationally conditioned Church."³² This danger may be seen in many of the indigenous churches in the Philippines, where the anti-foreign sentiment is strong.³³

Taiwan, the Little Flock, an indigenous Chinese church, has many valuable features, but when efforts to explore the church structure were made for this study, nationalistic feeling led to a total refusal to cooperate. Structures which express the nature of the Church as mission must exclude such nationalism which isolates.

2) Syncretism

In the same way, excessive emphasis upon the indigenous features of the Church could lead to syncretism. The emphasis upon the Chinese aspect of life and culture to the detriment of Christian distinctives can be found in many areas of Hong Kong and Taiwan. In the city of Taichung, Taiwan, there is a small shrine and temple called the Hall of Five Teachings. The teachings of Buddha, Lao-tzu, Confucius, Mohammed and Christ are all revered and incorporated into a pattern of religious life. When questioned by Christians as to the uniqueness of Christ and his claims, the leader of the sect stated that Christ was a great teacher but that the traditions of China incorporated

. Ibid., p. 259.

. Danker, Op.cit., pp. 130-131.

1 religions and all faiths. In the Philippines, there are scores of sects which merge animistic beliefs with Christian teachings.³⁴ The Iglesia Ni Cristo, with its efficient Christology, has tripled its membership within a twelve year period.³⁵ Structures must be found which do deserve the purity of the faith while giving full, legitimate expression of indigenous aspects of the nature of the church.

3) The need for historical perspective

In the third place, the indigenous church cannot develop its proper role and occupy its proper place within the Church Universal without an appreciation of the history of the Church throughout the ages. This is especially important for the development of an indigenous theology. Situational theology is a very necessary and vital part of the development of the theology of the indigenous church. Fleming emphasizes this properly when he says that the theology of the Asian churches cannot be the "docile dogmatic tolerances of daughter churches echoing the historic confessions of mother churches in the West", and adds, "Let us have the insights of the reformers fully appreciated in the Asian churches, but the theological obedience of the Younger Churches' (must be) their obedience, in their situation".³⁶ The tension between the present situation, with its new demands, and church history, with its valuable lessons, can be resolved by the use and development of proper

. Nelson, Op.cit., p. 101.

. Danker, Op.cit., pp. 128-130.

. Fleming, ed., Op.cit., p. 4.

structures for church government. The lessons of the past with the problems of the present must be brought together in an interplay between theology and structure which will make it possible to share the confessional and historical heritage of the Church in all its riches as a part of a common heritage of East and West without forming a barrier at any given point.³⁷

A Summary Statement

In summary then, the churches in Asia are faced with the task of forming structures which will make it possible to express the missionary nature of the Church of Christ. The Church Universal is an extension of the Incarnation of Christ in that it has the task and commission of continuing the reconciliation of man to God. Ecclesiastical order must aid in the expression and realization of that reconciling structure. The indigenous church in Asia shares in this task of developing and using church structures for the fulfilment of the missionary nature of the Church. It has been seen that the indigenous church is necessarily and properly universal in its scope and locally distinctive in its expression of that universal character. In order to avoid problems and utilize the full potential of the indigenous church, it is necessary to build structures within the churches of Asia which will overcome nationalistic egotism, sectarian tendencies and help develop indigenous theology with proper reference to church history. The indigenous

. Fleming, ed., Op.cit., (Hwang) p. 14.

urch, which is the Church Universal in its local setting,
st use church governmental structures to these ends, for
e larger end of the full expression of the missionary
ture of the Church.

CHAPTER SIX

CHURCH STRUCTURES IN RELATION TO AUTHORITY FOR
GOVERNING

I. MISSION AND AUTHORITY

If the nature of the Church is seen to be reconciling mission, this will in turn affect the source, place and use of authority in church structures. The churches of Asia face the resolution of this question within their own situation. To the extent that these churches are the product of Western, confessional missionary activity, there will be an inescapable historical influence. However, the Asian churches are also resolving this question in the Asian context. This can well result in an enrichment of the life of the Church Universal.

II. MISSION AND AUTHORITY IN ASIA

The questions which surround authority in church government may be seen to fall into at least three general categories which affect the Asian churches. There is first of all the authority of the clergy in the churches. Secondly, there is the relative authority of church and state. Finally, there is the continuing question of secularism as it affects authority for church government in the Asian churches.

The Authority of the Clergy

The source, place and use of authority for the clergy in the church has been a vexed question throughout the history of the Church. As seen above, this has been one of

major sources of divisions between the three traditional polities, and perhaps the clearest point of demarcation between Catholic and Protestant polity. The question is a very important one in the churches of Asia today.

1. The Source of Authority

The authorization of the clergy to serve as ministers of God and assume roles in church government is a subject of lively debate today. This debate may be seen to have far-reaching consequences, for the churches of Asia would seem to be divided on the twin issues of ordination and training and the source of authority for the ministry. The churches of India may be used as the first example of this division.

a. The debate over ordination

The Church of South India may serve as the best-known example of conflict over ordination. This Church, incorporating approximately one million members, was formed in 1947 through the union of four dioceses of the (Anglican) Church of India, Burma and Ceylon with seven Church Councils of the South India United Church. These seven councils had been formed through an earlier union of Congregationalists, Presbyterians and the South India Province of the Methodist Church. One further council of the South India United Church joined the union in 1950.¹ This union was of great importance to an understanding of the question of authority over ordination in the churches of Asia. What was accomplished in this union which would make it so important?

Packer, J.I., ed., All In Each Place. (Appleford: Marcham Manor Press, 1965), "The Church of England and the Church of South India", by C.O. Buchanan, pp. 189-190.

1) Episcopal in polity

First of all, a local regional church was established which transcended the confessional ties of the individual members of the union. This was done through the union of episcopalian and non-episcopalians in a single episcopally-governed fellowship, and the establishment of this fellowship as an episcopal Church in the historic succession.²

However, of perhaps greater importance was the manner in which this episcopally-governed fellowship was established, the means whereby authority was given to the ministers to exercise their ministry. In the inauguration service on September, 1947, the presiding bishop said to the ministers of the three uniting churches, upon their assent to the basis and constitution of the Church of South India,

"By authority of the Church of South India, I commit to you who have already been ordained to the ministry of the Word and Sacraments, and who have now accepted the call of God to minister as presbyters in the Church of South India, authority to exercise that ministry in all congregations of this Church to which you shall be duly called or appointed in accordance with the constitution of the Church; in the name of the Father and of the Son and of the Holy Spirit. Amen."³

An examination of this means of union reveals the following points. First, the ministry included on equal footing both episcopally-ordained and non-episcopally-ordained ministers. There was no insistence upon the episcopal ordination as the source of authority for the present ministry. Second, this united ministry was open to non-episcopally ordained men who might join the Church of

Ibid., p. 190.

Packer, ed., Ibid., (Buchanan), p. 190.

with India at some future date. Thus, there was also no assistance upon episcopal ordination as the source of authority for the future ministry. Third, while the Church hedged herself to a review and decision on the problem of episcopal ordination at the end of the first thirty years, there was definitely no commitment to decide in favour of episcopal ordination. Indeed, the current talks between non-episcopal Lutheran churches and the Church of South India will probably preclude any closure of the ministry to non-episcopal ministers at any future date.⁴

2) The Historic Episcopate rejected

The Church of South India is episcopal in government, the principle underlying that episcopal government is that of acceptance of the necessity of the Historic Episcopate. It would seem that, in principle, there is almost an indifference to the question of ordination through the episcopate. There is no sense in which ministers without episcopal ordination are in any way considered as qualified or acceptable.⁵ This very indifference is a source of great controversy in the Anglican Church in England. The emphasis there is now upon the unification of the ministry through episcopal ordination; it is felt that this way full recognition of the Church of South India will be granted.⁶ However, it is precisely this emphasis which is rejected throughout the Church of South India.

Ibid., p. 191.

Ibid., p. 191.

Ibid., pp. 195, 198. This chapter by Buchanan deals thoroughly with the relationship between the Church of England and the Church of South India.

Hollis, as first Moderator of the Church of South India, points out that unification upon episcopal ordination over the first thirty years was neither explicit nor implicit in the Union ceremony. To hold that view is to hold a "radical misunderstanding of our basis of union. The ministry became one by the act of God through which the Church of South India came into being."⁷ Nor can it be argued that the unification of the ministry was intended through the use of the inauguration ceremony as a vehicle to convey episcopal ordination to all as a basis for final unification. Bishop Thorn, a former Methodist, points out that what was given was "not anything that could be interpreted as ordination or supplemental ordination, but solely an extension of authority to minister in congregations for which they had not yet received such authority."⁸ Hollis, on the basis of contact with churches planted by non-episcopal missionaries, states further,

"We in South India would deny our own history if we assented to the claim that episcopal ordination is essential to the existence of a true ministry and to the celebration of the Eucharist."⁹

3) Theological and practical implications

The importance of these affirmations lies in the theological and practical implications for the churches of India. The theological implications are found in the continuing debate on Protestant or Catholic values; the practical implications are to be found in the effects upon church growth.

Packer, Op.cit., "Opening the Discussion", pp. 221, 237., p. 221.

Ibid., p. 221.

Sundkler, Bengt, The Church of South India, The Movement Towards Union, 1900-1947. (London: Lutterworth, 1954), p. 321.

a) The necessity for Protestant values

Reference has been made to the debate now current in the Church of England as to recognition of the ministry of the Church of South India. This is merely a continuation of the debate which swirled about two men prior to union. These men were Bishop Palmer of the Anglican Church and H. Bartlet of the Congregational Church. It was Palmer's contention that the "Church of the Future could only be the Church of the Fathers."¹⁰ The Church Fathers chosen by Palmer were those of the fourth and fifth centuries; however, Bartlet took the patristic argument even further back, going back to the sub-apostolic age.¹¹ The Anglicans felt that the second century was not truly representative of the future Church; their opponents felt that the Ignatian stage was nearest to the ethos of the sub-apostolic Church, in that it was constitutional and democratic in its emphasis, rather than imperial and sacerdotal.¹² Both of these patristic arguments were later challenged by Streckeisen, who insisted that the Church which should serve as the model for the future was the Church of the Reformation.¹³ Union was delayed many times over this very issue. Anglicans rejected any formula which implied equal validity of the ministry, insisting that the true meaning of the episcopacy demanded episcopal ordination. Palmer stated, "...the most distinguishing mark of a bishop is that he is the sole minister of Ordination."¹⁴

Ibid., p. 180.

Ibid., p. 179.

Ibid., p. 181.

Ibid., p. 181.

Ibid., p. 153.

The argument thus revolved about the nature and source of authority for church government. Only when the protestant view was incorporated into the union was it possible to persuade the non-episcopal churches to join in the formation of the Church of South India. There would seem to be at least two basic theological problems involved in this controversy. Not only was the argument for Protestant principles of authority, there was also a disagreement on the fundamentals of this argument. This must be discussed in detail below; for the present, it is necessary to examine the practical implications of this controversy for church growth in Asia.

b) Church growth through modified structures

The union of the Church of South India and the activities of other churches in India illustrate two practical approaches to church growth. Both involve modification of church structures, especially in relation to authority, for the purpose of promoting church growth.

1) Modification through church union

The first approach is that of church union. The report of the Church of South India Commission on Integration and Joint Action in 1963 was significantly titled, "Renewal and Advance".¹⁵ Hwang emphasizes that the fact of the minority status of the Church in Asia is not as important as the fact that the Church is so divided. The unity of the Church is said to have a unique missionary power. It is

¹⁵ The Church of South India, (Commission Report), Renewal and Advance. (Christian Literature Society: Madras, 1963).

this ground that he calls for re-union: "The way back union may be arduous and full of pitfalls, but we cannot ve it up without denying Christ's revolution of the new fe in Koinonia."¹⁶

This study is not the place to discuss the relative peratives or merits of spiritual versus organic unity; wever, the path taken for renewal and advance in South dia is the path of organic unity. If there be any value the arguments for union or unity, it must be realized at the "unique missionary power" needed for the Church to- y is seriously delayed, if not permanently prevented, rough the continued insistence upon episcopal ordination sed upon theories of authority for church government.

It is argued that unity based upon episcopal ordination th consequent communion with some central office, be it nterbury or Rome, is a "horizontal method of realizing stitutional integration and is a man-made idea, which has clear scriptural sanction."¹⁷ This would tend to place man in the place of Christ, for it would give the power granting or withholding Christian fellowship to an stitutional head rather than upon mutual relationship the Head of the Church.¹⁸

Perhaps the most obvious example of the resultant visiveness of such man-made unity is found in the question full communion. This is defined as "the complete inter-

. Fleming, ed., Op.cit., (Hwang), pp. 12,13.

. Packer, ed., Op.cit., "The Unity of All in Each Place" by A.M. Stibbs, pp. 57, 65, p. 58.

. Ibid., p. 58.

angeability of laity and ministers between two churches in their respective offices and functions in the church."¹⁹ Full communion is denied, as it is between the Anglican Church and the Church of South India, on the grounds of invalid orders, the unity of the Spirit cannot be proclaimed as a missionary witness to non-Christian Indians.²⁰

It is this insistence upon the priority of episcopal ordination which is rejected by non-episcopal groups working toward union with the Church of South India. Though final official statements have not yet been received, the Lutherans have generally indicated that they do not oppose episcopal polity in principle. There have been some doubts expressed as to the effectiveness of an episcopal polity; however, these seem to have been resolved through a proposal of an agreeable constitution. But the Lutherans emphatically reject the necessity of the Historic Episcopate for the life or authority of the Church.²¹

The Methodist Church in Southern Asia would agree to an episcopalian form of government; this is basically their present polity. However, it must be based upon constitutional agreement rather than the Historic Episcopate. A constitutional form of episcopal government with a large measure of autonomy is the best structure at least for the present."²² Note two emphases in this: 1) The episcopal government must be constitutional; 2) The episcopal structure

Ibid., (Buchanan), p. 199.

For a full discussion of this, cf. Buchanan, writing in Packer, Op.cit., pp. 199-208.

Faith and Order, No. 52, Op.cit., p. 14.

Letter from Bishop R.D. Joshi, May 19, 1971.

not accepted as immutable; pragmatic factors have the most weight. On these grounds, there is a possibility of union.

2) Modification through joint action

Prior to union, and in some cases as an alternative union, is the spiritual unity manifest in many ecumenical programmes. The Lutherans have been participating in this movement on a large scale. An example of this is Andhra Christian Theological College, where "the community there has proved that (they) are one in Christ with (their) Baptist, Church of South Indian, Anglican and Methodist brethren."²³ Methodists in Southern Asia realize the value of such ecumenical projects, and also participate in many inter-church activities. This is especially true in the medical and educational field, where their joint action is on the increase.

The contrast between the prospects for union in the Church of South India and other Christian bodies in South India and the failure of union negotiations in North India is disheartening. Although there are some ecumenical projects in operation in the northern part of India, especially in education, the Anglican insistence upon a unification in the Service of Reconciliation which would make the ministries of non-episcopalian churches acceptable to the advocates of the historic episcopate acts as a very real stumbling block. It is felt that in rejecting the Church of South India form of unification in the face of pressure from England, the Church of North India would be substituting a rite which is a "liturgical chameleon, taking on

Schmitthenner, (letter), Op.cit., p. 2.

different colours of meaning for those who take part according to the private convictions that they bring to it."²⁴ This ambiguity is unacceptable to other Christians who feel that it would be a violation of Christian principle to join on this basis.

Unity or union...both of these are impeded by an arbitrary insistence upon episcopal ordination as the source of authority for church government. Still another hindrance to church growth through an improper emphasis upon the source of authority may be found in Asia today.

b. The debate over training

Inasmuch as no man takes the ministry unto himself, there must be a standard of qualification from the human as well as the divine commission. But the question in Asia is not whether there should be qualification; the question is what should this qualification be?

The criticism is made of the present standard of qualification that it is a "purely artificial standard of learning as the necessary qualification for the ministry."²⁵ As far back as 1932, it was proposed that emphasis be put on "preparation for the practical, social and human tasks which confront a spiritual leader in the actual world of the present time, both in the city and in the rural community."²⁶ Criticism is also made that our Western standards concentrate function and authority in the hands of

Packer, ed., Op.cit., p. 31.

Allen, Op.cit., p. 135.

Hocking, Op.cit., p. 115.

a man, for only he is the possessor of the education needed to qualify for the work of the ministry.²⁷ The results of this may be seen in the life of the churches of Irian today.

1) The lack of leadership

One of the major problems of the educational qualification for the ministry is expressed by Waemo Waesa of the Bag Lutheran Church in Irian, Indonesia.

"A man has to go to school many years before he becomes a pastor. Those who go to school for such a long time will be few in number, and even then they will be too few to go around. The congregations must not be left without leaders. In order to keep them from going to pieces and dying, we should make use of other types of leaders."²⁸

When there are not enough leaders in the churches, the churches suffer spiritual deprivations. Thus, the educational standard which was established to provide leadership qualified to feed the flock is actually defeating its own purpose through limitation of leaders.

The churches in India have been careful and successful in ordaining traditionally-qualified men. But the traditional function does not seem to follow the traditional qualification. Neither the trained men nor the churches seem to feel that it is necessary to have the pastoral ministry as it has been brought from the West.²⁹

This may be seen in two manifestations of the life of the church. First, there are not enough pastors to perform

Allen, Op.cit., p. 135.

Danker, Op.cit., p. 157.

Newbiggin, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 52, 1963, "The Ordained Ministry in the Indian Church", by Wm. Stewart, pp. 144-154, p. 145.

the traditional functions of the pastoral ministry. In the Church of South India, the average minister must act as pastor to eight congregations, but in Assam, one man must pastor thirty or more church groups.³⁰ Second, and perhaps more serious because of the long-range implications, the additional pastoral ministry is regarded as of minor importance. "The cure of souls" is not necessarily, or even generally, the concern of the ministry. As a general rule, the more qualifications (by Western standards) a man has, the more likely he is to enter some other form of ministry. The general goal of the best qualified men is to enter administration.³¹

2) The stifling of church life

Yet another effect of the insistence upon artificial standards may be seen from the experience of the churches started by one mission society in Hong Kong. This denomination, with a total Christian community of approximately 500 people, has been limited to a total of eight congregations. The denominational Book of Discipline sets a standard for ordination entirely feasible for the American situation; however, the churches in Hong Kong were unable to meet that standard. It was not until 1969 that these standards were effectively set aside and ordination was made available to pastors who had proven themselves in service although the educational standards had not been fully met. No effects have been noted in the life of these churches.

Ibid., p. 145.

Ibid., p. 146.

st, there has been a failure to expand and grow, even
 ere there was great opportunity, because it was felt
 the part of both the ministry and the laity that there
 e not enough ministers to head the work. The equation
 the mind of the people was, "Without an ordained minister,
 ere can be no new work." Secondly, the failure to ordain
 who had proven themselves in service was hindering the
 toral ministry of unordained men who for various reasons
 not meet the American educational standard. These un-
 ained men were doing the ministry expected of an ordained
 , but they were not respected by their congregations
 ause they had not been ordained.³²

The effect of this type of work without ordination may
 seen in the reply given by an Indian pastor. One of the
 astions in the questionnaire which he was asked to complete
 this study dealt with his role as a minister: "Please
 t, in order of importance, the roles you play as a
 ister." He did not complete this question, for he was
 an (ordained) minister, and therefore not qualified to
 wer. This man had been a pastor for 25 years, and his
 k of ordination made him feel inferior to the ordained
 istry.³³

The Methodists in India trained men to the B.D. level
 ordained them, enrolling them on the books of the
 hodist Conference of Great Britain. However, these

The records of the Mission Superintendent, Hong Kong
 Free Methodist Mission.

Questionnaire No. 188B.

lained men were too few in number, so unordained men were
 senced to give the sacraments. The only difference
 between the two groups of men, both performing identical
 ministries, was the educational standard imposed from the
 at.³⁴ Would it not be far more realistic, and far better
 the morale of the ministry, to use the work done as the
 standard for ordination? The sense of inferiority on the
 part of the unordained men was reinforced by the practice
 missions in the not-too-distant past of granting "mission-
 ary status" to ordained men who had outstanding ability and
 responsibilities. This served to elevate the ordained
 vice, but at the same time, the Western standard was put
 above the work involved in the pastorate.³⁵

3) The alienation of clergy from laity

The introduction of the Western standard for
 ministerial authority may be said to have produced yet an-
 other problem in Japan. The Japanese Church has the
 highest percentage of trained, ordained clergy of any
 country in the world.³⁶ It is perhaps ironic that the
 Japanese Church, with its zeal to purge itself of "the stink
 butter" has continued to use the Western standard of
 ministerial authority for church government. But the
 growing contradiction becomes a cause for concern when it is
 realized that the Japanese ministry has lost its contact
 with the society about it and is not

Hollis, Paternalism, p. 55.

Newbiggin, Op.cit., Vol. 52, 1963, (Stewart), p. 147.

Sinclair, Margaret, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 50, 1961, "Hendrik
 Kraemer in Japan", by Richard Drummond, pp. 451-459,
 p. 456.

le to minister relevantly to man in his daily needs. The cults and sects of Japan could perhaps teach the Church a lesson, for they seem to possess a true lay apostolate and are not dependent upon a professional clergy for leadership and expansion.³⁷

The Church in Japan is experiencing difficulties at present because of the rejection of this professional leadership by at least a vocal, activist minority within the churches. In 1970, the Free Methodist Church of Japan was prevented from holding its regular annual meeting by the action of some of the younger pastors and their laymen. The auditorium was occupied by the demonstrators and banners were strung up denouncing the church leadership and demanding changes in the leadership structure of the church. The situation was extremely tense for a time, and the problems are not fully resolved even yet.³⁸ The same type of problem may be seen on an even larger scale in the United Church of Christ.

The United Church of Christ, or Kyodan, comprises approximately 80% of all protestants in Japan.³⁹ Here, the problem is on both the national and the local level. For the past two years, the central structure of the United Church has been virtually paralyzed because of disruptive protests. There are no magnetic leaders in the Kyodan today, as there were in the first thirty years of the life of

. Danker, Op.cit., pp. 231-232.

. Letter from Elmer E. Parsons, Asia Area Secretary of the Free Methodist Missionary Board, June 13, 1970.

. Letter from Elmer E. Parsons, April 15, 1971.

Church. The present leaders are unable to do what the former leadership did, hold the Church together "by their attractive leadership (as contrasted to binding forms wrapped out the barrel staves which force them to stay together)."⁴⁰ Young leadership has come up which does not hesitate to forcibly take over meetings and conduct them so that only their voices are heard."⁴¹ The local problem is closely related. Today, the laymen are not willing to either passively follow the leadership of the pastor or quietly leave the church. There is an active group of young rebels who will either disrupt services or forcibly take them over, and then run them to their own design. The problem seems to lie in the nature of authority in the church. Palmore states:

"Perhaps the central question facing us today is in relation to the whole question of authority in the church. When each person or group claims to speak in the name of Jesus Christ, what to do with conflicting voices?...Some have actively debated the issues and gone further to ask what is the nature of the authority of the church....

"The smoke of battle still lies too heavily to predict where the battle will go from here."⁴²

Thus, it may be seen that the churches in Asia are faced with a problem of standards. Does the source, use of place of ministerial authority derive from only one form of ordination? Is the educational standard of qualification for ordination the best for the life of the churches?

2. These problems seen as a result of paternalism.

Both of these problems stem from theological issues

Letter from Peyton Palmore, Research Institute on Mission, United Church of Christ in Japan.

Ibid.

Ibid.

church government, introduced and complicated by the eternalism of the missionaries. This may be seen first all in the question of the form of ordination.

a. Ordination as a Western import

The present and continuing debate in the Church of England, with its reverberations in the Church of South India and its effects upon the proposed union of the Church of South India, is of grave concern, for even a tacit recognition of the Historic Episcopate as a necessary basis for church government is felt to be a betrayal of Protestant principles. Packer states that unless there is clear and unambiguous recognition of the fullness of Christ's grace in non-episcopal churches, and of his authority in their ministers, the end result is a retreat from the Gospel within the Church and an obscuring of the Gospel from the world.⁴³

It may be viewed as significant that among the strongest opponents of the "catholic" position on the episcopacy are those Anglicans who take an "evangelical" stand on the relationship between church government and the authority to govern. According to this position, it was not until 1662 that the preface to the Ordinal of the Church of England was made to say that all ministers must have episcopal ordination; it was from this unification about the episcopacy that these Anglicans feel has come the mistaken impression that the episcopacy is essential to the very being of the Church. This is a view which no pre-

Packer, ed., Op.cit., "Wanted - A Pattern for Union" by J.I. Packer, pp. 15-40, p. 34.

45 Anglican could or wished to hold with any consistency. However, the Caroline bishops and the Cavalier parliament had this as one of the tools of vengeance, according to Buchanan, who further states that it appears in its true light if it is viewed in the same class as the renunciation of the Solemn Oath and Covenant.⁴⁴ The unification rite proposed by some Anglicans to give authority is condemned by Newbiggin, who asserts that those who submit to this "have done a profanity".⁴⁵

If the historical nature of this issue be admitted, it is then possible to see how unfortunate are the effects on the churches of India. Is it unfair to say that this is a Western historical issue, given theological implications unacceptable to the majority of Protestants in the West, taken to Asia by missionaries who used their positions of authority to inject the controversy into the life of the churches of India? One need not deny the sincerity of these missionaries to deplore the results of their paternalism upon the church structures.

The basic issue here is theological. Ecclesiastical history was taken as the source of authority rather than the Biblical principles of church government. By referring the question to the fifth century, Palmer failed to take into consideration the scriptural practices and principles which make possible the adaptation of authority to church government to the particular situation. Of

Packer, ed., Op.cit., (Buchanan) p. 201. This comparison is based upon the relationship of the two acts of legislation.

Ibid., p. 198.

urse, this may be said to some degree of those who related authority to a historical time such as the second century or to the time of the Reformation. The theological issue, and its undesirable effects, is aggravated by the transportation of the problem from the West, where the historical connection gave it at least some relevance, to Asia, where it becomes completely irrelevant.

b. Training as a Western import

Much the same criticism may be made of the standard qualification for ordination. The Western situation has its own demands; these may be determined by the West for the West. However, the imposition of these demands upon the Asian situation and using the same standard for qualification for ordination is to substitute the experience of the West for the principles of the Bible. One may not legitimately deny that the West developed its standards of ministerial authority with regard to Biblical standards and principles; however, at the same time, one must remember that the result was a Western adaptation suitable for the West. When missionaries, however sincerely, imposed this standard upon Asia, the West became the standard rather than the Bible. This distortion of authority also has other theological implications. If church government is seen as an instrument for the completion of the mission of the Church, then a false centre of authority cannot but be an instrument of erosion against one of the four theological issues of church government previously discussed.

3. Summary

The place, use and source of authority for the clergy of great significance to the Church Universal. The experience of the churches in Asia is indicative of important lessons in this area. First, the Biblical standard must constantly be subject to re-examination in order to prevent historical or geographical factors from distorting the standard for authority in church government. Second, the place, use and source of authority must be adapted to the local situation in accord with these Biblical standards. The Asian result need not be the same as the Western. Third, the standards of authority must be designed to promote the life of the churches, both within the local congregation and the missionary outreach of the churches. Fourth, the authority of the clergy must be designed to provide moral leadership which is both relevant to the life of the entire community in which the churches are placed and which does not depend upon artificial or restrictive structures for implementation.

The Authority of Church and State

The churches of Asia today are also faced with the necessity to evolve structures which will both define and facilitate the proper relationship between Church and State. These will need to be flexible enough to serve the Church in the event that the present situation of general religious liberty should change. They will need to be based upon unswerving loyalty to God, but designed to make the church effective in varying situations, such as basic moral values in society.

1. Religious liberty and the churches.

The churches of Asia exist and operate in a political and social climate which may be described as extremely volatile. Flexible structures are needed to meet the demands imposed by the potential threats to religious liberty.

a. Religious liberty as a present fact

There is no guarantee that the present general liberty will continue. However, for the present, non-Communist Asia may be seen to have almost total freedom of religious belief and practice.

1) India

The most populous country of Asia, apart from Communist-controlled China, is the land of India. One of the great questions which faced the government of newly-independent India in 1947 was the role of religion in the state. It was necessary to decide if the state were to favour one religion over and against others, or if the state were to remain neutral, giving equal opportunity for worship and other forms of religious activity.⁴⁶

a) A complex situation

This was a question whose complexities were aggravated by the fact that the natural result of democratic rule by popular election would be the formation of a government inevitably dominated by the Hindus of India. By sheer force of number, it would be within their power to legislate for

46. Appasamy, A.J., The Christian Task in Independent India. (London: S.P.C.K., 1951), p. 1.

the benefit of their religion and the detriment of others.⁴⁷ Furthermore, there are definite political implications in the very structure of the Hindu religion.

Although there is no central authority in Hinduism, through which social regulations are disseminated, one of the outstanding features of Hindu society is the binding system of social organization.⁴⁸ Universal suffrage, as well as regular elections, has placed power in the hands of the illiterate masses who have not yet freed themselves from a high degree of susceptibility to appeals to communal and caste loyalties. One of the prominent features of modern Indian society is the major, if not decisive role which considerations of caste and community play in the selection of candidates, the formation of cabinets and the many other aspects of the political process.⁴⁹

b) Three basic attitudes

When this type of influence upon the political structure of India is recognized, it is easier to understand the problems facing the government of India in the formulation of the constitution and the establishment of religious policies. The conflicts may be summarized in three different attitudes toward the non-Hindu religions.

(1) Desire for Hindu establishment

First of all, there was the attitude of such powerful entities as the Pashtya Seva Sangh and the Hindu Maha Sabha,

Ibid., p. 1.

Smith, Donald, ed., South Asian Politics and Religion. "Political Implications of Asian Religions", by Smith, p. 10.

Ibid.

ose avowed aim was the establishment of Hindu Raj, or the Hindu equivalent of the Muslim state of Pakistan.⁵⁰ This was the natural result of the Asian tendency to communalism, i.e., "the tendency of the socio-religious group to attempt to maximize its economic, social and political strength at the expense of other groups."⁵¹

(2) Desire to ban conversion

The second of these attitudes is a form of communalism as well, although it takes a less outspoken form. The debate is not over the rights of other religions to exist in India; the controversy is centred about the right to propagate and convert new members. There are two basic arguments advanced in the rejection of conversion from one religion to another. First of all, Hindus believe that no religion is an ultimate expression of the truth. Thus, Hindu tolerance of the existence of other religious bodies is based upon the prior agreement that God cannot be known in a final sense through any one religion.⁵² Thus, evangelism and conversions are to be prohibited on the basis of religious freedom, for they imply the rightness of one belief and, in the sense that the one is right, the wrongness of another. This would breed intolerance, which in turn would be detrimental to the welfare of the country.⁵³ Furthermore, all religious bodies are ethnic divisions within the country.

Appasamy, Op.cit., p. 1.

Smith, Op.cit., p. 23.

Bingle, E.J., ed., International Review of Missions. (London: Oxford University Press, Vol. 45, 1956),

"Freedom of Conversion, the Issue in India", by Charles W. Forman, pp. 180-193, p. 182.

Ibid., p. 180.

conversion from faith to faith would disturb the balance between the divisions and this would affect the stability of the country. If religion is a part of the nation, religion must be united for the good of the nation.⁵⁴

(3) Desire for a secular democracy

Fortunately for the Church, it was the third of the attitudes toward religious freedom which triumphed in the formation of the Indian nation. The official attitude of the government is one of religious neutrality. The ideal set up in India is that of a secular democratic state. This does not mean the prohibition of religion; it does mean that it is the privilege of any citizen to follow his own religious belief without the risk of political disability being placed upon him because of his creed.⁵⁵ This includes the freedom of conversion, for Article Twenty-five of the constitution states that citizens will have the freedom to propagate their religion.⁵⁶ There is some restriction on the Church, notably in the entrance of new missionaries and in the regulation of expansion into new areas.⁵⁷ These will be discussed below. However, for the practical daily life of the Church, there is effective religious freedom in India.

2) Hong Kong

Leaving India, with its background of British colonialism and its new-found independence, one may travel to Hong

⁵⁴ Ibid., p. 185.

⁵⁵ Appasamy, Op.cit., p. 2.

⁵⁶ Bingle, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 45, 1956, (Forman), p. 189.

⁵⁷ Joshi, Op.cit.

ing, still a British Crown Colony. Here there is total religious freedom, guaranteed by the practices of the British government and buttressed by the traditional tolerance of the Chinese people. Although the total area of the colony is only $398\frac{1}{2}$ square miles, there is a large and diverse population, and this diversity is reflected in the religious composition of the community.⁵⁸ Buddhism, Confucianism and Taoism are intermingled among the Chinese population, and eclectic practices and beliefs are not only accepted but taken for granted.⁵⁹ Christianity, both Protestant and Catholic, is deeply rooted in the society.⁶⁰ There is an active Jewish community, while Islam and Hinduism have equal numbers of adherents, and other Indian residents follow Sikhism and other Indian religions.⁶¹ The Government not only permits complete freedom of religion, but is actively supporting religious groups which wish to serve the community by means of schools, hospitals and other forms of social service.⁶²

3) Formosa

Formosa is yet another centre of Chinese culture. There are many similarities to Hong Kong, but also many differences. One of the important similarities is the complete freedom of religion. Chiang Kai Shek is a member of the Methodist Church and makes public profession of his

Hong Kong Government Information Service, Hong Kong, 1969. (Hong Kong: Government Press, 1970), p. 206.

Ibid., pp. 192, 194.

Ibid., p. 194.

Ibid., pp. 196-197.

Ibid., p. 195.

th.⁶³ Among the guarantees written into the Constitution is the guarantee of religious liberty, including both the practice and the propagation of one's religious beliefs.⁶⁴ There are certain areas of conflict which will be discussed below; however, the official constitutional position is that all religions, including Christianity, are equal before the law. In this sense, Formosa is a secular and democratic state.

4) The Philippine Islands

Upon entering the Philippine Islands, one finds that the pre-Spanish, Malayan culture has been blended with the Spanish, Catholic culture and that the result is a sociological development which cannot be divorced from the religious development of the people. Indeed, Nelson speaks of the people as "inherently religious", and states that religion is a strong factor in determining and conditioning the daily life of almost every individual.⁶⁵ Catholicism has not been an established religion since 1898, but has maintained strong influence in society and politics.⁶⁶ American Protestantism is active in the Philippines, and many religious sects which merge animistic beliefs with traditional Catholic practices range from one pole of the religious

Goddard, W., Formosa, A Study in Chinese History.
(London: MacMillan and Co., 1966), p. 180.

Ibid., p. 182.

Nelson, Op.cit., p. 101.

Koyama, Kosuke, ed., South East Asia Journal of Theology.
(ATS in SEA, Singapore, Vol. II, Spring, 1970),
"Christian Koinonia and Some Philippine Cultural Forces",
by V.R. Gorospe, pp. 19-36, p. 27.

spectrum to the other.⁶⁷ There are also many sects which have emerged from Protestant Christianity.⁶⁸ The important thing to note at this point is that in the Philippines there is both freedom to be Christian and the cultural heritage which incorporates the greatest degree of Christian influence in Asian society.

5) Indonesia

Whereas the Philippines have a Malayan background predominated by the influence of an historical Christianity, the Republic of Indonesia has an Islamic religious heritage blended with their Malayan cultural background. As a small minority within a Muslim world, Christians desire to have a free Church in a neutral state.⁶⁹ The Republic has a Central Bureau for religious affairs, with a Christian theologian attached in an official capacity to speak and advise on matters pertaining to the Christian Church.⁷⁰ The current freedom is the result of active participation in the establishment of the Republic by both Christians and Muslims, who insisted that a truly democratic state would include equal civil rights, including religious liberty, for everybody. These advocates of religious liberty were supported by far-sighted Muslims, who rejected an Islamic state as unlikely to be recognized internationally.⁷¹ There

Ibid., pp. 27-28.

Danker, Op.cit., pp. 129-131.

Goodall, Norman, ed., International Review of Missions. (London: Oxford University Press, Vol. 37, 1948), "Church and State in Indonesia", by A.J. Rasker, pp. 321-329, p. 324.

Ibid., p. 324.

Goodall, ed., Op.cit., "Indonesia and Religious Liberty", by J. Verkuyl, Vol. 38, 1949, pp. 312-321, p. 316.

complete equality of opportunity for Christians, as for other religious groups, although there is a noticeable tendency among some Indonesian leaders toward the recognition of Islam as the religion of their nationalism. When the Netherlands was in control of Indonesia, there was religious freedom, but with a definite bias toward Christianity, at least in that government funds supported the established Church. The Church has not accepted this privileged place under the Republic.⁷² Although there are many problems involved in religious liberty in Indonesia, there is constitutional guarantee that there is freedom of every citizen to "profess his own religion and perform the duties of his religion and creed."⁷³

6) Japan

The churches which have been examined thus far are united in a common history of general freedom and political guarantees of tolerance. However, the Church of Japan does not share this history. The unhappy times of the Church in Japan will be dealt with in detail below; at this point, it is sufficient to state that Japan now has constitutional guarantees that all citizens shall enjoy religious liberty. The only governmental control upon the operation of religious bodies is the demand that they register with the government in order to qualify for the privilege of tax exemption.⁷⁴

Ibid., pp. 318-319.

Ibid., p. 315.

Lee, Op.cit., p. 138.

b. Religious liberty possibly temporary

But in the event that the present climate of toleration and religious freedom should end, what would be the result for the Church? What structures should be devised to ensure that the life of the Church is preserved?

1) A climate of threat

The present political situation in Asia is such that this is far more than an academic question. As shown above, there are parties in India and groups in Indonesia which would restrict all but the majority religions; at the same time, Japan has a large number of aggressive, nationally-oriented cults or sects, the chief of which is Soka Gakkai.⁷⁵ The chief goal of Soka Gakkai is the marriage of religion and politics. It is militant, intolerant and with effective, hierarchical structures of administration.⁷⁶ A suggestion has been made that this movement "could offer a convenient tool for jingoistic nationalism and militarism."⁷⁷

The forces of both radical atheism and revolutionary Marxism are both strong and growing in Asia today. They pose a challenge and a threat to the Church.⁷⁸ Perhaps this can best be seen in the reaction of communism to the Church. It is pointed out that the Church in China has been deprived of its central institutions and administrative machinery by the Communist regime.⁷⁹ Was this destruction

Reischauer, E.C., Japan, The Story of a Nation. (London: Duckworth & Co., 1970), p. 310.

Nish, Ian, The Story of Japan. (London: Faber and Co., 1968), p. 122.

Danker, Op.cit., p. 233.

Sinclair, M. ed., Op.cit., Vol. 50, 1961. "The Church in Modern Society", by A. Schmidt, pp. 445-450, p. 447.

Firth, loc. cit.

the superstructure accomplished so easily because it did not meet the needs of the Chinese Church? If there are lessons to be learned from this, they must be learned quickly. This, writing in anticipation of the fall of China in 1949, said, "Communism has become far more than a portent of peril on the horizon of the younger churches. It is already entrenched in their midst."⁸⁰ This appraisal is at least true today as it was then.

2) Suggested solutions

If this be so, then what should be done? Can structures be devised to provide aid in time of trouble? What type of structures should be suggested?

a) Lessons from the Japanese Church

There is one Church in Asia which can serve as an example of the classical Church/State conflict in an especially valuable way, for it has regained its freedom within its own society and enough time has passed so that a historical perspective allows a true picture. From this picture, the lessons learned by the Church in Japan can instruct other churches in Asia.

At the turn of the century, the Church was one of the most creative and modern bodies in Japan.⁸¹ Perhaps it was because of this creativity, which was regarded as a threat to government plans, or perhaps because of Western ties, or the chauvinistic movement in Japan, centred in its

Goodall, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 38, 1949, "Missionary Strategy and the Rural Church", by J. Merle Davis, pp. 401-411, p. 411.

Sinclair, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 50, 1961, (Drummond), p. 452.

religious aspects about Shintoism, set out to either stamp Christianity or to neutralize its effectiveness.⁸² The attack centred upon the structures of the Church; in order to control the Church all churches were coerced to join together and form the Church of Christ in Japan.⁸³ This attack was far more subtle than outright oppression; rather than crushing the Protestant movement, the government strategy recognized and protected Christianity through the Religious Bodies Law of 1940, but this recognition and protection was dependent upon so many restricting conditions that, practically speaking, the Church lost its autonomy.⁸⁴ The effects of this "protection" may be summarized as follows:

- 1) The form and organization were government imposed.
- 2) Pressure was of such force and design that it **virtually forced churches to join the union organization.**
- 3) The ministry was controlled through complete **centralization, with all appointments in the hands of one man.**
- 4) Organizational forms were made completely **subservient to state aims.**
- 5) **There was a large degree of effectiveness in dominating the inner life of the Church.**⁸⁵

The Japanese churchmen sought to accommodate the life of the Church to the demands of the State by correlating the Christian faith to the spirit of the times. In adapting itself to these nationalistic trends, this section of the

Goodall, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 35, 1946, "The Church in Japan", by Luman J. Shafer, pp. 121-130, p.

Lee, Op.cit., pp. 44, 45.

Goodall, ed., Op.cit., (Shafer), pp. 121-122.

Ibid., p. 122.

Japanese Church compromised its relationship to Christ, their witness to the world, and their relationship to the Church Universal.⁸⁶ But other sections of the Japanese Church were able to preserve their own integrity only by becoming isolated, pietistic communities.⁸⁷ Nevertheless, like much of the Japanese Church was guilty of failure, whether through compromise or withdrawal, even in the midst of this failure there were faithful witnesses. The activities of these Christians were of significant effect on the policies of the Japanese government, both in retaining and reforming evil policies.⁸⁸

The United Church of Christ in Japan continued as a united organization after the war, but modifications in structure were made.⁸⁹ This reorganization was undertaken in response, especially, to the criticism of the younger ministers and the laymen.⁹⁰ The trend has been, especially in recent years, both in the Kyodan and in those denominational churches which do not belong to the United Church, for the decentralization of organizational structures. The Kyodan, at the local level, is generally congregational in its present structure. The initiative on the national scale is shifting from central headquarters to district centres. This is not only to diminish administrative costs, but more important, to make it possible to get "planning power into

Takenaka, Op.cit., pp. 71-78.

Ibid., p. 119.

Goodall, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 35, 1946, "The Church and Reconciliation with Japan", by Charles McLaren, pp. 293-302, p. 295.

Takenaka, Op.cit., p. 85.

Goodall, ed. Op.cit., Vol. 35, 1946, (Shafer), p. 121.

ser contact with the people who have to carry out the work of real mission: the local churches." However, a parallel line of development is bringing into operation a central authority for the appointment of ministers.⁹¹

The present activity of the malcontents in the Kyodan is disruptive, but it can provide an example for the reorganization of the Church in time of trouble, whether the conflict be external, as with the State, or whether it be of internal origin. While the central structure has been almost paralyzed for two years due to the protests, "the work of the mission of the church has gone on to a remarkable extent."⁹² It was the congregational life of the churches which formed the nucleus for the revival of church life in Japan after 1945.⁹³

It would seem that congregational structures are of great importance to the continued life and mission of the Church in time of trial. The structures of the Church, faced with conflict such as may come from a hostile State, must be adaptable. If all the strength is centralized and the local church is not built up, the consequences for the future of the Church and its membership can be grave indeed. This summarizes the situation in these words:

"...ultimately the strength or weakness of the Church is the strength or weakness of each local congregation. What ultimately matters is that they should be communities of faithful men and women living by the Word and the Sacraments as genuine local manifestations of the Body of Christ.

Palmore, Op.cit., p. 1.

Ibid., p. 1.

Goodall, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 35, 1946, (Shafer), p. 123.

Centralized systems of administration have their advantages, but they are not an end in themselves. The end is the building up of the People of God in every local church.⁹⁴

of the saving factors, already mentioned above, in the case of the Church in Japan was that the highly centralized, government-controlled organization was unable to control completely the local congregation. The local church organizations were intact and functioning, and the ministers were carrying on with their regular work.⁹⁵

b) A situation of great complexity

The world of Asia is a troubled world, and the Church is inevitably involved in the troubles of her world. The involvement may be a negative one, as when the Church withdraws. But the redemptive involvement demands a positive action to the troubles of the world. When the Church is confronted with what is basically a moral issue, there must be more than a perfunctory witness, even when this brings conflict with the State. Some of these issues are sharply-lined; others are more debatable.

(1) Areas of possible debate

One of these debatable issues is the Christian participation and Church cooperation in the Guided Democracy of Indonesia under Sukarno. Guided Democracy is described as a highly emotional doctrine of revolution which demanded conformity of all citizens."⁹⁶ Churches and Christians in

Firth, Op.cit., p. 257.

Goodall, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 35, 1946, Shafer, loc. cit.

Koyama, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 11, 1970, "Faith and Politics" by A.C. Thompson, pp. 1-18, p. 14.

Indonesia differed on the dividing line between Christian patriotism and Christian compromise.⁹⁷

In the same vein, there is a feeling on the part of those churches in Taiwan who work most closely with the Taiwanese population of the island that the Church must take a stand against some of the practices of the Nationalist Government of Chiang Kai Shek. It is stated that political interference is affecting the life of the churches.⁹⁸ At the same time, equally sincere Christians feel that there is great opportunity for church growth under the present government.⁹⁹

These are examples of the place of individual Christian conscience in the relationship between Church and State; they are also examples of how the Church has the opportunity profitably support and guide the individual conscience through the proper use of structures to suit the individual situation. How the Christian and the Church should act when the State demands acceptance of what may be unacceptable must be determined by the particular situation, the individual conscience and the effects upon the mission of the Church as a whole.

These were among the factors which caused American and European missionaries to India to subscribe to the pledge that they would "confine themselves to their spiritual and social work and not take part in the political struggle"

Ibid., p. 15.

Questionnaire T505.

James H. Taylor, Jr., Principal of China Evangelical Seminary, Taipei, 1971.

pre-independence India.¹⁰⁰ British missionaries were generally personally reluctant to take part in any activity which was political in nature in India; this reluctance was reinforced by the laws of Britain. The Indian Christians were caught up in what could be viewed as a false dichotomy: political activity or Christian activity. In many instances, Christianity was identified with imperialistic sentiment; this divided Christians from Christians as well as the Church from the community.¹⁰¹ Could not the Ekklesia have helped here in working out structures for guidance rather than placing this in the category of a strict dichotomy?

(2) Structures for united witness

While such political questions may be matters of individual conscience and subject to debate, there are other, moral issues which demand a forthright response from the Ekklesia. These moral issues must be faced and structures devised which will express the authority of God through his Ekklesia as part of the plan of reconciliation.

(a) Militarism

Christians in lands where the State is committed to a wrong course of action, as judged by Biblical moral standards, will need to be united through their church structures to express the will of the Lord. This may be present in what seems to be militaristic situations, such as the present government in Indonesia. Because of the

1. Appasamy, Op.cit., p. 3.

2. Ibid., pp. 3,4.

and composition of the government, some Indonesian Christians are saying that "the present situation could be better understood and accepted as a temporary one."¹⁰² Part of the failure of the Christians in Japan before the second world war was their inability to distinguish the moral implications of the militaristic movement, or to express effectively their beliefs when the movement was opposed. The churches were assigned tasks related to the mobilization of the nation's spiritual resources, and in some ways looked on the war as a holy war to realize Japan's "Manifest Destiny" for the liberation of Asia through the war and the establishment of the "Greater Asian Circle".¹⁰³ Part of the reaction against militarism in Japan today is inspired by Christian leadership which sees the moral failure of the church at that time.¹⁰⁴

(b) Racism

Yet another issue in which the Church must build structures which express the authority of God is that of race relations. "An as yet unsolved dilemma for the Christian Church is that missions are identified with those white races where colour prejudice and discrimination are strongest."¹⁰⁵ This is a problem which is generally associated with white-coloured relations, but the problem also exists within the non-white nations of Asia as well. Conflict within society is sometimes a forerunner of official government policy.

1. Koyama, ed., Vol. 11, 1970, Op.cit., (Thompson), p. 14.

2. Takenaka, Op.cit., p. 87.

3. Ibid., pp. 93-101.

4. Goodall, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 35, 1946, "Mission Strategy in the New Age" by J. Merle Davis, pp. 303, 313, p. 311.

There has been sporadic repressive legislation aimed at the Chinese minority in the Philippines since independence. A legislative expression of racism has been on both the national and local level.¹⁰⁶ In their efforts to consolidate their empire, the Japanese Government subjected the Korean people, in Korea and in Japan, to a reign of terror. Every effort was made to destroy the Korean culture to allow the substitution of the Japanese culture.¹⁰⁷ What should be the position of the Church in this type of situation?

(3) Redemptive caution

Hoekendijk speaks an appropriate word of caution at this point. He urges the Church to do what it can within the situation at hand, not feeling that because perfection is not instantly attainable, the comparatively small act is worthless. When the Church seeks to do more than this, there is danger of becoming yet another political party.¹⁰⁸ The position of the Church as God's agency of reconciliation involves redemption rather than revolution.

The redemptive approach as a step-by-step solution to the race problem may be seen in Japan. In a reply to a question concerning the existence of ethnic groups within the community, and the Church's ministry to them, it was stated that the Church evangelized among the Koreans, helped them obtain better education, and worked for the improvement

-
- . Purcell, Victor, The Chinese in Southeast Asia. (London: Oxford University Press, 1965), pp. 557-561.
 - . Goodall, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 36, 1947, "The Christian Church in Korea", by Kwan Sik Kim, pp. 125-140, p. 125.
 - . Hoekendijk, The Church Inside Out, p. 140.

their place in society.¹⁰⁹ This is a well-balanced and effective Christian witness in the problem of race, suitable in places where the Church must oppose the State.

The Church is God's force for reconciliation within the world. This task of reconciliation embraces two spheres, spiritual and social. God's concern with man may be said to be with the total man, for it is impossible to separate the spiritual and social aspects of man. If this is true, then the Church must bear witness in society in order to win the man who lives within that society. The Church must beware of the dangers of false involvement "in politics or economic disputes, but there is a growing conviction that the Church must seek to evangelize every aspect of the nation's life."¹¹⁰ Thus, the Church must have structures of authority which adequately express the truth of the Gospel in any relationship between Church and State.

2. Suggested principles.

What should be the reaction of the Church to a hostile State? To a friendly or neutral State? It is impossible to set forth dogmatic rules for every situation. However, it is possible to suggest some principles which can guide the thinking of the churches in Asia.

a. The principle of loyalty to Christ

All structures within the Church should be based upon the fundamental principle of loyalty to Christ. The authority of Christ must be the authority of the Church; it

109. Questionnaire J177, also J179.

110. Hoekendijk, The Church Inside Out, p. 141.

possible to make these two spheres of authority, the fact of the expression, synonymous only when there is complete loyalty to the Head of the Church.

b. The principle of precedent authority

When there is complete loyalty to Christ, then the Church can claim the precedence of Christ's authority. The relative position of Christ's authority becomes clear only on this basis. Thus, in times of conflict, the dispute must not be between two organizations, the Church and the State, but such; the conflict must lie in a conflict for loyalty in which the State would usurp the rightful authority of Christ.

c. The principle of interdependence

The geographical Church is a part of the larger whole, the Universal Church. There is an interdependence here in which each sees the actions of any part of the Body of Christ as affecting all of the Body. Thus, all relationships between Church and State must be based upon the welfare of the entirety of Christ. The interests of the Church Universal must take precedence over any immediate interests of the national Church.

d. The principle of support for the individual

If this principle is to be followed, and if the authority of Christ is to take precedence over the authority of the State, structures of authority in the Church must be constituted that there will be support for the individual believer in time of conflict. The conscience of the individual believer must be taken into the consideration of the structures of accommodation between an embattled Church

a hostile State. Such structures of support will include, as a bare minimum, both guidance and a promotion of solidarity based upon Christian fellowship.

e. The principle of progress and preservation

Finally, the Church must be progressive in its outlook, adaptable to changing conditions upon the unchanging principles of Biblical truth. Vital structures will express the life of a vital Church at the same time as they promote and preserve the life of the Church under all circumstances.

If the structure of authority in the Church can be so constructed as to accomplish these things in time of conflict and peace, the relationship between Church and State will be such that the life and mission of the Church and of the individual Christian will continue to be of influence at all times.

The Mission and the Church

Yet another area in which governmental structures must give forth the pre-eminent authority of Christ is that of the relationship between the Mission, the missionary and the Church. This may be one of the most difficult questions which face the churches in Asia today. It may be termed as follows: How can the missionary activity of the Western world be integrated into the life of the churches in Asia to the fulfilment of the common task of the Church Universal?

1. Two foundational statements.

The self-hood of the churches of Asia may be either impeded or hindered by the presence and activity of the missionary and the Mission organization. It is the purpose

this portion of the study to show how the churches in Asia are working today with the Western missionary organizations. Prior to this, it is necessary to make the following foundational statements concerning the churches in Asia.

a. Part of the Church Universal.

First of all, an indigenous church is not a specimen to be studied as some avis raris in an ecclesiastical zoo. An indigenous church, or the church which has attained selfhood, is the norm toward which all missionary activity is really directed. The Chinese leader, C.Y. Cheng states concerning this:

"An indigenous Church is nothing more or less than a normal healthy growth of the Christian Church of which Jesus Christ is the supreme Head. The Church does not exist for the sake of being indigenous. An indigenous Church in the so-called mission field is not essentially different from a normal Church in any other part of the world."¹¹¹

The previous discussion of paternalism was essentially a study of church authority expressed in a structure which prevented this "normal healthy growth of the Christian Church". It is said among Christian leaders in Asia today that missions in the past has brought about "the bane of parental possessiveness on the one hand and an only-child mentality on the other. This stand in the way of growth toward a mature church in Asia."¹¹²

b. The "esse" of self-hood

The growth of a mature church in Asia is seen as the present goal of both missionary and Asian. The "Three-Self

. Paton, ed., Jerusalem Report, Vol. III, p. 171.

. Fleming, ed., Op.cit., Hwang, p. 14.

ement" in China has been mentioned above, and these three evidences of selfhood in the Church may be taken as a general indicator of maturity. A word of caution is needed at this point, however, for there is increasing recognition that a mere mechanical achievement of self-government, self-propagation and self-support does not automatically show that a church is mature. There are some factors, especially spiritual factors, which cannot be neatly graphed and graded.

1) Self-government

Self-government must be seen in terms of essential autonomy for the church in its local situation. This is defined as "specifically that a Church must be able under God to make its own response to its Lord in the specific situation in which, along with the other Churches in the same region, it has been called to mission. When a church exercises autonomy, it is not simply seeking organizational independence."¹¹³ This needs to be emphasized, for organizational independence may be divisiveness as an expression of spiritual weakness. "The issue is whether a Church in a specific situation or nation is free to make its own decisions in obedience to God and in the fullness of the work of grace."¹¹⁴ What kind of autonomy must a church have in order that it may most effectively discharge its task of mission?

2) Self-support

Nor can it be categorically stated that self-support

1. South East Asia Christian Conference, Op.cit., p. 14.

2. Ibid., p. 14.

of the esse of selfhood. Hocking believes that foreign subsidies are the greatest single cause of weakness in the life and morale of the Church, and states that "no church in any land will be robust and virile until it supports itself out of its own resources through its own endeavours."¹¹⁵ But it is the experience of the Church of South India that excessive help from abroad is the greatest hindrance to the spiritual growth of the Church."¹¹⁶ If the emphasis is placed upon spiritual growth, the operative word becomes "excessive" when speaking of subsidies. It will be necessary to determine, if possible, at which point subsidy becomes excessive and consequently harmful to spiritual growth. Another question involved in the controversy over subsidies is that of missionary control of the church through continued control of subsidy. What is the pattern in the churches in India today?

3) Self-propagation

Finally, self-propagation must be viewed in terms of its place in the self-life of the churches of Asia. It has been advanced that the esse of the Church is mission; if this be granted, it is necessary to explore the relationship between growth stemming from a church's own resources as an expression of its own spiritual life and the previously mentioned aspects of selfhood. Is self-propagation an automatic, or even a natural result of autonomy in government and finances? What is the experience of the churches of India?

115. Hocking, loc. cit.

116. Renewal and Advance, p. 68.

All of these must be viewed in relationship to the place of the missionary and the Mission organization to the life of the churches. What place will be occupied in a fully autonomous church, one which has its own viable forms of organization? What will the church do if mission subsidies continue? If they are cut off? What will the church do with the missionary in a self-propagating church. Is there any place for the expatriate in the world of Asian Christianity? These questions all relate to the basic problem of authority and structure for church government.

2. The place of the Mission organization.

One of the most difficult problems to solve in any discussion of authority in church structure is the question of the Mission in the life of the Church. Is the Mission to be integrated or is it to maintain a separate existence? If it does maintain a separate organization, how can this be kept from dominating the life of the Church? These are not easy questions to answer, and the churches in Asia are approaching the problem in a number of ways.

a. A three-fold problem

There would seem to be many difficulties involved with the continued presence of the Mission in Asia. These may be viewed in broad perspective as covering at least three areas: Social; Practical; and Theological.

1) A social problem

First of all, the new national self-consciousness of Asians is found in the life of the Asian churches as well as in the nations in which they exist. There is a rejection of

side influences which might hinder "self-realization on a basis of (the church's) own spiritual and religious heritage."¹¹⁷ This was the trend even before 1945, as seen in a study of five documents prepared by the churches in India and China. The Indian churches felt that the relationships between missionaries and the churches were in great need of improvement. It was stated that the missionaries should be members and servants of the Church in India, although dual membership between India and the home-land was not excluded. One of the major functions of the missionaries was seen as serving as a living link between East and West. Perhaps most important, missionaries were expected to serve as equal colleagues, including accepting the direction of Indian nationals for their work.¹¹⁸ In China came even more definite statement of the role it was felt that the Mission should accept. The emphasis was on the Church; even a Church-centred Mission was unacceptable. The Church was felt to be the proper agency for the exclusive direction of all missionary personnel and all decisions which involve the Church should be decided by joint consultation. The end goal of this was the practical domination of the Mission as an organized body on the world.¹¹⁹

This demand for Church control of missionary personnel was at its most insistent in those areas where the authority

-
- . Sinclair, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 47, 1958, "Changes in the Patterns of Western Missions", by W. Freytag, pp. 163-170, p. 164.
 - . Goodall, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 35, 1946, "China and India Look Ahead", by J.W. Decker, pp. 131-142, p. 137.
 - . Ibid., p. 137.

the Mission has been paternalistic. In Taiwan, one rich with a history of paternalistic practices is at odds with the missionary personnel over this. The elected Chinese leader insists that he should be allowed to assign missionary personnel; the mission organization, supported by the American missionary society, resists this. The controversy centres about a missionary couple who was trained to do Taiwanese work as their assignment from the Mission; the Chinese leader now wishes to assign them to work with a Mandarin-speaking church. The issue is at present unresolved, but the immediate centre of the storm, the missionary couple, probably will not return to Taiwan.¹²⁰

However, total integration of the Mission into the life of the Church does not present an instant, or even a certain solution to the problem of the role of the missionary in the field. Especially where there has been a history of paternalism, integration of the missionary into the Church councils may do away with direct domination only to substitute domination by influence. A missionary from the Philippines has led the struggle to achieve selfhood for his denominational Church in the field relates his experience: "The presence of the missionary both inhibits free discussion and influences the nations to make the decision which they feel will be most pleasing to their missionary colleagues."¹²¹

-
- . Wm. Bicksler, Principal of Holy Light Bible Seminary, Kaohsiung, Taiwan, in a letter of April 16, 1971.
 - . Report by John H. Schlosser, at that time Mission Superintendent of the Philippine Free Methodist Church, given at a seminar on missions at the YMCA, Hong Kong, June, 1968.

cussing the missionary's influence upon church decisions in India, Hanson states that his experience is that the Asians too often bow to what they feel is expected of them, utter their polite 'chittamu' (amen)", and proceed upon a course of action imposed upon them by the West.¹²² According to information received from a leader in Hong Kong, the only way to solve this dilemma, at least in his church, was to wait for the retirement of paternalistic missionaries and the emergence of dynamic national leadership to replace them.¹²³ The problem is that paternalistic missionaries tend to inhibit the development of this type of leadership; the result is that there generally is a gap between the retirement of the missionary and the emergence of the leadership. This leadership vacuum can be a time of trial to the churches. However, in the presence of the nationalism of Asia, the time of waiting for retirement by the paternalistic missionaries can be a time of tension and difficulty as well.

2) A practical problem

The presence of a paternalistic Mission can be a source of practical difficulty as well. This practical difficulty is perhaps seen most clearly in the institutional life of the Church. This problem involves the place and use of subsidies, both in relation to the Church and the Mission in relation to the authority over the institutions. Should the institutional life of the Church be under the control of the Asian Church or should the Western Mission

. Hanson, Op.cit., p. 88.

. Questionnaire H205.

ercise control? Niles illustrates the inherent practical problems raised by this issue.

Institutional activities, when supported by foreign funds and manned by trained personnel from abroad, were seen detrimental to the life of the Methodist Church in Ceylon. When the institutions were controlled by the missionaries, resolution was negated by the retiring of the missionary, not a position of equality and service in the life and governmental structure of the Church, but to a new position of authority. His authority over the institutions, through the subsidies, made him immune to control by the Church.¹²⁴

Such use of foreign subsidy and the fact and use of authority in the institutions may be seen to have at least two effects. One is the crippling of the spiritual life and evangelistic advance of the Church. The other is the creation of an organization which is in actual competition with the Church, a competition which the Church cannot win because the institutions have a greater budget.

a) The effect on the life of the church

Murray points out that the majority of churches in India are still dependent upon foreign aid, both in subsidy and personnel. The problem is centred in the institutions, which give an illusory appearance of vigor and health.

"Very soon after outside help had ceased, the present full, rounded and vigorous programme of the Church would be reduced to a thin, emaciated skeleton struggling to survive and to grapple with a task for which it had little adequate preparation."¹²⁵

. Niles, Upon the Earth, p. 179.

. Sinclair, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 47, 1958, "If Mission Help is Cut Off", by J.S. Murray, pp. 417-427, p. 420.

The survey made by questionnaire for this study shows that institutions are the greatest recipient of continuing subsidy.¹²⁶ It would appear that the churches in India are receiving approximately fifty percent of their budget through this source, and institutions, on the average, receive the largest portion of this subsidy. In one of the larger churches, for example, the total foreign subsidy amounted to just short of one million dollars, and institutional work was the largest beneficiary.¹²⁷ The majority of Missions operating from Hong Kong and Taiwan showed institutional work as one of the two largest items of subsidy. In Japan, the institutional side of the Church does not seem to be stressed heavily. Evangelism, church planting and the construction and maintenance of church buildings take precedence in the use of mission subsidy. This would seem to accord with Emer's statement that the greatest dependence in Japan is upon foreign aid for the building of sanctuaries.¹²⁸

In view of this practical problem of the Mission's dependence through subsidy and authority in the institutional life of the Church, and the practical effect of dependence, what should be done? At what point in the life of the churches in Asia does this practical problem become serious? Is there a need to re-evaluate the place of institutions and subsidy? A suggestion to the answer for these questions is found in the attitude of the Church of South India.

"Everybody is agreed that if wasteful expenditures on institutions is stopped there will be money for new developments. Not till then. The Indian Church

-
- . Analytical Chart of Survey Questionnaires.
 - . Schmitthenner, Op.cit., p. 1.
 - . Sinclair, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 50, 1961, (Drummond), p.456.

will not be able for a long time to come to finance institutional work on the scale to which Missionary Societies have hitherto been doing. It will not also want to do so."¹²⁹

Two points stand out from this. First, the work of institutions is not an expression of the self-hood of the Indian Church. Second, this institutional work is not being conducted according to the desires of the Indian Church but according to the direction of the Missionary Societies.

The Church of South India goes on to state:

"It is generally also agreed that excessive help is the greatest hindrance to the spiritual growth of the Church. The Church is tempted all the time it receives these grants to try to perpetuate types of work which are beyond its own resources and which cannot be effectively maintained without aid from abroad. People keep on looking to the West. There is no attempt at relying upon God or using the fullness that is ours in Christ and which is available when we discover and follow the pattern of witness and service. The Church must now take courage and have the faith to tell the Western Churches that we need their prayers, and consecrated men and women to work alongside of us, but that their financial subsidies have become largely detrimental to our spiritual growth."¹³⁰

Thus, the practical problem of a controlling Mission presence through subsidy and personnel in institutions, as well as in other parts of Church life, becomes a spiritual problem. The spiritual growth of the Church is hindered, and the presence of Mission subsidy and personnel becomes a false centre of authority. If one cannot say that all subsidy, as seen in the example of institutional work, is necessarily undesirable, one must say that when Mission subsidy and personnel, regardless of the area of Church life,

9. Church of South India, Op.cit., p. 68.

10. Ibid., pp. 68-69.

some detrimental to the spiritual growth of the Church and establish a false centre of authority, there is a serious practical problem in the presence of the Mission.

b) The factor of competition

The next aspect of the practical problem of the Mission in the life of the Church, as typified by institutional work, is the development of the Mission organization as an actual competitor to the Church. Institutions may be designed to serve the Church but actually become divisive and harmful.

A group of five primary schools, with a total of 3,700 students were operated by a Mission for the benefit of the Church. It was recognized that the Church could not support such an operation, so the entire system was subsidized as a service to the Church. In practice, there was a sharp division between the Church and the Mission over the schools, for it was a basic rule of the foreign subsidy grant that no money could be used to pay pastors' salaries. This was resented by the pastors, who did not receive as high a scale of pay as the teachers in the schools. It was also resented by the congregations, for it was felt that with all the subsidy given to the schools, it was unfair that they should be expected to give for the support of the pastors. The pastors felt that they were inferior in status to the teachers, largely because of smaller salaries; the people felt that the Church was less important than the schools, for the subsidy was all given to the operation of the institutions. With a budget approximately eight times that

the entire operational budget of the Church, the institutions, designed to help, became a hindrance.¹³¹

3) A theological problem

The place of the Mission and the missionary in this situation is a social and practical problem; some would go further and state that the existence of such an organization as the Mission, existing as a separate entity, is theologically unacceptable. According to Neill, it is an aberration of the theology of the Church to separate missionary work as a distinct branch of the Church; thus, the problems of foreign missionary status are a result of an aberration of the place of the ministry in the theology of the Church.¹³²

Such a position would seem extreme if it is held that only the ministry, as an ordained and therefore separate group, is responsible for the mission of the Church. This would seem to be the case, for Neill speaks of the "office" of a missionary, seemingly setting up a dichotomy of function and position,¹³³ but the question should be one of the "office" of the missionary or the "office" of the minister. Rather, the question would seem best centered about the mission of the Church, in which all members have a share. Thus, when the work of mission is concentrated exclusively or even largely in the hands of an organization, the Mission, the theology of the Church has been distorted.

. Report to Dr. Charles Kirkpatrick, General Missionary Secretary of the Free Methodist Church, June, 1969.

. Neill, Creative Tension, p. 85.

. Ibid., p. 89.

The problems of the churches of India have arisen from such a distortion, for the Mission has come to be regarded as the active body responsible for all advance. Under these conditions, the Mission supersedes the Church and in effect negates the missionary nature of the Church.¹³⁴ It is when the Mission and the missionary are placed in this role that one can agree with those who say that the office of missionary is both unscriptural and obsolete.¹³⁵ The role of the Church, as the total body of believers, must be maintained, and no organization may be allowed to frustrate or distort the missionary nature of the Church.

b. A pattern of contemporary activity

Yet this is one of the patterns of the present activity of the churches of Asia. Paternalism is still an active force in Asia, but there are also strong, healthy churches which are developing strong, healthy relationships with the missions and missionaries.

1) Continuing paternalism

Paternalistic organization is not a regrettable but historical oddity. Missions in many parts of Asia appear to be maintaining a paternalistic presence and control; the results of this relationship continue to be the same in the life of today's churches as in the life of those described above.

One Mission in Taiwan began work fifteen years ago in the northern part of the island. The missionary force has

.. Hollis, Paternalism, p. 66.

.. Neill, loc. cit.

abled in that time and the Mission is in full control of the Church. A missionary is in charge of church administration on the general level, and in none of the ten categories specified in the questionnaire does the Church have any part in determining the role of the missionary. The relative position of the Mission to the Church is described as "separate and authoritative". Seventy per cent of the total church budget is subsidized by the Mission; this subsidy goes mainly for the payment of pastor's salaries and the building and maintenance of church plants.¹³⁶ One pastor reports that the appointment of pastors is done by the Mission if the local congregation is not self-supporting.¹³⁷

Yet another missionary reports from Taiwan that there is some problem in the operation of the congregational polity of his denomination. The previous, authoritative role of the missionary has produced a Chinese Church which encounters problems in self-government because the "people are not used to governing themselves".¹³⁸

It is in this type of situation, where the Mission is, or has been, dominant, that the self-hood of the Church is weakest in developing. In the case of one Mission in Japan, twenty-five percent of the Church budget was subsidized (after eighty years on the field) and the major portion of the funds went to pastors' salaries, evangelism and church-planting. In theory, an aggressive programme of evangelism and church-planting might justify such a large subsidy, but only if it

1. Questionnaire T599.

2. Questionnaire T215.

3. Questionnaire T509.

be a matter of joint action between the wealthier Western Church and a poor but aggressive Asian Church. However, in this instance, missionaries seem to be leaders in the general work of the Church. They not only supply the funds but control and use them. Two missionaries were in church administration, eight couples were acting as pastors in Japanese churches, and sixty-six missionaries were engaged in church-planting. The Church has only partial control in determining any function or role of the missionary.¹³⁹

Yet another Mission, this time in Hong Kong, reports that plans are for the Church to be fully indigenous within a few years. This Mission has operated in Hong Kong for seventeen years, and at present subsidizes fifty percent of the total church budget. The largest areas of subsidy are pastors' salaries and the building and maintenance of church buildings. Institutional work is not included in the Church budget; the Mission has established and operates a hospital, a school system and a social service centre. In none of these does the Church have any authority in determining the function or role of the missionary. The operation of the local congregation is within the province of the Church, but local evangelism and church-planting are still partially controlled by the Mission. The missionary maintains his citizenship in his homeland, a practice which may further hinder his integration into the life of the Church.¹⁴⁰

Without further information as to plans, long-range goals

. Questionnaire J109.

. Questionnaire H305.

Other such factors, one cannot judge the possibility of emergence of an indigenous Church within ten years. However, on the basis of the information received, one may be justified in wondering how the Church and Mission, after seventeen years of paternalistic relationship which has brought them to the position described above, will succeed in attaining self-hood in such a short period of time.

2) Encouraging developments

However, while these examples of continuing paternalism are not isolated instances, there is also the emergence of a healthy, mature relationship between Church and Mission within the churches of Asia. These would seem to be the more representative of the total development within Asia. There are two types of relationships which can be traced.

a) Two approaches

There is the relationship between Church and Mission in which total integration has been achieved. The Mission has been absorbed into the life of the Church and the missionary has taken a position of equality rather than authority. The second type of relationship is one in which the Mission is separate in organization, but equal or subordinate in authority. This places the missionary in the position of an equal partner rather than an authoritative overseer.

(1) Total integration

The first approach is advocated by many of the Missions in Asia. A missionary to Japan writes, "The missionary should join the Japanese Church, serve in church government

elected, and consider that his place of birth is of only incidental importance."¹⁴¹ In this view, the missionary becomes a fully integrated member of the church on the mission field. The important point is that he is both willing and able to serve under national direction. To do so, he must be so able to adapt himself to the local situation that he is not given special privileges because he is a missionary. In other words, full integration demands both an attitude of giving on the part of the missionary and an acceptance of that attitude on the part of the national pastors and men.

The Missions who have been in Asia the longest generally have followed the plan described above and have become fully integrated. Comments such as the one by a missionary in Japan and a missionary in Taiwan are expressive of the relationship between Mission and Church. "The Mission does not function as such. Its main work as an organization is for the welfare of the missionaries...families, children's education, etc."¹⁴² "The Mission has virtually disappeared."¹⁴³ Such integration is the end result of a long history of missionary activity, in many cases involving a transition from paternalism to the selfhood of the Church.

(2) Organizational separation

The second approach is also concerned with the elimination of the authority of the missionary when it springs from special privilege. In this approach, the Mission should be

-
- . Letter from Dr. Elmer Parsons, June, 1969.
 - . Questionnaire J159.
 - . Questionnaire T505.

separate organization but never authoritative in its relationship to the Church. According to the local situation, the relationship may be one of equality or subordination, but there should never be organizational integration.

There are two reasons generally advanced for this mode of approach. First, it is felt that the missionary is never able to take a place of true equality within an organization with the national Christians. Even when he has the sincere desire to do so, this cannot be accepted and acted upon by the national Christians.¹⁴⁴ This reason would seem to be most valid when the Mission has built a strong paternalistic pattern which must be corrected. Second, some Missions proceed on the premise that the Mission is never going to be a full part of the Church on the field. The Church should always be separate from the Mission so that there is never dependence upon the Mission for personnel or any other aspect of church life. Then, when the Mission withdraws from the field, whether voluntarily or because of necessity, as in a change of political climate, the Church can continue as before without any essential disruption.

On the whole, Mission societies with a shorter history of work in their particular area seem to exhibit a trend toward a separate but equal/subordinate status. This would seem to be a matter of policy rather than a question of time; integration is not viewed as necessary or desirable because the Church is a separate body with full autonomy from the Mission. This type of operation is typical of the Christian

.. Report to Dr. Charles D. Kirkpatrick, August, 1971.
Op.cit.

Missionary Alliance work, where the Mission organization completely separate from the Church, which is described "fully under Chinese supervision and operation."¹⁴⁵ The Mission is described as "separate, aiding in specialized ministries or holding positions only because qualified nationals have not been found or trained," and this has been a relationship from the beginning of the work.¹⁴⁶ The Southern Baptist Mission in Hong Kong is described as separate, but supportive and advisory."¹⁴⁷

These two missionary organizations may also be used as examples of the trend toward integrating the institutional life of the Mission and the Church. The pattern of the Christian and Missionary Alliance is one in which the local congregation is responsible for any institutional work done. Waterloo Road church in Kowloon Tong is not only completely self-supporting but takes the responsibility for the operation of a kindergarten and a primary school. In projects where the local congregation is unable to assume responsibility, a group of congregations act together. In large projects, such as the secondary school in Kowloon, the local congregations work together through their union organization and operate the institution through a board of management. Missionaries are invited to assist as needed, they are under the direction of the institutional managers.¹⁴⁸

-
- . Questionnaire H207. C&MA work operates on the same pattern in all of Asia.
 - . Ibid.
 - . Questionnaire H299.
 - . Questionnaire H207.

The Southern Baptists approach this somewhat differently. Work is subsidized by the Mission as well as being supported through the Church. Institutional management is through a management committee, with both Mission and Church representation. Control of subsidy resides with the management of the institution rather than with the Mission, and missionary personnel are under the direction of the institutional management when they have been assigned by the Mission at the request of the institution.¹⁴⁹

Both of these patterns are working well. They emphasize the authority of the Church in management. Finances may be completely provided by the Church or partially provided by the Mission; in neither case is there financial assurance for Mission control or direction of the institution. These institutions form a part of the natural expression of the life of the Church and at the same time provide structures which utilize the specialized ability of the missionary without sacrificing the autonomy of the Church.

b) The present situation

The trends in Asia may be summarized as follows:

(1) Paternalism a problem

Paternalism is a distortion of the life of the Church Universal as represented by the localized representative in Asia. This may be said, for the authority of a portion of the Church Universal, as represented by the Mission Society, has been placed above the authority of the larger body, the Asian portion of the Body of Christ.

(2) Integration and separation

The practical, social and theological problems of the authority of the Church in relation to the Mission society in Asia are serious problems; however, they are not insoluble. At present, two approaches are employed by the Missions and Churches. Integration involves the absorption of the Mission, while other Missions act as partners with the Churches, operating as separate organization, whether with equal authority or within a subordinate role. Both of these are sincere attempts to ensure that the authority of the Church is not usurped by the Mission.

3. Suggested principles.

From this study of the use and structure of authority in the churches of Asia, as seen in the relative position of the Mission society to the Church, one may formulate the following principles.

a. Integrated organization

Where a Mission has been started as the centre of activity, it is perhaps necessary to change the pattern of authority by making the Mission an integrated part of the Church organization. By a comparatively radical change in the centre of authority, the selfhood of the Church may be realized and the Mission take its place within the life of the Church, assisting but not leading, aiding but not dominating.

b. Separate organization

If a Mission has started work in a particular place with the method and goal of establishing a completely

onomous Church from the first, the integration of the mission is of much less importance. The end of integration is to make the Church central rather than the Mission. If this is accomplished from the first, the process of devolution is obviated. Furthermore, when the Church has its own structures, rooted in its own culture from the first, the eventual withdrawal of the Mission, whether voluntarily or because of some exigency such as political pressure, does not deprive the Church of leadership.

c. The local situation in determining organizational form.

The local situation, with its own historical distinctive, will call for the adoption of a local solution to the problem of the Mission society in the life of the Church. There are two things which must be borne in mind. First, there is three-stage development...full Mission control, devolution and integration...there will need to be a co-operative effort to ensure the welfare of both missionaries and nationals. Without this, there may well be serious harm to the Church through reaction to past paternalism. Devolution is a passing phase, and the younger churches will need to have a concern for the missionaries.¹⁵⁰ Second, the most desirable relationship between Mission and Church in any local situation is as the structures of authority are defined in one of mutual respect and concern. "The Church should have the largest possible freedom to develop its own autonomous life and at the same time the leaders of the

. Niles, Upon the Earth, p. 157.

rch should have the largest possible opportunity to draw on the accumulated wisdom and intelligent guidance of Christians from abroad."¹⁵¹

d. Institutions and organizational form

Institutions must be developed in such a way that there never be a dual power structure. The Church is hindered, one might almost state prevented, from the development of true autonomy if the Mission operates the institutions in such a way that the funds involved give greater prestige, greater financial attraction and greater opportunity than does the Church. Ideally, the institutional organization should be indigenous...an expression of the Church's response to institutional service, within the framework and limitations of the culture and the Church's own ability to maintain the programme. Where this is not possible, the institutions should be a joint operation, with fundamental structures which prevent financial strength on the part of the Mission from becoming an undue influence in the operation of the institutions.

e. The place of authority

Authority in the church government must never be regarded as an end in itself. Authority for government is rather an expression of the nature of the Church and a means to the attainment of the purpose of the Church. The missionary nature of the Church demands inter-dependence rather than independence; on this basis, the Mission and the

. Hocking, Op.cit., p. 107.

rch can work together as partners rather than as rivals
power.

A Summary Statement

The question of authority for church government is one importance in the consideration of governmental structures. s question may be seen clearly in the life of the churches Asia, for these churches are representative of the Church versal. There are three important areas of consideration ch have been shown in relation to these churches.

First, there is the question of the place, source use of authority for the clergy. This question involves h the method and significance of ordination and the ining for the ministry. From this portion of the study emerged fresh evidence that Protestant principles must upheld in considerations of ordination as a source of isterial authority. This takes a practical as well as heological significance, for it is seen that this question often pivotal in matters of church union or joint action. s, ordination is seen as important both theologically and ctically because of its influence upon church growth.

Another area of discussion concerning the place, rce and use of ministerial authority was that of training. ining was seen as important, but recognition was given t such training should qualify the minister to serve in Asian situation. On this basis, training must be given meet Asian needs rather than Western standards.

Second, the relative authority of Church and State were n to be of importance in modern Asia. There is religious

erty in the countries of Asia which are not dominated by munism; this is an opportunity for the growth of the rich. However, the present situation was seen as subject change. If the possible change became actual, what would the Church do? The structures of authority in the rich were seen as a means of expressing the authority of Christ in relation to the State, whether in time of peace or time of conflict. The need for effective structures to promote the life of the Church in all relationships to the State became clear. All structures of authority in the rich should be designed with this as one of the criteria.

Third, it was seen that the structures of authority in the churches in Asia must be so designed as to integrate and utilize all parts of the Church. The Asian churches are seen as part of the Church Universal, and the relationships between the Western Mission societies are of great importance, for the structures of authority between the Asian Church and the Western Mission have great influence upon the accomplishment of the task of the Church Universal in Asia.

The place of the Mission society in the life of the Asian Church was seen to present three problems. There was the social problem of the Mission as an organization within the framework of a self-conscious Asian Church. There was the practical problem of the effect of Western science and finances as a factor in the possible distortion of structures of authority in the churches in Asia. This was seen typically in the institutional life of the churches. Finally, there was the possible theological problem which

ulted from the Mission usurping the authority and function the Church in areas of advance.

Present patterns were seen to show that paternalism still present in the life of the Asian churches, petuating all three of the problems of the Mission in life of the Church. But patterns of progress were seen be even more apparent. The Church in Asia is also eloping a healthy, mature relationship with the Mission anizations. This relationship, especially in situations re the Mission has a long history of activity, may be the al integration of the Mission into the church; all hority resides with the church. However, where the sion does not have a long organizational history in the ale, or where an indigenous church is established from first, the Mission may exist as a separate organization. existence of the separate organization does not become indrance to the life of the church, for authority is shared well-defined spheres or the Mission society acknowledges full authority of the church and is subordinate. It seen that both of these approaches were successful in eloping profitable structures of authority in the life the Church.

CHAPTER SEVEN

CHURCH STRUCTURES AND RELATIONSHIPS WITHIN ASIAN CHURCHES.

I. FOUR AREAS OF CONCERN

The structures of authority are of great importance in life of the churches of Asia, as in all churches, for they are determinative, in varying degrees, of relationships within the church. The government of a church and the administrative practices of that governmental structure would tend to affect the relationships within the churches in Asia in four areas.

Relationships Within The Congregation

The first of these areas would be the relationship between the people within the congregation to each other. This may take a number of forms of expression.

1. A socially homogenous congregation.

Perhaps the surest way to promote harmonious relationships between all constituent members of a given congregation is to have a socially homogenous membership and to make the church and the local congregation the major, decisive factors in social life. Among the Bataks of Indonesia, adat law was the shaping and controlling force in the life of society...the clan, the family and the individual.

Rhenish missionaries succeeded in Christianizing the adat, and through the retention of the structure of the adat in the Christian Church, the way was paved for the reception of the masses into the Church.¹ The adat law provided a

Sundkler, World of Mission, p. 189.

icle and a structure for the introduction of Christianial relationships within the Church, thus eliminating y problems of relationships.

The same is seen in the Lakher Independent Evangelicalrch. This is a mass movement church which has brought ety-nine percent of the community into the Church. Thus, same social relationships which gave rank, responsibility authority in the pre-Christian society have been retained the Church, giving a framework for congregational ationships.²

2. The effect of secular social factors.

Such relationships emphasize the fact that the Christian carries over into the congregational life many of the luences of the secular social life. Thus, secular social tors may have a large, if not decisive, influence upon the ationships within the congregation. Two examples may ve to illustrate this.

In the southern part of Taiwan, a congregation was ned to minister to an area which included Taiwanese ners, Nationalist soldiers from the mainland of China and kai tribesmen who had been resettled on the plains. How- r, social factors played a large part in keeping this con- gation from becoming a homogenous whole. The Taiwanese ners resented the Nationalist soldiers and refused to re the same services with them. Part of this problem in the language barrier...it was necessary to interpret o the Taiwanese dialect, and this was acceptable to

ther the farmers or the soldiers. Part of the problem in the factor of people-consciousness. Both Taiwanese soldiers regarded the Drukai tribesmen as inferiors, and tribesmen responded negatively to this treatment. The congregation was meant to serve as the missionary wedge of Church into the unevangelized district, but there was no effective outreach because of social differences which made difficult proper relationships within the congregation. It was not until a pastor was appointed who spoke both Taiwanese and Mandarin, and whose Taiwanese wife helped bridge the gap between the two Chinese groups, that the barrier was broken down. Even so, it was found necessary to have virtually two congregations sharing the one building. There were two sets of services and church activities, one in Mandarin and the other in Taiwanese. The one link between the two congregations was the congregational governing board which had representative membership from the two congregations. As for the Drukai tribesmen, a tribal pastor was sent to minister to them, and within four years a congregation of over two hundred people was gathered, a sanctuary had been built, and the congregation was largely self-supporting.³

The second example of this influence of the secular relationships upon the congregational relationships may be seen in the life of a church in northern India.⁴ This is a church with 137 members, located in an urban and industrial community of Nagpur district. The local governing body is

Conference records, Formosa Free Methodist Church.
Questionnaire 100B.

h policy-making and policy-executing in its functions. The pastor considers his task in administration as one of coordination of activities rather than the supply of direction and initiative. However, the election of the local governing body is of serious concern to him, for both in the election of the board and its regular activities, factional differences are detrimental to the relationships between members of the congregation. This is expressed in political activity at the annual congregational meeting, and during the year by members with family ties working as a group within the church.

3. The value of neutral leadership.

This problem is evidently rather prevalent in India. It is spoken of as Parti Bazi, partisan activity, and is seen as a carry-over of the secular social system into the relationships of the congregation.⁵ It is in this type of situation that broadly-based and homogenous church life is seen as especially valuable. Leadership beyond the local congregation proves valuable because it is neutral and may be used to overcome family and factional loyalties.⁶

Hwang speaks of the Church in Asia as a creative authority which must bear the reconciling power of Christ to all nations and the peoples. It is on this basis that the concentration upon ethnic churches is deplored, for the church must be reconciled and reconciling power among the

Hayward, Op.cit., p. 93.

Hanson, Op.cit., p. 183.

verse groups of the world. Christian relationships have additionally been based upon the concepts embodied in such scripture as Colossians 3:11.⁷

On the other hand, MacGavran states that it may be necessary to have "segregated" churches...churches which are "one-peoples" congregations. This is not seen so much as a useful segregation as much as it is realistic administration. Where two groups are forced to integrate, the superior or socially dominant group will become dominant; the result will be the exodus of the weaker, socially inferior group.⁸

4. Summary.

The relationships between members of the congregation involve three vital factors. First, harmonious relationships within the congregation are best promoted through the Christianization of the social milieu. Social structures can only be related to congregational relationships. Second, where the social milieu is not Christianized, it must be recognized that secular social relationships are strong and will continue to influence congregational relationships. Congregational life is not amenable to legislation for the achievement of harmonious relationships between socially divided groups. Rather than to frustrate the congregational life, it is seen as best to have "segregated" churches rather than to force integration of socially-divided groups. Third, where there is internal division because of family or factional loyalties, leadership resources from outside

Hwang, C.H., Joint Action for Mission in Formosa. (New York: Friendship Press, 1968), pp. 18, 19.

MacGavran, Understanding Church Growth., p. 211.

congregation can provide neutral guidance and assistance which is beneficial.

Relationships Involving Larger Church Structure

Congregational relationships are an important area of church life; in many instances, issues involved in the life of the local congregation are also of importance to the larger Ekklesia. Thus, the relationships between the congregation and the larger Church structure, if it exists, are important. The degree of autonomy exercised by the local congregation and the degree of authority exercised by the church organization vary, both because of traditional polity and the influence of local conditions and cultural factors. This will be discussed in detail below. The important consideration for this section is the reminder that all congregation-Church relationships must be guided by the standard of church growth and the missionary outreach of the Church.

1. Church growth through larger structures

In the illustration used above, the function of an extra-congregational authority may be seen to be of great value to this end. One pastor was unable to unite three ethnically-divided groups, so the denominational authority provided leadership resources and direction which was able to unite two groups, albeit somewhat loosely. The third group eventually formed into a separate congregation and flourished within its own social milieu.

The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan is yet another example of the use of extra-congregational structure for the advancement of the Church. Hakkas, Taiwanese and mountain aboriginal groups make up the three main groups within this

omination. While the Taiwanese are the most numerous in the Church, evangelism is also active among the Hakkas, and the mountain tribal churches have come into the Presbyterian Church through a mass movement which began when the Japanese were in control of the island. In 1965, a movement was initiated to double the membership of the Church within five years. Emphasis was placed upon the mountain churches for one year, upon rural areas for one year, and upon urban evangelization for yet another, with a total, co-ordinated plan and programme. It is interesting to note that this plan was a representation from the congregational level, co-ordination at the denominational level and was designed to build the local church as the instrument of the advance of the Presbyterian Church through intensive evangelization and unification.⁹

The emphasis upon structure for church government and administration which is advocated by the World Council of Churches would combine the dual aspects of faith and order. Faith is seen as the expression of a vital spiritual life and order as the form which this life assumed. The form is seen as necessarily flexible for the success of the Church as a reconciling force. But this flexibility of structure must be one of continual openness to the Holy Spirit if it is to be acceptable.¹⁰

Song, Op.cit., pp. 18-20.

Faith and Order Commission, Survey of Church Union Negotiations, 1965-1967, Commission Paper No. 52. (Lausanne: WCC Press, 1968), pp. 3, 4, 32.

2. Suggested principles.

Three points may be drawn from the above discussion act as possible guides for the establishment of relations between congregational and denominational structures. First, the local congregation is unable to act as a missionary unit when socially divisive forces prove strong enough to prevent harmonious relationships within the congregation. In this situation, if in no other, extra-congregational structure may prove helpful. Second, the supra-congregational structure should be flexible, capable of adaptation to the local situation. The degree of authority and the exact function of the supra-congregational organization, its form, and its relationship to the traditional polity of the denomination must be part of an open structure, responsive to the leadership of the Holy Spirit. Third, the relationships between members of the local congregation, and between the congregation and any denominational super-structure, must be part of the total life of the Church, as such, measured by the missionary nature and purpose of the Church.

Relationships Between Clergy and Laity.

The relationship between the clergy and the laity is another vital area of relationship which is determined by the missionary nature and purpose of the Church. The World Council of Churches, in a study conducted in 1952, suggests that there are two possible extremes in this relationship.

The minister may think of himself as a professional and therefore in a position to dominate. On the other hand, the laity may think of him as a servant, in the sense that he

open to any popular demand. Both of these are viewed as distortion of the life of the Church.¹¹ The reality of this distortion is found in the life of the churches in Asia in a number of ways which affect church structure and the mission of the Church.

1. A dominant clergy.

The dominance of the clergy in Asia would seem to be a present fact in the life of the churches. Church and missionary leaders replied to the question, "Where is the leadership strength of the Church?", by stating that the clergy is dominant. This dominance would seem to be found in a broad spectrum of churches, regardless of official identity or the nation in which the churches are located.

a. Three reasons for present situation

This dominance of the clergy may be traced to a number of reasons. These may be seen to vary according to the local situation, but generally speaking, there are at least three major reasons for the present distortion.

1) Leadership qualities

One reason for the present dominance of the clergy may be seen to be the natural relationship of a qualified leader to less-qualified followers. A survey of rural churches in China showed that where there were poorly educated, lower class congregations, there was a need for strong, direct leadership.¹² Where there is inability to participate in the government of the congregation, the people would seem to

WCC, Evangelism in India. (Geneva: Secretariat for Evangelism, 1952), pp. 23, 24.

Liu, Op.cit., pp. 231-233.

ed a dominant pastor.¹³ Where the minister is better
 ined than his congregation, there may be three results.
 pastor may feel that his training justifies an attitude
 condescension and a failure to take the congregation
 to the administrative processes of the church. Or the
 ple may feel that their lack of training disqualifies
 m from any participation in church government, even though
 pastor may wish to include them. Finally, there may be
 mutual feeling on the part of the pastor and his congre-
 sion that the work of the church ought to be left to the
 alified "professional".

The difficulty in all three of those attitudes is
 it church government becomes one-sided. The contributions
 the laity may be meagre or great, but there is not full
 gregational life until the pastor is willing to share
 idership and the layman able to share it.¹⁴

2) Asian social patterns

However, this dominance of the clergy may also be a
 ult of the social patterns of many of the nations of the
 ent. In Chinese cultures, as well as in Japan, Confucian
 ics are a part of the entire social fabric.¹⁵ The
 ect of this is to make the minister the equivalent of
 Confucian gentleman or the superior man.¹⁶ The emer-
 ce of congregations, independent of other organizations,

Rigg, Op.cit., pp. 256, 257.

Dickinson, Op.cit., p. 75.

Oldham, ed., Op.cit., Vol. I, 1912, "Christianity in
 Japan", by Tasuka Harada, p. 80.

Sinclair, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 50, 1961, (Schmidt) p. 455.

dependent of other and centred about the person of one minister as leader, is yet another symptom of this Confucian influence. Hong Kong has a large number of independent, one-congregation churches;¹⁷ Taiwan shows a trend toward development of small groups within one denomination, generally centred about one man. The Mandarin Church, the Little Church and the True Jesus Church are indigenous and increasingly "fragmented" in this sense.¹⁸ In India, the traditional spiritual leader has been the guru, a revered teacher, whose relationship to his followers is that of a father to his disciples.¹⁹ Leadership in the Philippines is strongly centralized, and authority is personalized on both the local and wider levels. Authoritarianism and a "patron-client" relationship are two common features of Philippine society.²⁰ Thus, it may be seen that social factors do contribute to the dominance of the clergy in Asia.

3) The influence of paternalism

But there is yet another factor which would seem to contribute to the dominance of the clergy in the life of the Asian churches. Paternalism would seem to have resulted in establishing a pattern of clerical dominance through the influence of the missionary. Where this has occurred, the relation of the minister to his congregation has been distorted. India can be used as an example of this distortion.

Hong Kong Directory of Churches.

J.H. Taylor, Jr., Op.cit.

Mr. K. David, September, 1971.

Koyama, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 11, Spring 1970, (Gorsope), pp. 25-27.

One of the problems facing the churches is that the ordained minister has succeeded to the position of the strict missionary. He exercises a paternalistic oversight over the congregations, with whom he has little direct contact except in the administration of the sacraments. The ordained workers are paid, directed and disciplined by this successor to the missionary.²¹

2. Undesirable results.

Where church structures have established a dominance which is not congruent with the social pattern, the results may be undesirable in the life of the church. The discussion below will reveal that India has a strongly patriarchal pattern of leadership, of which the guru forms the part, but that this leadership has a strongly personal element in it. The remote ordained minister may exercise the authority of the guru, but without the personal element leadership is deficient.

Mention of the problem of a dominant clergy in relationship to social patterns may be summarized in showing at least three undesirable results.

a. Potential alienation

The dominance of the clergy may lead to the loss of rapport with the congregations, or even to the alienation of the people. Mention has already been made of the lack of cultural congruence in the Japanese ministry, and how younger Christians are rebelling against the former dominance.²²

Hollis, Paternalism, pp. 53, 54.

Palmore, loc. cit.

following the Western pattern of the ministry, and incorporating a distorted dominance, the clergy has unconsciously alienated the younger members of the churches. This pattern of rejection of the clergy is symptomatic of a larger trend found in the relationship between clergy and laity in Asia today.

Jones reports from Japan that while Japan is a ripe evangelistic field, there is anti-church feeling among the people, especially among the young.²³ The reaction is against the institutional side of Christianity, represented by the clergy as a separate, professional class. This is part of the strength of the No-Church Movement in Japan, which minimizes the institutional in favour of the spiritual.²⁴

In a recent survey of middle-school students in Hong Kong, this same latent anti-clericalism was found to be prevalent. The Protestant young people seemed to feel that their ministers were too concerned with status, and had a poorer opinion of their pastors than Catholic students had of their priests.²⁵ This type of attitude has serious implications for the relationships of the congregation and the missionary nature of the Church.

This is especially so in that it seems to be the young who are alienated by the dominance of the clergy. Asia is an area in which the young will play an increasingly important role, if for no other reason than their numerical

Bingle, ed. Op.cit., Vol. 45, 1956, "Editorial Survey", p.4.

Lee, Op.cit., pp. 109-110.

Letter from Dr. Manfred Berndt, of the Lutheran Church, Missouri Synod, Hong Kong, July, 1971.

length. At the present time, over fifty percent of the population of Asia is under nineteen years of age, and the population is increasing in all countries of Asia, with the exception of Japan and Hong Kong.²⁶

b. Loss of identification

Yet another way in which the clergy may occupy a position of dominance which has undesirable effects is seen in Niles. Speaking as a Methodist, with the institution of itinerant ministry assigned through the denominational structure, he notes that the Methodist itinerancy can mean a loss of effectiveness in ministry because it can create a professional class not called upon to pay the price of identification in a non-Christian society.²⁷ To the extent that such a minister is not one with his congregation, in that he is set apart and above by his professional status and his relationship to the structure of the denomination, there may well be a hindrance to the ministry.

c. Potential indifference

Perhaps this is the reason why the work of one denomination in Hong Kong was hindered by the relationship between the pastors and the laity. The modified episcopal structure of this denomination assigned the pastors to their circuits annually, through what was intended to be a representative committee. A recurring problem in the local circuits was the failure of the Christians to support their

United Nations Organization, ed., United Nations Demographic Survey, 1969. (New York: U.N. Press, 1970), p. 117.

Niles, Upon the Earth, p. 164.

tors. This was seen in two general attitudes. First, the members of the congregations felt they had not chosen a pastor...since he was assigned by the denomination, let the denomination assume responsibility for his salary. Second, in the event that the pastor tried to exercise leadership in any difficult area which called for sacrifice on the part of the congregation, he would be met with passive non-cooperation or overt opposition. He had been assigned, not a paid professional and did not understand or represent the congregation. The place of dominance which the denominational structure seemed to foster was a barrier to a sharing of mutual responsibility between the pastor and the congregation.²⁸

3. Encouraging trends.

While it is possible to see many faults and problems in the present relationships between the clergy and the laity in Asia, there are some encouraging trends which are appearing at different points and varied pace.

a. Changing concept of ministry

The first of these is the concept of the ministry held by the minister himself. In response to the question, "What are the most important roles you play as minister of the local congregation?", the large majority answered that they considered the pastoral or the teaching ministry was most important, but they also felt that it was important to be a good teacher. Very few felt that it was most important to be a pastor, an administrative leader or an administrative co-

Interview with Rev. Grant Nealis, Field Chairman of Oriental Missionary Society, May, 1969.

linator. This primarily pastoral self-image, with strong emphasis upon preaching and teaching, denotes a changing concept of the minister's role.²⁹

b. Increasing lay activity

This trend is also reflected in yet another way in churches in Asia. While it was generally agreed that clergy was dominant in the church life, a large number of informants pointed out that there was increasing activity on the part of the laymen, and that the laity was becoming more influential than in the past. Some of the churches are taking active steps to ensure that this trend was continued. Church structures, such as the new constitution of the Missouri Synod of the Lutheran Church in Hong Kong, which became operative in 1972, are designed to ensure parity between the laymen and the ministry.³⁰

4. Summary.

In summary then, the churches of Asia are generally in need of improved relationships between the clergy and the laity. This is seen in the dominance of the laity as a professional class, resulting from educational and cultural factors, as well as from missionary paternalism. When a change such as this is incorporated into church structures, there are at least three undesirable effects. There is a loss of rapport, or even alienation, between the clergy and the laity. There is also a loss of identification in mission and a loss of a sense of mutual responsibility.

Analytical Chart of Questionnaires.

Questionnaire H205.

ever, two trends are encouraging in the midst of these blemes. The ministry is showing a healthy concept of its task as primarily pastoral, and the laity is becoming increasingly influential and active.

Relationships in Discipline.

The final areas of relationships which may now be cited in the churches of Asia are those which involve discipline in the church. Once again, this area of relationship is of importance for the missionary activity of the church, and must be judged by this standard.

1. Four types of relationships.

It may be seen that there are at least four types of relationships which can be found in discipline.

a. "Imposed" discipline

The first type of relationship is seen in what may be described as "imposed" discipline. This is a vertical relationship, consisting of a dominant figure assigning a measure of discipline to a subordinate. This may take at least three forms within the churches of Asia.

1) Culturally imposed discipline

There may be a culturally "imposed" discipline, in the sense that a discipline from one cultural situation is arbitrarily imposed within a different situation. Without further elaboration of the Western-based disciplinary action discussed in the section on paternalism, it is possible to state that there must be a distinction between cultural offense and biblical sin. One is a matter of mores, the other is a matter of morals. The first is a matter of man's social standards, the second is a matter of God's divine law. One

temporal while the other is eternal. When one makes a distinction between Christian discipline and (western) cultural discipline, it is necessary to remember that the Bible cannot act as the arbiter of Asian morals. The Bible alone can be the standard. At the same time, it is well to remember that Western culture has been thoroughly conditioned by Christian ethics, dealing with such important matters as marriage and slavery. Thus, the emphasis upon Christ, not culture, must be the emphasis upon not imposing late modern Western culture as a standard for discipline.³¹

2) Ecclesiastically imposed discipline

There is a second form of "imposed" discipline, in which an ecclesiastical official, with or without reference to the local congregation, assigns a disciplinary judgment. The danger in this is that the local congregation will not understand the rationale or the justice of the ecclesiastical decision. This, in turn, may void the discipline in terms of its corrective influence. The reaction of the congregation, which the offender must live his Christian life, is of great importance, especially when it is in a collectivist culture as is found in varying forms throughout Asia.

3) Clerically imposed discipline

The fact that the clergy in contemporary Asia is generally described as dominant highlights a relationship which may lead to a third form of "imposed" discipline. Where the pastor makes the decision for discipline without

Sinclair, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 47, 1958, "Christianity in a Cultural Context", by David L. Hamm, pp. 386-400, pp. 386-388.

quate reference to the congregation, one of two things well occur. The person receiving discipline may accept passively but not continue in the church. Or, he may challenge the authority of the pastor and promote dissension. These both would fall within the pattern described by Palmore, in speaking of problems facing the United Church of Christ in Japan.³²

These three forms of "imposed" discipline may be found in the churches in Asia today. However, a far healthier, more spiritually-valid form of discipline is that which involves the whole congregation, or in areas of broad import, the whole Church.

b. Discipline through natural consensus

This relationship is seen as discipline through natural consensus. It is natural, in the sense that it is in accord with the culture in which the church lives; it is natural in that it depends upon the Holy Spirit and the Bible (both of which should be natural factors of guidance in the life of the new creature in Christ) for the standard of right and wrong. It is discipline by consensus, for it is based upon the decision of the congregation as a whole or upon the decision of their representatives. This natural consensus is the way in which collectivist Asia makes its decisions.³³

Previous mention has been made of the web of relationships and customs in Hindu society which control all spheres of daily life.³⁴ Discipline in the Church is best imposed

Palmore, loc. cit.

Goodall, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 35, 1946, (Davis), p. 312.

Smith, loc. cit.

Asia when this type of collectivist relationship can be utilized by the Church.

An example from the mountains of Taiwan will show how a Christian use of collectivism results in discipline by natural consensus which is effective in the Asian social context. In a church of the Paiwan tribe, a Christian had publicly broken the code of the Church against drunkenness.

The local congregation's governing board, elected by the congregation, met with the pastor to discuss the possible discipline which should be taken. Upon examination of the scriptures and after discussion and prayer, it was decided that discipline would consist of three things. First, the offender would be barred from the sacraments until he had been restored to fellowship. Second, the way to restored fellowship would be through public confession of his sin before the congregation and apology to those he had harmed while drunk. Third, he would be on probation within the congregation for a period of time even after he had been admitted to communion.

The advantages of this form of discipline were threefold. First, it was done in such a way that the offense to the community and to the Church was shown to be serious. Second, it was done in accord with the guidance of the Holy Spirit and the Biblical principles of judgment. Third, the probationary period was brought in as a cultural expression of public disapproval of the acts leading to discipline.

Natural consensus led to a restoration of the offender to the congregation and maintained the witness of the church.

the community. But even this type of superior discipline is for caution.

c. Punitive discipline

Even the best form of discipline may take too severe a form and thus be damaging to relationships. This type of punitive discipline is warned against in II Corinthians 11:19-21, and would seem best avoided if three considerations included in the decision upon the form and severity. First, the discipline which is least likely to be merely punitive will be based upon biblical principles and decided in by reliance upon the Holy Spirit. Second, the discipline should be in accord with the culture. This is where the precedents set in church history or denominational practices the West may be especially weak. For example, a disciplinary action which may be perfectly normal in the West may be excessively punitive in the Chinese context, for it may cause the offender to lose "face" beyond acceptability. It is here that the national understanding of culture must be accepted over the traditional code of discipline practised in Western denomination. Third, consensus agreement will be helpful in avoiding punitive decisions. The compassion of one will moderate the harshness of another; the principle of one will avoid the weakness of the other. It is in the avoidance of compromise or punitive discipline that the spiritual life may be strengthened, individually for the congregation, through a judicious use of discipline.

d. Pastoral discipline

This strengthening of the spiritual life of the individual and the congregation is important in the proper relationship of discipline. Discipline at its worst may be punitive, but discipline at its best should be pastoral. The concept of pastoral discipline automatically brings thoughts of the activity of the clergy. But the pastoral discipline which was practiced in New Testament times was more than the decision and action of a professional minister. The laity was closely associated and involved in the entire activity. It was their participation which made discipline so effective. The importance of lay participation in both the decision and execution of discipline with the congregation is seen clearly in the case of the Corinthian immorality. Pastoral discipline must include lay participation as part of the service of the priesthood of the believers. The clergy alone cannot exercise discipline, more than can the laity alone. "We should concentrate on the association of lay people with the clergy at every stage in the expression of the Church's authority."³⁵ In discipline, the punishment of the offender cannot be the end, or even the primary task of the congregation. There must be exercise of a teaching ministry to prevent sin through knowledge as well as the healing ministry of discipline to restore the sinner. Discipline does not mean mere punishment; rather it embraces a discipline of life based upon the discipling power of the Gospel.

Hanson, Op.cit., p. 122.

1) Legalism in authority

In any attempt to exercise the pastoral ministry of "discipling" through discipline, there is always the constant temptation to solve questions through rigid legalism and to substitute authority with excommunication as the end result of discipline.³⁶ The way of legalism is a problem today, even if it was in the New Testament Church. The Batak Church was founded upon the structure of the Christianized adat law, making it possible for the entire Batak people to come in to the Church. However, this adat law became a series of absolute legal strictures in which the letter tended to replace the spirit, with a consequent decline in Christian sensitivity to sin.³⁷

2) Doctrinal and moral authority

A better way in which to achieve pastoral discipline would seem to be the observance of the Reformers' pattern of both doctrinal and moral authority. This is the way now followed by many Asian churches, and it is spiritually helpful and true to the New Testament practice and situation.³⁸ This type of discipline makes its own precedents, based not upon biblical authority and then, where there is no definitive scriptural practice, upon the practice of the local church.³⁹ This observance of the practice of the local church has the value of following a cultural pattern closely akin to the Asian, but in cases of doubt or conflict

Ibid., p. 109.

Sundkler, World of Mission, p. 190.

Hanson, Op.cit., p. 110.

Ibid., p. 152.

h the Asian pattern of today, one must recognize that pattern of the early church is not authoritative but actic.

2. Suggested principles.

It may be seen that there are at least four types of ationships which may be formed and practiced in the rcise of discipline. The imposition of discipline which s not suit the cultural situation, and the imposition of cipline without the proper regard to the congregation, ther by the pastor or by officers of the general Church, been seen to be undesirable. The same may be said of itive discipline. Both of these fall short of the goal discipline as a means of perfecting the relationships hin the church in order that the church may be effective its missionary task.

Thus, it is proposed that discipline be natural, an ession of the spiritual life of the church. The toral nature of the discipline is also important, using term "pastoral" in the broad sense in which the minister the congregation are related in the greatest possible ree to use discipline for spiritual growth.

II. SUMMARY STATEMENT

Relationships within the Church require structures ch will promote the Church as a missionary force, both on congregational level and on the general level. These be seen to consist of four different relationships which uire varied structures and practices for the achievement

of the same goal.

The local congregation consists of people in relationship to each other, not only within their church life but within the social and cultural structure of their everyday life. Thus, the best relationship within the congregation may be achieved through the Christianization of the social structure as a framework for the relationships within the Church. Where this is not possible, the local congregation, generally through the assistance of the general Church, must find ways in which adaptation to the relationships within the local social structure may be made for the fulfilment of the missionary nature of the congregation. In this context, it may be pragmatically valid to have segregated congregations as a recognition of the divisions within the society in which the church must live and work.

The relationships between the local congregation and the larger church structure are also important to the expression of the missionary nature of the church. It is this expression which must be the standard, especially in terms of pragmatic achievement of church growth. The local congregation is often faced with situations when the only way in which church growth may be achieved is through cooperation with the larger church as structured through representative organization and planning. This type of structure must be broad enough to take into account the totality of needs and problems, and at the same time, flexible enough to accommodate itself to each local situation.

Within the local congregation and also within the larger structures, the relationship between clergy and laity

is of great importance. It would seem a present fact in the life of the churches in Asia that the clergy is dominant; this may be explained by cultural factors, differences in the rate of development of the laity, and the past failure of church structures to create a healthy and productive relationship between the clergy and the laity. However, there are two encouraging signs in the life of the churches. The pastors are seeing themselves as men of God with a commission which primarily involves activity as pastors, teachers and preachers. Furthermore, the laity is becoming increasingly active and influential.

Within the framework of both congregational and general church life, the relationships of Christians are shaped by the forms of discipline used. Unsatisfactory discipline may be imposed from above, through authority within the congregation or from without, taking no proper consideration of the local situation. Discipline which is primarily punitive is also unsatisfactory. Both of these should be avoided, for they do not promote the missionary nature of the church. Obversely, satisfactory discipline takes full account of the local situation and involves the entire area of the church concerned to the greatest possible degree. The resulting discipline is natural to the particular situation, and is related to pastoral discipline, the "discipling" of the life of the Christian or church through the proper exercise of discipline. Both natural and pastoral discipline promote the missionary nature of the church.

CHAPTER EIGHT

CHURCH STRUCTURES AND THE PURPOSE OF THE CHURCH

I. THE INCARNATIONAL CHURCH IN THE WORLD OF ASIA

A. A Concern For The World

If the incarnational nature of the Ekklesia is such that God has designed the Church to act as a mediator between man and God for redemptive purposes, then the Ekklesia must be concerned with the world at all times. There are two aspects of the world of Asia which are of concern to this present portion of the study: the population trends in Asia and the society of Asia.

1. Population trends.

Inasmuch as the Church is designed to be a mediator, one of the concerns of the Church must be the number of men in the world. An examination of the population growth in the world of Asia shows an alarming increase in the sheer numbers of the men with which the Asian churches must be concerned:

"Population statistics are not just ciphers...they stand for persons for whom Christ died. And the Church exists to tell them what God in Christ has done and is doing for them. Our concern for church growth in the midst of population growth is motivated by this mission of the Church."¹

An examination of the population trends in Asia shows that there is good reason to view the growth of the number of men for whom Christ died as a literal explosion. In 1950, the annual increase in population was 1,381 million. by 1969, this growth rate had increased to 1,988 million per

1. Hwang, Op.cit., p. 14.

year. And this average growth is increasing at an ever-accelerating rate. From 1960 to 1969, the average rate was two percent per annum; however, from 1966 to 1969, the average increase was two and one/tenth percent per annum.²

When one is dealing with thousands of millions, the increase of even one/tenth of one percent is significant. And the countries of Asia are aware of the problem. However, so far only two of them have been able to reduce the annual increase. Hong Kong has been able to introduce family planning measures which have reduced the annual increase by .4% since 1967,³ while Japan has reduced her annual increase to only 1.1%. Other Asian countries are continuing to multiply at a challenging rate. Indonesia has increased her population by 2.5% annually in the last decade. Taiwan increases her population by 2.8% per annum,⁴ and has increased her population so rapidly that it has doubled within the last two decades.⁵ The Philippines has an annual increase of 3.5%⁶...this makes her one of the fastest growing countries in the world. The population of the Philippines should double within the next fifteen years.⁷ Hong Kong faces terrible problems of overcrowding, and even the present decline in the birth rate is only a check rather than a solution. The influx of refugees from Communist China has been the greatest factor in the problem over the past twenty-five years. The population in 1945 was 600,000, increasing

2. United Nations Organization, ed., Op.cit., pp. 115, 119.

3. Hong Kong Government Information Service Statistics, 1970.

4. United Nations, Op.cit., p. 172.

5. Hwang, Op.cit., p. 13.

6. United Nations, Op.cit., p. 173.

7. Nelson, Op.cit., p. 16.

in 1947 to 1,800,000, in 1950 to 2,360,000 and 4,040,000 in 1969.⁸ India, with a population of 500,000,000 faces the greatest challenge in population growth; the Indian population is increasing at the rate of 2.5% per annum.⁹

One cannot declare that numerical growth is the sole mark or the most important characteristic of a missionary church. As in any activity, an obsession with quantity at the expense of quality is a serious mistake. However, the place of numerical growth must be recognized as important, when viewed in the perspective of man's need for redemption and the Church's mission to that end. Hwang states, "Numerical growth is not all that matters for a missionary church, but it is an integral and indispensable aspect of its life." When population explosion takes place and the Christian community in the total community is still a minority, "numerical growth must continue to be one of the Church's urgent and essential concerns."¹⁰

And the Church is not merely a minority community, but a small minority, within the countries of Asia. At the end of 1964, the Christian community in Taiwan, including Roman Catholics, was only 5% of the total population.¹¹ In Japan, the Church numbers only a fraction of 1% of the total nation,¹² while Indian Christians are a minority of only 2.2%.¹³ On this basis, the Church must be concerned with

8. Hong Kong Government, *Op.cit.*, p. 231.

9. United Nations, *Op.cit.*, p. 173.

10. Hwang, *Op.cit.*, p. 15.

11. *Ibid.*, p. 14.

12. Takenaka, *Op.cit.*, p. 119.

13. Nault, ed., *Op.cit.*, Vol. 10, p. 100.

numbers. "All of us in Asia are concerned with evangelizing for growth. If the Christians here today are truly to be the first-fruits (of Christ in Asia), we cannot be content to remain a small minority."¹⁴

This is not to encourage presumption that men can do this in their own ability or wisdom. The Church is an expectant community, awaiting the harvest from the Lord. However, reliance upon the Lord should not blind the Church to the task nor paralyze it in action and effort. If Christ died for all, then the Church must fulfil the destiny which Christ planned for the world.¹⁵ "To be a creative minority bearing the reconciling power of Christ to the nations and peoples in this historic hour...only in that perspective and for that aim does the numerical growth of the Church have its real significance."¹⁶

The significance of this concern to this present study upon church government and administrative structures is typified in a report from Hong Kong. In viewing the great increase in population there, it is seen that the churches are not able to cope with the situation. The strongly-established parishes and congregations cannot make more than an impression where the opportunity exists.¹⁷ While one cannot say that the fault lies solely with church structure, such as the parish system, one may legitimately ask two questions. First, are the churches organized to take

14. Fleming, ed., Op.cit., Hwang, p. 15.

15. Hwang, Op.cit., p. 19.

16. Ibid., p. 19.

17. Sinclair, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 50, 1961. "Editorial Survey", p.14.

advantage of the opportunities that do exist and to make opportunities where there are none? Second, if the churches are not able to do so, what hinders them?

2. Asian society.

The concern of the Ekklesia with men involves more than mere numbers; it also involves their homes, the places and the cultures in which they live. The world of Saint Paul and the early church was an homogenous world. The ancient Ekklesia spread through adjacent territories among people similar in ideas and culture and language to those who composed the church. Today, the Ekklesia exists in a fragmented world, divided by culture, ideas and language. However, the task is the same although the world is different.¹⁸

a. The relativity of structures

It is stated that one of the things which is necessary for the fulfilment of the purpose of the Church in this particular moment in history is the reformation of structures so that they may be appropriate to a missionary understanding of the Church. Thus, there is both room and need for the most radical criticism of the dispensable elements in the traditional structures in order to determine whether in this concrete situation and in that, they are best suited to embody the divine life of Christ in the midst of the world.¹⁹ Within this context of criticism for advance, theology and sociology may be viewed as partners rather than as rivals, for sociology has a great contribution to make, for it has

18. Paton, A Faith for the World, p. 107.

19. Champion, ed., Outlook for Christianity. (London: Lutterworth Press, 1967) "The Church in Its World Mission" by L. Newbiggin, pp. 109-118, pp. 116, 117.

undertaken important research into church structures. From these studies, sociology calls the attention of theology to the relativity of the structures of ecclesiastical life.²⁰

While there may be relativity to structure, there may never be relativity in purpose. The quest for structures which transcend the past for the redemption of the present is a quest "for ways of obedience to insights God has already given us and to which we have assented. It is a call to review all existing patterns of work and relationships in a given local situation in the light of the common faith which God has given us concerning the missionary task and nature of the Church."²¹

1) Structures for mission

In this quest the place of cultural adaptation of ecclesiastical structures is important to the achievement of the goal. The World Council of Churches states, "It is increasingly clear that the Christian mission must be carried on within and not apart from the structures of human society. It is within such social structures that men are to be found."²² Thus, if men must be reached within the structures of their society, the structure of the Church must be brought into a vital relationship to the structures of society. The structure of the Church determines to a large extent whether it is a redemptive community within the larger community, or whether it is a community apart.²³

20. Newbiggin, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 52 (Margull), p. 443.

21. W.C.C. Joint Action for Mission. (Geneva: Commission on World Mission and Evangelism, 1962), p. 7.

22. Ibid., p. 4.

23. Abrecht, loc. cit.

One of the great concerns of the churches of Asia is that Christ be brought to Asia for the redemption of Asia; that is, that Christ rather than Western culture be the burden of the Gospel. It has been seen that the confusion of Christ with Western culture was one of the major criticisms of the practices of paternalistic missionaries. This criticism is still valid, but reference must once again be made to Hamm's thesis that the relationship of Christ to Western culture is unique, for Western culture is the product of Christian teaching in many of its ethical and spiritual values. Thus, the division must be between Christ and late modern Western culture.²⁴ Two areas of special importance for the cultural determination of church structures are suggested.

a) Structures to support the individual

First of all, structures will need to be planned to help the individual develop and assert Christian integrity in the face of the old collectivist pattern. While a society may be collectivist rather than individualistic without being fundamentally antagonistic to Christian values, when the collectivist society is non-Christian, the Christian individual must face his responsibility for individual Christian integrity.

b) Structures for decision-making

Second, decision-making structures are very important to the life of the Church. The Western pattern is democratic decision; therefore, one must ask if they are democratic and Christian or if they are democratic because they

24. Sinclair, ed., Op.cit., Hamm, loc. cit.

are a product of Christianity? One need not agree with all the details of Bready's book, This Freedom Whence? to realize that a strong case is made for the view that Western democracy is a product of centuries of Western, Christian development. Is it possible to have such democratic procedures without the background of Christian development? Is it even necessary to have democratic decision if the persons making the decisions are of a different type of background?

2) Structures and cultural weaknesses

The difference in background between the civilization of Asia and Europe may well be of notable effect upon the life of the church. This effect is most noticeable, at least to those from the West, when the Christian Church reflects a weakness in the national culture. To the extent that family loyalty hinders or minimizes individual loyalty and integrity, the church in the Philippines has a problem.²⁵ The Korean Church is suffering division today because divisiveness is an historical and present cultural factor in the life of the nation. It is present in Korean politics through the ages, and it is a potent factor in local social organization.²⁶ If church structures are to promote the missionary nature and purpose of the Church, structures will need to be built which will enable the Church to overcome the weaknesses of the national culture while utilizing the strengths of that same culture.

25. Koyama, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 11, 1970, p. 26.

26. Sinclair, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 50, 1961, "Policy Lessons from Korea", by John C. Smith, pp. 320-324, p. 322.

b. The leadership of the Holy Spirit

Neill emphasizes an important word of caution at this point in the search for culturally-oriented structures. While sociology can be an important aid to theology in the formulation of church structures, one must never act as if any group of men can bring into existence the ideal Church for any given situation. Christ is the only one who can bring a Church into being.²⁷ The search for better forms of church government and administrative practices will always be a matter of divine-human cooperation so that the result may be a "living, growing body of believers through whom the ideals and the spirit of Christ can be transmitted and his principles of life promoted."²⁸

Gibson points out that the aim of missionary activity from the West must not be to establish a Western sect. The Church is the goal and the standard.²⁹ In the same terms, Asian churchmen are not seeking to establish an Eastern sect but to build the Church. The difference in cultures must never act to obscure or replace the one essential unifying factor...the universal and indivisible Holy Spirit. It is with this in mind that the World Council of Churches asks three questions: "What is the proper relationship between 'Spirit, Order and Organization'?"; "if order is sought, how can the deadening effects of institutionalism be avoided?"; "Can continual openness to the Holy Spirit be built into a

27. Neill, Creative Tension, p. 91.

28. Hocking, Op.cit., p. 109.

29. Gibson, Op.cit., p. 232.

structure?"³⁰

It is as the Holy Spirit has continual access to men through the structures of the Church that the Church can grow. Church structures which are open to the Holy Spirit and congruent with the structures of society are those which will "renew and revitalize both the single units (of society) and the group rather than to build the church as an institution to stand out as an entity in itself apart from the larger whole of society."³¹ This is the true value of the indigenous church, that it is free to "follow what the Holy Spirit and the Scriptures direct...it to do"³² and thus achieve the rate of church growth demanded by the world situation.

B. Summary

The life and work of the Church lie in the world of men. This world is rapidly growing more crowded and the Church is faced with the challenge of church growth that it might meet the increased rate of population growth. In Asia, as in all areas of the world, church structures are important to the achievement of church growth. Two basic requirements for the development of structures must be observed. First, the structures of the growing church must be fitted to the structures of the society in which live the men it is hoped to win. Second, and of the utmost importance, structures must be open to the activity of the Holy Spirit so that the life of God may be transmitted to the world of men.

30. Faith and Order Commission, Paper 52, Op.cit., p. 32.

31. Hocking, Op.cit., p. 109.

32. MacGavran, Understanding Church Growth, p. 344.

II. THE INDIGENOUS CHURCH IN THE WORLD OF ASIA

A. The Structures of the Asian Churches Today

With this in mind, it is now possible to turn to the detailed structure of the Indigenous Church in the Asian world today. If it be granted that structure is a matter of concern for church growth, a survey of the indigenous churches in Asia must deal with at least two questions. First, are structures introduced by missionaries a source of difficulty for the churches in Asia today? Second, what trends, if any, are observable for the reform of church structures, and what are the causes of these trends?

1. Paternalism and weaknesses in church structure.

Without further discussion of paternalism, and without equating all Western missionary activity with paternalism, it is possible to see that the problems of church structure in Asia today are related to the failure of the churches to adapt their patterns to the world in which they must minister.

In the world of Asia which was created after the second world war, Asian churches have had to face great challenges. Asian society is seething with change; these changes include the political and religious implications of renascent Asian faiths and the significance of nationalism. The Gospel has been handicapped by its inherited Western image, and the indigenization of the Church in Asia has become of great importance.³³

To remake the Church in an Asian form is an extremely complex task, especially so when the Church must start from

33. Fleming, ed., Op.cit., p. 4.

its point of Western forms, structures and practices. This process of indigenization must include the effective use of all valid methods and means to make possible three phenomena within the life of the Church. The Church must establish communication between the people and the Gospel. Cultural elements compatible with the Gospel must be appropriated to the life of the Church in order to minimize the shock of transition from the old to the new community, and finally, the Church must help to mold a new and genuinely Christian culture in the country.³⁴

The problems facing the Church in Japan typify the relevance of this process of indigenization to the problems of church structure in the present Asian situation. Early missionaries to Japan brought their "ideal and reality of a Calvinist and Puritan incarnation of the Gospel". The Japanese leaders assimilated this cultural presentation, and although the Church in Japan is the leader in Asian ecclesiastical autonomy, "its image still reflects this impact". This former Western image is now *passee* in the West and thus the Japanese churches have become alienated from both their traditional feudal culture and their new culture of industrial and democratic society.³⁵

This problem is found in varying degrees in other Asian countries and churches. The failure to adapt to the Asian situation has proven a great handicap to the churches in Asia. But social changes in modern Asia now present the Church with another opportunity.

34. Newbiggin, ed., *Op.cit.*, Vol. 52, 1963, "The Breaking In of the Future" by Vern Rossman, pp. 129-143, pp. 131-132.

35. *Ibid.*, pp. 130, 131.

2. New opportunities to develop structures for mission.

The Asian society in which the Church has been a stranger from the West is experiencing a great transformation.

a. Industrial and urban patterns

The countries of Asia are experiencing a shift from rural to urban society, from agricultural to industrial emphasis. Almost every mission field is experiencing a profound transformation characterized by the phenomenal growth of urban populations. Large cities are developing at a rapid and seemingly uncontrolled pace.³⁶

1) Japan

Japan is experiencing a real transformation of society, with important implications for the social structure of the nation, as the agricultural areas continue to lose population to towns and urban centres.³⁷ Takenaka states that rapid industrialization and the growing numbers of industrial workers are two increasingly prominent facts of Japanese life.³⁸ Industrialization is transforming the old traditional institutions of Japan, and whole Japan is economically and technically in advance of the rest of Asia, this newly-created social phenomenon is also shared by other Asian societies.³⁹

2) Taiwan

The situation in Taiwan is evidence of this. Taiwanese

36. Sinclair, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 47, 1958, "Book Review" by R.D. Bontrager, pp. 475-476.

37. Nish, Op.cit., p. 213.

38. Takenaka, Op.cit., p. 119.

39. Sinclair, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 50, 1961, "The Challenge in East Asia" by Alfred Schmidt, pp. 445-450, p. 447ff.

society has been traditionally agricultural. However, the land-reform measures of the government, beginning in 1949 and ending in 1953, transformed the social structures and accelerated the pace of social change. The new promotion of industrial and commercial development has made Taiwanese society increasingly urban and industrial.⁴⁰ Urbanization is not a new phenomenon in Taiwanese society; it began under the Japanese in the decades between 1920 and 1940. However, it has greatly accelerated in the years since 1950.⁴¹ The role of industry in urbanization may be seen to be significant. In 1951, Taiwan had 5,662 factories. This increased to 27,500 in 1964, and featured growing diversification, enlarged scale of industrial plants, a constant improvement of the quality of goods, and, of special importance, a steady increase in the number of those employed.⁴² Urbanization has raised standards of living and economic development. These have, in turn, stimulated industry and the development of commerce, bringing prosperity. These two factors have formed a circle of cause and effect.⁴³ The result has been increased flow of population from the rural areas to the cities, particularly among the young.⁴⁴

3) Hong Kong

The new emphasis upon the industrial and commercial which is now found in Taiwan is virtually traditional in

40. Hwang, Op.cit., p. 24.

41. Ibid., pp. 32-34.

42. Ibid., pp. 34-35.

43. Ibid., p. 28.

44. Ibid., p. 30.

Hong Kong, founded as it was for the promotion of trade and industry.⁴⁵ The Hong Kong story is impressive in terms of growth. By the end of 1969, it had risen to a place among the twenty-five leading trading nations of the world. It is placed ninth in terms of exports per head of population. The size of such an achievement is emphasized when one realizes that this tremendous growth has taken place in an area of less than 400 square miles and with a population of four million people, situated half a world away from its major markets and dependent upon imports for its resources to manufacture finished goods. "The key factor in this development has been the growth and increasing sophistication of the manufacturing sector of the economy."⁴⁶ One fourth of the population is engaged in industry or commerce, with the greatest number of this work-force employed in manufacture. Only seven percent of the working force is engaged in agriculture or agriculturally-related employment.⁴⁷ The emphasis upon industry is complemented by the changes in the living habits of the people of Hong Kong. Hong Kong is characterized by vast estates of low-cost housing, with individual blocks of flats housing hundreds and even thousands of people. This forms new social patterns, with an emphasis upon individuality and a swing from the traditional multi-generation Chinese family. By the end of 1969, better than one-fourth of the population lived in these vast complexes, and planning is continuous for the development of new estates.⁴⁸

45. Danker, Op.cit., p. 137.

46. Hong Kong Government, Op.cit., p. 1.

47. Ibid., p. 26.

48. Ibid., p. 301.

b. Legislative factors

Apart from urbanization and industrialization, there are other factors which are breaking down traditional social patterns in Asian countries. In India, for instance, caste restrictions have been a millenia-old part of the social fabric; the idea of caste is the all-pervasive principle on which social life has developed.⁴⁹ The Indian Constitution has introduced basic legislative and regulative principles to break down the inequities involved in caste-society. These may be summarized under three principles:

- 1) Ascribed status is to be replaced by voluntary affiliation;
- 2) The integrity and autonomy of groups within society is to be emphasized;
- 3) Rank ordering among groups will not receive governmental recognition.⁵⁰

While the realization of such reforms is necessarily slow, often frustratingly so, it is official policy and constitutionally guaranteed.

Such social reforms are evidence of a growing realization that the future of Asia depends upon changes in the traditional patterns of Asian society. These reforms are an attempt by the political governments to mold society into structures which will make Asia increasingly influential in the modern world.

B. Social Change as an Opportunity for the Churches

With the many changes in Asian society comes a new opportunity to develop an effective and relevant form of

49. Smith, loc. cit.

50. Smith, Op.cit., p. 289.

church government and ecclesiastical structure within the life of the individual nations the Church is seeking to win to Christ. In what sense may it be said that there is opportunity to be found in the evolution of new society?

Social change can mean much for the Church, for the introduction of new social structures can lead to the re-evaluation of traditional cultural patterns and values.⁵¹ This may benefit the Church in two ways. First, a change of cultural values may lead to more receptivity of what was formerly considered culturally alien. Second, a time of change in secular social structures gives the Church an opportunity to abandon its unsuccessful ecclesiastical structures and develop new structures congruent to the emerging society. New social patterns may be welcomed as an opportunity for the Ekklesia.⁵²

1. Changes in the family system

This may be seen in the emergence in Hong Kong of a new family system. Under the web of the Confucian system, conversion was often very difficult.⁵³ Filial piety encouraged the son to think of the family, with the father as the head, even before he thought of the nation or the emperor. However, the family system in Hong Kong is now primarily a two-generation family, without the old emphasis upon filial piety.⁵⁴ Thus, if the Church is attractive to a member of the family, there is not the former pressure to

51. Abrecht, Op.cit., pp. 13, 14.

52. Ibid., p. 62.

53. Danker, Op.cit., p. 139.

54. Analytical Chart of Questionnaires.

conform if the remainder of the family opposes conversion. When the family system no longer serves as a barrier to conversion, an opportunity is opened for the Church.⁵⁵

This same phenomenon is observed in Taiwan, although the extent of the change may not be as great.⁵⁶

"The traditional family ethical codes closely bound with Confucianism are being secularized; they are no longer as sacred as before. The concepts such as authority, obedience, and filial piety which subsisted on the strength of a feudal structure of society and the reality these concepts used to carry have been going through a process of disintegration."⁵⁷

2. Changes toward cultural pluralism

The new social freedom and mobility may be traced to a cultural pluralism resulting from modern cultural disintegration. In this cultural pluralism, there are no cultural majorities or absolutes; this, in turn, results in a religious vacuum and deep psychological unrest. Schmidt states, "The collapse of old traditional institutions as a result of modern industrialization is strikingly evident in Japan..."⁵⁸ The tensions created by this in Japan are also evident in other Asian nations, and these tensions afford an opportunity for the Ekklesia to establish "a guiding light for a new structure (to replace the lost tradition) and a basic new organization of society."⁵⁹

55. Danker, Op.cit., p. 140.

56. Analytical Chart of Questionnaires.

57. Song, Op.cit., p. 17.

58. Sinclair, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 50, 1961, (Schmidt), p. 447.

59. Ibid., p. 447.

III. SUMMARY

The incarnational nature of the Ekklesia inevitably demands that the churches of Asia must develop structures which will reflect and accomplish the redemptive purpose of the Ekklesia. As the world of Asia becomes ever more crowded through the population growth, there must also be church growth, for Christ died for these men. And the churches must win these men within their own world of Asia. This will demand the revision of church structures to suit the Asian situation. Once again, the revision of all structures must be under the guidance and leadership of the Holy Spirit.

As the Holy Spirit leads in the development of new structures, the Indigenous Church in Asia today will be able to fulfil the missionary purpose of the Ekklesia. The old, paternalistic structures hindered this purpose, but there is now new opportunity to develop structures for mission. Changes in the nature of society through urbanization and industrialization, and through social legislation form new social patterns which offer fresh opportunity to adapt church structures to the Asian situation. Evidence of this is seen in the changing nature and role of the family, and in the increasing pluralism of Asian society. The adaptation of church structures for mission will involve both larger structures and those of the congregations themselves.

CHAPTER NINE

REFORMS IN LARGER CHURCH STRUCTURES

I. THE CALL FOR REFORM OF STRUCTURES.

The world in which the Ekklesia must work in Asia is a changing world. Rural and agricultural Asia is becoming urban and industrial Asia. Social legislation is also forcing changes in basic social patterns. The new patterns created by these secular pressures afford a new opportunity for the churches in Asia to become relevant and redemptive through the development of new structures which will carry the eternal life of Christ to the new societies of Asia.

The urgency of this is recognized by Asian churchmen.

"Are the churches with their existing structure and ministry able to cope with these new developments and give a message to these (emerging) groups? Unless the churches seek out a strategy to meet this problem, it is very likely that the churches in most of our (Asian) countries¹ will turn sooner or later into dead structures."

II. EFFORTS TOWARD REFORM OF STRUCTURES

The efforts to meet this changing world in redemptive mission are multi-faceted. Reform of church structure plays an important part in these efforts. These reforms would seem to include an effort to make the largest structures of the churches of Asia more effective through pragmatic adaptation.

1. Fleming, ed., Op.cit., "Common Mission - Common Life", by Won Yong Kang, pp. 31-44, p. 34.

The polity of the churches in Asia would seem to be in transition from Western forms to those forms which culturally promote the life of the geographical church. India, Taiwan, Hong Kong and Japan may serve as examples of this transition.

A. The Churches in India

The churches in India are typical of other Asian churches, inasmuch as they are the product of Western missionary effort. One of the by-products of this missionary effort has been the general introduction and establishment of the three major forms of Western polity.

1. A trend toward a constitutional episcopacy

However, there seems to be a trend away from the former denominational polities. A survey of the churches in India shows that there is a strong trend toward an episcopal form of government adapted to the Indian cultural situation. The churches involved in the survey range from modified episcopal to congregational in their original polity. Two-thirds of the churches have become more episcopal in form since 1945, while an even greater number stated that this trend was either continuing or had become evident at the present time. More than ninety-four percent of the church leaders stated that the form of church government most advantageous for their churches was episcopalian.²

This would seem to confirm the trend observed in the union of the churches which now form the Church of South

2. Analytical Chart of Questionnaires.

India. The Episcopal, Presbyterian and Congregational polities merged into an essentially episcopal form of government. This union seems to be of great influence, either as an example to other churches, or as an opportunity to merge with the Church of South India.

One of the reforms in larger church structures which is seen in India is the union of different confessional families into the Church of North India. In view of the questions raised by some connected with the Church of South India, as discussed above, it is necessary first of all to state the basis of union and then the implications seen in this union.

The union of the Council of Baptist Churches in North India, the Church of the Brethren, the Disciples of Christ, the Church of India, Pakistan, Burma and Ceylon (Anglican), the Methodist Church (British and Australasian Conferences) and the United Church of North India (Presbyterian and Congregational), took place at Nagpur on the 29th of November, 1970. The inaugural service included the inauguration and declaration of the Church of North India, and the representative act of unification of the ministries of the uniting churches including Holy Communion.

This unification of the ministry is of special interest in discussions of reforms of larger church structures. Unification was accomplished by the laying-on of hands. Six ministers of the uniting churches laid hands on three chosen representative ministers including a

3. World Council of Churches, ed., Ecumenical Press Service. (Geneva: WCC, 10th December, 1970, p. 5.).

bishop. These six included a bishop of the Historic Episcopate and two were ministers of non-episcopal churches; they acted in joint responsibility and authority in this act of laying-on of hands. The three who had received laying-on of hands repeated the process for others present at the service; these then returned to their diocese and continued the ceremony until all presbyters had had hands laid on them.⁴

The following points should be emphasized in the interpretation of this event. First, the Church of North India unified the ministry on the basis of the presentation of the entire ministry to the Lord as his commissioned servants. This avoided the question of the episcopacy as esse or bene esse of the Ekklesia; it also allowed for immediate unification of the ministry rather than after a period of time. Secondly, this act of unification was not considered as an act of re-ordination of any ministers of any confessional family or denomination.

In view of the criticisms of the plan of union proposed for the Church of North India, it is also necessary to emphasize that the language used in speaking of the ministry and the nature of the Church was deliberately neutral. The ten years following the union of the Church of South India have been characterized "the years of struggle", a struggle over these very questions of terms and interpretation. But at the moment when there appeared to be deadlock and no hope of union, a change of emphasis took place.

4. Ibid.

This change of emphasis was based upon a renewed sense of the spiritual unity of all members of the negotiating bodies, and the result was a "spiritual transcendence" of the vexed questions of episcopacy and structure. The questions surrounding the validity of different ministries were not slighted, but deliberately avoided, for the consensus of feeling was that such questions were spiritually unimportant. Acceptance of the ministries of each group was made on the basis of sufficient recognition of the grace of God at work in each differing ministry. Thus, spiritual unity preceded organic unity, and indeed, was the only way in which united structure and organization was achieved.

But what of the future? It is too early to make judgment of what has taken place in North India. It will take at least ten years before trends and developments become clear enough for valid evaluation. However, two points do stand out at this particular time.

First, the episcopacy which has been inaugurated in the union is a constitutional episcopate. This provides for the place of the layman in service, and also provides for the place of the congregation as a vital unit within the Church.

Second, this reform of larger church structures through union was done because members of disparate confessional backgrounds agreed that this was the way in which the mission of the Ekklesia could best be accomplished in North

India. Union was on this basis and for this motive.⁵

2. The influence of cultural factors.

It is possible to discern strong cultural factors behind the trend toward episcopal polity. The sociological factors in the days of the early church which eventually brought about the episcopal polity are also observable in the Indian situation. Rural India is still a thoroughly patriarchal society, and India is still a very rural nation.⁶ Although India has a population of 500 million, there are only six cities with a population of one million or more.⁷

This patriarchal characteristic of the Indian society has led the Indians to seek a strong central organization, personalized in the office of the bishop. As one former congregational churchman replied, when questioned as to how he could accept the bishop and still remain true to his convictions, that there was no real conflict, for the bishop was his "father-in-God".⁸

One of the problems which the churches in India have faced over the years is how to find a Christian pattern of

5. The above material was furnished in an interview with Dr. William Stewart, formerly of Serampore Theological College, and chairman of the Committee for Negotiations on Union, 21st January, 1971. For further information consult: Kellock, J., Breakthrough for Church Union. (Madras: Christian Literature Society, 1965; Stewart Wm., ed., Church Union News and Views. Serampore: Serampore College Press, May, 1960. Negotiations Committee, ed., Plan for Church Union in North India and Pakistan; 4th Edition. Madras: Christian Literature Society, 1905.

6. Hanson, Op.cit., p. 163.

7. Nault, ed., Op.cit., p. 100.

8. Hanson, Op.cit., p. 121.

society. Reference has already been made to the all-pervasive pattern of caste on which social life has developed, and which forms a binding pattern of social organization. In rejecting the caste system, the churches were faced with the development of ways to substitute a Christian pattern for the individual and for society, and to make the individual and society useful and productive within this new, Christian pattern. The missionaries could not decide how to use the biradiri system of class hierarchy, nor could they decide how effectively not to use it. The general result was a paternalistic government in the village churches. However, there were two faults in this system of church government. First, the missionary could not serve as the head of each village church in terms of actual residence, so the patriarchal aspect of the society was not fulfilled. Second, the duties of the local church and its officers were already effectively fulfilled by the biradiri. The net result was the erection of the church as an institution apart from the social structure of the villages and cities rather than within them.⁹

The difference between the episcopal office and the paternalistic office of the missionary will be discussed below. However, it would seem that the trend toward episcopal government observed in the churches in India is an indigenous effort to form structures for the church which will be congruent to the structures of society. "The caste-

9. Hayward, Op.cit., pp. 177-179.

religious division of Indian society into religious-oriented self-governing units has prepared the minds of its members for a theocracy which reaches into all aspects of human life and association."¹⁰ The episcopacy developing in India would seem to be the best representative of this theocracy.

The uses of the episcopacy in India are many, most of which will be discussed in the section on congregational life. However, one major use is found which is pertinent to the present discussion of larger church structures. The bishop in India becomes an active and visible bond of unity in the Church.

The bishops of the Church of South India come from Presbyterian, Congregational and Methodist backgrounds, as well as from the Anglican Church. This has resulted in an emphasis upon the office of the bishop which is far different than the traditional concept. The bishop is an elected bishop, elected through both lay and ministerial representation, and his powers and duties are clearly spelled out in the constitution of the Church of South India. The result is that his work as bishop is far more pastoral than that of bishops in other churches. While there are many problems still to be resolved, one of the benefits now becoming more apparent is the concept of a constitutional episcopacy in which the daily administration of the Church is a shared responsibility borne by the bishop and his fellow presbyters. "The bishop's authority is not lacking,

10. Hayward, Op.cit., p. 179.

but it is authority in a family, exemplified by the affectionate and dignified Indian way of referring to him as 'our honoured father'."¹¹

The difference between the episcopal office and that of the paternalistic missionary lies precisely at this point. The bishop is elected, his authority and duties are clearly defined, and his responsibility is shared by those with whom he works. None of these were generally true of the missionary, and as a result the paternalism of the missionary could not fill the need for a socially congruent father figure.

It is this concept of a spiritual father which unites the various branches of the Church of South India. An example of this unity is seen in Dornakal Diocese, where 50,000 Methodists and 50,000 Anglicans work together as Christians, united in the person of the bishop.¹² And it is this constitutional authority which is a source for potential union with other groups in South India. As the President of the Andhra Evangelical Lutheran Church states, the trend away from his form of church government is due to the contacts with the Church of South India.¹³

The churches of India which are able to determine their own polity show a strong preference for centralized authority. While this must be discussed more fully in the section on congregational life, two examples may be used to show this preference on the level of the general church

11. Hanson, Op.cit., p. 161.

12. Ibid., p. 164.

13. Questionnaire I401.

structure.

The Baptists who organized the churches in the Delhi area controlled these churches through the missionary organization. It was discovered early in the life of the Delhi churches that local congregations were ineffective in their attempts to solve their own problems and to work with others. In 1912, the missionaries tried to emphasize the centrality of the Church over the Mission through the formation of church councils. However, these were still subordinate to the Baptist Missionary Society except in evangelism. The organization was eventually changed to a joint advisory committee representing the Church and the North India Conference. In 1947, the Baptist Missionary Society and the Church Council formed the Baptist Union of North India. The Delhi churches had their district union, but without a voice in policy. It was found that local autonomy did not meet the needs of the churches, so powers of policy-making reside with the Baptist Union of North India.¹⁴

An analysis of this situation reveals two points germane to this discussion. First, the Baptist polity, brought from America, proved unsuitable for the Indian situation and thus has been necessarily modified. Second, the congregational polity was found unworkable by both missionaries and the indigenous church. The Baptist Missionary Society tried to operate on the level of local autonomy, but found it necessary to exercise effective

14. Hayward, Op.cit., pp. 44-45.

control on the supra-congregational level through its control of funds and determination of general policy. When the church became indigenous, the Baptist Union of North India tried to revert to Baptist polity, but is now having to become more centralized, with control resting in the general church body.

The second example of indigenous adaptation comes from North India as well. The Lakher Independent Evangelical Church started as a mass movement toward Christianity. Large segments of the community became Christians through the efforts of one missionary, who introduced a congregational polity. Devolution brought Indian leadership to the fore, and the polity was changed in the face of cultural problems, such as divisiveness and factional lobbying, which made the local congregation a virtually impotent unit. The present trend is toward a strongly-centralized Presbyterian polity, and the pastors agree with the General Secretary that it would be most advantageous to go beyond this and adopt episcopal polity.¹⁵

It is noteworthy to see that a mass-movement started under the congregational polity, but when the Church became autonomous, the congregational polity was modified and is still in the process of culturally-inspired evolution. The effect on church growth is plain...church membership more than doubled between 1962 and 1968,¹⁶ and the Lakher community is now Christianized, with 99% membership in the Church.¹⁷

15. Questionnaire I408.

16. World Christian Yearbook, 1968.

17. Questionnaire I408.

3. The churches and the community.

The place of the churches in the Indian community is still in need of improvement. Anti-Christian feeling was reported as present but moderate, although some respondents reported that it was strong and persistent. The greatest causes of anti-Christian feeling were religious and nationalistic sentiment, which are almost inseparable in the context of Hindu society. The majority of the church leaders felt that their churches were representative of society, both governmentally and in attendant membership. This would seem to be a reflection of a number of factors, one of which is the evolution of polity. The church leaders also felt that their churches were now semi-integrated units within the total society, although the contacts were somewhat limited.¹⁸

B. The Churches in Hong Kong

The churches in Hong Kong also show a distinct trend away from their introduced polities.

1. A trend toward congregational polity.

This trend is toward a congregational form of government. Two of the largest churches in Hong Kong are the Chinese Methodist Church and the Church of Christ in China. The Church of Christ in China is a union of Methodist Episcopal, Presbyterian and Congregational bodies. The polity adopted was congregational rather than modified episcopal or presbyterian. One Methodist body which did not join the United Church was the nucleus for the Chinese

18. Analytical Chart of Questionnaires.

Methodist Church. However, while maintaining Methodist denominational identity, the polity was changed to congregational. Thus, these two large churches have already completed their evolution from the Western form of church government. The Christian and Missionary Alliance Church is yet another highly successful Church in Hong Kong, with a basically congregational polity. The constitution was introduced by the missionaries, but put into effect immediately by the Chinese Church which was indigenous from the first.¹⁹ The cultural parallel between the constitution and Chinese social structure may be seen below. The Southern Baptists are also congregational in polity, and are one of the largest groups in Hong Kong.²⁰ Thus, four of the largest churches in the colony were either originally congregational in polity or have become so upon union and autonomy.

This strong congregational emphasis is reflected in the questionnaires sent to the churches. While the majority of respondents report that there is no trend at present away from the original polity, nor has there been a trend since 1945, one must bear in mind that this acts as a confirmation of the acceptance of the congregational polity by the four large churches discussed above. While only thirty percent report that there is now a trend away from the original polity, this would form a much larger percentage if these four congregational bodies were excluded from the analysis. Furthermore, it is significant that the

19. Questionnaire H207.

20. Questionnaire H299.

trend reported is unanimously seen as toward the congregational form of church government. Further significance may be seen in the fact that this trend seems to arise solely from the Church, without reference to the Mission. The preference of the Chinese churches for congregational government shows most clearly in the statements of those leaders who stated their views on the most advantageous polity. Almost half of the respondents wanted to maintain their present form of government. Of these, all but one (an Anglican) were already congregational in polity. Forty-five percent of the respondents wished to change to a more congregational form of government; this included those remaining congregational churchmen who registered dissatisfaction with the degree of congregational emphasis within their churches.²¹

2. The influence of cultural factors.

The reason behind the preference for congregational polity lies in the close parallel between congregational principles and the historical or traditional form of government within Chinese society. Wei explains this as follows:

"The social genius of the Chinese is found in the small, compact community living in intimate personal relationships. It is this intimate social contact which generates the sentiments which cement the group together and give it a sense of solidarity. Sometimes it is the village, sometimes the clan, and very often it is just the neighbourhood."²²

This emphasis upon small-group decision and structure is typical of Chinese society, which reaches its decisions

21. Analytical Chart of Questionnaires.

22. Goodall, ed., *Op.cit.*, Vol. 35, 1946, "The Four-Centre Church in China", by Francis Cho-min Wei, pp. 271-277, p. 271.

through the attainment of group consensus rather than majority decision. Early congregational groups in the West modified and amended through discussion, for they felt that consensus was the scriptural pattern for acts taken by the Church.²³ Perhaps more relevant to the question of polity than the authority of scripture at this point is the effect of the milieu of a society which had more in common with the Orient than with modern Occidental society. To what extent did the Holy Spirit channel direction for activity through the familiar social pattern for decision and government which found both in the secular and religious world of the early church? Was consensus decision the pattern of church government, or is it not more reasonable to see a principle of cultural features utilized by the Holy Spirit?

A missionary to China at the turn of the century perceived the natural tendency to congregational polity, although it was contrary to his denominational polity. This tendency was characterized by a natural instinct for self-government, strengthened by national custom. The family was seen as the unit of social life, with filial piety as the type of political organization and civil government. The principle of popular local government was carried out, with the village wise men deciding local disputes through consensus. The judgment of this missionary was, "If no guidance is given (the Chinese) in organizing the local church, you are practically giving them congregationalism as their type of church government."²⁴

23. Peel, Inevitable Congregationalism, loc. cit.

24. Gibson, Op.cit., p. 196.

The Chinese churches in Hong Kong which have congregational polity are often joined together in a loose federation or union. This trend toward a union structure within the denomination may be the cause for the dissatisfaction expressed by those congregational leaders who felt that their denomination should become even more distinctly congregational.

The Church of Christ in China has a large number of institutions and schools under its care and direction, as do the Southern Baptists. The union of congregations is responsible for these through representative councils. There is no problem in this, for it is recognized that the local congregations could not carry on such extensive institutional programmes. However, there is a modification of the congregational pattern in the appointment of ministers which may be a source of irritation to those who want strict local autonomy. Although the minister is seen as primarily responsible to the congregation, his appointment is often a matter of consultation between the union and the local congregation. Yet another departure from the Western pattern of congregational authority which may be eventually changed is the assignment of partial, if not sole authority in doctrine to the union.²⁵

Despite these areas of modified congregational autonomy, the congregational pattern is firmly established. As the Chinese Chairman of the Christian and Missionary Alliance Church points out, the union has no authority in

25. Analytical Chart of Questionnaires.

matters of local congregational concern and is prohibited by the constitution of the church from taking part in internal affairs.²⁶ The local congregation maintains internal autonomy with limited reference to a federated structure. Emphasis is made upon local responsibility and local autonomy, in accord with traditional Chinese society.

3. The churches and the community.

Despite the demonstrated preference for congregational polity with its relationship to the traditional cultural structure, it is disappointing to find that the churches in Hong Kong have not yet found an integrated place in society. There are a number of possible reasons for this. Many of the churches have not become fully indigenous, and there may be a paternalistic overhang. Also, the overall polity may be congruent with the society, but the unitary structure of the congregation may still be defective.

Two-thirds of the pastors questioned felt that their congregations were isolated units within society, without proper contacts with other units of society. Almost all the others felt that their congregations were only semi-integrated into society, with limited contacts. The failure of governmental structure in Hong Kong may be caused by or related to the failure to attract a representative attendance in the church. More than half the pastors felt that their congregations were not representative of society, and these same pastors, together with a further fifteen percent, felt

26. Letter from Rev. Phillip Teng, November, 1970.

that their local congregations were not representative of society in governmental structure.²⁷ The factors involved will be explored further in the discussion of the congregational life, but the lesson to be drawn from this may be that denominational polity and congregational structure are both important if the church is to be an integral part of society.

C. The Churches In Taiwan

The churches in Taiwan also show the characteristics of Chinese society, although they are somewhat different in their development than their counterparts in Hong Kong.

1. A trend toward congregational polity.

While the trend toward congregational polity does not seem to be as advanced as that seen in Hong Kong, the cause of this may lie in the relation of many of the churches to the Mission organization. A comparison of the churches in Hong Kong with those in Taiwan shows that the Hong Kong churches are far more autonomous. Perhaps this is natural, for the majority of the denominational churches in Taiwan are the product of missionary activity started only after the closing of mainland China in 1950. Only the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan has been active prior to the second world war.²⁸ This Church is fully autonomous and shows signs of becoming less centralized in its general structure and more congregational in its emphasis.²⁹ It is significant that over ninety percent of the respondents agreed that

27. Analytical Chart of Questionnaires.

28. Ibid.

29. Ibid.

their congregation would benefit if their denomination became more congregational in its polity.³⁰ The trend thus emerging would seem to be one of potential evolution toward congregational polity, retarded to some degree by lack of full autonomy.

2. The influence of cultural factors.

The same social and cultural factors which made the congregational polity natural to the Hong Kong churches would seem to apply to the churches in Taiwan. The emphasis upon unitary loyalty and local structure in government is, if anything, more pronounced in Taiwan than in Hong Kong. Indications are that Hong Kong has shifted almost completely to allegiance to the nuclear (two-generation) family,³¹ while in Taiwan the loyalty is still divided between the two-generation family, the extended family, the clan and the community.³² The explanation for this may lie in the far greater proportion of rural to urban people in Taiwan than in Hong Kong. There is also less Western influences in Taiwan than in Hong Kong, where English is the official language and the colonial government structure is modelled after the British civil service.

In surveying the churches in Taiwan, one continually is referred to the mountain tribal churches. Many of the denominations now working in Taiwan are active in work among these tribes, although the majority of tribal Christians

30. Ibid.

31. Ibid.

32. Ibid.

are members of the Presbyterian Church. As one Presbyterian pastor wrote, "After the war, our church began working with the mountain people. This resulted in a great turning to God among these people. It has been termed 'the miracle of the twentieth century'."³³ However, evangelization had started in the mountains even before the Chinese churches were able to enter them upon the expulsion of the Japanese. When the Presbyterian Church began working in the mountains, there were already flourishing churches waiting to be gathered into the denomination. It is possible to see success as the result of opportunity; the Presbyterians were the first to contact these mountain churches and so they were the first to reap the benefits. However, there is at least one other explanation within the human context.

The initial and continuing success of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan in this ingathering of the mountain tribesmen may possibly be linked with the parallel between the Presbyterian polity and the tribal organization. Freytag has examined the tribal organizations of the mountain aborigines and has isolated five common factors in their governmental structure.³⁴ These form a close parallel with Presbyterian polity.

First, the tribal people are accustomed to self-government. They have leadership which takes natural responsibility; the social structure consists of gradient positions, with concomitant tasks. The Presbyterian polity

33. Questionnaire T569.

34. Freytag, Justus, A New Day in the Mountains. (Taiwan: Research Centre, Taiwan Theological College, 1968), pp. 16-18.

emphasizes self-government with assigned responsibility and gradient positions within all levels of local and denominational structures.

Second, the main loyalty within the tribes is to the village. This is seen to parallel the Presbyterian loyalty to the session. The primary contacts within the village leadership receive the loyalty of the villagers rather than loyalty to a centralized leadership. Thus, the Presbyterian emphasis upon the kirk session rather than upon hierarchial denominational structure is also culturally congruent.

Third, there is strong but secondary loyalty to the clan or tribe. The village is of first importance, but the responsibility to extra-village loyalties and authority is also acknowledged. The congregational emphasis upon the local congregation as a complete unit with no integral ties to a larger structure would not find acceptance in this type of situation. However, the Presbyterian relationship between kirk session, presbytery, synod and general assembly closely parallels the tribal structure.

Fourth, there is a well-developed system of family obedience to extra-familial regulation. In terms of church polity, two points of significance may be made. The smaller unit (family) accepts regulation from the larger unit (clan or tribe) while remaining as a complete unit within itself. The session-presbytery relationship approximates this. Also, in terms of overall activity and relationships, the ability of the family to subordinate their interests to the

larger good relieves the tensions within the church which are found in India. Thus, there is no need for such strongly centralized government to overcome factional divisions.

Fifth, ritual groups are of great importance to the government of village and tribe. The incorporation of the religious structure into the governmental structure of the society on all levels can be of great significance to the government of the church. When the church polity closely parallels the tribal and village polity, as has been seen above, the way is opened for a widespread acceptance of the church into the social life of the group. Reference has already been made to the failure of the missionaries to achieve this with the biradiri in India, and the success of the Rhenish missionaries to the Bataks in incorporating the adat law into the church structure. This is yet another example of success through the congruence of social and ecclesiastical structures.

3. The churches and the community.

The place of the churches in the community in Taiwan is difficult to ascertain. It would seem that the attendant membership in the congregations is representative of the social structure of the community, but the governmental structure is not seen as typical of the governmental structure of society. There were no reports from the mountain churches to show the differences, if any, between social structure, attendance and polity. However, as is generally the case with large movements into the churches,

there would probably be little if any conflict. The churches among the Chinese report that the local congregation is an isolated unit in the community, with limited contacts or a semi-integrated unit with limited contacts. No one felt that the congregation was fully integrated into the community with well-established contacts. The failure for the church to penetrate the community may lie in the strong religious feeling of the Taiwanese people. There seems to be widespread anti-Christian feeling, moderate to strong in intensity. The main cause of this, according to ninety percent of the church leaders replying, was religious loyalty.³⁵

D. The Churches In Japan

Japan has been described as the most independent and nationalistic nation in all of Asia. This independence would seem to extend to the churches, as has already been noted.

1. A trend toward independence.

This independence is also expressed in a trend away from the polities which have been introduced by the missionaries. While the United Church of Christ in Japan is a union of Western denominations, resulting in a synthesis of the major Western polities, the form generally reported by pastors and other leaders as the "official" polity was the presbyterian. Inasmuch as the majority of Japanese Christians are members of the United Church, this would seem to be the major polity. Information was received from

35. Analytical Chart of Questionnaires.

Presbyterian churches which did not join with the United Church, and also from churches with modified episcopal polity. Some information was received from congregational (Baptist) churches, so all major polities apart from the full episcopal were represented.

On the basis of the information received, indications are that there are conflicts within the churches as to the form of polity to be adopted. However, there would seem to be a trend away from centralized authority which controls the activity of the local congregation. Within the United Church, the trend is toward a modified congregational polity or a modified presbyterian polity, subject to individual interpretation. This seeming contradiction is explained by Palmore, who points out that the pastors want full autonomy for the local congregation but want their appointment to be through an authority above the congregational level.³⁶ The majority of church leaders who report a presbyterian or modified episcopal polity wish to have a more congregational form of denominational government, and the reported trends within the churches would seem to point away from centralization of authority in the hands of one person.³⁷

There are two factors which must be taken into consideration. First, the United Church is in a time of transition, with the very nature* of authority for church government under challenge.³⁸ Other churches are also experiencing this problem. This reaction against authority

36. Palmore, Op.cit.

37. Analytical Chart of Questionnaires.

38. Palmore, Op.cit., p. 1.

within the church has a natural effect upon attitudes toward polity. What the cause/effect relationship is cannot be determined at the present time.³⁹ Secondly, the churches in Japan are examples of the difference between official polity and actual practice. This may be seen by looking at the United Church, with eighty percent of all Japanese Christians in its membership. With an official polity which is basically presbyterian, one would expect to find a well-developed gradation of authority with emphasis upon parity. The actual situation is much different. The pattern of church administration within the United Church has been one of strong centralization. Dynamic leaders have molded the entire governmental structure about themselves with a consequent failure to develop and use the official structures.⁴⁰ Now that these dynamic leaders are gone, is it not to be expected that the pendulum should swing the other way?

2. The influence of cultural factors.

However, there are also cultural factors which seem to be affecting the development and evolution of polity within the Japanese churches. These may best be understood by first surveying modern Japanese society and then seeing the social structure of the churches.

a. Social structures in Japan

Traditional Japanese society has been feudalistic, with regional or national governments centred about the

39. Ibid.

40. Palmore, loc. cit.

person of one man. However, within the central structure of each segment of society there has been a definite gradation of authority and responsibility. One of the features of the feudalistic system was the lack of social mobility.⁴¹ Although not a definite caste system in the sense of India, the hierarchy of society tended to vertical relationships which were clear-cut and distinct. Thus, one might compare Indian society to a stack of building bricks in which the strata admitted no upward mobility, while Japanese society was developed on the principle of a wheel, with the segment of society centred about the feudal lord represented by the rim of the wheel as a social marker, with the spokes separating the segmental divisions. These segmental divisions were bounded by the rim of the wheel, so that there was no outward movement, and fixed in relationship to the central hub by the spokes of the wheel, so there was no lateral mobility.

At the time of the Meiji restoration, the rim of the wheel was broken off, the feudal lord was removed as the hub of the various segments of society, and the people became aligned to a central government. However, the Samurai class was left without a definite place within the new society and many of them entered the Church at that time.⁴² In fact, it may be said that early Japanese Protestantism originated out of Samurai backgrounds.⁴³ However, these Samurai which made up so large a group within the Christian

41. Reischauer, Op.cit., p.

42. Takenaka, Op.cit., p. 22.

43. Ibid., p. 28.

church were not typical of Japanese society, and were further alienated from society by their transition from a disenfranchised social group to followers of the Western religion.

Modern Japanese society has incorporated some of the democratic practices of the West, but the industrial society which has developed since the end of the war has also reverted to some of the feudalistic tendencies of traditional society. In a large business or industrial concern, an employee is cared for as a total person. Arrangements are made for his housing, the education of his children, his social life, his recreation...his total life, including his retirement and burial, is lived within the framework of this feudalistic paternalism. The supreme loyalty is to the employer and the company. Job mobility is considered as an evidence of defective character, but on the other hand, the employer is practically bound to continue employment of every person hired, regardless of efficiency.⁴⁴ This centripetal system of relationships in Japanese society promotes hierarchical governmental practices within social organizations. As mentioned previously, the Soka Gakkai uses an hierarchial structure as one of its methods for advance.⁴⁵

b. Social structures in the churches

In comparing the Japanese churches with other segments of society, it is interesting to note that the Church still

44. Reischauer, Op.cit., p. 324.

45. Ibid., p. 312.

does not represent a cross-section of Japanese society. The membership at the end of the nineteenth century was predominantly middle-class;⁴⁶ this tendency is still true, and the intellectual elements of society are also attracted to Christianity. About sixty-four percent of the members are in the category of middle-class salaried workers and students, while only two percent are industrial workers, one percent labourers, and one percent agricultural workers. The percentage of educational achievement among church members is three to four times that of other organizations. Forty-eight percent of the men and eighteen percent of the women have college or university education.⁴⁷ This middle-class and intellectual image raises some questions about church structures. Reischauer states that the hierarchical type of organization is suited to the lower-class and working groups in Japan. If this is so, what type of church government does the middle-class, intellectual Christian prefer?

While there has been a tendency to centralization about a dynamic leader, this tendency is now being replaced by an emphasis upon decentralization on the local level. Thus, it would seem that a modified congregationalism, with a central union exercising some authority, as in the appointment of pastors, is the pattern developing within the Japanese churches. But this pattern is contrary to the central social pattern; therefore, one may perhaps

46. Newbiggin, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 52, 1963, (Rossman), p.130.

47. Reischauer, Op.cit., p. 313.

legitimately ask if this type of church structure is best calculated to promote the Church as an organization with a mission. One cannot categorically state there is a definite causal relationship between the socially-restricted composition of the Church and the lack of congruence with general patterns of social organization; one may have doubts as to the ability of churches organized on this pattern to penetrate society with an effective witness.

3. The churches and the community.

These doubts are reinforced by the attitude of the Japanese people toward the churches. Christianity is regarded as the religion of the intellectuals;⁴⁸ as such, it would fail to win a foothold among ordinary people. This would seem to be borne out by the views of Japanese pastors as to the relationships of their congregation toward the community. A slight majority felt that their congregation was an isolated unit in society, while the other respondents felt that their congregation was only semi-integrated and enjoyed limited contacts. Not one pastor felt that this congregation was an integrated unit of society with adequate contacts in the community.⁴⁹ The majority of churches are in the urban areas, and Lee's study of the structure of five churches in Tokyo showed a very definite stratification of society within the churches. Each congregation was centred about one particular class of people. This practical segregation may be acceptable, if

48. Takenaka, *Op.cit.*, p. 120.

49. Analytical Chart of Questionnaires.

it increases the effectiveness of the witness of the individual congregation, but it must also be part of a plan to serve the total society through an approach to the individual segments. However, Lee's study showed that the lower-class churches were the weaker churches, both numerically and in general effectiveness of witness. The net effect was that the middle-class, educated churches were making more appeal to their particular social group than were the lower-class churches to theirs, and so there was a disparity in the rate of growth.⁵⁰ Thus, the dislocation of the church as a redemptive force within the total community would seem to be perpetuated and made more pronounced.

E. The Churches In The Philippine Islands.

A further indication of the trends in church government in Asia may be seen in a limited study of the churches in the Philippines. This study is necessarily limited by the failure of the churches in the Philippines to return a sufficient number of questionnaires to aid in the formation of valid conclusions. However, on the basis of other information, it is possible to make some suggestions as to the effects of church structure upon the expansion of the Church in the Philippines.

1. A suggested trend towards centralization.

First of all, the churches in the Philippines which show the fastest rate of growth are those which have an episcopal or modified episcopal polity. This may be used

50. Lee, Op.cit., esp. pp. 161-163.

only as an indication, for the growth statistics do not give reasons for growth, and therefore the correlation cannot be conclusive. However, in conjunction with other indications, one may conclude that this centralized polity is either of some assistance in church growth, or at the very least, not a serious hindrance.⁵¹ Danker suggests that there is a value to a modified-episcopal structure which brings the people of the various villages into fellowship with a larger group. The Lutheran Church in the Philippines is proceeding on this basis.⁵² The Philippine Independent Church is one of the most successful of all the churches in the Philippines, and it is both fully indigenous and episcopal in government.⁵³ Among the heretical or semi-heretical groups, the Iglesia Ni Cristo is an outstanding example of the growth of a centralized organization. It is one of the fastest growing churches in the Philippines, and employs a high degree of organization at all levels, with corresponding discipline. The central figure in the church is its founder, Felix Manalo, who makes all final decisions. This is true of all church life, whether on the general or local levels.⁵⁴ This would seem to be an approximation in the Philippines of the Bantu Prophet Movement in Africa. Thus, one may accept that there are indications that church growth is best promoted in the Philippine

51. Elwood, D.J., Churches and Sects in the Philippines. (Dumaguete City: Silliman University, 1967), pp. 129-141.

52. Danker, Op.cit., p. 122.

53. Ibid., p. 128.

54. Ibid., pp. 129-130.

situation by the use of a centralized government, as found in the episcopal or modified episcopal churches.

2. The influence of cultural factors.

There would seem to be cultural factors to explain this tendency. Elwood shows a number of traditional traits which tend to a low estimate of individual worth, dependence upon group membership for security and an acceptance of imposed direction.⁵⁵ Rizal places the blame for traditional Filipino indolence and passivity upon the Spanish domination during their colonial period.⁵⁶ The identification of the Church with the episcopacy, through Catholic influence, may also be of some significance.⁵⁷

3. The churches and the community.

The place of the Ekklesia in the community is difficult to determine. However, there are two factors which would indicate that the community regards Christianity with general favour. Unfortunately, neither indicate the extent of genuine integration or the presence of contacts helpful for missionary outreach within the area of the local group.

First of all, the Philippines has had a long historical contact with Christianity through the Catholic Church under the Spanish. This has succeeded in introducing Christian cultural factors into the general cultural environment.⁵⁸

Inasmuch as 83.3% of Filipinos identify themselves as Roman

55. Koyama, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 11, 1970. "Some Traditional Filipino Beliefs about Man" by D.G. Elwood, pp. 37-53, pp. 43-49.

56. Ibid., p. 44.

57. Ibid., p. 44.

58. Koyama, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 11, Spring, 1970, Gorospe, p. 27.

Catholics, it would seem that regardless of the depth of Catholic devotion, there is no strong indigenous religion to provide organized opposition to the Gospel and the Church, as in China or Japan.⁵⁹ Secondly, the people themselves are intensely religious and interested in spiritual matters. Religion forms an important part of their life and thought.⁶⁰

The place of the Church in the Philippine community seems to be more secure than in any other Asian country. However, the place of the Protestant Church may be a matter of greater doubt. It would seem incumbent upon Protestants to take advantage of the Christian influence upon the culture to promote the establishment of all possible bridges between the Church and the people, in order that the Church might truly be a redemptive force in the community. All governmental structures should be used to this end.

F. Summary Statement

The countries of Asia have become increasingly independent since 1945. This independence has been seen first of all in the political area, and then in the economic area. The churches of Asia also show strong trends toward genuine autonomy in their total life.

The developments in churches in Asia show that the trend toward independence is reflected in the evolution of culturally congruent forms of polity. India has developed a strong pattern of constitutional episcopacy to meet the

59. Ibid., p. 27.

60. Nelson, Op.cit., p. 101.

needs of the Indian culture, and the same would seem to hold true for the Philippines. On the other hand, Hong Kong and Taiwan are both developing a congregational polity which is in keeping with their cultural backgrounds.

Japan, on the other hand, presents a rather puzzling picture of development in polity. The modified congregationalism which the Japanese churches are developing does not fit the pattern of hierarchical social organization which seems to be true for the wider area of Japanese society. While it is not possible to make fixed judgments, indications are that the disparity in church organization is a reflection of the general failure of the churches to attract a genuine cross-section of Japanese society. The middle-class, intellectual image of the Ekklesia is not representative of the total image of Japanese society, and the churches are possibly perpetuating this difference in their polity.

The important function of all church structure must be to aid the Church to penetrate the community, in order to accomplish the redemptive purpose of the Church. Asian churches are developing culturally congruent structures which are aiding them in this essential task.

CHAPTER TEN

REFORM OF CONGREGATIONAL STRUCTURES

Apart from the reforms in the polity of the churches of Asia, there are also many areas of change in the administrative structure and general life of the congregations which may be traced. These may be approached in two different ways. The place of the congregation within the Ekklesia is important, and secondly, it may be seen that there are different attempts to make the congregational structures more effective in its witness.

I. THE PLACE OF THE CONGREGATION WITHIN THE CHURCH

The congregation as an organizational unit and the structures of this organization are seen by many as the most important aspects of church life in today's world. If this be true for the world as a whole, it is also true for Asia.

A. The Importance Of The Congregation

Much has been said about the place of the culture and its effects in determining the structures of the Church, both on the general and the local levels. The importance of this lies in the nature of the Church. It is compelled to be a missionary community; its very nature demands that it act as leaven within the old milieu. But in any consideration of the churches of Asia, it is necessary to recognize that they are joined to the "order and values of traditional society by a thousand invisible bonds" which inevitably have an effect on the churches and their accomplishment of their purpose and the fulfilment of the

demands of their missionary nature.¹ The most serious indictment which can be made of the paternalistic structures previously discussed is that these structures divorce the churches from their milieu and cause destructive alienation or non-productive tension; in doing this, paternalistic structures obscure the missionary and redemptive nature of the Church.²

But the question is heard with increasing frequency and urgency, "What is the missionary unit of the Church?" Professor Casalis would seem to reject the organized Church in his view that the proper theological order is God-World-Church.³ However, if this rejection of the Church as the means of salvation is in reality a rejection of an organized body as the sole means of salvation, this view becomes more meaningful. There is a need for clear distinction at this point. The Church cannot be the only means of salvation, for God works through individuals as well. Nevertheless, the Church is the organized instrument for salvation, and as such is the instrument chosen and commissioned by God to that end. Indeed, in the broadest sense, the work of the individual in bringing men to Christ is the work of the smallest unit of the Church, i.e., one man, in fulfilling the commission of Christ to the Church. The individual is brought together with other individuals and these form the organized church on the congregational level which comprises the Church Universal. Rejection of ecclesiastical organi-

1. Sundkler, World of Mission, p. 180.

2. Ibid., p. 174.

3. Newbiggin, ed., loc. cit., Vol. 52, 1963 (Margull).

zation leads to ecclesiastical anarchy, which in turn frustrates the redemptive purpose of God. If the Church is not speaking effectively to the modern world, if the Church is not fulfilling its redemptive purpose, this should not lead one to reject the concept of the Church per se... what must be rejected or reformed are those structures and forms of organization which render the Church sterile and powerless to accomplish its commission.

This is why it is so important to re-examine the structures of the churches in Asia today. Are the churches truly missionary, truly redemptive? If not, where is the failure? If not, what is being done to correct the situation?

"If the Church is to be true to its missionary nature and calling, it cannot continue to tolerate without question anything which hinders the fulfillment of the missionary task. Whether one looks at the great geographical areas which are still without witness to the Gospel, or at the many human communities in modern urban society in which no effective sign of Christ's redeeming ministry is present, one has to conclude that a recovery of missionary mobility is greatly needed." ⁴

If the Church is commissioned for God's redemptive purpose, and Church organization is a means to that end, then one is brought once again to the question, "What is the missionary unit of the Church?" If the proper theological order is God-Church-World, what is the point at which God meets with the world through the Church? The concern for missionary mobility is the concern to free the Church from all forms of organization and structure which hinders this divine-human encounter.

4. Newbiggin, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 52, (Margull), p. 59.

And it is this concern for constructive reform which leads to the emphasis upon the congregation as the missionary unit of the Church, replacing any former emphasis upon the larger structures. Davis states that the way to successful church growth is the freeing of the vitality of the congregation; when the life of the congregation becomes static the church becomes static.⁵ Margull agrees that the congregation is the essential agent of evangelism, but he sees the most serious problem "with regard to the congregation is its traditional structure, which in most cases makes it impossible for it to become the agent of evangelism."⁶ On this basis, it is for the sake of the congregation, its missionary task and nature, and so for the sake of the Church, that questions of structures must be raised.

B. The Congregation And Structures for Mission

Thus, to think of the Church as a missionary organization is to think first of all of the congregation and the congregations as missionary organizations. The Church is not dependent upon the parish or any other form of organization; it is dependent, however, upon the congregation of the faithful, those who gather together in the name of Christ. In this sense, the Church is a Congregation gathered together to worship Christ, for the worshipping congregation becomes a microcosm of the Church Universal. But the Church is also a congregation which is essentially an apostolate...a body

5. Goodall, Op.cit., Vol. 38, 1949, "Missionary Strategy and the Rural Church", by J. Merle Davis, pp. 401-411, p. 410.

6. Newbiggin, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 52, (Margull) 1963, p. 435.

sent out into every area of life for the purpose of gathering the community into the congregation.⁷ Organization and structure are means to that end.

The comparison between the early church and the churches in Asia today reveals a deficiency in the Asian churches at this very point. They are not generally missionary congregations. It was because this fact has been recognized that the East Asian Christian Conference, meeting in Kuala Lumpur in 1959, stated that there was a need for the study of sociological factors which tend to make the local congregation a self-centred and inward-looking communal group, and requested consideration of new patterns of the ministry and of congregational life which might help the Church to break loose from the old limiting conceptions.⁸ At least one of the major contributing factors would seem to be the failure of the churches in Asia to form their own structures for missionary outreach according to the local situation. This is the difference between the primitive church and the Asian churches, according to a recent study committee; the primitive church succeeded as a missionary congregation because it was able to form such structures.⁹

C. The Congregation, Structures For Mission And Cultural Factors.

The relationship between the development of successful missionary structures and sociological or cultural factors

7. Ibid., p. 47.

8. Abrecht, Op.cit., p. 62.

9. Newbiggin, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 52, 1963, p. 50.

is recognized by Asian leaders. It is pointed out, for example, that there are great opportunities in Japan for the development of indigenous Christianity. But the life situation must act as the constant standard for the development of these forms. "Does this meet the particular need of society for the Gospel at this particular time" must be the measure of value.¹⁰ In this light, Western elements within the Church must be examined and reformulated to meet the needs of modern Japan. Christian non-church movements and the non-Christian movements such as Soka Gakkai constantly challenge the present structure of the Church. They have no heavy investment in buildings, and they receive no assistance from abroad. Their great strength lies in the voluntary participation of non-professional lay leaders.¹¹ Song asks if the churches can afford to be complacent and assured that the structures inherited from the West are suitable for Asia when the Gospel is faced with an entirely new situation.

The effect of cultural factors upon the structures of congregational life is of great importance. In fact, the entire administrative structure of a local church could be upset if the church is not free to observe its own cultural norms.

1. Social relationships.

Within Asian societies, the kinship system is of

10. Takenaka, Op.cit., p. 121.

11. Ibid., p. 123.

extreme importance. The entire system of social relationships is governed or affected by relationships within the family. The family is more than the two-generation family of the West; it is the entire group of people related to one another either by blood or marriage.¹² Within rural areas especially, for there the traditional social system has suffered the least dislocation, this web of relationships is of great influence.¹³ The application to congregational administration and structure is at least three-fold. First, a person without influence or status within the kinship system is at a personal disadvantage and may be offensive to social norms if he is appointed to the local governing board or expected to take part in the decision-making apparatus of the church. Second, there are some persons who are not permitted to have face-to-face relationships. The presence of two such persons on a decision-making body would present real problems. Third, within the kinship system, some persons may only address each other with jocular language, which often takes the form of jocular insults.¹⁴ These examples may be used to show the importance of observing cultural factors in establishing the administrative bodies of the congregation.

To a large extent, this would seem to be no real problem, for the churches in the lands surveyed generally

12. Bingle, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 45, 1956, "The Missionary and the Cultures of Man", by R.T. Parsons, pp. 161-168, p.164.

13. MacGavran, Op.cit., p. 174, p. 200.

14. Bingle, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 45, 1956 (Parsons), p. 164.

seem to have freedom to elect their own congregational bodies.¹⁵ However, there are two exceptions which pose potential problems. It was reported in a small number of instances that where the local congregation was not self-supporting, the mission had the authority to appoint or veto the selection of officers.¹⁶ In other instances, the appointment of membership to committees or local governing bodies was not within the province of the local congregation. Final approval came from the general church.¹⁷ Dependent upon a full consideration of all the facts and the total situation, such policies may be justified or desirable. As a general rule, however, it would seem that the local church is best qualified to form its own administrative structures in terms of the choice of personnel.

2. Structures should complement the culture.

Turning from this comparatively narrow range of cultural influence upon congregational structures, one may find that the retention of Western polities or practices not socially adapted to the Asian situation is detrimental to the entire life of the congregation. In this case, structures must be devised which utilize cultural strengths and compensate for cultural weaknesses.

a. The Kui Church - North India

This may be seen in the Kui churches in North India. The supreme loyalty of the Kui people is to the extended family. It is the duty of the individual to fulfil a role

15. Analytical Chart of Questionnaires.

16. Ibid.

17. Ibid.

within the kinship pattern of the tribe. Patrilineal descent is both the law and the custom, so the father is the strong figure in the family. After family loyalty, the next strong loyalty of the Kuis is to the village community. The churches were originally Baptist in polity, with a strong emphasis upon congregational autonomy. It is now recognized that total autonomy is not good for the Kui congregations. "If autonomy results in violent reaction to any form of spiritual control, and even temporary withdrawal from one's own association or union, it can be most harmful to the life and growth of the church, as experience has shown."¹⁸ The problem lies in the fact of family and factional loyalty. Therefore, certain Christian leaders on various levels of the denominational structure are acting as "episkipoi", (bishops, in the literal sense of Overseers) giving spiritual leadership and providing direction which can overcome the tendency to autonomous isolation on the part of the local congregation.¹⁹

b. Churches in Delhi

A survey of the churches in Delhi which are stable and growing shows that they have strong central (extra-congregational) authority. St. Stephen's Anglican church resembles a close-knit family, taking care of the spiritual and material needs of its membership. The pastor occupies the position of a father in the family. While strong laymen are helpful and utilized, they do not exercise primary authority and women are excluded from the Parish Council.²⁰

18. Hayward, Op.cit., p. 341.

19. Hayward, ed., Op.cit., p. 341.

20. Ibid., p. 85.

Christ Church is another growing congregation. There is a large staff and all functions are centralized; this is balanced by well-planned general use of laymen. The congregational structure is developed with reference to both outside authority and strong local authority.²¹

However, Delhi Central Baptist is verging upon disintegration. At one time, there was strong local authority in the person of a missionary and the church was strong in every way. However, the missionary was withdrawn with devolution and no structure of authority has replaced the personal authority of the missionary. Attendance has declined from 500 in 1946 to 50 in 1966, with falling income, shrinking membership and general paralysis within the church itself, which in turn prevents it from reaching the community. A former pastor states, "The reason for the trouble is probably organizational." The church would seem to have fallen victim to Parti Bazi, the clash of strong factions. The minister has no power or authority, and the membership is congregational, with every member involved in every matter. This pastor continues, "In the congregational system, it is the most violent and vocal who command, and who are feared by others, while the decent members keep quiet."²² A former deacon states, "Baptist polity is deficient. There is no real centre of authority, no one to make a final decision. We have been slaves for centuries. We can accept the authority of someone above us...but we are not prepared to accept the authority of others like

21. Ibid., pp. 88-89.

22. Ibid., p. 94.

ourselves."²³

c. A proposed structure for Chinese cultures

While cultural factors would seem to prevent the successful operation of the congregational system in the structure of the local church in India, Wei proposes a basically congregational structure as an ideal organization to take advantage of the Chinese social genius, "...found in the small, compact community living in intimate personal relationships."²⁴ This church would be constructed on a four-centre basis, with the congregation at the very heart. This central congregational cell would have one hundred to one hundred and fifty adult members. There would be strong social contact among the group, centred in the Christian worship. The possession of a church building would not be essential, but a family atmosphere should be fostered. It would not be necessary to have a paid minister, but the spiritual leader must come from within the cell. The next centre would be the result of joint activity by various cells within a region, grouped together to support a centre of Christian social service. This would be a centre through which "Christian life will reach outwards by service towards the surrounding community, largely non-Christian." Wei further suggest that stereotyped practices be avoided, local needs must come first, and that care should be taken to avoid becoming a cog "in a complicated organization which will take the life out of it by killing

23. Ibid., p. 94.

24. Goodall, ed., Vol. 35, 1946, (Wei), loc. cit.

its (own) initiative."²⁵ The third centre would be for Christian learning. All congregations, regardless of denomination could contribute and benefit in this type of arrangement. It would be in constant touch with the life of the churches throughout the country, especially in its own area. "What the research science laboratories in the university are to many of the industrial establishments in a modern state, the Christian seat of learning in China ought to be to the Christian movement in the country generally and to the local church in its own region in particular."²⁶ The fourth centre would be a centre for Christian pilgrimages. In this, a Buddhist and Taoist institution and tradition with real attraction to the Chinese people would be transformed and used for Christ.²⁷

There are several salient points involved in the projected four-centre church for Chinese society. First, the structure is devised by a Chinese for the Chinese social milieu. Second, it is basically congregational, minimizing the form and control of a central organization. This also seems to be congruent to the general social structure of Chinese society. Third, its limitations are determined by the capabilities and limitations of the individual congregation and the regional congregations.

It is interesting to speculate what would happen if this type of organization were to be put into effect. Unfortunately, it presupposes a higher degree of willingness

25. Ibid., p. 272.

26. Ibid., p. 273.

27. Ibid., pp. 274, 75.

to lower congregational barriers than now seems to exist; this, if nothing else, would militate against any attempt to operate in this fashion. However, some indication of the possible success of such a structure may be seen in the partial implementation of this type of organization by groups who have proven the utility of such structures for church growth in Chinese society.

Some indigenous Chinese churches in Taiwan are practicing the cell-type of congregational structure advocated above. The True Jesus Church and the Little Flock are growing, especially within the cities, and their individual congregational structure is almost identical to that advocated by Wei.²⁸ One of the strong features of these indigenous congregational churches is their care for their membership. They are concerned with both spiritual and social service to their membership.²⁹ While this does not employ a social service to the community, as an expression of Christian concern, it is a measure of the success of Christian social service that such concern promotes the family atmosphere within the local congregation. No strong centre of Christian learning has yet been evolved, at least in the sense that Wei advocates. However, Tao Feng Shan in Hong Kong does combine a place for spiritual pilgrimage and group retreats, and this is proving to be a highly successful and effective Christian centre.³⁰

28. Letter from James H. Taylor, Jr., 1971.

29. Ibid.

30. Sinclair, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 50, 1961, p. 14.

d. Church and culture in the Philippines

The Philippines provides yet another example of how the local congregation can be plagued by cultural problems if the structures are not designed to overcome these. Here the family is the basic unit in terms of controlling pressures. Kinship ties are prevalent in elections and other matters of community decisions. There is a basic inability of the people to make or accept criticism. The political life of the republic is an example of how family-centred and supporter-centred practices can be of great detriment; furthermore, the prevalent philosophy is "lamangan", perhaps best translated as "succeed without regard to the means".³¹ The potential factionalism, the effect of refusal to make or accept criticism, and the individualistic "lamangan" are all problems which affect the life of the local congregation, and which must be faced and overcome if the church is to go out into the community and fulfil its missionary purpose.

However, there are also social factors which can be utilized in congregational structures to overcome these weaknesses. The wife and mother in the Philippines enjoys a position perhaps unique in all of Asia. India, Japan, Taiwan, and Hong Kong are strongly male-oriented cultures. The father is reported to have the final decision in all major matters in the family and is responsible for major discipline. While the wife may own property in her own right and has some control over family income, she is

31. Nelson, Op.cit., pp. 99-101.

completely absorbed into the husband's family and maintains little if any tie with her family.³² However, the woman in the Philippines is in a strong position in society and is the central figure in the family. She is the wife, mother, treasurer, and disburser of funds. She may own property, and always retains ownership of the property which she brings to the marriage. A wife receives continuous support from her family and kin, so there is not the loss of individual or personal autonomy which is found in societies where the wife is absorbed into the husband's family.³³

This position in society provides a great potential for leadership for the churches. The Filipina is generally more religious than the man, and this may be used by the churches.³⁴ Indeed, many churches are devising structures which may be incorporated into congregational life which take advantage of the unique position of the woman in Philippine culture. The Catholic Church is now allowing women to act as lectors or extraordinary ministers of some liturgical functions in cases of necessity.³⁵ Some Protestant churches are utilizing women in a position of deaconess; these are being of great assistance to the pastor. Furthermore, trained but unordained women often do a better job as pastors than ordained seminary graduates.³⁶ An area of fruitful study might be found in the examination of possible structures which could be formed to utilize Christian mothers in some

32. Analytical Chart of Questionnaires.

33. Nelson, Op.cit., pp. 99-100.

34. Koyama, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 11, 1970 (Gorospe), p. 24.

35. Ibid., p. 24.

36. Schlosser, Op.cit., p. 2.

form of cell leadership, perhaps with special reference to their own families and within the kinship system.

e. The committee within the congregation

One aspect of congregational structure which needs further study is the organization and function of committees within the congregation. The majority of church leaders and pastors indicated that their churches were organized into committees to meet the needs of congregational life. However, a large number of answers from Hong Kong, Taiwan and India indicated that these committees were not functioning, either because of lack of interest or because the personnel within the churches were not capable of service. Only in Japan, with its high percentage of educated, middle-class members, did there appear a trend which indicated that the congregations were both organized and functioning in committee structure.³⁷ One is only able to ask questions rather than to draw definite conclusions on the basis of information received, but further study may reveal at least three factors. First, the dominant clergy discourages lay participation; second, structures on the congregational level are not understood or accepted by the people supposed to operate them. As Allen points out, organization is permanent only when it can be understood and maintained. The test of good organization is naturalness and permanence.³⁸ Third, the churches are failing to attract capable personnel or to train present personnel for service within the congregation.

37. Analytical Chart of Questionnaires.

38. Allen, Op.cit., p. 194.

D. Summary

The congregation of the faithful is seen today as the agent and centre of the missionary Church. The structures within the congregation are of great influence in the fulfilment of this missionary purpose. Thus, the structure of the congregation is being re-examined and reformed to enable the congregation in its local situation be a truly missionary church. However, the local situation is composed of cultural factors which can be either detrimental to congregational structure or provide valuable resources. Structures will be reformed satisfactorily only when these cultural factors are taken into consideration and structures devised which will not hinder the missionary purpose of the congregation, but will rather utilize all resources for the fulfilment of that purpose.

II. THREE IMPORTANT COMPONENTS OF CONGREGATIONAL LIFE

The churches of Asia are faced with the great task of providing an effective witness and an aggressive missionary outreach in the world in which they exist. One may hope that the criticism voiced by Song, in speaking of the Church in Taiwan, may be met with positive action: it is said that the result of the Western inheritances is "that the Church in Taiwan today has to move away from a too sacralized concept of the Church and her ministry, which tends to close off the Church from the world. So far it has seemed that the Church exists for Christians and Christians exist for the Church...(the result is) a Church ingrown upon itself."³⁹

39. Song, Op.cit., pp. 7,8.

It would seem unreasonable to suppose that Taiwan is alone in this tendency, inasmuch as it has already been shown that Western paternalistic practices were common in all of Asia. If the congregations of the churches in Asia today are ingrown in this way, they are prevented from fulfilling their missionary calling. Then what can be done about it? How can the situation be corrected? Some suggestions may be made on the basis of an examination of the congregations in their basic forms.

There would seem to be at least three basic components of congregational life. These are, first of all, the laity in the congregation, and then secondly, the ministry for the congregation, and finally, the practical arrangements for the life of the congregation. These practical arrangements would include the problem of finances and self-support. These may now be considered for their influence upon the missionary congregation and its structures.

A. The Laity and Structures for Mission.

One of the challenges which face the churches in Asia today would seem to be the constructive use of the laity in the missionary work of the Church. It has been shown above that the clergy is dominant in Asia, but the hopeful trend has also emerged that the laity is becoming increasingly active and influential. This trend is seen as affecting the life of the laity in the witness of the churches.

1. Successful lay witness.

There are many churches in Asia today which are utilizing the witnessing power of the laity in organized

programs of advance. It would be valuable in many instances if the churches of Asia were blessed with the abundance of educated, intelligent laymen which characterizes the Anglican Church in Hong Kong. The Bishop of Hong Kong writes that they form a valuable supplement to the ministry of the church, taking a strong part in the life of the church as a whole. Bankers, doctors, businessmen, lawyers and teachers are all found in the Anglican Church, and a "great many give tirelessly of their energy on all kinds of diocesan and school committees".⁴⁰ But the ministry of the laity in Hong Kong Anglicanism is not confined to committee work, valuable as this may be. The Anglican church is taking a strong lead in the utilization of laymen to serve as part-time ministers. These laymen, already distinguished in some area of secular work, are ordained to the part-time ministry, but always the emphasis is to serve in the context of their life as a layman. An example of this may be seen in the case of James Chang Ling Wong, a superintending engineer for a great maritime firm in Hong Kong, who served as an auxiliary clergyman for twenty years, before entering the regular Anglican ministry and eventually becoming a bishop.⁴¹

Other churches are utilizing the laity for missionary outreach as well. The Christian Churches in Mid-Java form a concerned and effective church; it is concerned for mission and it is effective through its use of laymen. This presbyterian body in Indonesia is organized into one synod,

40. Letter from Gilbert Baker, Bishop of Hong Kong, June 4, 1971.

41. Greenslade, Op.cit., p. 51.

ten presbyteries, and 102 congregations. The impressive fact about each of these congregations is that each one has its own mission field, supplies its own Javanese evangelists, and has a representative commission on missionary outreach.⁴² One of the strengths of the Methodist Church in China prior to World War II was their emphasis upon lay leadership. They used strong leadership from the villages as local preachers, training them as they served. In one district alone, such spontaneous leadership resulted in a membership increase within the district congregations of 600 members within one decade.⁴³

Bishop Azariah of Dornakal tried to impress upon the laymen of the Anglican church the importance of witnessing for Christ. He taught the baptized Christians to place their hands on their heads and repeat, "I am a baptized Christian. Woe unto me if I preach not the Gospel."⁴⁴ This emphasis has been carried on by the Church of South India, which recognizes that there must be a shift from emphasis upon the professional ministry and a new recognition of the place of the layman. The Church of South India states that India will only be won for Christ when the average Christian is aware of his privilege and duty to witness and work for Christ.⁴⁵

It is this awareness of privilege and duty which the Missouri Synod of the Lutheran Church is attempting to build

42. Bingle, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 45, 1956, "The Christian Churches in Mid-Java" by B. Probo-Winoto, pp. 174-179, pp. 174-177.

43. Rose, Op.cit., p. 123, p. 141.

44. Graham, Op.cit., p. 61.

45. Church of South India, Op.cit., pp. 190-191.

in the churches of the Philippines. There is such a concern for the lay apostolate that provision is being made for a full-time staff for training programmes for laymen.⁴⁶

2. Benefits from lay witness.

There is not only an awareness of the privilege and duty of the laity in church service; there is an awareness of the practical advantages available through the intelligent use of an alert, well-trained laity. These advantages may be shown through the examination of some of the training schemes now being used in Asian churches.

Fundamental to the advantages inherent in lay witness is the fact that ordinary Christians can witness and persuade others in extraordinary situations and thus churches can multiply in extraordinary places.⁴⁷ Danker tells of the Filipinos who were converted in the course of some business transactions in one village and took the Gospel back to their home village. Through their efforts, the majority of those in that isolated mountain village were converted; these formed a ready-made congregation when a minister became available.⁴⁸ The success of such lay witness lies partly in the fact that non-Christians see laymen as men just like themselves. They identify from the first, and then see a desirable difference.⁴⁹

However, it is not to minimize the power of the Holy Spirit in transforming lives and making plain this desirable difference to also emphasize that a dedicated layman is made

46. Danker, Op.cit., p. 134.

47. Allen, Missionary Methods, pp. 121, 122.

48. Danker, Op.cit., p. 118.

49. WCC, Evangelism In India, p. 23.

even more effective if he has received training in leadership. It is in this sense that the Anglican Church in Hong Kong is striving to develop the diaconate which can share many of the tasks in the ministry and multiply missionary outreach. The key to the success of the Anglican programme is that they are working with men who have a good education as the basis of their own secular success.⁵⁰

The training of educated laymen best serves the church in a situation where the laymen are then able to penetrate to the various strata of society. Baker points out that the balance which they have been able to achieve in Hong Kong enables their churches to operate on the congregational level without the dangers of clericalism or the view of wealthy laymen that the pastor is "a hired man".⁵¹ The emphasis is upon joint action for missionary outreach.

However, if the churches were to place too large an emphasis upon education for the laymen as a pre-requisite to training them for Christian service, many areas of Asia would never be able to train laymen, for in many areas the minister is the only well-educated man in the congregation.⁵² The other extreme is perhaps found in Japan, where it has been shown that the churches are dominated by the middle-class and the intellectual elements in the community; these may be operating in witness to their own strata of society, but the lower-class, working man is virtually excluded.⁵³

50. Bishop Baker, Letter, Op.cit., p. 2.

51. Ibid., p. 2.

52. Dickinson, Op.cit., p. 75.

53. Takenaka, loc. cit.

The best balance would seem to be achieved through training laymen within their own congregations to work for Christ in their own occupations and their own locale.

By doing this, the Church of South India would seem to be overcoming a shortage of ordained ministers and at the same time strengthening church life in some congregations. This shortage of ordained men has made it necessary to fall back on the services of laymen within the congregations for what has often been considered the sole function of the clergyman. The Christian panchayat or council chairman "has assumed some of the function of the evangelist, but he remains the congregation's own lay leader and its representative to the wider councils of the Church, rather than a substitute for the evangelist selected and trained by the official church structure outside the village congregation."⁵⁴ This pattern within the Church of South India has proven to be of great benefit for the total life of the Church.

This would seem to be because the problems of leadership can best be solved in the Asian situation through judicious use of training and a programme of in-service practical instruction. The leaders of the local churches learn by leading.⁵⁵ There can then emerge from this lay leadership a full-time professional ministry which is peculiarly suited to the local situation and can meet most fully the particular needs of the country or region.⁵⁶

The Lakher Church of North India is an example of this. There are two groups of ministers in this church.

54. Mackie, Op.cit., p. 54.

55. Allen, Missionary Methods, p. 135.

56. Newbiggin, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 52, 1963, p. 52.

At present, the younger men are sent to regular seminary or theological college and given a traditional training for the ordained ministry. However, when the church was still in its early days, there were so few ministers that laymen acted as church leaders, fulfilling the functions of pastors. After nine years of this type of practical in-service training, these older pastors were ordained. This former pattern is no longer necessary, but it did provide the necessary leadership at the beginning of the church, and also served as a bridge between the time when the church was first planted and its maturity. There was no arrested growth while a generation of professional ministers was raised up.⁵⁷

The Lakher Church also provides an example of the way in which lay leadership within the local congregation grows according to a pattern which others can follow. It is this type of natural leadership which Allen finds so valuable simply because it can be trained to the local situation.⁵⁸

One of the opportunities in Asia today is found in what has been termed a great "Christian diaspora".⁵⁹ The presence of even a few Christians, scattered by the Asian social revolution from their old homes and placed in a new situation, provides nuclear potential for congregations. It is at this point that the churches must find new ways to meet the challenge, for the parish system is termed inadequate at three points to deal with these potential congregations.

57. Questionnaire 171B.

58. Allen, Missionary Methods, pp. 137, 138.

59. Newbiggin, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 52, 1963, p. 51.

First, regular congregational life does not meet the needs of these Christians in their new situations. Second, the traditional pastoral care occupies the parish minister so much that he has no time or opportunity to build up these nuclei. Third, there is no present way to recognize and utilize those with the gifts to bring these congregations to life. However, lay leadership can do what the professional ministry cannot do, especially if they can be trained and organized.⁶⁰ This may be seen in the successes of non-Christian or semi-heretical organizations at this point.

Where the Soka Gakkai has advanced in Japan, it has done so through the leadership of the laity. Without a professional leadership, but with trained membership, it is an increasingly potent force.⁶¹ The Iglesia Ni Cristo of the Philippines is not orthodox in its Christology, but it has learned the secret of disciplined activity with lay leadership.⁶² This lay leadership has provided the impetus which has contributed largely to the tripling of the Iglesia's membership between 1948 and 1960.⁶³

This emphasis upon the laity is not to say that the laity will replace the clergy. In fact, the professional ministry and the lay ministry are basically complementary. In the churches of Asia, the ministry may be broadened to train lay ministers as well as to show laymen how to perform other functions of the missionary church. "Training will

60. Ibid., p. 51.

61. Reischauer, Op.cit., p.

62. Koyama, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 11, Spring, 1970 (Gorospe), p.33.

63. Danker, loc. cit., p. 130.

always be necessary, but it must be adapted to equip men and women for the infinitely varied circumstances in which the missionary advance of the Church has to be promoted."⁶⁴

3. The lay witness as a complementary ministry.

In summary, then, the laity has a definite place within the life of the missionary congregation. He is necessary for the fulfilment of the missionary outreach of the local church, for he can do things which the pastor cannot do. The complementary nature of the lay ministry should free the pastor to concentrate upon those things for which the professional ministry must remain responsible. Greater dependence should be put upon lay workers, with provision for training as necessary and desirable in each local situation. Great flexibility in training, both in level and in content, must be a feature of all training programmes. The one goal of missionary outreach is the standard of excellence for such programmes. It should be the constant goal of the pastor in all of his pastoral care that the congregation should come to regard itself as the primary agency for mission in its own locale.

B. The Clergy and Structures for Mission.

In separation of the discussion between the laity first and then the ministry, there is a danger that the false dichotomy which has been deplored will be perpetuated. It must be stressed that the laity and the ministry are both parts of the missionary congregation. Their activities are the activities of the Body of Christ. Thus, no one is

⁶⁴. Newbiggin, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 52, 1963, p. 53.

justified in saying, "Because you are a minister, you have no part in my ministry as a layman." Nor may the clergyman say, "Because you are a layman, you are not to share my ministry as a clergyman." The point which must be understood is that the fact of the ministry as a part of the congregation is not in question...the question in the churches of Asia today concerns the form which this ministry should assume. "Is the whole pattern of ... the paid ministry imported by the missions irrelevant to oriental conditions, especially as they are shaping now?"⁶⁵

If Warren is correct in stating that the pattern of a full-time, paid and ordained ministry is a Western import to Asia,⁶⁶ what should be done about changing the pattern? What is being done at present? What will be the relationship of the minister to the laity?

1. The need to change the pattern of the ministry.

What should be done about changing the pattern? Chao holds that there is a great need for a well-trained, fully qualified ministry in order to provide necessary leadership. This leadership must be broadly-educated and cultural orientation is necessary.⁶⁷ Note especially the emphasis upon qualification, training and cultural orientation. In speaking of the ministry in both India and Indonesia, it has been stated that it is a widespread fallacy that there is no need for a highly-educated minister

65. Goodall, ed., Missions Under the Cross, p. 197.

66. Warren, op.cit., p. 118.

67. Goodall, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 37, 1948, "The Christian Ministry in China", by T.C. Chao, pp. 256-263, pp. 257-259.

to pastor and provide Christian nurture for unsophisticated rural congregations.⁶⁸ Note once again the emphasis upon a well-educated ministry.

It would seem that Asian leaders feel that it is necessary for the ministry to be well-educated, but with the cultural emphasis which Chao and others make, this education must be suited for the advance of the churches in Asia rather than in other parts of the world. Education must be measured in terms of qualifying the student for service within his own culture. "The excellence which we seek to foster should be defined in terms of that kind of theological training which leads to a real encounter between the student and the Gospel in terms of his own forms of thought and culture."⁶⁹

With this emphasis upon excellence in education and the equal emphasis upon cultural orientation, it would appear that at least one of the most important things which must be taken into account in changing the pattern of the ministry in Asia is the matter of theological education. Theological education is said to be of fundamental importance for the creation of autonomous, missionary churches in Asia.⁷⁰ It is on this basis that reference is made again to the criticism of Allen that Western standards of theological education fail to prepare the minister for the Asian situation.⁷¹ To what extent is this type of criticism justified today?

68. Goodall, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 38, 1949, (Davis), p. 420.

69. Newbiggin, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 52, 1963, p. 9.

70. Warren, Op.cit., p. 86.

71. Allen, Missionary Methods, pp. 135-137.

In response to the question, "Do you feel that there is a need for improvement in theological education? If so, in what areas?", the majority of leaders in Hong Kong agreed that there was a definite need for improvement. Practical emphasis was felt to be most important, followed by a need for cultural orientation. Taiwanese churchmen were even more unanimous in their desire for improvement, but they felt that cultural orientation was most important, followed closely by practical training. India felt that a practical emphasis was most important, with theological emphasis in second place. The Indian leaders reporting were completely unanimous in agreement that there was need for improvement. Japan reported that practical emphasis was most important, with theological emphasis a very close second choice. It is perhaps significant that in all four countries church leaders minimized the necessity of a larger amount of training. On the average, the four countries reported that practical training was most important, followed by cultural emphasis and then by theological emphasis.⁷²

One other matter should be brought to the attention of this study, especially in view of the above discussion of theological education. The clergy has been reported as dominant in Asia, as shown in previous discussion. The reason for this dominance is open to question. However, the remark of one church leader involved in education in Hong Kong is pertinent at this point. In speaking of the problem of ministerial status and authority, it was stated

72. Analytical Chart of Questionnaires.

that "the real problem, I think, is a theological one, that is, that ministry is not seen for what (etymologically and theologically) it should mean, namely diakonia, service, in the spirit of Mark 10:41-45."⁷³ To the extent that this is true of Hong Kong, and also to the extent that it is true of other Asian countries, this is a theological problem which affects the pattern of the Asian ministry.

The solution suggested is many-sided. Seminaries are seen to be at fault; theological education must be constantly reviewed in the light of the theologically correct view of diakonia. The congregations must re-examine their constitutions and pastoral offices in this same light. Berndt further suggests that one way in which the pattern could be continually purified is to remove direct material benefits now accrued through higher position. Material and societal advantages can never provide the proper motivation for the scriptural pattern of diakonia.⁷⁴ It must be the concern of seminaries, congregations and church leaders to abolish the present pattern of a professional class of ministers with special prerequisites and privileges.

2. Attempts to change the pattern of the ministry.

What is being done to change the pattern? It would seem to be the thought of Asian churchmen that the full-time ministry, to the extent that it continues to exist, can prove most valuable as a resource for the training of

73. Letter from Dr. Berndt, Op.cit., p. 1.

74. Ibid., p. 1.

laymen and congregations. Chao suggests a three-fold plan for the ministry. First, there would be a small number of highly educated and trained ministerial leaders. These would provide the core for further training. The second gradation of ministers would be assistants to the regular ministerial leadership. They would be trained through the work of the ministry, and would be put in charge of small centres. Both groups of ministers would spend time, according to their abilities, in discipling lay leadership as a further supplementary ministry.⁷⁵

While this pattern was originally suggested for China, it is very similar to a plan being put into effect by the Church of South India at the present time. Chosen men were given three and one-half years of "in-service" training, including nine ten-day periods of corporate study. There was much teaching and counselling by the full-time ministers in charge of the area. Ordination as deacons was intended to lead to the position of presbyter as the final result. The number of village congregations quadrupled in twelve years as this plan was followed. This provides a pattern for an effective ministry because the men are fully a part of the congregation in which they minister, and as a result they are not hindered by a social or economic gap. The ministry provided this way is more effective than the old pattern, for these new congregations brought into being through this in-service training are

75. Goodall, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 37, 1948, (Chao), pp. 259-262.

more securely grounded in the faith than those under the care of professional catechists.⁷⁶

This new pattern provides a desirable corrective to the pattern of parish ministry found in many parts of Asia, where the professional, full-time minister is forced to act as pastoral overseer for twenty to sixty congregations.⁷⁷ It is in this type of situation that "the churches are literally being starved of spiritual nourishment by the decay of the pastoral ministry itself."⁷⁸ This multi-congregation parish pattern results in the congregations becoming "outstations" of some distant central "headquarters".⁷⁹

Yet another area in which the pattern of the Western ministry, in the broader sense, is being changed in Asia is the relationship of pastors, church officials, bishops and laymen in the Church of South India. This is an example of what is possible in many areas of Asia, depending upon the local situation and the ministry developed.

It has been stressed that the Church of South India is a constitutional episcopal Church. There is one synod, fifteen dioceses, and a number of administrative districts within the various dioceses. The major criticism of the pattern which has developed from the original constitution is that there has been a failure to provide for the spiritual responsibilities of the pastors who act as chairman

76. Newbiggin, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 52, 1963, p. 57.

77. Ibid., "The Ordained Ministry in the Indian Church", by Wm. Stewart, pp. 144-154, p. 145.

78. Ibid., p. 154.

79. Ibid., p. 57.

of the administrative districts. There is too great an emphasis upon administration and not enough upon spiritual, pastoral leadership.⁸⁰ As a result, recommendation has been made that every diocese should have an adequate number of men to act as area pastors. These workers will be separate and distinct from administrative workers. The thrust is to provide men to itinerate in their areas giving pastoral supervision to congregations and giving spiritual counsel and help to (congregational) pastors and lay workers.⁸¹

A development, perhaps small in itself, but important for its implications, that may be observed in the Church of South India is the relationship of the diocesan bishop to the other members of the Church, especially to the laymen. There have been times when the bishop was desirous of ordaining a particular candidate, but the majority of the Ministerial Committee was against this ordination. Because the bishop was outvoted, the voice of the people was decisive. This principle of the choice of the people, in ordination and in other important matters, is of great importance to the development of the ministry and the structures of the missionary congregation.⁸²

The strong emphasis upon pastoral ministry over the administrative ministry is necessary in India, with the social and cultural patterns which have been seen to lead to a centralized structure. But there is an underlying

80. Church of South India, Op.cit., p. 59.

81. Ibid., p. 60.

82. Hanson, Op.cit., p. 170.

principle which is of great importance to the entire pattern of the ministry in Asia. Regardless of the type of church structures which develop through the pressures of cultural, social or any other influences, the pattern of the ministry is primarily that of diakonia; the episcopacy, the presbytery or any other form of ministerial pattern, whether from Asia or Europe, are only means of expression of this fundamental role.

In line with this, there are other possible patterns within the Asian situation. One of these may be seen in the attempt to follow the Biblical pattern of ministerial training within the Philippine situation. Paul and other disciples were accustomed to the Jewish rabbinical method of peripatetic training of young men for service. Through personal instruction and the experience gained in the actual ministry, Barnabas brought John Mark to the place of useful ministry which Paul recognized in later life. Paul, in turn, trained Timothy, Titus and a number of others. This is the type of pattern which Paul urges Timothy to preserve and use.⁸³ One of the advantages of this type of training is that it is personalized, and adaptable for use in both sophisticated and unsophisticated Asian situations. The emphasis upon continuous personalized training also leads to a continuous development of trained personnel. It is also adaptable to various degrees or levels of training, from the complete training of the ministry to supplemental training for ministers, or even for building a well-qualified

83. II Timothy 2:2.

laity within each congregation. However, although these advantages did appear within the work carried on by one denomination within the Philippines, the advantages were mixed with problems. This type of training, with modifications for formal seminary training, was used for the preparation of ministers to ordination. It was found that the pastors were well-trained, but problems occurred over a period of time as the students tended to identify with their favourite instructor so strongly that a party spirit began to become evident. The stronger the personality of the instructor, the more serious the problem.⁸⁴

One of the most important lessons to be drawn from the study of the New Testament pattern of the ministry is that the ministry is not a professional class but the calling of all who believe in Christ. Differences in pattern take on the proper perspective when it is realized that the most important thing is "that the greatest possible resources should be made available for missionary work", which underlines the statement of the World Council of Churches that "the ministry is not a particular sociological group, but a function which can be performed in many different social situations."⁸⁵ It is on this basis that Song says that the task of all churches in Asia is to see that there is brought into existence a church which:

"does not allow a hierarchy of clergy to monopolise the welfare of the church. Instead she is a community of forgiven and being forgiven sinners

84. The Rev. James Spurling, formerly of Butuan City, Philippines, speaking of experiences at Light and Life Seminary.

85. Newbiggin, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 52, 1963, p. 54.

who, through their engagement in their respective ministries, equally take part in the one ministry of Christ, namely the ministry of reconciliation."⁸⁶

3. Suggested principles.

Any pattern of the ministry must be geared to the solution of the relationship between the ministry and the laity within the congregation. The following suggestions may be made on the basis of the previous discussion.

First, the ministry and the laity should both recognize that the congregation is basically missionary in its nature and purpose. Thus, as parts of the congregation, both the ministry and the laity have work to do for God. This work is complementary rather than competitive, dependent upon mutual cooperation rather than a dominant attitude on the part of the minister or laity.

Second, the ministry must be adapted to the local situation, and as a result be flexible in all its pattern and function. This adaptation to the local situation may be on a national, regional, social or ethnic basis, but the most important area of adjustment must be the needs of the local congregation for the purpose of redemptive outreach.

Third, the ministry must be one with the people in all aspects of their life. In this way, the minimal barrier will be raised and the congregation will benefit. This may be seen in the different practices of churches in North and South India. The churches in North India

86. Koyama, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 11, 1970, "Whither Protestantism in Asia Today?" by Song Choan-Sing, pp. 66-76, p. 72.

located their educated, respectable pastors in the upper-caste section of the village. The churches in South India located them in the untouchable ward. Pickett observes that the South Indian procedure, in which the ministry and the laity were closely identified socially, was much more successful in terms of creating a genuine Christian Church.⁸⁷

C. Finance and Structures for Mission

One of the greatest problems of Asian churches today would seem to be the question of finances. Is self-support a realistic goal? Many areas of Asia are extremely poor, and many times the churches are located in the poorest strata of the poor society. Thus, it may well be affirmed, "One of the greatest obstacles to increased giving is the extreme poverty of the people..."⁸⁸ But the question of finances is not simply a matter of importance because of the theories of this man or that; it is a matter of importance for finances have a direct effect upon the missionary life and activity of the Church and churches.

1. Finance and the ministry.

One of the areas of greatest concern in terms of finance is the ministry. It is reported that self-support has been achieved in many Asian churches, but this has been done only through the use of part-time pastors or the laity in many instances. "A minister of religion with a salary regularly paid to him through the community is an institution entirely new to the Chinese..."⁸⁹

87. McGavran, Op.cit., p.192.

88. Bingle, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 45, 1956, p. 418.

89. Goodall, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 35, 1946, (Wei), p. 272.

The problem of self-support when there is a full-time, paid ministry for which the local congregation is responsible, is aggravated when that congregation is in the rural, agricultural areas. Of the 130,000 village churches in mission lands, such as Asia has traditionally been considered, the greatest problem has been a lack of dedicated, equipped workers, largely because of the problem of support. Missions have introduced the western-style, middle-class level of the ministry to underprivileged people. The result has been a constant struggle, for

"The villagers live close to the land. Their income is mostly in kind. They handle little cash. There is no place in the community for a non-productive family. A village church to be enduring and indigenous must be a land-based church and find its place within the land economy."⁹⁰

The development of different patterns of ministry has already been discussed. However, the importance of finding a ministry which can be supported from the Asian economy is of great importance. There are at least three reasons for this.

a. A hindrance to the minister

First, the constant concern for salary is a detriment to the work of the ministry as it has been introduced into the churches of Asia. Two examples from India may be used to illustrate the two major effects upon the work of the ministry. First, there is a failure to pursue and initiate aggressive programmes of evangelism because of inability to support them. One denomination reports that the work

90. Goodall, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 38, 1949, (Davis), p. 409.

of their Bible women is of greatest value, and is one of the most effective ways in which the church is evangelizing the communities. However, the constant question of support is causing serious question as to how long this program can be carried on.⁹¹ Second, the recruitment and life of the individual minister is affected. One catechist came to see the President of his Church, (the first time in connection with finances), completely discouraged and in poor health. His congregation was not paying him enough to live on...his salary for the previous month had been only 1/8th of the minimum he was supposed to receive. His family was eating only once a day, and the children cried at times for hunger. His son had been expelled from boarding school because the parents could not pay the fees, and was now walking nine miles to school each morning and nine miles home each evening.⁹² Under conditions such as these, the individual pastor may well doubt the value of continued ministry.

b. A hindrance to the congregation.

But the second reason is closely akin to the first, for in many areas it is a matter of cause and effect. The people of Asia would seem to fail to give, in many instances, because of a lack of Christian priorities. This may, in turn be an expression of weak spiritual life. From India, accounts are given of how wandering Hindu sadhus are given contributions by Christians up to twenty times as great as the annual contribution given to the local church. Large

91. Schmitthenner, Op.cit., p. 4.

92. Ibid., p. 5.

amounts of money are also spent for betel nut and tobacco. It thus becomes a question of basic priorities. "It is not that the church cannot 'afford' a full-time ordained ministry...it is that the churches have tacitly counted this a luxury that they can well do without."⁹³ This problem is aggravated in many Asian countries by materialism which is found in the churches as well as in secular society. Hong Kong may be cited as an example of this problem. "People are gripped with the fever of making money, not merely for food and clothing, but also for refrigerators and T.V. sets. In many if not most homes the parents are both employed, sometimes seven days a week."⁹⁴ The effect of finances upon the life of the church as a spiritual force is of great importance, for "The power of money to bend and control opinion in an area of great poverty and under-privilege" is an established fact.⁹⁵ It is for this reason that self-support is often urged as a means to "remove from the hands of any self-seeking leader that financial power which the other workers fear."⁹⁶ The spiritual vitality of the congregation would seem to have some definite relationship to the failure of congregations to develop satisfactory relationships and arrangements in terms of finances.

c. A hindrance to missionary outreach

It is this need for satisfactory financial arrangements

93. Newbiggin, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 52, 1963 (Stewart), p.149.

94. Report from John H. Schlosser, June, 1971, p. 2.

95. Hanson, Op.cit., p. 78.

96. Report from Schlosser, June, 1971, p. 4.

and satisfactory spiritual relationships which is the third reason for finding a pattern of ministry which can be supported within the Asian economy. This question is of great importance to the total missionary outreach of the Church, whether it be in the village or the urban situation. "If these small units or cells of the Church Universal are static or sterile (through lack of leadership or weak spiritual life), the advance of the whole movement is blocked."⁹⁷

2. Finance as a source of strength.

The work of the churches may be seen to be greatly affected by the matter of finances, and it is therefore encouraging to note that definite steps are being taken to make financial arrangements a source of strength rather than a constant stumbling-block.

a. Self-support as a fact

The dark picture depicted above needs to be balanced by the realization that many of the Churches in Asia are self-supporting; they have solved the financial question. This may have come about through gradual financial evolution, as in the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan,⁹⁸ or it may have been an instituted programme planned from the start of the church, as in the Christian and Missionary Alliance Church in Hong Kong.⁹⁹ These are mature Churches, both willing and able to carry on their own financial programme. The key to such programmes is financial responsibility at the congregational level.

97. Goodall, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 38, 1949, (Davis), p.410.

98. Questionnaire, T505.

99. Questionnaire, H207.

b. Self-support as a possibility.

Other churches are gradually reducing the amount of foreign subsidy, making a real effort to become self-supporting at the congregational level, although there may be difficulty in achieving denominational self-sufficiency. A church leader from the Philippines states, "Barring some political crisis, we do not expect in the foreseeable future to outgrow the need for missionaries and some financial aid. Since 1958, all pastors have been paid from Philippine sources. Other parts of the total programme continue to receive foreign aid and may do so indefinitely."¹⁰⁰ The Methodist Bishop of Bombay writes, "Most of the churches are moving toward self-support. Our own church will be completely on its own by 1976 as far as church development work is concerned. But medical and educational work will take at least another ten years."¹⁰¹ Some Asian pastors report that their denomination is operating a plan of self-support designed to make the congregations financially independent of foreign aid. For example, an Indian pastor discloses that there is denominational aid for weak congregations through a central fund, to which all churches contribute. This makes it possible for the churches to operate on their own financial ability and strength.¹⁰²

There are also efforts to adapt the congregational life to the Asian situation. Reference was made to the need for continued subsidy even though pastors were

100. Questionnaire P206.

101. Joshi, Op.cit.

102. Questionnaire I100B.

supported by the churches. This subsidy was used for institutions. Without repeating the previous discussion on institutional life, it is possible to see that congregational life will be strengthened as "an agonizing reappraisal" of the place and purpose of institutions is made, with concentration upon the best and strongest institutions in terms of evangelistic outreach and Indian capability.¹⁰³ Many of the problems of the churches, in relation to financial matters, may be solved by eliminating Western elements and developing indigenous Asian substitutes. Song suggests that the house church is truly suitable to Asian demands;¹⁰⁴ it is in this light Takenaka states that Western concepts of a traditional parish ministry are irrelevant to Japan, for they make the church dependent upon a church building and a professional minister.¹⁰⁵ The development of self-supporting ashrams to which converts and inquirers can go for fellowship and training is suggested as one way in which the Indian churches can overcome financial difficulties and build congregational life.¹⁰⁶

c. Self-support and the necessary attitudes

But there must always be stressed the necessity for a development of evangelistic attitudes as the basis for any solution of financial problems. Stewardship training which does not stress the evangelistic implications may easily degenerate into pharisaical practices. Many Christians question the legitimacy of Christian business

103. Renewal and Advance, p.

104. Koyama, ed., Op.cit., Vol. 11, Spring, 1970 (Song), p.70.

105. Takenaka, Op.cit., p. 123.

106. Schmitthenner, Op.cit., p. 2.

endeavours when operated as a means for raising church funds. Danker argues that there is nothing intrinsically wrong with such practices as long as evangelical attitudes are maintained.¹⁰⁷ What would seem more important than any inflexible rule would be the broad principle of missionary activity in the church. If the churches of Asia can cultivate the attitude of giving rather than of asking, and if the congregations can be awakened to the evangelical task, the accidental problems of subsidy, total self-support, institutions and congregational and denominational life will be more readily solved.¹⁰⁸ This is yet another case in which all church structures, in this instance those which involve finance, must be referred to the ultimate goal and purpose of the missionary church.

III. A SUMMARY IN RETROSPECT

This study of church structures in Asia today may be summarized in relation to the missionary nature and purpose of the Church. This has been the dominant theme which has emerged from the study of Asian churches.

In the consideration of church structures and the nature of the Ekklesia, it was seen that Asian leaders hold that the incarnational nature of the Church Universal demands a role of reconciliation. This leads to the consideration that the nature of the Ekklesia be thought of in terms of missionary activity, and all structures will be shaped and limited by these terms. The Asian churches are striving to

107. Danker, Op.cit., pp. 292, 293.

108. Ibid., p. 293.

serve God in the world to which they have been commissioned. These churches are faced with the thesis of confessional loyalty and the antithesis of cultural bonds. The synthesis must lie in the resolution of tension between a concern for the faith and adaptation to the social milieu; one of the ways in which this may be accomplished is the re-evaluation of governmental structures in the light of the ultimate missionary nature and purpose of the Church. In doing this, the Indigenous Church of Asia is taking her proper place in the Church Universal.

A second area which was considered was the structure of church government and the authority for those structures. The place, use and source of authority for the clergy was discussed first of all, revealing that the authority of the clergy depends upon ordination and training. It was seen that the question of ordination as a source of authority has both theological and practical implications for church growth in the Asian churches. Qualification for the ministry through training was also seen to pose problems for the missionary life of the Asian churches. A definite link with paternalistic structures was traced in the use of ordination and training as the determinant of the place, use and source of ministerial authority.

The spheres of authority claimed by Church and State were also shown to be important to the missionary activity of the churches in Asia. While non-communist Asia now enjoys almost total religious liberty, the social and political situation is very volatile. This makes it necessary for the churches to be prepared with structures which will

preserve church life and promote the missionary work of the churches in the face of hostile authority. These structures may be best formulated on the basis of definite principles, some of which are suggested in the study.

Yet another area of authority concerned the integration of the Mission Society into the missionary activity of the Asian churches. The Indigenous Church was seen to be a part of the Universal Church, but mature selfhood cannot be measured by a mechanical achievement of the "Three-Selfs". The special place of the Mission Society in the missionary activity of the churches was seen as a problem which needed special structures for solution. This problem has social, practical and theological implications. The structures to solve the problem are being built in various patterns. Some Missions are attempting to solve the problem while perpetuating the paternalistic structures which have created the problem. Other Missions are developing healthy relationships with the churches through integration or the establishment of organizations which are separate but equal rather than dominant in authority. The section closed with the formulation of some principles for the achievement of the proper place of the Mission in the missionary activity of the Asian churches.

The effect of church government upon the relationships within the Asian churches was the third area of concern for this portion of the study. The relationships of the people in the local congregation were discussed, and it was seen that a socially homogenous congregation was

best. Discussion was made of the effect of secular social factors upon congregational relationships, and the value of neutral leadership resources in time of tension was shown. The governing of relationships between the local congregation and larger church structures was referred to the missionary nature of the church, which was seen to govern the relationships between the clergy and the laity. Although the clergy is now dominant in the Asian churches, there is a change in the trend of these relationships. This is desirable, for the dominance of the clergy distorts the relationships within the churches and makes it difficult for the church structures to be effective in missionary activity. Thus, when ministers do develop a pastoral concept of their role and the laity become influential and active, the missionary outreach of the Asian churches will be enhanced.

The relationships involved in discipline were also seen to be important to the Asian churches as they sought to fulfill their missionary commission. At least four types of discipline appeared in the Asian context. Imposed discipline and punitive discipline were rejected for their detrimental effect upon the churches' ministry of reconciliation, while discipline through natural consensus and pastoral discipline were seen to be helpful for their promotion of the missionary life and activity of the Asian churches. On the basis of the exercise of discipline shown to be current in the Asian churches, it was possible to draw up some principles for relationships involving discipline.

The fourth area of consideration was the relationship between church government and the purpose of the Church. The purpose of church government, in all its varied structures, was seen to be the redemption of the world. The population explosion in Asia was seen as possessing special significance, for the number of men for whom Christ died is increasingly large. The Asian world was the world in which these men must be won, so church structures must be revised in accord with the purpose of the Church and dependent upon the leadership of the Holy Spirit. Church structures in Asia are now being revised in accord with this purpose. The paternalistic structures of the past are being replaced with structures designed to take advantage of the opportunity afforded by the new social patterns in Asia.

There are reforms in the larger church structures, as polity is adapted to the missionary purpose of the Church. India exhibits a trend toward episcopal polity, while Hong Kong and Taiwan are evolving congregational structures. Japan is developing a modified congregational form of church government, while the Philippines show a trend toward a centralization. All of these trends are seen to be influenced by cultural factors, and the structures developed in congruence with cultural patterns are generally beneficial to the missionary purpose of the churches. Japan was seen to be developing a polity suitable to the cultural characteristics of the membership of the Church, but this pattern and this membership were both seen as atypical of Japanese society. This may be the reason why Japan is the

least integrated into the total community of all the churches of Asia.

Apart from the larger church structures, there are also reforms in congregational structures, as local patterns are adapted to the missionary nature and purpose of the Church. The congregation is seen as the primary agent of evangelism, and for this reason the congregation must be truly missionary in its organization. Apart from cultural factors, there would seem to be at least three components of congregational life which will need to be considered in devising structures the churches can use for missionary activity. Structures must take into account the best use of the laity in mission, the most adequate patterns for ministry within the Asian congregations, and the solution of the problems involved in such practical matters of congregational life as the finances for the ministry. All of these must be taken into account because of their vital effect upon the vital ministry of the congregation. Asian churches are doing this at the present time, and the result is a strengthening of the missionary activity of the churches. The purpose of church government is being achieved through the fulfilment of the missionary purpose of the Church.

The four theological bases of church government can be used as a standard for the development of church structures in the churches of Asia today. On the basis of present activity in the re-formation of church structures, the Asian Church may well be able to contribute to the advance of the Church Universal.

CHAPTER ELEVEN

SUMMARY STATEMENTS AND SUGGESTIONS

I. The theological implications of church government are of great importance to the theology of the Church. These implications are of significance in determining the view of the nature of the Ekklesia, the questions of authority in the churches, and the purpose of the churches. All of these affect the relationships within the Church, a matter of complementary importance to the three cardinal areas of church government as they affect the theology of the Church. If there is no other point of difference between the Catholic and Protestant theological systems, it must be seen that a basic difference, based upon these four points, has developed in the history of the Church.

The Catholic position has been shown to place the nature of the Church within the realm of the Historic Episcopate, stating that the nature of the Church is both determined and maintained by the apostolic succession as preserved and transmitted in this Historic Episcopate. Authority in the Church is theologically derived from the Historic Episcopate, although there are different opinions as to how this is achieved, for the Historic Episcopate is that which validates both the nature and exercise of authority within the Church. The purpose of the Church is seen as redemptive, but once again, this is seen to be dependent upon the validating presence and activity of the Historic Episcopate. As a consequence of this importance of the Historic Episcopate, the relationships within the

Church become completely vertical, at least in theological formulation, for the Historic Episcopate is essential to all aspects of the Church and thus stands in a mediating position and relationship between God and the believer.

Protestant Christians, however, have been shown to place the Church, as the Body of Christ, above the limitations of any one particular theory of church structure or "definitive" polity. The spiritual nature of the Church is manifested in the structure, and as such may take different forms of expression. The nature of the Church determines the polity rather than the polity determining the nature of the Church. As to authority in the Church, the ultimate authority has been shown to be the scriptures, subject to all legitimate forms of interpretation. On this basis, authority for church government can never legitimately become sui juris, but is at all times subject to the corrective standard of the objective principles of scriptural truth. Protestant Christianity believes that the mission of the Church is an extension of the Incarnational nature of the Church, and this redemptive activity of the Church is to be accomplished through the wise use of all legitimate means. To this end, church polity and structure become means whereby the Church can best fulfil its redemptive mission. Relationships within the Church are thus determined by the essential equality before God which is posited in the Protestant concept of the priesthood of all believers. In this sense, relationships within the Church are horizontal in nature rather than vertical.

II. The form which church structures take is subject to the authority of the scriptures. All other standards must be referred to this definitive standard. Surely too often it has been Scripture interpreted only in terms of some confessional documents, therefore not in practice, sola scriptura.

It would be a mistake to assert that Church structures are theologically neutral, for this implies that there is no need to validate structures by an objective standard of truth. The need for a standard of truth for the measurement of church structures lies in the fact that all matters to do with the Church are of theological importance; therefore, church structures are necessarily of theological consequence. On this basis, it is necessary to formulate a theology of church government for the effective and truthful development of church structures.

At the same time, it would be a mistake to place theological formulations as the basis for validation of church structures. Theological formulations are unreliable to the extent that they are the subjective product of finite man. Therefore, it is necessary to go beyond the authority of theological statements to an higher authority.

This higher, objective authority can never reside in the person of one man or in any group of men. It is at this point that Protestants differ with Catholics upon the place of the Historic Episcopate in the formulation of church government. Protestants demand that authority be objective in the sense of a recognized corpus of definitive truth. Protestants generally recognize the existence of

such a corpus in the collection of books which comprise the Bible.

The recognized authority of the Bible is one of the distinguishing characteristics of Protestant Christianity. This is not to say that all Protestants have the same interpretation of the nature of this authority. Neither is this to say that all Protestants agree on the interpretation of the meaning of scriptures. This lack of uniformity in Protestant attitudes toward the authority and meaning of scriptures has led, among other things, to different schools of theological thought. These differ, but they are united in the sense that the differences revolve about the one central point of argument. The differences may perhaps be put into proper perspective through the use of an analogy.

The laws of a nation are passed as authoritative standards for all citizens of that nation. These laws form objective standards of reference by which all activities are judged. However, these laws are subject to interpretation by the courts of the nation. While the courts have no power to change the objective standard, different schools of legal thought as to the application of these laws are found in the judicial system of the nation. Thus, the law is unchanging, while the "vogue" of legal thought and interpretation changes from time to time.

If one seeks to build a system of church government upon theological formulations, this is to build upon subjective interpretation of the truth. This is a contributory error, if not the fundamental error, which has led to the enthronement of the Historic Episcopate as the very

foundation of church government. Theological formulations may change; therefore, it is necessary to go beyond these subjective formulations to the objective standard of scriptural principles. All three of the classical Protestant polities are based upon scriptural truth; to that extent, all three are true. No one of the three classical Protestant, Western polities contain all the truth for church government; to that extent there is room for improvement and adaptation. In any system of church government, the important thing is not the form in which the truth is expressed; the important matter is the relation to the standard of truth.

There is a need for an objective standard by which all forms of church government may be measured. This standard is found in the authoritative principles of the scriptures.

III. While the objective authority of the scriptural principles for church government and operational structures does not change, the actual structures are subject to influence from historical, social and cultural factors. Thus, the form of the structures may vary as a result of differing geographical locale and differing historical chronological development.

The divine and human aspects of the Church become very plain in a consideration of the scriptural principles and the human adaptation of those principles for the life of the Church in the world of men. The study has shown this to be true in all parts of the world.

The developmental nature of church structures was shown in the study of the evolution of the episcopacy from the time of the early church to the time that it assumed its present form. The presbyterian and congregational polities were also shown to be the product of social, cultural and historical factors in Western countries. All Western polities have changed in form and substance throughout their historic development. It is not possible to adduce only scriptural authority as the sole source of Western polities and church structures.

As the churches of the West went to the nations of the East in mission, the object was to establish the Church of Christ, both through and for the redemption of men for whom Christ had died. This expression of the Incarnational nature of the Church was unfortunately marred by the belief that the Western churches were the standard by which the structures of the Asian churches must be developed. The confusion of Western theological formulations in polity with scriptural principles of authority resulted in paternalistic structures of church government. It has been shown that the net effect of such paternalistic structures has been detrimental to the life and activity of Asian churches.

However, the study of contemporary Asian Christianity shows that the Asian churches are beginning to develop their own church structures for the Asian situation. Based upon studies of five important Asian nations, this study would seem to show that as churches become autonomous, the historical, cultural and social factors which are peculiarly

Asian are increasingly taken into account in the life of the churches. This results in the modification of transmitted structures and the development of new structures, all with particular reference to the needs of Asia. In this way, the churches of Asia are taking their places as truly Asian extensions of the Universal Body of Christ.

IV. The differences between the Churches of Asia and the Churches of the West are the product of cultural, social and historical factors; as such, the divisions are superficial. The unity between the Churches of the West and the Churches of Asia is the result of the common nature of the Body of Christ; on this basis, one may say the unity of the Churches is essential.

Differences between churches belong to the world of men. Therefore, they are temporary and subject to change from the very factors which produce them. As a study of the sociological factors has shown that church structures are relative, even so must it be borne in mind that while church structures are molded by human factors, these same human factors prevent any structure from becoming immutable, and at the same time, prevent consideration of structure as immutable per se.

While these differences become subject to change through human factors, the essential unity of the Church is immutable, for this unity is based upon the nature of the changeless Christ. The Church is the Body of Christ, and cannot be divided; true extensions of this body may take different forms but these forms are accidentally different while the unity in Christ is essential.

V. As all differing forms of church government are to be measured by the authoritative principles of scripture, so all forms of church government are to be the expressions of the Incarnational nature of the Church, and as such, tools for the accomplishment of that Incarnational Church's missionary task.

The essential unity of scriptural principles which, among other things, provide a rationale for the plan of salvation and a framework of principle for church government, is the basis for the evaluation of church structures by their missionary value. It has been seen that no form of church government is sacrosanct; all forms and polities are adaptable within the basic framework of scriptural principles. However, there must be some underlying rationale for the adaptation of church structures.

This rationale is found in the missionary task of the Church. The adaptation of church structures is prompted by changing conditions but not by a capricious desire for change. It is prompted by a desire for the expansion of the Church through all legitimate means. When the polity or practices of any church organization are modified, it must be on the basis of pragmatic adaptation of structures in order that a greater number of men may be won to Christ in that particular given situation.

This could conceivably lead to a multiplicity of church structures within a given geographical locale. Ethnic groups or social strata may well respond best to differing structures. In such a situation, the missionary task of the Church would call for scripturally-based

adaptation of the structures to the varying situations.

In this type of situation, there are three basic principles. First, the authority of the scriptures governs principles of church structure; these principles have been given as guide-lines for the benefit of the Church. Second, the Church has only one major task in this world; the accomplishment of the missionary task is more important than any form of organization. Third, organization is a tool which should be judiciously used in all situations for the accomplishment of the missionary task of the Church.

SUGGESTIONS

On the basis of the findings of this study, it is possible to make some suggestions for practical application in consideration of church growth.

1. Sociology and cultural anthropology are two tools which may be used to greater effect in the promotion of church growth. The first way in which these tools may be used to assist is the development of church structures designed to promote church growth through this present membership. The second effective use of these tools lies in the formulation of long-range goals and plans for the achievement of those goals on the basis of the social and cultural composition of the community now influenced as well as the total community which will be ideally influenced.

2. Denominations which are in existence today might well ask the following questions about church structures:

1) What were the reasons that this denomination took its historic form of church government and formulated its administrative practices?

2) Were those reasons truly valid for that time?

3) Are those reasons truly valid for today, or are there compelling reasons for modification of denominational structures?

4) Are present denominational structures promoting the Ekklesia or merely preserving an historical tradition?

3. The local, regional and general aspects of church government are of import as they relate to each other. Study of all factors which would influence the ability of the geographical segments of a church organization to promote church growth within the limitations of that geographical area, and at the same time contribute to the church growth of smaller and larger geographical segments would seem to be a project of value. This is true of both denominational and ecumenical activity.

4. Denominations may find through a study of their constituency that there is room and need for modification of polity or adoption of differing polities within the framework of the denominational organization.

5. Local congregations may find that the denominational structure is not suitable to the particular sociological situation in which they are placed. Two courses of action might be suggested. First, the

congregation may seek to change the denominational structure, at least enough to secure more local autonomy for missionary activity in the local situation. Second, in those areas where the local congregation has autonomy, practices and organization may be adapted so that church structures may be used as a tool for missionary activity.

6. Ecumenical unions will need to take into account the possible differences in social strata and other cultural factors which have helped form the governmental structures and practices of the churches which have now decided to merge. Accommodation to these factors may well lead to adoption of multiple polities within the framework of the new church organization, as demanded to meet the challenges of widely-differing opportunities for missionary activity.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

I. Church Government and Administration

- Bea, Augustin, Cardinal, We Who Serve. London: Geoffrey Chapman, 1969.
- Bromiley, G.W., Christian Ministry. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans Publishing Co., 1960.
- Brown, W.A. Imperialistic Religion and the Religion of Democracy. London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1923.
- Brent, C.H., ed., Can the Churches Unite? London: The Century Co., 1927.
- Bryden, W.W., Why I am a Presbyterian. Toronto: Presbyterian Publications, 1934.
- Butler, Christopher, The Idea of the Church. London: Darton, Longman and Todd, 1962.
- _____, The Theology of Vatican II. London: Darton, Longman and Todd, 1967.
- Campbell, Robert, Relations of the Christian Churches. Toronto: Wm. Briggs, 1913.
- Campbell, T.G., The Work of the Eldership. Glasgow: John Smith & Son, Ltd., 1915.
- Champion, L.G., Baptists and Unity. London: A.R. Mowbray & Co., 1962.
- Cole, Alan, The Body of Christ. Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1964.
- Charteris, A.H., The Church of Christ. London: MacMillan & Co., 1905.
- Clemance, Clement. New Testament Order and Discipline. London: John Snow & Co., 1876.
- Cunningham, Wm., Discussions on Church Principles. Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1863.
- Davies, Rupert, Methodists and Unity. London: A.R. Mowbray & Co., 1962.
- Davidson, D., The Congregationalist's Manual. Edinburgh: Waugh & Innes, 1833.
- Davidson, Samuel, The Ecclesiastical Polity of the New Testament. London: Jackson & Walford, 1848.

- De Blank, Joost, The Parish in Action. London: Mowbrays, 1954.
- Dexter, Henry, Congregationalism. Boston: Nichols & Noyes, 1865.
- Dolan, Rex, The Big Change. Toronto: Ryerson Press, 1967.
- Dulles, Allen, The True Church. New York: Fleming H. Revell Co., 1907.
- Farrar, Thomas, The Christian Ministry. London: William Wells Gardner, 1880.
- Findlay, Geo. G., The Church of Christ. London: Charles H. Kelly, 1893.
- Fisher, G.F., The Archbishop Speaks. London: Evans Bros., Ltd., 1958.
- _____ Report on Lambeth Conference, 1948. London: S.P.C.K., 1148.
- _____ The Anglican-Methodist Conversations and Problems of Christian Unity. London: Oxford Press, 1964.
- Forsyth, P.T., Congregationalism and Reunion. London: Independent Press, 1917, rev. 1952.
- Flew, R. Newton., Jesus and His Church. London: Epworth Press, 1938.
- Gettys, Joseph M., What Presbyterians Believe. Clinton: Presbyterian College Press, 1953.
- Goodall, Norman, The Local Church. London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1966.
- Goodrich, Albert, A Primer of Congregationalism. London: Congregational Union, 1909.
- Gore, Charles, The Church and Ministry. London: Longmans, Green & Co., 1919.
- Green, Michael, Called to Serve. Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1964.
- Hanson, A.T., The Pioneer Ministry. London: SCM Press, 1961.
- Hatch, Edwin, The Growth of Church Institutions. London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1887.
- Hebert, A.G., Apostle and Bishop. London: Faber and Faber, 1963.

- Hebert, A.G., The Form of the Church. London: Faber and Faber, 1948.
- Henderson, G.D., The Scottish Ruling Elder. London: James Clarke & Co., 1935.
- _____, Presbyterianism. Aberdeen: The University Press, 1954.
- Hillerbrand, Hans J., Christendom Divided. London: Hutchinson & Co., 1971.
- Hodge, Charles, The Church and Its Polity. London: Thomas Nelson & Sons, 1879.
- Horton, Walter, Our Christian Faith. Boston: The Pilgrim Press, 1945.
- Jalland, T.G., The Origin and Evolution of the Christian Church. London: Hutchinson's University Library, 1948.
- Kendall, W.S., ed., Book of Discipline. Winona Lake, Indiana: The Free Methodist Publishing House, 1965.
- Kirk, K.E., The Apostolic Ministry. (3rd ed.), London: Lutterworth Press, 1957.
- Knox, David, The Thirty-Nine Articles. London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1967.
- Kung, Hans, The Church. London: Burns & Oates, 1967.
- Lightfoot, J.B., The Christian Ministry. London: MacMillan & Co., 1901.
- Line, John, The Doctrine of the Christian Ministry, London: Lutterworth Press, 1959.
- MacHardy, George, Congregational Principles. Edinburgh: Congregational Union, 1894.
- MacKennal, Alexander, The Evolution of English Congregationalism. London: James Nisbet & Co., 1901.
- MacLear, G.F. and Williams, W.W., An Introduction to the Articles of the Church of England. London: MacMillan & Co., 1896.
- Mascall, E.L., The Recovery of Unity. London: Longmans, Green & Co., 1958.
- Mead, Frank S., ed., Handbook of Denominations. New York: Abingdon Press, 1970.

- Minchin, Basil, Every Man in His Ministry. London: Darton, Longman & Co., 1960.
- Moberly, R.C., Ministerial Priesthood. London: John Murray, 1899.
- Morris, Leon, Ministers of God. London: IVF Press, 1964.
- Neill, Stephen, Anglicanism. London: Penguin Books, Ltd., 1958.
- Packer, J.I., ed., All in Each Place. Appleford: Marcham Manor Press, 1965.
- Parker, P.L., ed., The Journal of John Wesley. Chicago: Moody Press, 1962.
- Paterson, William, The Church of the New Testament. London: H.R. Allenson, 1902.
- Paton, David M., Anglicans and Unity. London: Mowbray & Co., Ltd., 1962.
- _____, ed., The Reform of the Ministry. London: Lutterworth Press, 1968.
- Peck, A.L., Anglicanism and Episcopacy. London: Faith Press, Ltd., 1958.
- Peel, Albert, Inevitable Congregationalism. London: Independent Press, 1937.
- _____, The Noble Army of Congregational Martyrs. London: Independent Press, 1948.
- Pierce, Wm., and Horne, C.S., A Primer of Church Fellowship. London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1893.
- Pike, E.C., The Spiritual Basis of Nonconformity. London: Bible Christian Book-Room, 1897.
- Ramsay, M.C., ed., Lambeth Essays on Ministry. London: S.P.C.K. 1969.
- Reid, J.K.S., Presbyterians and Unity. London: Mowbray & Co. Ltd., 1962.
- Rigg, James H., Church Organization. London: T. Woomer, 1887.
- Rudge, Peter, F., Ministry and Management. London: Tavistock Publications, 1968.
- Routley, Erik, Congregationalists and Unity. London: Mowbray & Co., 1962.

- Selbie, W.B., Congregationalism. London: Methuen & Co., 1927.
- Simon, Glyn, ed., Bishops. London: Faith Press, 1961.
- Simpson, Sparrow, John Wesley and the Church of England. London: S.P.C.K., 1934.
- Skydsgaard, K.E., One In Christ. Philadelphia: Muhlenberg Press, 1957.
- Smith, K.L. Carrick, The Church and the Churches. London: SCM Press, Ltd., 1948.
- Stated Clerk, ed., The Book of Church Order. Richmond: Board of Christian Education, 1964.
- Telfer, W., The Office of a Bishop. London: Longman & Todd, 1962.
- Thornton, Martin, Pastoral Theology: A Reorientation. London: S.P.C.K., 1956.
- Torrance, T.F. Royal Priesthood. Edinburgh: Oliver & Boyd, Ltd., 1955.

II. Missions and Mission

A. Principles.

- Allen, Roland, Missionary Methods: St. Paul's or Ours? London: World Dominion Press, 1953.
- _____ Missionary Principles. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1964.
- Abrecht, Paul, The Churches and Rapid Social Change. London: SCM Press, 1961.
- Blauw, Johannes, The Missionary Nature of the Church. London: Lutterworth Press, 1962.
- Boer, Harry, Pentecost and Missions. London: Lutterworth Press, 1964.
- Davis, Merle, New Buildings on Old Foundations. London: International Missionary Council, 1945.
- Fleming, J., ed., One People...One Mission. East Asia Christian Conference, 1963.
- Hallencreutz, C.F., Kraemer Towards Tambaram. Upsalla: Gleerup, 1966.

- Hocking, W.E., Re-Thinking Missions. London: Harper & Brothers, 1932.
- Jarrett, Kerr, M., Christ and the New Nations. London: S.P.C.K., 1966.
- Kraemer, Hendrik, World Cultures and World Religions. London: Lutterworth Press, 1960.
- _____ From Mission Field to Independent Church. London: SCM Press, 1958.
- MacGavran, Donald, Bridges of God. New York: Friendship Press, 1955.
- _____ How Churches Grow. London: World Dominion Press, 1959.
- _____ Understanding Church Growth. Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1970.
- Muir, Wm., The Call of the New Era. London: Morgan & Scott, Ltd., 1910.
- Niles, D.T. The Message and Its Messengers. London: Carey Kingsgate Press, 1967.
- _____ Upon the Earth. London: Lutterworth Press, 1962.
- Oldham, J.H., The World and the Gospel. Edinburgh: United Free Church of Scotland, 1916.
- Paton, Wm., ed., The Missionary Motive. London: SCM Press, 1913.
- Paton, Wm., A Faith for the World. Edinburgh: United Free Church of Scotland, 1929.
- _____ The Church and the New Order. London: SCM Press, 1941.
- Sundkler, Bengt, World of Mission. London: Lutterworth Press, 1965.
- Warren, Max, Perspective in Mission. London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1964.

B. Studies in Mission

- Appasamy, A.J., The Christian Task in Independent India. London: S.P.C.K., 1951.
- Beaver, R.P., Ecumenical Beginnings in Protestant World Mission. New York: Thomas Nelson & Sons, 1964.

- Bitton, Nelson, The Regeneration of New China. Edinburgh: The Church of Scotland, 1914.
- Campbell, Wm., Missionary Success in Formosa. London: Trubner & Co., 1889, 2 Volumes.
- Carus-Wilson, Mary L.G., The Expansion of Christianity. London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1914.
- Champion, L.G., Outlook for Christianity. London: Lutterworth Press, 1967.
- Chatterton, Eyre, A History of the Church of England in India. London: S.P.C.K., 1924.
- Church of South India, ed., Renewal and Advance. Madras: Christian Literature Society, 1963.
- Danker, Wm.J., Two Worlds or None. St. Louis: Concordia Publishing House, 1964.
- Dickinson, R., Line and Plummet. Geneva: World Council of Churches, 1968.
- Devasahayam, D.M. and Sudarisanam, A.N., ed., Rethinking Christianity in India. Madras: Hogarth Press, 1938.
- Eddy, G.S., The New Era in Asia. Edinburgh: Oliphant, Anderson & Ferrier, 1914.
- Elwood, J.J., Churches and Sects in The Philippines. Dumaguete City: Silliman University, 1967.
- Firth, C.B., Introduction to Indian Church History. Madras: Christian Literature Society, 1961.
- Freytag, J., A New Day in the Mountains. Tainan: Tainan Theological College, 1968.
- Freytag, Walter, Spiritual Revolution in the East. London: Lutterworth Press, 1940.
- Gibson, J. Campbell, Mission Problems and Mission Methods in South China. Edinburgh: Oliphant, Anderson & Ferrier, 1902.
- Glover, T.R., The Nature and Purpose of A Christian Society. London: Headley Brothers, 1912.
- Glover, R.H. and Kane, J.H., The Progress of World-Wide Missions. New York: Harper & Brothers, 1960.
- Goodall, Norman, Christian Missions and Social Ferment. London: Epworth Press, 1964.
- _____ A History of the London Missionary Society, 1895-1945. London: Oxford University Press, 1954.

- Goodall, Norman, ed., Missions Under the Cross. London: Edinburgh House Press, 1953.
- Graham, Carol, Azariah of N Dornakal. London: SCM Press, Ltd., 1946.
- Greenslade, S.L., Shepherding the Flock. London: SCM Press, Ltd., 1967.
- Hanson, A., Beyond Anglicanism. London: Darton, Longman and Todd, 1965.
- Hammer, Raymond, Japan's Religious Ferment. London: SCM Press, Ltd., 1961.
- Hayward, Victor, ed., The Church as Christian Community. London: Lutterworth, 1966.
- Hewat, Elizabeth, Vision and Achievement. London: Nelson & Sons, 1960.
- Herklots, H.G.G., Frontiers of the Church. London: Ernest Benn Ltd., 1961.
- Hoekendijk, J.C., The Church Inside Out. London: SCM Press, Ltd., 1964.
- Hogg, W.R., One World One Mission. New York: Friendship Press, 1960.
- Hollis, Michael, Mission, Unity and Truth. London: Press, 1967.
- _____, Paternalism and the Church. London: Oxford University Press, 1962.
- Hwang, C.H., Joint Action for Mission in Formosa. New York: Friendship Press, 1968.
- James, A.T.S., Twenty-Five Years of the L.M.S., 1895-1920. London: S.P.C.K., 1966.
- Latourette, K.S., Missions Tomorrow. New York: Harper & Brothers, 1936.
- _____, A History of Christian Missions in China. London: S.P.C.K., 1929.
- _____, The Christian World Mission in Our Day. London: Eyre & Spottiswoode, 1954.
- Lawrence, E.A., Modern Missions in the East. New York: Fleming H. Revell, 1894.
- Lee, Robert, Stranger in the Land. London: Lutterworth Press, 1967.

- Liu, Kwang-Ching, American Missionaries in China. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1966.
- Luke, P.Y. and Carman, J.B., Village Christians and Hindu Culture. London: Lutterworth, 1968.
- MacKay, G.L., From Far Formosa. Edinburgh: Oliphant, Anderson and Ferrier, 1895.
- Mackie, Steven G., ed., Can Churches be Compared? New York: Friendship Press, 1970.
- MacLennan, Kenneth, Twenty Years of Missionary Co-operation. London: Edinburgh House Press, 1927.
- Morrison, J.H., The Scottish Churches' Work Abroad. Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1927.
- Neill, Stephen, Creative Tension. London: Edinburgh House Press, 1959.
- _____, The Unfinished Task, London: Edinburgh House Press, 1957.
- _____, Colonialism and Christian Missions. London: Lutterworth Press, 1966.
- Neve, H.T., Sources for Change. Geneva: World Council of Churches, 1968.
- Newbiggin, L. Visser 't Hooft and Niles, D.T., Decisive Hour for the Christian Mission. London: SCM Press, Ltd., 1959.
- Norton, H.W., Evangelical Free Church Foreign Missions. Moline, Illinois: Christian Service Foundation, 1964.
- Paton, Wm., World Community. London: SCM Press, 1938.
- Phillips, C.J., Protestant America and the Pagan World. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1969.
- Sundkler, Bengt, Church of South India: The Movement Towards Union. London: Lutterworth Press, 1954.
- Tucker, Henry, The History of the Episcopal Church in Japan. New York: Charles Scribner's & Sons, 1938.
- Rawlinson, A.E.J., The Church of South India. London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1951.
- Richardson, Wm. J., Reappraisal: Prelude to Change. Maryknoll, New York: Maryknoll Publications, 1965.

- Robinson, C.H., History of Christian Missions. Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1915.
- Rose, J., A Church Born to Suffer. London: Cargate Press, 1951.
- Soltau, Stanley, Korea: The Hermit Nation. London: World Dominion Press, 1937.
- Takenaka, Masao, Reconciliation and Renewal in Japan. New York: Friendship Press, 1967.
- Thompson, R.W. and Johnson, A.N., British Foreign Missions, 1837-1897. London: Blackie & Son, 1899.
- Van Akkeren, Philip, Sri and Christ. London: Lutterworth Press, 1971.
- Warneck, Gustav, A History of Protestant Missions. Edinburgh: Oliphant, Anderson & Ferrier, 1901.
- _____, Modern Missions and Culture. Edinburgh: James Gemmil, 1883.
- Weber, Hans-Ruedi, Asia and the Ecumenical Movement. London: SCM Press, 1966.
- Whale, John S., Christian Reunion: Historic Divisions Reconsidered. London: Lutterworth Press, 1971.
- _____, What is a Living Church? London: Edinburgh House Press, 1938.

III. Periodicals

A. International Review of Missions (Classified according to year, volume and editor)

Oldham, J.H., ed., International Review of Missions. London: Oxford University Press.

Vol. I, 1912

"The Growth of the Church in the Mission Field. I. Among the Bataks", by J. Warneck, pp. 20-43.

"Christianity in Japan", by Tasuka Harada, pp. 750-780.

Vol. II, 1913

"Church and Mission in Japan", by A.J. Brown, pp. 674-689.

"Indigenous Christianity" by Wm. Gascoyne-Cecil, pp. 722-732.

Vol. IV, 1915

"The Church in Changing China", by A.H. Smith, pp. 96-108.

"The Distribution of Christian Forces in Japan", by G.W. Fulton, pp. 109-119.

"Self-Support in the Mission Field", by H.T. Hodgkin, pp. 261-274.

Vol. V, 1916

"The Importance of Making Christianity Indigenous", by C.T. Wang, pp. 75-86.

Vol. X, 1921,

"Present-Day Problems of the Church in the Mission Field", by A.J. Brown, pp. 478-495.

Vol. XIV, 1925

"The Church in China at the Crossroads", by H.T. Hodgkin, pp. 545-559.

Vol. XV, 1926

"The Present Situation in China and its Significance for Missionary Administration" by P.W. Kuo, pp. 43-55.

Paton, Wm., ed., International Review of Missions.
London: Oxford University Press.

Vol. XVII, 1928

"Christianity and Confucianism", by T.C. Chao, pp. 588-600.

"The Younger and Older Churches", by Stacy Waddy, pp. 610-618.

Vol. XX, 1931

"The Chinese Christian Church Coming of Age", by P.C. Hsu, pp. 356-366.

Vol. XXVI, 1937

"The Ministry in Japanese Religions", by G.W. Iglehart, pp. 480-492.

Vol. XXVII, 1938

"The Life of the Indigenous Church", a symposium by four authors: 'Worship', by W.F. France, pp. 372-377; 'Theological Training', by L.P. Larsen, pp. 377-385; 'Institutional Work', by Francis C.M. Wei, pp. 386-393; 'Finance', by F.F. Goodsell, pp. 393-402.

"Self-Support: False and True", by V.S. Azariah, pp. 361-371.

"Christianity in Japan: Characteristics of the Church", by H. Kozaki, pp. 355-358.

Vol. 32, 1943

"Principles of Missions in a New Age",
by J. Merle Davis, pp. 264-271.

Goodall, Norman, ed., International Review of Missions.
London: Oxford University Press.

Vol. 34, 1945.

"The Foreign Missionary in India", by
J.E.L. Newbiggin, pp. 86-94.

Vol. 35, 1946

"The Church and Reconciliation with Japan",
by Charles McLaren, pp. 293-302.

"Christianity in Japan", by Luman J. Shafer,
pp. 121-130.

"Mission Strategy in the New Age", by
J. Merle Davis, pp. 303-313.

"The Four-Centre Church in China", by
Francis Cho-min Wei, pp. 271-277.

"China and India Look Ahead", by
J.W. Decker, pp. 271-277.

"'Foreign' Missions as a Theological
Corrective", by Jakob Jocz, pp. 256-262.

Vol. 36, 1947

"'Functional' Social Anthropology and
Christian Missionary Method", by
W.H. Newell, pp. 253-257.

"The Christian Church in Korea", by
Kwan Sik Kim, pp. 125-140.

Vol. 37, 1948

"Training and Maintenance of the Christian
Ministry in China", by T.C. Chao,
pp. 256-264.

Vol. 38, 1949

"Theological Training in Indonesia", by
A.J. Rasker, pp. 412-421.

"Missionary Strategy and the Rural Church",
by J. Merle Davis, pp. 401-411.

Bingle, E.J., The International Review of Missions. London:
Oxford University Press.

Vol. 42, 1953

"Our Christian Mission and the Rural World",
by I.W. Moomaw, pp. 249-256.

Vol. 45, 1956

"Survey of Asia", by editor, pp. 3-33.

"The Christian Churches in Mid-Java", by
Basuki Probowinoto, pp. 174-179.

"Book Review", by P.D. Lathuihamallo,
An Indonesian Travel Diary., by
 Th. Muller-Kruger, pp. 132-133.

"The New Pattern of the Church", by
 Eber Priestley, pp. 412-419.

"The Missionary and the Cultures of Man",
 by R.T. Parsons, pp. 161-168.

"Freedom of Conversion, the Issue in India",
 by Charles W. Forman, pp. 180-193.

Vol. 44, 1955.

"New Methods for a New Age in Missions",
 by Donald MacGavran, pp. 394-403.

Sinclair, Margaret, ed., International Review of Missions.
 London: Oxford University Press.

Vol. 47, 1958

"If Mission Help is Cut Off! What Should
 the Church Do?", by J.S. Murray, pp. 417-427.

"Changes in the Patterns of Western Missions",
 by W. Freytag, pp. 163-170.

"Christianity in a Cultural Context", by
 David L. Hamm, pp. 386-400.

"Book Review", by R.D. Bontrager, Missions
 and the Urban Masses, by editors,
 pp. 475-476.

Vol. 50, 1961

"Editorial Survey", pp. 3-26.

"Policy Lessons from Korea", by John C.
 Smith, pp. 320-325.

"The Church in Modern Society", by Alfred
 Schmidt, pp. 445-450.

"Hendrik Kraemer in Japan", by
 Richard H. Drummond, pp. 451-459.

Newbiggin, J.E.L., ed., International Review of Missions.
 London: Oxford University Press.

Vol. 52, 1963

"Developments During 1962", by the editor,
 pp. 3-14.

"A Tent-Making Ministry", a committee report
 for the World Council of Churches,
 pp. 47-59.

"Indigenization and the Renaissance of
 Traditional Cultures", by M.M. Thomas,
 pp. 191-194.

"Structures for Missionary Congregations", by Hans Jochen Margull, pp. 433-446.

"The Ordained Ministry in the Indian Church", by Wm. Stewart, pp. 143-154.

"Book Review", by Henry Lefever, Frontiers of the Christian World Mission Since 1938, edited by W.C. Harr, pp. 73-75.

"The Breaking in of the Future", by Vern Rossman, pp. 129-143.

Vol. 57, 1968

"Church Growth Strategy Continued", by D. MacGavran, pp. 335-343.

Potter, Philip, ed., International Review of Mission. Lausanne: World Council of Churches, Vol. LX, No. 237, January, 1971, "Mission and Humanization", by Peter Beyerhaus, pp. 11-24.

B. South East Asia Journal of Theology.

Koyama, Kosuke, ed., The South East Asia Journal of Theology. Singapore: Association of Theological Schools in South East Asia.

Vol. 11, Spring 1970

"Faith and Politics: The Indonesian Contribution", by Alan C. Thomson, pp. 1-18.

"Christian Koinonia and Some Philippine Cultural Forces", by Vitaliano R. Gorospe, S.J., pp. 19-36.

"Whither Protestantism in Asia Today?", by Song Choan-Seng, pp. 66-76.

"A Theological Approach to Some Traditional Filipino Beliefs about Man", by Douglas J. Elwood, pp. 37-54.

Vol. 12, Autumn, 1970

"Indonesian and Philippino Reflections", edited, pp. 44-48.

"The Advancement of Theological Education in Asia", by D.D. Williams, pp. 52-64.

"New Methods in Theological Teaching", by E.E. Harvey, pp. 74-82.

"Theological Education in the 70's in the Philippines", by Emerito Nacpil, pp. 83-86.

IV. General Sources

- Cragg, G.R., From Puritanism to the Age of Reason. London: Cambridge University Press, 1950.
- Cremer, Hermann, Biblio-Theological Lexicon of New Testament Greek. Translated by Wm. Urwick. Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1878.
- Dale, R.W., The History of English Congregationalism. London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1907.
- Franke, W., China and the West. Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1967.
- Fisher, C.A., South East Asia: A Social, Economic and Political Geography. London: Methuen & Co., 1964.
- George, G.H. and K., The Protestant Mind of the English Reformation. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1961.
- Goddard, W., Formosa, A Study in Chinese History. London: MacMillan & Co., 1966.
- Grigson, Geoffrey, ed., Ideas. London: Grosvenor Press, 1956.
- Gunn, G.S., Singers of Israel. London: Lutterworth Press, 1963.
- Hackett, Francis, Henry the Eighth. London: The Reprint Society, 1929.
- Hong Kong Government Information Service, ed., Hong Kong, 1969. Hong Kong: Hong Kong Government Press, 1970.
- Jones, F.P., ed., Documents of the Three-Self Movement. New York: National Council of Churches in Christ, U.S.A., 1963.
- Nelson, Raymond, The Philippines. London: Thames and Hudson, 1968.
- Nish, Ian, The Story of Japan. London: Faber, 1968.
- Pannikar, K.M., Asia and Western Dominance. London: Lutterworth Press, 1953.
- Purcell, Victor., The Chinese in Southeast Asia. London: Oxford University Press, 1965.
- Reischauer, E., Japan, The Story of a Nation. London: Duckworth & Co., 1970.

- Schmidt, K.L., The Church. London: Charles and Adam Black, 1938.
- Smith, Donald, ed., South Asian Politics and Religion. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1966.
- Tenney, M.A., Blueprint for a Christian World. Winona Lake, Indiana: Light and Life Press, 1953.
- Torbert, Robert G., A History of the Baptists. London: The Carey Kingsgate Press Ltd., 1963.
- Underwood, A.C., A History of the English Baptists. London: Kingsgate Press, 1947.
- Veitch, T.S., The Brethren Movement. London: Pickering & Inglis, n.d.
- Whitley, W.T., A History of British Baptists. London: C. Griffin & Co., 1923.
- Wiley, Horton, Christian Theology, Vol. III, Kansas City: Beacon Hill Press, 1953.

V. Miscellaneous Sources

A. Pamphlets and Mimeographed Material.

- Anderson, Wilhelm, Towards a Theology of Mission. London: SCM Press, 1955.
- Dodd, Cragg, and Ellul, Social and Cultural Factors in Church Divisions. London: SCM Press, 1952.
- Edited, "Ecumenical Press Service", Geneva: World Council of Churches, Nos. 35/37 and 12/38.
- Faith and Order Commission, WCC, Survey of Church Union Negotiations, 1965-1967. Geneva: World Council of Churches, 1968.
- Freytag, Walter, The Gospel and the Religions. London: SCM Press, 1957.
- Hood, George, In Whole and in Part. London: Edinburgh House, 1971.
- International Missionary Council, ed., Minutes of Enlarged Meeting of International Missionary Council, Willingen, 1952, London: IMC, 1952.
- Mackie, Steven, G., ed., Can Churches be Compared? Geneva: World Council of Churches, 1970.

- Newbiggin, Lesslie, ed., Joint Action for Mission. Geneva: World Council of Churches, 1962.
- Niles, D.T., ed., The Christian Community within the Human Community. Bangkok: EACC, 1964.
- Oldham, J.H., The Question of the Church in the World of Today. London: Edinburgh House Press, 1936.
- _____, The New Christian Adventure. New York: International Missionary Council, 1929.
- Omura, I. and Marantika, S., ed., Confessional Families and the Churches in Asia. Kandy: EACC, 1965.
- Orchard, R.K., Out of Every Nation. London: SCM Press, 1959.
- Scott, R.W., Ecumenical Studies: Evangelism in India. Geneva: World Council of Churches, 1952.
- Torrance, T.F., Concerning Amsterdam, The Nature and Mission of the Church. reprinted from "Scottish Journal of Theology", Vol. 2, No. 3.
- World Headquarters, Free Methodist Church, "Questionnaire on China". Winona Lake, Ind.: General Missionary Board, 1961. (mimeographed material).

B. Articles, Encyclopedias and Reports

- Bauer, J.B., Encyclopedia of Biblical Theology. London: Sheed & Ward, Ltd., 1970. cf. "The Church" by V. Warnack.
- Bethel, J.P., ed., Webster's New Collegiate Dictionary. Springfield: G&C Merriam Co., 1951.
- Buttrick, George A., ed., The Interpreter's Dictionary of the Bible. Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1962. cf. "Church Government" by M.H. Shepherd, Jr.
- Davis, John D., ed., Westminster Dictionary of the Bible. Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1944, cf. "Bishop"; "Elder".
- Harrison, Everett F., Baker's Dictionary of Theology. Grand Rapids: Baker Book House, 1960, cf. "Church Government" by Leon Morris.
- International Missionary Council, ed., Tamparam Madras Series. London: Humphrey Milford, 1939. Vols. II, VI, and VII.

- International Missionary Council, ed., Jerusalem Meeting Report. London: Humphrey Milford, 1928, Vols. II, III.
- Nault, Wm. H., ed., The World Book Encyclopedia. Chicago: Field Enterprises Educational Corporation, 1967, Vols. 1, 10.
- Turnbull, Ralph G., Baker's Dictionary of Practical Theology. Grand Rapids: Baker Book House, 1967. cf. "Administration".
- Leon-Dufour, Xavier, Dictionary of Biblical Theology. London: Geoffrey Chapman, 1967, cf. "The Church".
- United Nations Organization, ed., Demographic Survey, 1969. New York: United Nations Press, 1970.
- World Missionary Conference, ed., World Missionary Conference, 1910. Edinburgh: Oliphant, Anderson & Ferrier, 1910, Vols. I, II, and IX.

APPENDIX ONE

SALARY SCALE FOR A MISSION CHURCH

(Hong Kong Dollars Converted Into Pounds Sterling)

Salary Scale for Male Pastors	Pounds per Month
1. <u>Married</u>	
Starting	30.00
Annual increment	3.00
Dependent allowance	
wife	10.00
children	
birth to six years of age	2.00
six to twelve years of age	3.00
twelve to fifteen years of age	4.00
fifteen to eighteen years of age	5.00
Housing allowance	4.15
Increment for ordination	10.00
2. <u>Single</u>	
Starting	25.00
Annual increment	2.50
Housing allowance	3.75
Increment for ordination	10.00

Salary Scale for Female Pastors and Bible Women

1. <u>Married</u>	
Starting	25.00
Annual increment	2.50
Housing allowance	3.75
Increment for ordination	10.00
Differential for pastor's position	5.00
2. <u>Single</u>	
Starting	20.00
Annual increment	2.00
Housing allowance	3.50

The monthly salary of a married pastor with ten years experience and two children of five and eight years of age would be sixty-four pounds and fifteen pence. The average wage of a factory worker, a chief clerk, or an accountant would be approximately forty-three pounds per month. This shows the arbitrary standard set by some Missions, making it difficult for a local congregation to achieve self-support, for the pastor's salary far exceeds the average income of most congregations.

APPENDIX TWO

ANALYTICAL CHART OF THE QUESTIONNAIRES

One of the important tools used in this study was the questionnaire sent to Asian and missionary leaders in six Asian countries: India, Japan, the Philippines, Indonesia, Taiwan and Hong Kong. It was hoped that these six different countries would provide a cross-section of trends and practices in church structures which would show the effects of cultural, historical, racial and social influences upon Asian Confessional Families. It is to be regretted that insufficient replies were received from the Philippines and Indonesia to include these countries in the conclusions drawn from an analysis of the questionnaires. However, three totally different milieus....the Indian, the Japanese and the Chinese....are represented in the answers received, and the conclusions have been incorporated in the body of the study.

The analytical chart may best be understood if explanation is made of the procedures used in determining the conclusions. Questionnaires sent to Asian leaders in India, Japan, Hong Kong and Taiwan; of those receiving these questionnaires, 48.5 percent answered in sufficient detail to give useful information. The information provided by these Asian leaders was supplemented by missionaries who replied to a separate but complementary questionnaire. It was necessary to be consistent in the correlation of the information received from these two different sources; a sincere attempt was made to interpret the questionnaires to discover trends rather than to merely confirm a priori opinions. It is to be hoped that this attempt was successful.

The questionnaires were designed, especially in the ones sent to Asian leaders, to reveal trends and practices in the local congregation as well as on the general denominational level. Information for activity on the general denominational level was also supplemented from books listed in the bibliography.

These questionnaires have been examined both individually and in comparison with the total body of information. The analytical chart is divided into three sections: 1) Larger Church Structures; 2) Congregational Structures; 3) The Church in Its World. Confessional Families naturally represent different ecclesiastical backgrounds; however, unless such backgrounds proved an influence upon the information given, the background was not taken into consideration. It is hoped that theological neutrality in interpretation and evaluation was thus preserved. A list of the Confessional Families in each country to whom questionnaires were sent may be found at the end of the chart. While it is to be regretted that some Confessional Families did not reply, those replying do represent a broad spectrum of theological and structural differences. A generally representative picture of church structures in contemporary Asia is thus, hopefully, achieved.

Answers to questions in the questionnaire are translated into percentile values for easier comparison. One difficulty was experienced in the evaluation of those questions which called for the ranking of categories in order of importance. Some who answered these questions did not list a complete value-ranking, i.e., a question calling for six rankings would be given only four, and two categories would be ignored. This made it necessary to examine each category individually, give the percentile ranking of each category on the basis of those replies received, and then give a separate ranking on the basis of total comparison of all categories.

ANALYTICAL CHART OF QUESTIONNAIRES

I. LARGER CHURCH STRUCTURES

Questions	Percentages			
	by			
	Country			
	T	HK	J	I
1. The official polity of your denomination is:				
1. Episcopal	--	11	--	21
2. Modified Episcopal	47	25	43	27
3. Presbyterian	40	--	43	18
4. Congregational	13	64	14	34
2. Has there been significant change in the form of church government since 1945? If so, in which direction?				
1. No change	80	100	58	26
2. Towards the episcopal form	3	--	9	74
3. Towards the congregational form	17	--	33	--
3. Is there at present a trend toward change in the form of church government? If so, in which direction?				
1. No trend	70	70	63	23
2. Towards the episcopal form	6	--	4	74
3. Towards the congregational form	24	30	33	3
4. Would it be of distinct advantage to your local congregation if your denomination within your country became:				
1. More episcopal in form	7	11	--	74
2. More congregational in form	90	72	37	11
3. Remained constant in the present form	3	17	63	15

The official polities of the various denominations and Churches answering show a wide variation. The episcopal polity shows least representation among the respondents; this naturally affects the trend of the answers received, but enough episcopal churchmen did reply so that the trends in church government could be fairly judged. As was noted in the body of the study, the strong congregational representation in Hong Kong is the result of shifts in polity, first among those groups which formed the Church of Christ in China, and then among those Methodist bodies which formed the Chinese Methodist Church. Thus, presbyterian and modified episcopal bodies became congregational in polity.

It may be seen that changes have taken place in the form of church government since 1945, but these changes, with the exception of India, are not large. The formation of the Church of South India and the Church of North India influences the figures in this area. However,

of more significance than the lack of completed change is the fact of the trend in many groups in Asia. This trend is strong: more polities are in the process of change than have changed completely. This trend is also consistent; where there is a change toward a form of church government, it would seem to be a continuation of a trend which led to change in other groups in the same country. This is underlined by the responses which show an impressive preference, on the basis of advantage to the local congregation, for one form of church government. This preference cuts across all Western, denominational polities and is seen to indicate that most churchmen in a given country, regardless of denominational background tend to unite on a desirable form of polity for their country or culture.

Thus, Taiwan and Hong Kong emphasize the preference among Chinese for congregational-type polity, while India seems to demonstrate a wide-spread preference for episcopal polity. The congregational preference in Japan is evident, as well, but this is a special case, as may be seen through further examination. Where the responses indicate a belief that it would be more advantageous to maintain their present polity, this generally, although not always, was found to be the response of a pastor whose denominational polity corresponded to the dominant trend.

If one takes, as a generalization, that episcopal churches appoint pastors strictly through the denominational structure, that modified episcopal and presbyterian appoint through joint agreement with the congregation, and that congregational churches appoint through congregational call, the trends in these four countries becomes apparent in this chart.

The Hong Kong picture shows a distortion of 11% in favor of joint appointment; this is occasioned by some of the bodies with official congregational polity reporting that extra-congregational bodies share authority in appointments. Note, however, that the churches are not satisfied with this, for 72% want greater congregational autonomy, and of the 17% favoring remaining constant, approximately 12% are already congregational in polity. Taiwan shows a distortion in the appointment of pastors, for 16% of those reporting said that the Mission society had authority over appointments when the local church was not self-supporting. The true situation is revealed more accurately when the figures are correlated with the 90% who want a more congregational form of church government.

Questions	Percentages			
	by			
	Country			
	T	HK	J	I
1. If there has been significant change in the form of church government, the main initiative has come from:				
1. Church	3	--	38	32
2. Mission	--	--	--	3
3. Church and Mission	17	--	4	39
4. Nil	80	100	58	26

Questions	Percentages			
	by			
	Country			
	T	HK	J	I
2. If there is at present a trend toward change, the main initiative comes from:				
1. Church	3	6	37	33
2. Mission	13	--	--	3
3. Church and Mission	14	19	--	41
4. Nil	70	75	63	23

The trend which is developing among different churches would seem to come almost equally from Church initiative and the joint initiative Church and Mission. This may be seen if the overall percentages are taken as a whole. However, the selective picture of the individual countries is quite different. The Japanese Church is by far the most independent, while the Church in Taiwan is somewhat subordinate to the Mission. The Indian and Hong Kong Churches show an emphasis upon joint effort. It might prove valuable to be able to trace why the Missions in Taiwan are now promoting change in the form of church government. Otherwise, the initiatives in the present trends and in the changes which have been completed since 1945 would seem to have a general continuity.

	T	HK	J	I
1. How are ministers appointed to the local church?				
1. Congregational call	13	53	22	6
2. Denominational appointment	--	11	10	23
3. Joint agreement	87	36	68	71
2. To whom is the minister in the local church primarily responsible?				
1. The local congregation	20	66	62	47
2. The local governing body	30	3	--	6
3. The denominational officers or bodies	23	28	25	32
4. The local governing body and denominational bodies or officers	27	3	13	15

The appointment pattern for Taiwan would seem to be consistent with the official polities. However, there is a hidden distortion. In the case of 20% of the churches replying, in the event of failure to achieve self-support, the pastor was appointed by the Mission or by the denomination without consultation with the local church. In Hong Kong, while 64% of those replying stated that their official polity was congregational, 11% of these stated that their pastors were appointed through joint agreement. This is evidently a residual feature of their former modified episcopal (Methodist) polity. The inconsistencies between official polity and the appointment processes in Japan may be explained by the blending of polities in the Kyodan and by the trend toward a modified congregational polity which seems to be emerging.

The trend toward centralization and episcopal polity is reflected in the appointment pattern in India.

The primary responsibility of fifty percent of the pastors reporting from Taiwan is to the local church organization, although only thirteen percent of the churches are officially congregational. This would seem to further reveal the emergent trend toward congregational polity. The modified episcopal polity has given way in Hong Kong to a more congregational approach, as seen in the percentages in the chart. The episcopal churchmen, however, are still primarily responsible to the bishop. The congregational trend evidenced by the large number of pastors in Japan who feel primarily responsible to their local congregation must be balanced by other factors. Palmore, as discussed in the body of the study, points out that many pastors wish local autonomy, but also desire centralized authority to which they can appeal at their discretion. India presents a picture of polarity in responsibility, with those churches which are traditionally conciliar in polity moving towards the episcopal polity in terms of responsibility, while there is also a large percentage of churches which expect primary responsibility to rest in the local church. Two things might help explain this. The traditional Indian pastor has been a strong leader; in this sense, he may feel primary responsibility to the church he leads. This may be borne out by noting the democratic nature of the episcopal structures developing. Secondly, there is a strong emphasis upon supra-congregational authority in the appointment of pastors. Only six percent of the pastors are appointed through direct call. This seems to suppose a co-ordinate responsibility to some form of extra-congregational authority.

The following is an analysis of the role of the minister, as seen by Asian pastors and leaders. Each country is listed separately, with the various functions listed and with a provision made for percentile comparison and a final ranking on the basis of percentile.

<u>Country</u>	<u>Percentage replying to function</u>	<u>Percentile rank</u>						<u>Rank</u>
		1	2	3	4	5	6	
Taiwan								
Priest	66.67	10	20	15	30	5	20	5
Pastor	96.67	74	14	--	7	--	5	1
Teacher	90.0	--	--	42	48	5	5	3
Administrative leader	66.67	5	--	5	30	55	5	4
Administrative co-ordinator	53.33	7	--	12	--	25	56	6
Preacher	86.67	11	50	16	23	--	--	2
Japan								
Priest	66.67	--	--	34	16	16	34	6
Pastor	100%	38	47	10	5	--	--	2
Teacher	90%	--	--	42	48	5	5	3
Administrative leader	95%	5	10	30	20	20	5	4
Administrative co-ordinator	76%	6	6	--	12	50	25	5
Preacher	100%	53	33	14	--	--	--	1

<u>Country</u>	<u>Percentage replying to function</u>	<u>Percentile rank</u>						<u>Rank</u>
		1	2	3	4	5	6	
Hong Kong								
Priest	100%	6	6	11	8	8	61	6
Pastor	97%	74	17	--	6	3	--	1
Teacher	99%	6	12	57	6	6	13	3
Administrative leader	100%	6	6	13	55	11	9	4
Administrative co-ordinator	100%	3	--	11	6	67	13	5
Preacher	100%	9	64	9	13	6	3	2
India								
Priest	94%	9	55	--	33	--	3	4
Pastor	97%	90	6	61	--	31	48	1
Teacher	94%	6	3	32	9	3	46	6
Administrative leader	97%	38	--	43	12	7	--	3
Administrative co-ordinator	94%	--	33	6	39	19	3	5
Preacher	91%	38	3	6	9	40	--	2

The denominational and theological background of the men answering the questionnaires is reflected in the above chart. Pastoral concern is evidenced most often, although Japan emphasizes preaching before the pastoral ministry. The low rank of teacher in India perhaps reflects the division of function between the pastor-in-charge of a church/parish and the teacher often assigned to work in a subordinate role. India is also unique in its emphasis upon the priestly and administrative functions of the ministry.

The following is an analysis of the views of Asian leaders on theological education. Each country is listed separately, with the different categories listed and with a provision made for percentile comparison and a final ranking on the basis of the percentile.

1. Do you feel that there should be improvement in the theological training of your Church in preparation for ordination?

<u>Country</u>	<u>Yes</u>	<u>No</u>
Taiwan	80%	20%
Hong Kong	89	11
Japan	96	4
India	100	--

2. Please rank in order of importance the ways to improve the theological education.

<u>Country</u>	<u>Percentage ranking the change</u>	<u>Percentile rank</u>						<u>Rank</u>
		1	2	3	4	5	6	
Taiwan								
Amount of training	43%	23	--	7	70			4
Theological emphasis	57%	18	23	41	18			3
Practical emphasis	67%	45	30	25	--			1
Cultural orientation	63%	37	41	11	11			2

<u>Country</u>	<u>Percentage ranking the change</u>	<u>Percentile rank</u>						<u>Rank</u>
		1	2	3	4	5	6	
Hong Kong								
Amount of training	75%	--	4	--	96			4
Theological emphasis	86%	14	14	72	--			3
Practical emphasis	89%	56	31	10	3			1
Cultural orientation	61%	31	53	16	--			2
Japan								
Amount of training	62%	30	23	--	47			4
Theological emphasis	72%	20	40	27	13			2
Practical emphasis	86%	44	17	33	5			1
Cultural orientation	72%	34	20	12	34			3
India								
Amount of training	100%	10	45	32	13			3
Theological emphasis	88%	44	30	13	13			2
Practical emphasis	100%	53	11	36	--			1
Cultural orientation	82%	--	14	14	72			4

II. CONGREGATIONAL STRUCTURES

Questions	Percentages by Country			
	T	HK	J	I
1. If there is a local governing body, the members act in a:				
1. Policy-making role	27	20	10	9
2. Policy-executing role	3	--	14	29
3. Policy-making and policy-executing role	70	80	76	62
2. How are members of the local governing body selected?				
1. Elected by the local church	90	100	95	100
2. Appointed by the denominational bodies or officers	--	--	5	--
3. Appointed by the Mission	3	--	--	--
4. Appointed by the pastor	7	--	--	--
3. What is the term of service for the members of the local governing body?				
1. Permanent	7	--	--	30
2. Subject to renewal	90	100	85	64
3. Limited term, unrenovable	3	--	15	6
4. Is there any difficulty in the changing of official members? If so, what is it?				
1. No difficulty	84	82	52	86
2. Face	3	3	43	--
3. Factions	3	3	--	--
4. Influence	10	3	5	5
5. Limited personnel	--	9	--	9

The function of the local governing bodies would seem to be an accurate reflection of the official polities. The comparatively larger percentage of bodies in India which only execute policy would seem to reflect the trend toward an episcopal form of government where the local policy is given through denominational structures.

Those official bodies appointed by the Mission are the result of control maintained by the Mission where the local church is not self-supporting. This financial control is reported only in Taiwan. It is in the independent churches, grouped about a strong leader, that governing bodies are appointed by the pastor.

In the majority of the churches, the local governing body may be re-elected. In Hong Kong, all the churches employ this means of regular renewal to office. However, approximately nine percent of the churches employ a variation on this pattern; at set intervals a member must step down for a period before he can be re-elected. There may be a correlation between the high number of permanent appointments in India and the trend toward the episcopal polity.

Most of the churches experience no difficulty in the changing of the membership of the local governing body. The problem of limited personnel from whom to choose is found in Hong Kong and India, but it was not possible to determine the exact reasons. However, this could be a valuable area for further study to give an indication of the areas in which these churches have membership problems. It is perhaps significant that the one country reporting serious difficulty in changing official members is Japan. This would seem to reflect the discussion in the body of the study, showing that the churches in Japan are in turmoil over the very nature of authority in church government.

Questions	Percentages by Country			
	T	HK	J	I
1. Is your local congregation organized into committees to execute the functions of the church?				
1. Yes	77	97	86	95
2. No	23	3	14	5
2. What is the role of the pastor in these committees?				
1. Ex-officio member	41	36	44	41
2. Advisor without vote	16	39	--	--
3. Chairman	43	25	56	59
3. If these committees are organized but not functioning, the reasons (in order of importance) are:				
1. A lack of capable personnel	69	69	--	--
2. A lack of interested personnel	--	--	--	--
3. No need for the committee	--	--	--	--
4. Committee function usurped	--	--	--	--

Country	Percentage not functioning	Percentile rank				Rank
		1	2	3	4	
Taiwan	23					
1. A lack of capable personnel		40	40	13	7	2
2. A lack of interested personnel		45	40	15	--	1
3. No need for the committee		22	22	34	22	4
4. Committee function usurped		22	--	22	56	3
Hong Kong	39					
1. A lack of capable personnel		69	38	--	--	1
2. A lack of interested personnel		31	62	--	9	2
3. No need for the committee		--	--	89	9	3
4. Committee function usurped		--	--	11	82	4
Japan	14					
1. A lack of capable personnel		75	25	--	--	1
2. A lack of interested personnel		100	--	--	--	2
3. No need for the committee		--	--	--	100	4
4. Committee function usurped		--	--	100	--	3
India	36					
1. A lack of capable personnel		40	69	14	--	2
2. A lack of interested personnel		50	25	--	14	1
3. No need for the committee		10	--	14	72	4
4. Committee function usurped		--	6	72	14	3

Questions	Percentages by Country			
	T	HK	J	I
1. Who is responsible for the payment of the pastor's salary?				
1. The local congregation	75	61	95	15
2. The congregation and the denomination	25	6	5	35
3. The denomination, not the congregation	--	--	--	35
4. The Mission and the local congregation	--	--	--	9
5. The Mission and the denomination	--	--	--	3
6. The congregation, Mission and denomination	--	22	--	3

It has been seen that the majority of the Mission subsidy given to Mission Churches or to Churches with which the Mission works is channeled into institutions, denominational programs and other larger programs. However, it would seem that there is still some direct Mission support channeled to even individual congregations. There may also be hidden realities behind the report ideals; Taiwan reports no dependence upon Mission support at this point, but attention has already been called to Mission control exercised because of failure to achieve self-support. One might also wonder at the desirability of the Indian emphasis upon support through larger structures. The dismantling of denominational superstructure can be of great detriment

if the congregation has no strong life of its own. This is what happened in China, and should serve as a warning in other situations.

III. THE CHURCH IN ITS WORLD

Questions	Percentages by Country			
	T	HK	J	I
1. The most important unit of the culture, in terms of controlling pressures, is:				
1. The two-generation family	60	86	74	71
2. The three-generation family	14	11	5	12
3. The clan	13	3	--	5
4. The community	13	--	21	12
2. Is the local community predominantly:				
1. Rural and agricultural	33	3	14	64
2. Urban and industrial	20	39	24	21
3. Urban and commercial	47	58	62	15
3. Is the local church in the community:				
1. An isolated unit	58	58	55	27
2. A semi-isolated unit	42	36	45	41
3. A fully-integrated unit	--	6	--	32
4. Does the structure of the congregation reflect the structure of the community?				
1. Governmentally				
1. Yes	36	33	6	59
2. No	64	67	94	41
2. In attendant membership				
1. Yes	83	47	42	71
2. No	17	53	58	29
5. Is there anti-Christian feeling in the community?				
1. Yes	100	81	62	59
2. No	--	19	38	41
6. If there is anti-Christian feeling in the community, is it:				
1. Strong and persistent	13	--	15	15
2. Weak but growing	--	3	--	9
3. Present but moderate	77	75	43	32
4. Strong but decreasing	10	3	3	3
7. If there is anti-Christian feeling in the community, it is mainly traceable to which of the following reasons:				
1. Religious	80	33	16	48
2. Political	7	9	--	14
3. Nationalism	10	33	30	29
4. Historical factors	3	6	54	9

Questions	Percentages by Country			
	T	HK	J	I
8. Are there distinct ethnic groups in your country?				
1. Yes	67	61	38	74
2. No	33	39	62	26
9. If so, does your denomination seek to serve them?				
1. Yes	70	18	64	80
2. No	30	82	36	20
10. If there are distinct ethnic groups, does your congregation seek to serve them?				
1. Yes	40	9	36	56
2. No	60	91	64	44

The contrast between Hong Kong and Taiwan, in terms of controlling pressures, would seem to confirm the concept that Hong Kong has become more culturally pluralistic, and that the Western influence found in a Crown Colony is of significant effect upon family life. The greater percentage of rural churches in Taiwan would also serve as a partial explanation, for the rural Chinese tend to be more conservative than the urbanized community. However, it is interesting to note that the Hong Kong Chinese still prefer their traditional form of small-unit (congregational) government; it would seem that this has not changed.

The Japanese community is still a potent influence in terms of controlling pressures, although those churches replying had a large majority of urban, industrial/commercial areas. The emphasis upon the two-generation family as the major controlling unit also suggests that the individual is gaining more freedom than possible in previous generations. This would require further study, for the lack of social congruence in the Japanese churches may suggest that the two-generation family is a controlling pressure in the middle-class, intellectual milieu typical of the majority of the Japanese churches.

India remains a basically rural culture, and it is therefore somewhat surprising to find the two-generation family listed as the greatest factor in controlling pressures. This would seem to suggest a shift from traditional values of community and family relationships. This might be understood in terms of the Christian community being formed of third and fourth generation Christian families. If this is the case, (and it is outside the scope of the study to confirm), the tendency to become individual family units, through social isolation through caste and Western influences, might be the result. However, this would suppose a greater degree of acculturation than is suggested in the figures on the place of the local church in the community.

The small percentage of churches which replied that either their denomination or the local congregation, or sometimes both, were seeking to serve such ethnic groups as might be in their country or community leads one to wonder as to the reasons behind such lack of activity. Further study might reveal, among other factors, a sense of minority status on the part of the churches themselves, which could be influential in causing them to bridge the gap between their situation and the ethnic situation; apart from the national and cultural

differences, the Western elements in the Christian group-life, such as church polity and administrative factors, may be a factor.

The reported anti-Christian feeling and the position of the churches in the community suggest a need to devise structures which will help the churches break down the barriers which seem to exist between themselves and the community. The majority of the churches replying may be seen to feel that there is prejudice against the Christians in the community. This prejudice is generally moderate, and was generally connected with religious and nationalistic sentiments as the major causes. However, Japan expressed the belief that nationalistic and historical factors were the greatest causes of anti-Christian feeling. In this case, one may wonder at the extent of the effect of World War II upon the present status of the churches in Japan.

It is in particular reference to the relationship of the churches to the community that one might wish that Hood had been more specific and gone into greater detail in his study, "In Whole And In Part", compiled for the Conference of Missionary Societies in Great Britain and Ireland. However, unless it were possible to examine the actual results of the questionnaires sent out, there is no way of applying the generalized information supplied to the specific situations of individual countries.

Questions	Percentages by Country			
	T	HK	J	I
1. Who has the final decision in family matters?				
1. Husband	72	36	90	94
2. Wife	--	3	5	--
3. Both	38	61	5	6
2. What control does the wife have over family income?				
1. Full control	7	--	35	--
2. Partial control	83	100	65	94
3. No control	10	--	--	6
3. Can the wife own property in her own right?				
1. Yes	67	97	95	53
2. No	33	3	5	47
4. Who is responsible for family discipline?				
1. In minor problems				
1. Father	7	85	5	11
2. Mother	93	15	95	74
3. Both	--	--	--	15
2. In major problems				
1. Father	93	77	90	74
2. Mother	7	17	10	--
3. Both	--	6	--	26

The Asian society may be seen to be strongly male-oriented in terms of actual social standing. The information received is too

limited to be definitive, but further study might prove valuable in examination of the composition of the society in relation to church and community. What structures are there to attract and use men? Do women occupy a place in the churches which is contrary to cultural patterns? If so, is there a reaction against this which would prevent men from joining the church?

The following chart is an analysis of the importance of the factors which determine social position in the Asian cultures surveyed. The various factors are listed with a percentage shown for all factors involved, giving provision for percentile comparison and a final ranking on the basis of adjusted percentile.

<u>Country</u>	<u>Percentage listing given factors</u>	<u>Percentile rank</u>						<u>Rank</u>
		1	2	3	4	5	6	
Taiwan								
1. Hereditary rank and privilege	67%	20	15	15	30	20	--	2
2. Land ownership	64%	11	11	21	31	26	--	5
3. Wealth	77%	9	36	42	4	9	--	4
4. Education	87%	54	19	19	8	--	--	1
5. Specialized function, such as doctor	80%	17	34	9	20	20	--	3
Hong Kong								
1. Hereditary rank and privilege	86%	10	6	6	3	75	--	5
2. Land ownership	89%	3	19	6	63	9	--	4
3. Wealth	92%	67	24	3	3	3	--	1
4. Education	94%	17	48	9	17	9	--	2
5. Specialized function, such as doctor	92%	9	3	73	12	3	--	3
Japan								
1. Hereditary rank and privilege	86%	11	6	22	44	7	--	4
2. Land ownership	81%	12	12	12	41	23	--	5
3. Wealth	90%	25	38	25	5	5	--	2
4. Education	95%	50	30	10	5	5	--	1
5. Specialized function, such as doctor	95%	25	25	30	15	5	--	3
India								
1. Hereditary rank and privilege	94%	18	28	3	38	13	--	2
2. Land ownership	71%	--	21	12	13	54	--	5
3. Wealth	85%	11	7	41	37	4	--	4
4. Education	100%	41	41	13	3	3	--	1
5. Specialized function, such as doctor	97%	34	9	12	6	39	--	3

Different societies have differing values which show in their social positions. What is being done to attract and utilize community leaders in the churches? Are church structures designed to utilize naturally leaders or are they structured to express Western values? These are questions of consequence to the work of the churches.

There seems to be a need to devise structures which can overcome the following areas of handicap and hindrance to the work of mission:

- 1) Structures to overcome barriers against Christianity;
- 2) Structures to overcome hostility and utilize cultural units which exert controlling pressures;
- 3) Structures which are varied to meet different situations and within the Asian cultures.

There was seen to be little or no variation between structures reported by churches, despite a high degree of differentiation between such basic cultural factors as the rural/agricultural and the urban/industrial situations.

CORRESPONDENTS ON QUESTIONNAIRES

Taiwan

Assemblies of God

The Little Flock

The Mandarin Church of Taiwan

Oriental Missionary Society

Pentecostal Assemblies of Canada

Presbyterian Church of Taiwan

The True Jesus Church*

Hong Kong

Chinese Methodist Church

Chinese Rhenish Church*

Christian and Missionary Alliance Church

Chung Hwa Sheng Kung Hwei (Anglican)

Church of Christ in China

Free Methodist Church

Lutheran Church, Missouri Synod

Pentecostal Assemblies of God (Canada and America)*

Southern Baptist Church

Japan

Anglican Episcopal Church of Japan*

Assemblies of God Church of Japan

Free Methodist Church of Japan

Japan Baptist Convention*

Japan Evangelical Lutheran

Japan Jesus Christ Church*

Presbyterian and Reformed Church in Japan

Spirit of Jesus Church

United Church of Christ in Japan

India

Andhra Evangelical Lutheran Church
Assemblies of God, North India
Assemblies of God, South India*
Church of India, Pakistan, Burma and Ceylon
Church of South India
Free Methodist Church
Gossner Evangelical Lutheran Church*
Lakher Independent Evangelical Church
Methodist Church in Southern Asia
United Church of North India

*no reply